REPUBLIC OF GHANA

EVALUATION REPORT ON THE 2019 CHIEF DIRECTORS' PERFORMANCE AGREEMENT

GHANA CIVIL SERVICE

2020

REPUBLIC OF GHANA

EVALUATION REPORT ON THE 2019 CHIEF DIRECTOR'S PERFORMANCE AGREEMENT

GHANA CIVIL SERVICE

CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS vi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 2

PART ONE 8

CHAPTER ONE 8

1.0 INTRODUCTION 8

CHAPTER TWO 12

2.0 METHODOLOGY, APPROACHES AND MEASUREMENT PROTOCOLS 12

CHAPTER THREE 19

3.0 DISCUSSION OF RESULTS AND OVERVIEW OF THE FINDINGS AND ISSUES EMERGING 19

CHAPTER FOUR 42

4.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION 42

4.1 RECOMMENDATIONS 42

4.2 CONCLUSION 47

PART 2 49

5.0 FINDINGS FOR THE 2019 CHIEF DIRECTORS' EVALUATION 49

5.1 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Aviation 49

5.2 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Business Development 68

5.3 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs 81

5.4 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Defence 96

5.5 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations 121

5.6 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Energy 137

5.7 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation .. 156

5.8 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Finance 173

5.9 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture 191

5.10 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Agriculture 205

5.11 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Information 230

5.12 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Inner-City and Zongo Development 248

5.13 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of the Interior 262

5.14 Performance of the Chief Director, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice 280

5.15 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection 293
5.16 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Communications 310
5.17 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Education 330
5.18 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Health 348
5.19 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources 365
5.20 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development 378
5.21 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation 393
5.22 Performance of the Chief Director, Office of the Head of the Civil Service 404
5.23 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Office of the President 425
5.24 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Office of the Senior Minister 437
5.25 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs 452
5.26 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Planning 468
5.27 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Railways Development 485
5.28 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Regional Reorganisation and Development 502
5.29 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Roads and Highways 511
5.30 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Special Development Initiatives 528
5.31 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture 542
5.32 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Trade and Industry 558
5.33 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Sanitation and Water Resources 579
5.34 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Transport 594
5.35 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Works and Housing 608
5.36 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Youth and Sports 637
SIGNATURES OF THE EVALUATION TEAM 650
APPENDIX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE 653
APPENDIX 2: SCHEDULE OF VISITS FOR THE END OF YEAR EVALUATION EXERCISE OF THE 2019 CHIEF DIRECTORS' PERFORMANCE AGREEMENT 656
APPENDIX 3: INDICATORS AND ALLOCATION OF MARKS FOR SCHEDULE TWO 659

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Overall Results of Chief Directors for 2019 4
Table 2: Structure of the 2019 Performance Assessment Instrument....14
Table 3: Summary of Results on Schedule 1 - Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables - Total Score 60....22
Table 4: Summary of Results on Schedule 2 - General Operational and Administrative Deliverables - Total Score 30....27
Table 5: Summary of Results on Schedule 3 - Chief Director's Personal Capacity Development Plan - Total Score 10....36
Table 6: Overall Results of Chief Directors for 2019 39
Table 7: Performance of Ag. CD, Aviation in Schedule 1....49
Table 8: Performance of Ag. CD, Aviation in Schedule 2....55
Table 9: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Aviation. 60
Table 10: Performance of CD, Business Development in Schedule 1....68
Table 11: Performance of Chief Director, Business Development in Schedule 2....71
Table 12: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Business Development 76
Table 13: Performance of CD, Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs in Schedule 1 81
Table 14: Performance of Chief Director, Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs in Schedule 2....85
Table 15: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs....89
Table 16: Performance of CD, Defence in Schedule 1....96
Table 17: Performance of CD, Defence in Schedule 2....101
Table 18: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Defence 106
Table 19: Performance of CD, Employment and Labour Relations in Schedule 1 121
Table 20: Performance of Chief Director, Employment and Labour Relations in Schedule 2 126
Table 21: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Employment and Labour Relations 131
Table 22: Performance of Chief Director, Energy in Schedule 1 137
Table 23: Performance of Chief Director, Energy in Schedule 2 142
Table 24: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Energy....146
Table 25: Performance of CD, Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation in Schedule 1 156
Table 26: Performance of Chief Director, Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation in Schedule 2 162
Table 27: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation....167
Table 28: Performance of CD, Finance in Schedule 1....173
Table 29: Performance of CD, Finance in Schedule 2....180
Table 30: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Finance 186
Table 31: Performance of Ag. CD, Fisheries and Aquaculture in Schedule 1....191
Table 32: Performance of CD, Fisheries and Aquaculture in Schedule 2 197
Table 33: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Fisheries and Aquaculture 200
Table 34: Performance of Ag. CD, Agriculture in Schedule 1....205
Table 35: Performance of Ag. CD, Agriculture in Schedule 2....212
Table 36: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Agriculture 218
Table 37: Performance of CD, Information in Schedule 1....230
Table 38: Performance of Chief Director, Information in Schedule 2....235
Table 39: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Information 240
Table 40: Performance of Ag. CD, Inner-City and Zongo Development in Schedule 1 248

Table 41: Performance of Ag. CD, Inner-City and Zongo Development in Schedule 2 253
Table 42: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Inner City and Zongo Development 257
Table 43: Performance of CD, the Interior in Schedule 1 262
Table 44: Performance of CD, the Interior in Schedule 2 265
Table 45: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, the Interior 272
Table 46: Performance of CD, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice in Schedule 1 280
Table 47: Performance of Chief Director, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice in Schedule 2 284
Table 48: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice 289
Table 49: Performance of CD, Gender, Children and Social Protection in Schedule 1 293
Table 50: Performance of CD, Gender, Children and Social Protection in Schedule 2 298
Table 51: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Gender, Children and Social Protection 303
Table 52: Performance of CD, Communications in Schedule 1 310
Table 53: Performance of Chief Director, Communications in Schedule 2 316
Table 54: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Communications 321
Table 55: Performance of CD, Education in Schedule 1 330
Table 56: Performance of CD, Education in Schedule 2 336
Table 57: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Education 341
Table 58: Performance of CD, Health in Schedule 1 348
Table 59: Performance of CD, Health in Schedule 2 354
Table 60: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Health 359
Table 61: Performance of CD, Lands and Natural Resources in Schedule 1 365
Table 62: Performance of Chief Director, Lands and Natural Resources in Schedule 2 368
Table 63: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Lands and Natural Resources 373
Table 64: Performance of CD, Local Government and Rural Development in Schedule 1 378
Table 65: Performance of CD, Local Government and Rural Development in Schedule 2 383
Table 66: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Local Government and Rural Development 388
Table 67: Performance of Ag. CD, Monitoring and Evaluation in Schedule 1 393
Table 68: Performance of Ag. CD, Monitoring and Evaluation in Schedule 2 397
Table 69: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Monitoring and Evaluation 401
Table 70: Performance of CD, Office of the Head of the Civil Service in Schedule 1 404
Table 71: Performance of CD, Office of the Head of the Civil Service in Schedule 2 409
Table 72: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Office of the Head of the Civil Service 414
Table 73: Performance of Ag. CD, Office of the President in Schedule 1 425
Table 74: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Office of the President in Schedule 2 429
Table 75: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Office of the President 434
Table 76: Performance of Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister in Schedule 1 437
Table 77: Performance of Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister in Schedule 2 444
Table 78: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister 449
Table 79: Performance of CD, Parliamentary Affairs in Schedule 1 452
Table 80: Performance of Chief Director, Parliamentary Affairs in Schedule 2 457
Table 81: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Parliamentary Affairs 463
Table 82: Performance of CD, Planning in Schedule 1 468

Table 83: Performance of CD, Planning in Schedule 2 472
Table 84: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Planning. 477
Table 85: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Railways Development in Schedule 1 485
Table 86: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Railways Development in Schedule 2 492
Table 87: Schedule 3: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Railways Development 497
Table 88: Performance of CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development in Schedule 1 502
Table 89: Performance of CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development in Schedule 2 504
Table 90: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development 507
Table 91: Performance of Ag. CD, Roads and Highways in Schedule 1 511
Table 92: Performance of CD, Roads and Highways in Schedule 2 517
Table 93: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Roads and Highways 522
Table 94: Performance of CD, Special Development Initiatives in Schedule 1. 528
Table 95: Performance of CD, Special Development Initiatives in Schedule 2 532
Table 96: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Special Development Initiatives 537
Table 97: Performance of CD, Tourism, Arts and Culture in Schedule 1 542
Table 98: Performance of Chief Director, Tourism, Arts and Culture in Schedule 2 546
Table 99: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Tourism, Arts and Culture 551
Table 100: Performance of Ag. CD, Trade and Industry in Schedule 1 558
Table 101: Performance of Ag. CD, Trade and Industry in Schedule 2 562
Table 102: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Trade and Industry 567
Table 103: Performance of CD, Sanitation and Water Resources in Schedule 1 579
Table 104: Performance of CD, Sanitation and Water Resources in Schedule 2 585
Table 105: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Sanitation and Water Resources 589
Table 106: Performance of Ag. CD, Transport in Schedule 1 594
Table 107: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Transport in Schedule 2 596
Table 108: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Transport 601
Table 109: Performance of Chief Director, Works and Housing in Schedule 1 608
Table 110: Performance of Chief Director, Works and Housing in Schedule 2 621
Table 111: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Works and Housing 627
Table 112: Performance of Chief Director, Youth and Sports in Schedule 1 637
Table 113: Performance of Chief Director, Youth and Sports in Schedule 2 641
Table 114: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Youth and Sports 646

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAPAM	-	African Association for Public Administration and Management
AC	-	Audit Committees
AG	-	Attorney-General
AGI	-	Association of Ghana Industries
AGOA	-	African Growth and Opportunity Act
CAGD	-	Controller and Accountant General's Department
CDs	-	Chief Directors
CDsPAs	-	Chief Directors' Performance Agreements
CEMIS	-	Community Environmental Management Information Systems
CoS	-	Chief of Staff
COVID-19	-	Coronavirus Disease 2019
CPE	-	Continuing Professional Education
CPESDP	-	Coordinated Programme of Economic and Social Development Policies
CRPD	-	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CS	-	Civil Service
CSC	-	Civil Service Council
CSOs	-	Civil Society Organizations
CSUs	-	Client Service Units
DP	-	Development Partner
DTT	-	Digital Terrestrial Transmission
DVLA	-	Driver and Vehicle Licensing Authority
E.I.	-	Executive Instrument
ECOWAS	-	Economic Community of West African States
EMT	-	Economic Management Team
ETC	-	Entity Tender Committee
FAQs	-	Frequently Asked Questions
GCCI	-	Ghana Chamber of Commerce and Industry
GCX	-	Ghana Commodity Exchange
GDP	-	Gross Domestic Product
GIFMIS	-	Ghana Integrated Financial Management Information System
GITC	-	Ghana International Trade Commission
GNFS	-	Ghana National Fire Service
GSGDA	-	Ghana Shared Growth and Development Agenda
HCS	-	Head of the Civil Service
HoDs	-	Heads of Departments
IFAD	-	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IMC	-	Interim Management Committee
IMCC	-	Inter-Ministerial Coordinating Committee
IPEP	-	Infrastructure for Poverty Eradication Programme
KRAs	-	Key Results Areas
LEAP	-	Livelihood Empowerment against Poverty
MAB	-	Ministerial Advisory Board

MDAs	-	Ministries, Departments and Agencies
MELR	-	Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations
MESTI	-	Ministry of Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation
MINTER	-	Ministry of the Interior
MLGRD	-	Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development
MMDAs	-	Metropolitan Municipal and District Assemblies
MoD	-	Ministry of Defence
MoF	-	Ministry of Finance
MOFA	-	Ministry of Agriculture
MoFARI	-	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration
MOJAGD	-	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice
MOTI	-	Ministry of Trade and Industry
MOV	-	Means of Verification
MPA	-	Ministers' Priority Areas
MSD	-	Management Services Department
NACAP	-	National Anti-Corruption Action Plan
NDPC	-	National Development Planning Commission
NGO	-	Non Governmental Organization
NIC	-	National Insurance Commission
NITA	-	National Information Technology Agency
NPSRS	-	National Public Sector Reform Strategy
OECD	-	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OHCS	-	Office of the Head of the Civil Service
OHLGS	-	Office of the Head of the Local Government Service
OoP	-	Office of the President
OVIs	-	Objective Verifiable Indicators
PAS	-	Performance Agreement System
PBMED	-	Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate
PFM	-	Public Financial Management
PMS	-	Performance Management System
PPA	-	Public Procurement Authority
PPME	-	Policy Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation
PPP	-	Public Private Partnership
PPPAMS	-	Programme, Project, Policy Appraisal Management System
PRAAD	-	Public Records and Archives Administration Department
PRO	-	Public Relations Officer
PSC	-	Public Services Commission
PSRS	-	Public Sector Reform Secretariat
PWDs	-	Persons with Disabilities
RSIM	-	Research, Statistics and Information Management
SARP	-	Sub-vented Agencies Reform Programme
SDGs	-	Sustainable Development Goals
SEC	-	State Enterprises Commission
SME	-	Small and Medium Enterprises

SMTDP	-	Sector Medium Term Development Plan
SONA	-	State of the Nation Address
ToR	-	Terms of Reference
TPAs	-	Top Priority Areas
UN	-	United Nations
USAID	-	United States Agency for International Development
WB	-	World Bank
YWCA	-	Young Women's Christian Association

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Evaluation Team wishes to acknowledge the support of all institutions and individuals that contributed to the successful conduct of the assessment of the 2019 Chief Directors' Performance Agreements exercise. In particular, the Team would like to appreciate the following contributions:

- **The Chief of Staff,** for her appreciation of the concept of performance management as a critical tool for the efficient and effective management of resources in the country;

- **Honourable Sector Ministers,** who as the political heads of the Chief Directors, made time to interact with the Team and shared their views with the Evaluation Team on the performance of their Chief Directors;

- **The Civil Service Council,** for its continued support of the evaluation exercise which it sees as very critical for the work of the Civil Service as the Secretariat of the Executive arm of the Government;

- **The Head of the Civil Service**, Nana Agyekum-Dwamena, for providing technical backstopping to the Evaluation Team in spite of his busy schedule;

- **The Chief Directors,** for their support for the exercise through various preparatory processes leading to and during the conduct of the exercise. Their interest in performance management in the Civil Service was shown in their constructive comments during the interviews and the amount of time they spent with the Team. Special reference is made of the Acting CD of the Ministry of Railways Development who took over the position two (2) weeks before the evaluation session and the Director, Technical Coordination, of the Ministry of Health who stood in at the last minute forthe Chief Director due to his indisposition**;**

- **Partner Organizations of the Civil Service** for their commitment and support to this exercise;

- **The Secretaries to the Evaluation Team,** namely, Mrs. Mavis Asare-Donkor, Director Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate and Mrs. Elizabeth Obeng-Yeboah, Acting Director, Reforms Coordinating Unit bothof the OHCS who were ably supported by their staff. Together, this team made it easy for the Evaluators to undertake their assignment without any major hitches. They ensured that appointments with the Chief Directors and personal needs of the Evaluators were professionally organised.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION

Since 2014, Chief Directors in the Civil Service have been signing Performance Agreements as part of the arrangements by the Civil Service Council through the Office of the Head of the Civil Service to promote performance culture in the Civil Service. The Agreements are signed between the CD and HCS with the Minister of the CD being the witness. The CDPA constitute the apex of an arrangement by which staff below the level of Directors/Analogous Grades or Heads of Departments have their performance assessed through a Staff Appraisal Instrument and Directors/Analogous Grades and Heads of Departments sign Performance Agreements with their CDs.

The year, after the CDPA has been signed, a team was constituted by the HCS on behalf of the CSC to undertake the evaluation of the Agreement.

This is a report of the evaluation of the thirty-six (36) Chief Directors who signed the 2019 Performance Agreement. The Evaluation was conducted from 27th January to 20th March 2020.The purpose of the assignment as indicated in the Terms of Reference was to:

- Strengthen the performance management culture in the Civil Service;
- Assess the level and quality of work done by Chief Directors for the period January - December, 2019;
- Increase transparency and accountability in the delivery of Public Services;
- Stimulate healthy peer competition among Chief Directors and sector Ministries; and
- Provide an opportunity to learn lessons for the way forward.

Purpose, Anticipated Use and Organisation of the Evaluation Report

The evaluation report aims at determining the extent to which the deliverables agreed to and targets set in the signed Performance Agreements were achieved. The report also reviews the achievements of Chief Directors with respect to the Top Priority Areas of their Ministries and the conduct of their financial, human resource and administrative management responsibilities. It presents the results of their efforts at self-development.

The report is also intended to contribute to the larger effort to review performance, promote innovative approaches and improve decision-making and responsiveness in service delivery in the public sector in Ghana and it is hoped that the report will be shared among such critical institutions in the Public Service.

It is expected that the report will provide the Office of the Head of the Civil Service (OHCS) and the Civil Service Council with an overview of the performance of administrative leadership in the Civil Service and the strengths, weaknesses and trends in the different sectors. It should indicate effective and efficient utilization of resources in the Civil Service and of the performance culture in the Service.

The report is presented in two (2) Parts with Part 1 consisting of four (4) chapters, namely:

- Chapter One introduces the report through a background statement, purpose, the performance management arrangements of the Civil Service of Ghana and the context of the 2019 assessment period;
- The Second Chapter presents the approach and methodology for the assignment. The detailed discussion on the schedules and assignment of marks has been presented in Appendix Three;
- Chapter Three provides analysis of the results of the evaluation exercise with overviews of the findings and issues emerging based on the results; and

- Chapter Four draws out conclusions and recommendations for strengthening the evaluation process and for the Civil Service Council and other parties in order to improve service delivery.

Part 2 of the report provides the detailed scoring and findings for CDs.

The report has three (3) sets of Appendices as follows: (1) the Terms of Reference; (2) the Schedule of Visits and Interviews; and (3) Schedules and Assignment of Marks for Indicators and Explanatory Notes for Schedule Two.

METHODOLOGY

The exercise consisted of the following critical steps:

- Studying the Performance Agreements, Mid-Year Review and Self-Assessment Reports of the Chief Directors and other supporting documents;
- Holding review/interactive sessions with Chief Directors to discuss achievement levels based on the agreed deliverables and outputs in their 2019 Performance Agreements;
- Engaging Sector Ministers during the visit of the Team;
- Assigning scores and analysing the findings for trends and emerging issues; and
- Writing of Report.

The scoring was based on a scheme outlined in Part 1 of the report.

OVERALL FINDINGS

As with preceding instruments, the 2019 Agreement was categorized into three (3) Schedules as follows:

• Schedule 1	60	Institution-Specific Outputs and Deliverables: The deliverables presented here focused on the major areas of work for the Ministry, derived from the 2018-2021 Sector Medium Term Plan, the 2019 State of the Nation Address and Budget. Chief Directors were expected to identify a minimum of five (5) top priority areas (TPAs) and a maximum of ten (10).
• Schedule 2	30	General Operational and Administrative Deliverables: These deliverables were generic to all Chief Directors and aimed at the smooth functioning of the Ministry. They were grouped into six (6) Key Results Areas (KRAs) distilled from the legislative frameworks governing the operations of the Civil Service as part of the Public Services of Ghana.
• Schedule 3	10	The Chief Director's Personal Capacity Development Plan: This focused on actions they would take to enhance their effectiveness. Chief Directors were expected to engage in a minimum of five (5) key learning activities.

The overall scores for the performance of the CDs are presented in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Overall Results of Chief Directors for 2019

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	SCORE PER SCHEDULE			TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT	RANK
				S 1	S 2	S 3			
1	Patrick Nomo	Chief Director	Finance	60	29.65	10	**99.65**	**1st**	**Excellent**
2	Benjamin Gyasi	Chief Director	Education	60	29.375	10	**99.375**	**2nd**	
3	Solomon Asoalla	Chief Director	Works and Housing	59.54	29.76	10	**99.3**	**3rd**	
4	Edmund Offei-Annor	Ag. Chief Director	Roads and Highways	59.5	28.32	10	**97.82**	**4th**	
5	Dr. Afisah Zakariah	Chief Director	Gender, Children and Social Protection	58.8	28.225	10	**97.025**	**5th**	
6	Alhaji Ahmed Suleman	Chief Director	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice	58	28.995	10	**96.995**	**6th**	
7	Ing. Godwin J. Brocke	Chief Director	Office of the Head of the Civil Service	57.33	29.586	10	**96.916**	**7th**	
8	Adelaide Anno-Kumi	Chief Director	Interior	56.4	29.8	10	**96.2**	**8th**	
9	Nana Kwabena Adjei-Mensah	Chief Director	Health	58.1	27.95	10	**96.05**	**9th**	
10	Kizito Ballans	Chief Director	Employment and Labour Relations	57.8	28.18	10	**95.98**	**10th**	
11	Alhaji Hafiz Adams	Chief Director	Business Development	60	24.44	10	**94.44**	**11th**	
12	Prof Patrick Agbesinyale	Chief Director	Lands and Natural Resources	57	27.425	10	**94.425**	**12th**	
13	Dr. Evans Dzikum	Chief Director	Defence	55.6	28.550	10	**94.15**	**13th**	
14	Mabel Sagoe	Ag. Chief Director	Transport	53.9	29.025	10	**92.925**	**14th**	
15	Magdalene Ewurasi Appenteng	Chief Director	Communications	51.3	27.795	10	**89.095**	**15th**	**Very Good**
16	Benjamin Afful	Chief Director	Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs	52.7	25.775	10	**88.475**	**16th**	
17	Patrick Yaw Nimo	Ag. Chief Director	Trade and Industry	53	25.305	10	**88.305**	**17th**	
18	Robert P. Ankobia	Ag. Chief Director	Agriculture	52.052	26.12	10	**88.172**	**18th**	

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	SCORE PER SCHEDULE			TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT	RANK
				S 1	S 2	S 3			
19	Evans Aggrey-Darkoh	Chief Director	Parliamentary Affairs	52	25.197	10	**87.197**	**19th**	
20	Eric K. Armo Himbson	Chief Director	Special Development Initiative	50.8	26.27	10	**87.07**	**20th**	
21	Levina Owusu	Chief Director	Environment, Science, Technology & Innovations	49.4	27.470	10	**86.87**	**21st**	
22	Mamle Andrews	Chief Director	Information	50.2	25.745	10	**85.945**	**22nd**	
23	Alhaji Abudulai Yakubu	Chief Director	Tourism, Arts and Culture	53.4	24.16	8	**85.56**	**23rd**	
24	Frank Quist	Chief Director	Youth and Sports	47.7	27.17	10	**84.87**	**24th**	
25	Marian Kpakpah	Chief Director	Planning	48	24.86	10	**82.86**	**25th**	
26	Noah Tumfo	Chief Director	Water Resources and Sanitation	53.1	19.59	10	**82.69**	**26th**	
27	Kwabena Adjei-Boakye	Ag. Chief Director	Monitoring and Evaluation	51.4	20.775	10	**82.175**	**27th**	
28	Christiane Edmund	Ag. Chief Director	Aviation	43.6	27.425	10	**81.025**	**28th**	
29	Gifty Biyira Mahama	Ag. Chief Director	Inner City and Zongo Development	45.8	24.743	10	**80.543**	**29th**	
30	Henry Wood	Ag. Chief Director	Office of the President	42	27.713	10	**79.713**	**30th**	**Good**
31	Lawrence Apaalse	Chief Director	Energy	42.35	26.815	10	**79.165**	**31st**	
32	Charles K. Dondieu	Chief Director	Local Government & Rural Development	44.5	22.405	10	**76.905**	**32nd**	
33	Desmond Boateng	Ag. Chief Director	Railways Development	40	25.15	10	**75.15**	**33rd**	
34	Samuel Abu-Bonsrah	Ag. Chief Director	Senior Minister	34.07	24.316	10	**68.386**	**34th**	**unsatisfactory**
35	Frank Sofo	Ag. Chief Director	Fisheries & Aquaculture Development	42.6	14.983	10	**67.583**	**35th**	
36	Dawanorba Baeka	Chief Director	Regional Reorganisation and Development	48	12.973	6	**66.973**	**36th**	
37	AMB. Albert F Yankey	Chief Director	Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration	**N/A**					

OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The report outlines a number of Observations and Recommendations with the key ones indicated below:

Review of the CDPA Instrument

The current CDPA Instrument relates to outputs. It is felt that an Instrument based on outcomes will give a better reflection of how the Ministries are working to improve the socio-economic development of the country. An initiative by the CSC through the OHCS should be expedited so that the Instrument could be used for the 2021 Evaluation exercise. In the meantime, the 2020 exercise should be suspended to allow for the instrument to be finalized and the necessary awareness created among the CDs. The review of the Instrument will affect that of Directors/Analogous Grades and Heads of Department.

An exercise should also be undertaken to assess the implementation of the Staff Appraisal Instrument.

General Comments on the CDPA

CDs should see the CDPAs as documents guiding them in their daily operations and ensure that they monitor on a regular basis the achievements being made with respect to their implementation. In this regardCDs should ensure that:

- they are familiar with the Guidelines on the CDPAs and implement them;
  their Ministers are very conversant with the expectations of the CDPA especially with respect to issues relating to their involvement.

Schedule 1

- All Targets should be SMART and their attainment should be within the control of the CD and there should be not more than five (5) Targets for each TPA;
- The roles of the CDs should be clear with appropriate MOVs being provided for each role;
- CDs should seek the approval of the HCS before reviewing their Agreements.

Schedule 2

- CDs should continually monitor the reporting obligations indicated in the Agreement and ensure timely submission of high-quality documents/reports to the OHCS and other entities within timelines;
- The HCS should work with the CAGD to ensure that the electronic assets management tool of GIFMIS is implemented to promote better organisation of the assets of Ministries;
- CDs should ensure that their records are well organised to allow for easy storage and retrieval;
- Electronic records management systems should be encouraged;
- Serious consideration should be given to the role of Client Service Charters in the management arrangements of Ministries based on the new template to be developed under the auspices of the OHCS;
- CDs should ensure that their RSIM Directorates are well organised to undertake research to support their policy formulation function.

Schedule 3

- CDs should maintain good records of all capacity development programmes they participate in and to assess for themselves the gains made from their participation in the programmes.

Role of OHCS

- The HCS should re-introduce the Hearings arrangements for CDs so that assistance could be provided to the CDs on the selection of TPAs and associated Targets and the crafting of the language for the Targets and roles;
- The OHCS should acknowledge receipt of all documents received from CDs as part of the implementation of their CDPAs and provide feedback as to whether the documents meet the expectations of the OHCS;
- The OHCS should ensure that its Regulations relating to Posting are strictly adhered to; and
- OHCS should liaise with CDs to determine how best to reduce the amount of paper generated by this exercise with the aim of making the exercise electronic.

Role of Chief Directors

- CDs should prepare for the interaction with the Evaluation Team by ensuring that all documentation to be used to support their presentations are available at the time of the evaluation and they should exhibit adequate knowledge of all the documents; and
- CDs should involve as many of their staff as possible in the evaluation interactions for them also to appreciate the importance of their contribution to the attainment of the deliverables in the CDPA.

PART ONE
CHAPTER ONE

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background Statement and Purpose

The CDPA is the apex of the Performance Management arrangement within the Ghana Civil Service. Since 2014, the Office of the Head of the Civil Service (OHCS) has implemented the Performance Agreement (PA) System for Chief Directors (CDs) in the Ghana Civil Service. This is followed by the signing of Performance Agreements between Chief Directors and Directors/HoDs and Analogous grade officers. Deputy Directors and grades below them are assessed through the Staff Performance Appraisal Instrument with the targets of the Chief Directors cascading to the lowest level staff of the Ministries and Departments.

The evaluation of Chief Directors, as Bureaucratic Heads of the Ministries and Advisors to the Ministers, is a reflection of the performance of the Ministry.

The end-of-year assessment is to determine the extent to which the deliverables agreed upon in the signed Performance Agreements were attained. This is a Report of the evaluation of the 2019 Performance Agreements of CDs which was conducted from January 27th to March 20th 2020.

The report provides an overview of how resources are utilized in the Civil Service to achieve institutional goals and to support other performance management initiatives, as well as monitor and evaluate activities in the Civil Service to address national development efforts.

It also reviews the achievements of Chief Directors and the conduct of their financial, human resource and administrative management responsibilities and presents the results of their efforts at self-development.

The report further provides the Chief Directors with feedback on their performance and offers them the opportunity to determine their strengths and weaknesses as they steer the affairs of their Ministries to meet the ever-changing roles that they encounter in their operations. This helps them to examine their leadership styles and consider innovative ways of getting their work done to obtain optimum results with resources available to them.

The primary beneficiaries of the report will be the OHCS and the Civil Service Council. It is hoped that it will help them to appreciate better the performance of the administrative leadership in the Civil Service and the strengths, weaknesses and trends in the different sectors. This is most critical as the Council leads the drive for the review of the current Civil Service Law.

The secondary beneficiaries are the Public/Private Sector and Civil Society institutions that have interest in the performance of the Civil Service.

1.2 Organization of the Report

The report is organized in two (2) Parts with Part 1 consisting of four (4) Chapters, namely:

- Chapter One introduces the report through a background statement, purpose, the performance management arrangements of the Civil Service of Ghana and the context of the 2019 assessment period;
- The Second Chapter presents the approach and methodology for the assignment. The detailed discussion on the schedules and marks assigned has been presented in Appendix Three;
- Chapter Three provides an Overview of the Findings and Issues Emerging based on the results of the Evaluation Exercise; and

- Chapter Four draws out conclusions and recommendations for the evaluation process and for the Civil Service Council and other parties for strengthening service delivery.

Part 2 of the report provides the detailed scoring and findings for CDs.

The report has three (3) sets of Appendices as follows: (1) the Terms of Reference; (2) the Schedule of Visits and Interviews; and (3) Schedules and Assigning of Marks for Indicators and Explanatory Notes for Schedule Two.

1.3 Performance Management Arrangements of the Civil Service of Ghana

The Civil Service supports the realization of national goals and aspirations through the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of public policies, operations, measurable plans and programmes. PNDC Law 327 requires the Civil Service to:

- Initiate and formulate policy options for the consideration of the Government
- Initiate and advise on government plans
- Undertake necessary research for the effective implementation of government policies
- Implement government policies
- Review government policies and plans; and
- Monitor, coordinate and evaluate government policies and plans.

In pursuit of these responsibilities, the Service emphasizes efficiency, accountability, transparency, equity, ownership of public management processes and results as well as value-for-money performance.

To facilitate consistent performance management throughout the System, the Head of the Civil Service (HCS) administers a coordinated Performance Appraisal System, which is intended to cover all the staff. The approach adopted by the Office of the Head of the Civil Service is in tandem with the Performance Management Policy of the Public Services of Ghana under the auspices of the Public Service Commission (PSC). The policy aims at providing a mechanism for aligning individual development needs within the Public Service with the longer-term aspirations of the country as well as a basis for generating shared understanding and ownership of the processes and determining continuity in office of post-holders. Ultimately, through effective feedback mechanisms and provisions for continuous learning and improvement planning, it is expected that a performance-oriented culture will be fostered.

Within this model, the Head of Service signs Performance Agreements with the Chief Directors, witnessed by Sector Ministers. In turn, Chief Directors are required to sign Agreements with their Heads of Departments, Directors/Analogous Grades and Officers handling significant areas of work in the Ministry. These arrangements encourage these key officers to recognize how their work provides critical inputs for the Chief Director's own performance assessment. The Directors and Heads of Departments undertake participatory staff appraisals with their officers using performance appraisal instruments developed by the PSC. This arrangement provides a system by which the Agreement for the Chief Director cascades to all staff in the Ministry.

1.4 Components of the 2019 Performance Agreements

The Performance Agreement that Chief Directors commit to is intended to cover the achievement of sector goals and targets as well as efficient management of the available resources, including instilling the desired performance management culture in their institutions as well as their own self-development.

As with preceding instruments, the 2019 Agreement was categorized into three (3) Schedules as follows:

Item	Operational Areas
Schedule 1	**Institution-Specific Outputs and Deliverables:** The deliverables presented here focused on the major areas of work derived from the 2018-2021 Sector Medium Term Plan of the Ministry, the 2019 State of the Nation Address, the President's Flagship Programmes (Ministers Priority Areas) and 2019 Budget. Chief Directors were expected to identify a minimum of five (5) top priority areas (TPAs) and a maximum of ten (10).
Schedule 2	**General Operational and Administrative Deliverables:** These deliverables were generic to all Chief Directors and aimed at the smooth functioning of the Ministry. They were grouped into six (6) Key Results Areas (KRAs) distilled from the legislative framework governing the Civil Service.
Schedule 3	**The Chief Director's Personal Capacity Development Plan**: Chief Directors were expected to identify their competency gaps and engage in a minimum of five (5) key learning activities to enhance their effectiveness.

The Performance Agreement cycle was conducted in three (3) phases, namely:

- visits to all Sector Ministries for CDs and Directors/HoDs to collectively sign their documents with the HCS and endorsed by the Hon. Ministers in May 2019;
- mid-year monitoring exercise in August 2019 to enable CDs track progress of their targets and review them, if necessary with HCS; and,
- evaluation, held in January to March, 2020.

In anticipation of the external evaluation, CDs were required to prepare self-assessment reports which were valuable resources for the final review.

The external evaluation of CDs' performance agreements was intended to:

- Provide an assessment of the extent and quality of work done by CDs during the period under review for the Civil Service Council;
- Increase accountability in the delivery of public services;
- Provide a basis for engendering trust among the new political leadership in the reliability and consistency of Civil Service processes;
- Generate insights about influencing factors on the effectiveness of CS institutions and lessons for the way forward;
- Recognize effectiveness and outstanding performance among Chief Directors; and
- Contribute to strengthening the performance management culture in the Civil Service.

1.5 The Context of the Assignment in 2019

As the Bureaucratic heads of the Ministries, Chief Directors have the responsibility of managing and ensuring the overall performance of the Ministry. They are expected to put in place appropriate mechanisms for making sure that resources available to the Ministry are used efficiently and effectively towards achieving the overall aims of the Ministry. They are expected to apply appropriate management techniques in the affairs of their organizations and uphold the core Civil Service principles and values. They are also to promote the interests of the various clients of the Ministry and take account of gender sensitiveness in all that they do.

In the year 2019, there was stability in the mandates of Ministries in that no new Ministries were created or abolished. A total of thirty-six (36) institutions made up of thirty-three (33) Ministries and three (3) extra-Ministerial, participated in the exercise. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration could not partake in the exercise owing to the fact that the Chief Director was indisposed at the time of the exercise. The Office of the Vice-President being part of the Office of the President, was not included in the exercise.

As in the previous year, it was observed that CDs had to contend with building teams and blending work by mainstream Civil Servants, special and technical advisors, personal assistants, experts and consultants. Budgetary allocations continued to be a problem for most of the Ministries and this affected their work. In 2019, many of the CDs were able to develop innovative ways of getting their work done and achieving the targets they had set for their Ministries for the year, especially with respect to projects under the President's Special Initiative which were critical aspects of the CDPAs.

CHAPTER TWO

2.0 METHODOLOGY, APPROACHES AND MEASUREMENT PROTOCOLS

2.1 Scope of the Assignment and the Evaluation Process

The Evaluation of the 2019 CDs' Performance Agreements was guided by Terms of Reference (ToR) approved by the Office of Head of the Civil Service (OHCS). Experiences and insights gained from previous exercises, feedback from reports and Chief Directors, also informed the conduct of the assignment. The exercise consisted of the following steps:

- Studying the Performance Agreements, Mid-Year Review and Self-Assessment Reports of the Chief Directors and other supporting documents;
- Holding review/interactive sessions with Chief Directors to discuss achievement levels based on the agreed deliverables and outputs in their 2019 Performance Agreements;
- Engaging Sector Ministers who were available during the visit of the Team;
- Assigning scores and analysing the findings for trends and emerging issues; and
- Writing of Report

The Team with primary responsibility for the assignment consisted of:

1. Mr. Edwin Barnes (Retired Chief Director and Member of the Civil Service Council), Chairman;
2. Prof. Spencer Duncan (Public Sector Consultant), Member;
3. Nana Agyekum-Dwamena (Head of the Civil Service), who provided technical backstopping and analytical support for the entire process;
4. Mrs. Mavis Asare-Donkor (Director, Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate (PBMED), OHCS), Coordinating Support Team Leader; and
5. Mrs. Elizabeth Obeng-Yeboah (Acting Director, Reforms Coordinating Unit (RCU), (OHCS) Coordinating Support Team Member.

The Terms of Reference for the exercise have been provided in Appendix One.

2.2 Approach to the Assignment

The assignment began with an inception meeting between the Evaluation Team, the Head of the Civil Service and the Coordinating Support Team on 21st January, 2020.

Review of secondary information including Guidance Notes for the 2019 Performance Agreement Template for Chief Directors; Performance Agreements; Mid-Year Assessment Review Reports; CDs' Self-Assessment Reports and other supporting documents.

Interactive sessions with CDs and Sector Ministers were held between 27th January and 20th March, 2020.

Scoring and analysis of emerging information undertaken between 21st March and 10th April, 2020.

2.3 Follow-Up from 2018 Assessment and Implications for 2019 Exercise

The 2019 assignment took into account the new Ministries created in 2017, which were evaluated separately in 2018 as well as the Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation, which was not evaluated in 2018. The Ministries for Procurement and National Security did not take part in the exercise.

Most CDs signed their CDPAs in 2019 and were assessed and scored. The Agreements for the CDs for the Ministries of Regional Reorganisation and Development and Water Resources and Sanitation were signed in 2020 while that of the CD for the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development was not signed. However, all these three (3) CDs were assessed and scored.

All the CDs were scored on the same basis. It was recognized that some Ministries did not have staff at the Director level, hence a corrective measure was put in the scoring framework to accommodate this with respect to the Objective Verifiable Indicator (OVI) relating to the signing of Performance Agreements with Directors and their subsequent evaluation. Similarly, a corrective measure was incorporated in the scoring framework to take account of the entities whose structures did not require Ministerial Advisory Boards (MABs), namely, the Office of the President, the Office of Head of the Civil Service and the Office of the Senior Minister.

Also, with respect to Key Result Area (KRA) 2 – Financial Management, it was realized that some of the Ministries such as the Ministry of Regional Reorganisation and Developmenthad all issues under the KRA managed by the Office of the President (OoP). This was acknowledged and appropriate corrective measures taken into account. A few other Ministries had some of the OVIs under this KRA taken care of by the OoP, and the appropriate corrective measures were also applied.

2.4 Ministries/Extra Ministerial Organizations Evaluated

The list of Ministries/Organizations that participated in the exercise has been presented below:

- Ministry of Finance;
- Ministry of Trade and Industry;
- Ministry of Education;
- Ministry of Agriculture;
- Ministry of Energy;
- Ministry of Health;
- Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations;
- Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture;
- Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation;
- Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice;
- Ministry of Transport;
- Ministry of Defence;
- Ministry of the Interior;
- Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources;
- Ministry of Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation;
- Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development;
- Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection;
- Ministry of Communications;
- Ministry of Works and Housing;
- Ministry of Roads and Highways;
- Ministry of Youth and Sports;
- Ministry of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs;
- Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture;

- Office of the President;
- Office of the Head of the Civil Service;
- Office of the Senior Minister;
- Ministry of Railways Development;
- Ministry of Water Resources and Sanitation;
- Ministry of Information;
- Ministry of Aviation;
- Ministry of Special Development Initiatives;
- Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs;
- Ministry of Business Development;
- Ministry of Inner-City and Zongo Development;
- Ministry of Planning; and
- Ministry of Regional Reorganisation and Development.

There was no interaction with the CD, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration because he was indisposed during the period of the exercise.

As in previous years, efforts were made to interact with Sector Ministers while on the premises of their Ministries. Some engagements were fairly brief, others longer and insightful. However, these meetings provided opportunities to get the Ministers' views on the performance of their respective Chief Directors; their perceptions of the Performance Agreement Exercise and Civil Service productivity generally; as well as deepen their understanding of the entire process. The Evaluation Team met with seven (7) Ministers/Deputy Ministers as presented below:

Ministries Whose Political Leadership Met with the Evaluation Team

1. Ministry of Energy (Minister)
2. Ministry of Communications (Minister and Deputy Minister)
3. Ministry of Transport (Minister)
4. Ministry of Aviation (Deputy Minister)
5. Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations (Deputy Minister)
6. Ministry of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs (Minister)
7. Ministry of Health (Minister)

2.5 The Assessment Instrument

The fundamental principles and structure of the Performance Agreement remained unchanged. The format is indicated in the Table 2 below:

Table 2: Structure of the 2019 Performance Assessment Instrument

Schedule	Content	Remarks on Allocation of Marks	
One	Institution-specific outcomes and deliverables from its top priority areas (TPAs)	60	Chief Directors were required to focus on a minimum of five (5) and a maximum of ten (10) top priority areas that the sector Ministry would pursue in the course of the 2019 reporting year derived from the Sector Medium Term Plan (2018 to 2021) , the 2019 State of the Nation Address and other critical policy documents.

Two	General operational and administrative deliverables in accordance with Civil Service Regulations	30	These deliverables were common to all Chief Directors and clustered into six (6) key results areas (KRA) as follows: • KRA 1: Performance Reporting • KRA 2: Financial Management • KRA 3: Human Resource Management • KRA 4: Functional Ministerial Advisory Board • KRA 5: Customer Service Initiatives • KRA 6: Work Improvement Initiatives The details of the scoring protocols for Schedule Two are presented in Appendix 2.
Three	Personal capacity development plan	10	Chief Directors were required to indicate a minimum of five (5) Capacity Development Programmes in the course of 2019.

Scores were assigned to each CD and the results constructed into a League Table.

Schedule One

The sixty (60) marks were allocated based on the number of TPAs. For instance, five (5) TPAs were allocated a total of twelve (12) marks each. Ten (10) TPAs had six (6) each. Marks were further sub-divided based on the number of targets under each TPA. Scores were awarded based on the extent to which each target was met. The Agreement required CDs to assign timelines within which activities and targets would be undertaken or realized.

The roles the CD assigned to himself/herself towards the achievement of targets and the extent to which these were successfully performed also guided the distribution especially where a target had not been fully met. Given that Ministries have policy formulation, monitoring, evaluation, facilitation and oversight responsibilities, CDs could state such roles as drafting of cabinet memoranda; convening meetings to operationalize and track implementation of key activities; organizing stakeholder workshops; ensuring the release of approved funding and sourcing funds from external sources; and ensuring procurement processes are followed through.

Schedule Two

Under Schedule Two, six (6) standard KRAs were provided and marks were allocated based on the number of OVIs. Within the KRAs, the marks were further sub-divided based on each aspect and the weight assigned to its importance to the work of the CD.

Schedule Three

Under Schedule Three, the Team looked for evidence of actual enhancement of CDs' capacity through the activities and mechanisms they had identified. Given the constraints on CDs' time, the Team appreciated creativity and innovation in their self-development. CDs had to demonstrate how they had applied learning or shared acquired knowledge with their subordinates. Apart from the need to deepen understanding of the core

business of the Ministry/sector and emerging trends in public administration, there had to be indication that CDs had invested in leadership, people management and administrative skills.

Methods considered acceptable included attendance at workshops, professional conferences, international field visits, seminars, peer reviews/meetings, executive coaching, mentoring sessions and readings among others. Webinars, internet-based courses, organization of internal seminars and publications (including books, policy briefs, practice notes and chapters in journals) and expert presentations were also accepted by Team.

The Team took into account, whether Chief Directors had identified the skills gaps or desired competencies rather than just stating activities to be pursued. Acceptable proof of attendance at workshops, conferences and seminars included certificates, photographs and conference materials. Where the Chief Director had prepared a back-to-office report indicating the gains for the Ministry, they were commended. Again, where executive coaching and mentoring sessions had been used, evidence had to be provided such as notes on the discussions conducted and learning acquired. Evidence to support internet-based learning included downloaded study materials and demonstration of the capacities that had been gained. Proof of knowledge gained from reading included book summaries and narration of highlights during the interview process.

The Team also considered Chief Directors' attendance at generic programmes organized by the Public Services Commission and Office of Head of the Civil Service including Conferences, Policy Seminars, External High Level Study Visits and Chief Directors' Quarterly Meetings.

2.6 Scoring scheme for the exercise

The Evaluation Team agreed on the following scoring scheme for the exercise:

Schedule 1

- Where the Target set by the CD had not been met, the total score for the Target is reduced by 30%. The rest of the score is then shared based on the attainment of the various roles indicated by the CD.
- Where a report had no author nor dated, a mark of 10% was deducted from the score for the target. This is an issue that had been addressed since the start of the evaluation exercise in 2014 and it was agreed that some punitive measure be taken for the 2019 Evaluation.

Schedule 2

- Where documents were not despatched to their destinations by the prescribed date, a mark of 10% was deducted from the prescribed score. This was to respond to the need for timely response to requests. The provision was made to apply to the following OVIs which were randomly selected:
  - ✓ Submission of Action Plans to the OHCS by February 2019;
  - ✓ Submission of APR to OHCS by 15th January 2020;
  - ✓ Submission of Expenditure Returns to the CAGD by March 2019; and
  - ✓ Submission of Promotion Registers to OHCS by November 2019.

- The issue relating to reports (Schedule 2) i.e. where documents meant for the OHCS were not submitted but were made available to the Team during the exercise, only half of the score for this OVI was given.

2.7 Utilization of previous lessons for the 2019 Evaluation Exercise

The setting of Targets continue to be a problem for many CDs. Some of these Targets are not SMART and their assessment creates problems. A number of Targets also did not seem challenging enough – they were to

address routine activities of the Ministries. However, it was recognized that these were activities provided for in their budgets and for which financial resources had been made available, of which the Evaluation Team had no control over.

Some concerns that came up in previous Evaluations and which still surfaced during the 2019 Evaluation included the following:

- The relationship between some of the evidence offered in support of the TPAs could not be convincingly established;
- Means of verification (MOVs) were not provided for all targets. Some targets did not reflect the processes leading to their achievement even though there were prescribed steps to be followed but not just the attainment of the final product;
- Some targets were out of the control of CDs and there was no way these could be attained by the CDs themselves;
- CD's roles were not provided for some of the targets even though there was evidence that the targets had been achieved; and
- The crafting of some targets made their attainment and objective assessment difficult. For instance, a target which aims at "initiating" an activity is difficult to assess. Similarly, examples like, "commencing" a project or presenting a document "for approval" may not have the chance of achieving the target set.

In preparation for the interviews, CDs were encouraged to provide as much of their supporting evidence electronically to the Secretariat at the OHCS before the interview. This was important in order to reduce duplication and waste and encourage Ministries to organize their documentation ahead of time.

An innovation in 2018 was the introduction of the provision of a list of documents to be presented in support of various deliverables before the visit of the team. This made recording and association with actual events and activities much easier. This process continued more effectively in 2019.

Most self-assessment reports were informative and indicative of how the CDs viewed their own performance. However, some CDs varied their targets and indicators in their self-assessment reports without communicating or validating these changes with the HCS, thus creating some difficulty in determining what was to be measured. The Team relied on the original targets.

During the interview sessions, the content and quality of the documentary evidence presented and their relevance to the target set were examined. The Team's general observations have been presented in Chapter Three.

As in previous evaluation sessions, CDs were encouraged to bring in their support team to facilitate learning. The Evaluators recognised that having people to assist in the mobilization of documentation and other evidence reduced the pressure on the CD. It also gave Directors and other officers present an insight into the linkage of their work and that of the CD. It fostered an understanding of coordinated work and the realization that the results achieved by the Ministry depended on the level of team-sense and team work as well as the role of the CD as the coordinator of activities and leader of a team. In 2019, more CDs took advantage of this arrangement.

Again learning from previous assessment processes, ordinary members of staff were randomly selected to share their experience of performance appraisal processes and to verify their names on the Staff lists as well as the Individual Job Schedules.

The interview sessions offered the Team opportunities to assess the preparedness of the Chief Director for the review and to ascertain whether the CDs and their staff saw the Agreement as an ongoing guiding document

or as an annual obligation/ritual. In most instances, those who had used it as a "living document" emerged as top performing CDs. It was unfortunate to realise that some CDs werenot privy to certain documents being tendered in as evidence especially for some of the OVIs in Schedule 2.

Finally, as in previous years, the CDs were given a grace period to send in documentary evidence that was not immediately available during the interview session. Unfortunately, some CDs did not take advantage of this and as a result lost some marks.

CHAPTER THREE

3.0 DISCUSSION OF RESULTS AND OVERVIEW OF THE FINDINGS AND ISSUES EMERGING

3.1 General Observations

As was indicated in the 2018 Evaluation Report, the instrument had become somewhat routine, and less able to reflect critical nuances in performance. The situation has not been better this year. It is, however, good to know that a thorough review of the instrument has been initiated by the Civil Service Council through the OHCS to move from the output-oriented Targets to a more outcome-oriented one which would identify the impact of activities undertaken by the Ministries on the public. It is hoped that this would provide for a more critical and innovative way of assessing the performance of the CD.

The Research, Statistics and Information Management (RSIM) Directorates of most Ministries continue to be underutilized. For instance, while the media tracking undertaken by the Ministries could be used to generate information which when well analysed could assist in policy direction of Ministries, the information remains unused only adding to the wealth of information in the Ministries. Definitely, this is an issue that may need to be addressed in future CDPAs. It may, however, be necessary for the OHCS to take a critical look at the human resource capacities in the RSIMs.

It is worth mentioning the efforts of the Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation to help build the capacities of the Ministries in the area of monitoring and evaluation. It is hoped that this would go a long way towards ensuring better monitoring and evaluation arrangements not only for projects but also for policies and other activities in the Ministries. Again, associated with this will be an arrangement to build the capacity of officers in the Policy, Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring and Evaluation Directorates in the area of policy formulation. Programmes to build capacity in policy development should, however, be extended to all staff of the Ministries. This concept should be rolled out for all occupational classes in the Civil Service. Officers in the Human Resource Development Directorate, for instance, should be able to look at policy issues relating to all aspects of the human resource development of their staff. It was realized during the exercise that a number of Ministries had developed policies on various aspects of their work such as gender, welfare and transport. The question is whether the OHCS should take interest in these developments to ensure that service-wide policies are drawn for some of these common issues rather than leaving it to the Ministries with the possibility that inconsistent policies could be developed for various Ministries under the Civil Service.

The issue of resource availability, mainly financial and well-trained staff continues to be a problem for most Ministries and this has an effect on the attainment of the Targets in the CDPAs. There was also the occasional problem of getting the approval of the political leadership for some activities, which approval may not be forthcoming in a timely manner.

There were also occasional problems with Objective Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) involving Ministers, most especially with respect to the Ministerial Advisory Boards. This depends on the availability of Ministers who chairs the meetings and their non-availability adversely affects the attainment of this OVI in the CDPA. One issue that has come up occasionally has been on what constitutes Management in the Ministries, with respect to Management meetings. While in some Ministries it is the CD who chairs such meetings, there are others where the Minister chairs them. Maybe the OHCS can clarify by defining two levels of Management – one involving the CD and his/her top level staff and another involving the Minister, the CD and top level staff – with either of these qualifying under KRA 6.

While there was a minimization of the problem of targets which CDs had no control over in the 2019 CDPAs, unfortunately it occasionally appeared. It is hoped that CDs will continue to take note of this in subsequent CDPAs.

The mid-year review of CDPAs is being managed by the OHCS. Unfortunately, not all CDs are taking advantage of the activity to review their Targets or even TPAs where necessary. Some CDs have gone ahead and reviewed their CDPAs without the approval of the HCS and the Evaluation Team had had to rely on the original CDPAs.

3.2 Methodological Issues

The guidelines accompanying the Performance Agreements provided considerable details as to the types of documents, their formats and features and the dates/deadlines by which they were to be submitted. Unfortunately, it is realized that the quarterly implementation targets in the CDPAs were generally not adhered to primarily because of issues relating to budgetary releases. While budgets are released on a quarterly basis, the amounts released are not always adequate for activities for the quarter, which results in the rollover of activities into subsequent quarters. The quarterly indication of activities is important for monitoring performance and one wonders whether their inclusion in the CDPAs is really necessary since Evaluation Teams have over the years not penalized CDs for not undertaking an activity within particular quarters.

The quality of documents continues to be a problem and as usual deductions are made with respect to the documents not having owners/authors or being appropriately dated.

CDs have also been penalized for not submitting documents on time. This has initially been limited to four (4) OVIs but it is hoped to be extended to all OVIs in future. In this regard, it is expected that the OHCS would maintain accurate records on dates on which documents are received from the Ministries.

3.3 CDs' Attitudes towards the Performance Agreement Exercise

The Chief Directors' Performance Agreement (CDPA) provides the CD with the opportunity to indicate what he/she intends to achieve within the year based on various external factors which guide the work of the Ministry. The basis of these aspirations are outlined in the Guidelines for the CDPA and CDs are expected to achieve the Targets indicated within the year. CDs are constantly advised not to just sign the CDPAs documents and only bring them out during the mid and end-of-year monitoring/evaluation exercises. The documents should be seen as guiding their daily operations with officers being made aware of what is expected of them by providing inputs for the attainment of the various targets and OVIs. Unfortunately, the preparations for the end-of-year Evaluation exercise came up with the realization that the document was not kept "alive" throughout the year.

As was observed, especially in the 2019 Evaluation exercise, CDs who kept their eyes on their CDPAs:

a) were in control of the expectations of the Agreement;
b) implemented their commitments taking account of the varying environment around them;
c) ensured that documents were produced according to the deadlines in the CDPA;
d) that documents to be submitted to various offices were sent out on time;
e) that documents were of the right quality;
f) took active interest in the mid-year review activities by participating in the exercise themselves. These included their sector mid-year review process and the mid-year assessment visits by the OHCS;

g) ensured that all appropriate documents were well prepared and available to the Evaluation Team; and
h) took advantage of the mid-year window to review their Agreements where necessary.

3.4 Documentation

As bureaucrats, documentation is very critical to the work of CDs. While CDs themselves may not be able to look at each document before they leave the Ministry or are presented to an Evaluation Team, it is important for a CD to develop a system, which would make it possible for some officers to look seriously at the quality of documents. The Agreement signed between the CD and Directors/Heads of Analogous Grades and Heads of Department should provide such an opportunity. Efforts should therefore be made to ensure that these issues are addressed.

Documents, which were meant for internal consumption but were part of the CDPA, had not been referred to the CD for his study/comments. Some documents sent to the OHCS were sent out without the CD having any idea about the contents or when they were sent. It was unfortunate to realise that some CDs were seeing some documents for the first time as the Evaluation Team.

The following are relevant comments made in the 2018 CDPA Evaluation Report:

"During the review process, the Team observed that while some CDs were able to produce supporting evidence readily, others were challenged. Some of the challenges included the following:

- *Lack of preparation for the exercise; therefore, documents* ***that were specifically indicated*** *in the agreement were not prepared, not readily available or not assembled; while the Team offered "grace periods" for CDs to send supporting documents after their interviews, some were not able to take advantage of this opportunity;*
- *Quality of reports and documents: some undated, no indication of authors, memos unsigned, some incomplete and some just very badly organized. This did not augur well for the Ministry's capacity to provide valuable institutional documentation and tracking of events, impacting on institutional accountability, follow-up, feedback and knowledge management competences;*
- *Some of the reports were too descriptive and lacked analysis. Therefore, their purpose of helping the CD in decision-making was defeated;*
- *Fresh reproduction of reports/documents, in some cases, resulting in duplication of existing materials and, therefore, waste; others generated for the sole purpose of the assessment;*
- *Reports and communication not reviewed by the CD; in some cases, CDs were not familiar with the contents of the documents; CDs were encouraged to, as far as possible, read and review documents; or at least be briefed by subordinates on the contents and write their own opinions on the documents;*
- *Absence of written reports with claims that the report or interaction had been verbal; hence no record of it could be produced, including not logging the incident or activity;*
- *Documents that had little bearing on the activity they were intended to support were provided, sometimes justified by one associated word (subject, geographical location etc.)."*

3.5 Schedule 1 – Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

3.5.1 General

This Schedule defines the scope of operations of the Ministries and provides Strategic Objectives out of which TPAs are derived. A well-structured TPA should be easily identified with a particular Ministry. The CDPA provides sources from which CDs can derive their TPAs. Targets are to be set for the TPAs, with Means of Verification and Risk and Assumptions provided.

CDs were required to indicate a minimum of five (5) and a maximum of ten (10) TPAs for their sector that would be pursued by the Ministry in the course of the year. Targets were to be identified and the roles the CD would play towards their realization. The maximum score for this Schedule is sixty (60).

The scores obtained by the CDs for this Schedule are indicated in Table 3.

Table 3: Summary of Results on Schedule 1 - Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables - Total Score 60

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	NO. OF TPAs	SCORES FOR EACH PRIORITY AREA										TOTAL	ORDER OF MERIT
					TPA 1	TPA 2	TPA 3	TPA 4	TPA 5	TPA 6	TPA 7	TPA 8	TPA 9	TPA 10		
1	Patrick Nomo	Chief Director	Finance	8	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5			**60**	**1st**
2	Benjamin Gyasi	Chief Director	Education	5	12	12	12	12	12						**60**	**2nd**
3	Alhaji Hafiz Adams	Chief Director	Business Development	5	12	12	12	12	12						**60**	**3rd**
4	Solomon Asoalla	Chief Director	Works and Housing	8	7.04	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5			**59.54**	**4th**
5	Edmund Offei-Annor	Ag. Chief Director	Roads and Highways	10	6	5.5	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	**59.5**	**5th**
6	Dr. Afisah Zakariah	Chief Director	Gender, Children and Social Protection	5	10.8	12	12	12	12						**58.8**	**6th**
7	Nana Kwabena Adjei-Mensah	Chief Director	Health	5	11	12	12	12	11.1						**58.1**	**7th**
8	Alhaji Ahmed Suleman	Chief Director	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice	5	12	12	12	12	10						**58**	**8th**
9	Kizito Ballans	Chief Director	Employment and Labour Relations	5	9.8	12	12	12	12						**57.8**	**9th**

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	NO. OF TPAs	SCORES FOR EACH PRIORITY AREA										TOTAL	ORDER OF MERIT
					TPA 1	TPA 2	TPA 3	TPA 4	TPA 5	TPA 6	TPA 7	TPA 8	TPA 9	TPA 10		
10	Ing. Godwin J. Brocke	Chief Director	Office of the Head of the Civil Service	9	6.67	6.67	6.67	4	6.66	6.66	6.67	6.67	6.66		**57.33**	**10th**
11	Prof. Patrick Agbesinyale	Chief Director	Lands and Natural Resources	6	10	10	10	7	10	10					**57**	**11th**
12	Adelaide Anno-Kumi	Chief Director	Interior	5	12	12	12	8.4	12						**56.4**	**12th**
13	Dr. Evans Dzikum	Chief Director	Defence	6	10	10	8.6	7	10	10					**55.6**	**13th**
14	Mabel Sagoe	Ag. Chief Director	Transport	5	12	12	10.5	11	8.4						**53.9**	**14th**
15	Alhaji Abudulai Yakubu	Chief Director	Tourism, Arts and Culture	5	11.4	11	11	8	12						**53.4**	**15th**
16	Noah Tumfo	Chief Director	Water Resources and Sanitation	6	9.7	9	10	6	9.4	9					**53.1**	**16th**
17	Patrick Yaw Nimo	Ag. Chief Director	Trade and Industry	6	8	10	10	10	10	5					**53**	**17th**
18	Benjamin Afful	Chief Director	Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs	5	8.4	10.2	11	11.1	12						**52.7**	**18th**
19	Robert P. Ankobia	Ag. Chief Director	Agriculture	9	6.67	3.832	6.66	6.66	6.67	6.67	6.67	1.55	6.67		**52.052**	**19th**
20	Evans Aggrey-Darkoh	Chief Director	Parliamentary Affairs	6	10	10	10	10	2	10					**52**	**20th**
21	Kwabena Adjei-Boakye	Ag. Chief Director	Monitoring and Evaluation	5	8.4	10	11	10	12						**51.4**	**21st**
22	Magdalene Ewurasi Appenteng	Chief Director	Communications	6	6.8	8	10	9.5	7	10					**51.3**	**22nd**
23	Eric K. Armo Himbson	Chief Director	Special Development Initiative	6	8.1	10	7	10	8.7	7					**50.8**	**23rd**
24	Mamle Andrews	Chief Director	Information	6	10	7	7	6.5	10	9.7					**50.2**	**24th**
25	Levina Owusu	Chief Director	Environment, Science, Technology & Innovations	6	7.4	5	8.5	10	9.5	9					**49.4**	**25th**

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	NO. OF TPAs	SCORES FOR EACH PRIORITY AREA										TOTAL	ORDER OF MERIT
					TPA 1	TPA 2	TPA 3	TPA 4	TPA 5	TPA 6	TPA 7	TPA 8	TPA 9	TPA 10		
26	Dawanorba Baeka	Chief Director	Regional Reorganisation and Development	4	12	12	12	12							**48**	**26th**
27	Marian Kpakpah	Chief Director	Planning	5	8	4	12	12	12						**48**	**27th**
28	Frank Quist	Chief Director	Youth and Sports	5	9.5	10.2	11	7	10						**47.7**	**28th**
29	Gifty Biyira Mahama	Ag. Chief Director	Inner City and Zongo Development	5	8	10	10	9.8	8						**45.8**	**29th**
30	Charles K. Dondieu	Chief Director	Local Government & Rural Development	8	7.5	6.75	6.75	2	5	6.75	3.75	6			**44.5**	**30th**
31	Christiane Edmund	Ag. Chief Director	Aviation	6	9	4.5	9.5	6.1	6.5	8					**43.6**	**31st**
32	Frank Sofo	Ag. Chief Director	Fisheries & Aquaculture Development	5	12	3.6	3	12	12						**42.6**	**32nd**
33	Lawrence Apaalse	Chief Director	Energy	6	8	7.9	6.7	7.75	7	5					**42.35**	**33rd**
34	Henry Wood	Ag. Chief Director	Office of the President	5	12	12	6	0	12						**42**	**34th**
35	Desmond Boateng	Ag. Chief Director	Railways Development	5	9	10	4.2	6.3	10.5						**40**	**35th**
36	Samuel Abu-Bonsrah	Ag. Chief Director	Senior Minister	7	3.2	7	3	3	5	4.3	8.57				**34.07**	**36th**
37	AMB. Albert Yankey	Chief Director	Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration													

3.5.2 Comments on Schedule 1

3.5.2.1 TPAs and Strategic Objectives

The number of TPAs under this Schedule ranged from a minimum of four (4) for CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development to a maximum of ten (10) for the CD, Ministry of Roads and Highways. Most CDs had TPAs of either five (5) or six (6).

The CD, OHCS had nine (9) TPAs and the Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister had seven (7) TPAs. There were challenges when these had to be used to divide the total score of sixty (60). The findings on the results indicate how they were addressed. Table 3 provides for the number of TPAs for each Ministry.

Generally, each TPA was derived from single Strategic Objectives.

The scores for this Schedule ranged from 34.07 to 60 out of a total score of 60. Three (3) CDs had the maximum score of 60.

3.5.2.2 Targets and Roles of CDs

Majority of the Targets set for the various TPAs were between one (1) and five (5) though the CD, Works and Housing had as many as ten (10) for one of his TPAs. While it is appreciated that all these Targets may be critical, some could have been combined especially as the CDs roles were the same. It is recommended that a cap of five (5) be put on this OVI.

Many CDs seem to be oblivious of the primary functions of a Ministry, namely, Policy Formulation, Monitoring and Evaluation. While recognizing that in many situations Ministries would be expected to oversee the implementation of various programmes and projects, the monitoring and evaluation roles of the Ministries tend to be set aside with monitoring being undertaken by the implementing Departments or Agencies or, sometimes, the consultants to the projects. Such monitoring reports are thus not verified by the Ministry. Where CDs have included in their roles review of such Monitoring reports, there was little evidence of this being done in most cases.

Despite the fact that CDs have over the years been advised about setting Targets over which they have control, there were still a few CDs who had Targets for which they had no control. These are also reiterated in the Guidelines of the CDPAs.

Some Targets were neither SMART nor challenging. For instance, a Target on the launching of a campaign for an activity may not be seen as challenging unless it is seen as the beginning of a well-defined programme.

In the CDPAs, CDs have identified roles with associated Means of Verification. Unfortunately, in many cases the MOVs are not available to allow for the Team to verify whether the activity has been undertaken or not. There were no roles assigned to the Targets of one of the CDs though the Targets were achieved and relevant MOVs provided.

While several CDs indicated the intention to review documentation as part of their roles, there was not enough evidence to show they had actually studied and analysed the information available to them in order to advise the Minister effectively. While the Team accepted CDs' "minutes" on memoranda and reports, the ideal situation would have been to have a short report, brief or other communication indicating the CDs' appreciation of the situation and recommendations. Some CDs indicated that they had reviewed documents during their preparation for these to be presented to their Ministers. It is worth noting that the Team sighted situations where CDs had actually reviewed documents in their handwriting. Definitely, if "reviewing a document" is a role of the CD, then there should be evidence to this effect.

3.5.2.3 Review of Agreements

The Guidelines to the CDPAs has provision for the review of Agreements by CDs. This would generally only be applicable to Schedules 1 and 3. While some CDs sought approval from the HCS to undertake this, a number failed to seek this permission and went ahead to review their CDPAs. For instance, the CD, Energy and Ag. CD, Railways Development changed some TPAs without recourse to the HCS. The Evaluation Team relied on the original TPAs for the evaluation.

3.5.2.4 General Comments

Schedule 1 highlights the core business of the Ministry and determines to what extent a CD, as the Chief Advisor of the Minister, is conversant with the work of the Ministry. It is expected that a CD scores a minimum of 42 (70%) out of the total score of 60 marks. From the results, only two (2) CDs, Railways Development and Office of the Senior Minister, failed to get this minimum score.

3.6 Schedule 2 – General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

3.6.1 General

This Schedule provides the basic administrative and operational issues, which all CDs have to be aware of to ensure the effective and efficient management of their Ministries. It addresses the various laws and regulations, which CDs have to implement as part of their responsibilities. The issues under this Schedule relate to the following:

- Performance Reporting;
- Financial Management;
- Human Resource Management;
- Functional Ministerial Advisory Board;
- Customer Service Initiative; and
- Work Improvement Initiatives.

The scores for the CDs for this Schedule are indicated in Table 4 below.

Table 4: Summary of Results on Schedule 2 - General Operational and Administrative Deliverables - Total Score 30

No.	NAME	ORGANISATION/MINISTRY	KRA 1	KRA 2	KRA 3	KRA 4	KRA 5	KRA 6	TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT
			PERFORM. REPORTING	FIN MGT	HR MGT	MABs	CUSTOMER SERVICE	WORK ENV'T		
			4	5	10	2	4	5		
1	Adelaide Anno-Kumi	Interior	3.9	4.95	9.95	2	4	5	**29.8**	**1st**
2	Solomon Asoalla	Works and Housing	3.9	5	9.9	2	4	4.96	**29.76**	**2nd**
3	Patrick Nomo	Finance	3.9	5	9.75	2	4	5	**29.65**	**3rd**
4	Ing. Godwin J. Brocke	Office of the Head of the Civil Service	4	4.75	9.9	1.936	4	5	**29.586**	**4th**
5	Benjamin Gyasi	Education	3.9	4.8	9.8	2	3.875	5	**29.375**	**5th**
6	Mabel Sagoe	Transport	3.75	5	9.3	2	4	4.975	**29.025**	**6th**

No.	NAME	ORGANISATION/MINISTRY	KRA 1	KRA 2	KRA 3	KRA 4	KRA 5	KRA 6	TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT
			PERFORM. REPORTING	FIN MGT	HR MGT	MABs	CUSTOMER SERVICE	WORK ENV'T		
			4	5	10	2	4	5		
7	Alhaji Ahmed Suleman	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice	3.9	4.5	9.97	1.625	4	5	**28.995**	**7th**
8	Dr. Evans Dzikum	Defence	4	5	9.8	2	3.5	4.25	**28.550**	**8th**
9	Edmund Offei-Annor	Roads and Highways	4	4.25	9.9	1.25	4	4.920	**28.320**	**9th**
10	Dr. Afisah Zakariah	Gender, Children and Social Protection	3.9	4.5	9.95	0.875	4	5.00	**28.225**	**10th**
11	Kizito Ballans	Employment and Labour Relations	3.9	4.75	9.35	1.625	3.975	4.580	**28.180**	**11th**
12	Nana Kwabena Adjei-Mensah	Health	3.8	4.5	9.9	1.25	3.5	5	**27.95**	**12th**
13	Magdalene Ewurasi Appenteng	Communications	3.75	3.75	9.5	2	4	4.795	**27.795**	**13th**
14	Henry Wood	Office of the President	3.8	4.5	9.85	1.813	3.5	4.25	**27.713**	**14th**
15	Levina Owusu	Environment, Science, Technology & Innovations	4	4.25	9.7	0.875	3.975	4.670	**27.470**	**15th**
16	Christiane Edmund	Aviation	3.8	5	9.25	1.625	3.25	4.5	**27.425**	**16th**
17	Prof. Patrick Agbesinyale	Lands and Natural Resources	3.9	4.5	8.2	2	3.825	5.000	**27.425**	**17th**
18	Frank Quist	Youth and Sports	3.9	3.75	9.85	1.625	3.5	4.545	**27.17**	**18th**
19	Lawrence Apaalse	Energy	3.9	4.75	9.75	0.875	3	4.54	**26.815**	**19th**
20	Eric Armo Himbson	Special Development Initiative	3.8	2.5	9.97	1.625	3.375	5.00	**26.270**	**20th**
21	Robert P. Ankobia	Agriculture	3	4	9.95	0.875	3.975	4.32	**26.12**	**21st**
22	Benjamin Afful	Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs	3.9	3.5	9.25	1.625	3.25	4.25	**25.775**	**22nd**
23	Mamle Andrews	Information	2.4	4	9.8	1.25	3.5	4.795	**25.745**	**23rd**

No.	NAME	ORGANISATION/MINISTRY	KRA 1	KRA 2	KRA 3	KRA 4	KRA 5	KRA 6	TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT
			PERFORM. REPORTING	FIN MGT	HR MGT	MABs	CUSTOMER SERVICE	WORK ENV'T		
			4	5	10	2	4	5		
24	Patrick Yaw Nimo	Trade and Industry	3.8	3.25	9.75	1.25	3.355	3.9	**25.305**	**24th**
25	Evans Aggrey-Darkoh	Parliamentary Affairs	3.9	5	7.257	2	2.96	4.08	**25.197**	**25th**
26	Desmond Boateng	Railways Development	3.3	4.5	9.8	0.5	3.35	3.7	**25.150**	**26th**
27	Marian Kpakpah	Planning	3.4	3.25	9.8	1.25	3.2	3.96	**24.860**	**27th**
28	Gifty Biyira Mahama	Inner City and Zongo Development	3.4	3	8.673	1.25	4.000	4.42	**24.743**	**28th**
29	Alhaji Hafiz Adams	Business Development	3.9	2.25	10	0	3.5	4.79	**24.440**	**29th**
30	Samuel Abu-Bonsrah	Senior Minister	3.3	3.95	9.1	1.591	2.625	3.750	**24.316**	**30th**
31	Alhaji Abudulai Yakubu	Tourism, Arts and Culture	3.8	2.95	8.45	1.625	2.875	4.46	**24.160**	**31st**
32	Charles K. Dondieu	Local Government & Rural Development	2	3	8.7	1.25	3.75	3.705	**22.405**	**32nd**
33	Kwabena Adjei-Boakye	Monitoring and Evaluation	2.9	5	5	1.25	2.25	4.375	**20.775**	**33rd**
34	Noah Tumfo	Water Resources and Sanitation	2.5	1.5	7.965	0.5	3.25	3.875	**19.590**	**34th**
35	Frank Sofo	Fisheries & Aquaculture Development	1.9	2.5	5	0.875	2.50	2.208	**14.983**	**35th**
36	Dawanorba Baeka	Regional Reorganisation and Development	2.9	1.994	3.54	1	1.14	2.399	**12.973**	**36th**
37	AMB. Albert Yankey	Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration	**N/A**							

3.6.2 Comments on Schedule 2

3.6.2.1 Key Result Area 1: Performance Reporting

A soft copy of the 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan broken into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and the CDs Agreement is to be forwarded to the OHCS by end of February 2019. Generally, CDs met this requirement. The critical question, which needs to be answered is: What does the OHCS do with this document and its subsequent mid-year review report? There was no evidence provided of any analysis done on these documents with feedback being provided to the Ministries. CDs who did not meet the deadline were penalised.

CDs were required to report on follow-up actions on the issues identified in the Performance Report. CDs met this requirement to a large extent. However, some CDs had to be reminded that these actions should be aligned to the recommendations of the mid-year review and provide strategies for realizing the objectives and indicate targets to fulfil the Agreement. The CDs could use the mid-year reviews to amend their CDPAs and seek approval from the HCS. It is noteworthy that a number of CDs took advantage of this while a few amended their CDPAs without recourse to the HCS just because the issues had been discussed with the mid-year review team.

Finally, CDs were expected to ensure that their 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report was produced and submitted on time to OHCS. This requirement was also fulfilled by CDs though a few did not meet the deadlines and were subsequently penalised.

3.6.2.2 Key Result Area 2: Financial Management

Audit Committees (AC) were largely in place, apart from those Ministries that operated as part of the Office of the President and generally, meetings were held on a quarterly basis. Those Ministries with Audit Committees but did not meet the minimum of four (4) meetings or could not provide minutes and other evidence that they took place, were not awarded the full mark. Ministries were expected to take action on the AC's decisions and prepare a report. Though many Ministries had their four (4) meetings within the year, all were not held quarterly. Meetings are to be held quarterly and two (2) meetings in a quarter should count as one (1). CDs must pay attention to the requirements and appropriately advise chairs of the ACs.

Generally, the ACs were found to be very useful bodies because of their external and thus independent nature. They had helped to improve upon auditing and other administrative practices in the Ministries.

All Ministries prepared and submitted their 2019 Procurement Plans to the PPA and had their Entity Tender Committees (ETC) in place with the ETCs meeting at least once in the year to approve the Procurement Plan. Earlier requirements of at least four (4) ETC meetings were set aside. The requirement is to have submitted the Procurement Plan to the PPA and evidence of an ETC, which should at least meet once.

The challenge with Assets Registers observed in previous years persisted in 2019. Though there were improvements on the "inventory style" records, some Ministries could not demonstrate that their Registers had been updated. Some Registers had been dated and signed by the Estates Officer or authenticated by the Internal Auditor but not by both, as required. Some Registers had the signatures and authentication on some pages but not all, rendering them susceptible to abuse. It was discovered that in some instances, Internal Auditors authenticated documents which had not been signed by Estates Officers. The Assessment process will have to find a way of accommodating the concept of electronic Assets Registers, which is being promoted under the GIFMIS.

All the Ministries visited had submitted Final Accounts/Expenditure Returns and forwarded same to the Controller and Accountant General's Department (CAGD). This year, the Team strictly adhered to stipulated deadlines and deducted marks of CDs who failed to meet deadlines.

It was realized that some of the "new" Ministries had some or all the OVIs for this KRA managed by the OoP. Appropriate correcting factors were applied to the scores.

3.6.2.3 Key Result Area 3: Human Resources Management

Organisational Manuals were generally satisfactory. Some were being reviewed for reasons that they were over four (4) years old and there was evidence of support from Management Services Department (MSD) for this purpose.

Most Ministries had Updated Staff lists and Job schedules, though in one or two cases, staff were unable to identify with their assigned job schedules. HR Directorates would have to put in place measures to address this since they have responsibility for coordinating this activity in the Ministries with the various Directorates preparing the Job Schedules. Approved establishment levels were available, updated and evidence provided of having submitted these to OHCS.

Reports on 2018 Staff Appraisal processes were generally satisfactory. CDs were able to provide overviews of the quality of staff they had and their capacity and preparedness to deliver the mandate of the Ministry. There was also some difficulty with calculating and assigning scores for performance. The links between staff performance, identification of capacity development needs and reflection of these in the training plans needed to be strengthened. Unfortunately, there was no feedback from the OHCS on receipt of these reports to show whether the OHCS found them satisfactory. The success of the performance management system in the Civil Service depends on the successful implementation of the Staff Appraisal process and it is hoped that the OHCS would take this activity as something to spend more time on in the coming year.

There were reports on the planning and mid-year phases of the 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument. However, sometimes the reports were not separated for the two phases. Though there were descriptions of the processes that had transpired, there was insufficient discussion of the implications for next steps or what needed to be done differently. In some cases, CDs were seeing these reports at the same time as the Evaluation Team.

Reports on signing of Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades were generally available, though of differing quality and levels of information. The Team did not apply time/deadlines strictly in view of problems associated with the signing of the CDPAs in 2019. However, there were some Ministries in which this was not possible because there were no Directors/Analogous Grades. In these cases, a correcting factor was applied to the total for KRA 3.

Similarly, composite evaluation reports of varying quality and usefulness were prepared. The OHCS had provided CDs with a list of consultants who could be engaged for the evaluation in order to bring some level of uniformity in the management of the process. Unfortunately, as at the time of the evaluation sessions, some CDs were yet to get the evaluation of their relevant staff done and in some cases though the evaluation had been done, the reports were not ready. It might also be useful for the OHCS to provide some guidelines on what was expected in the reports.

Training Plans guide the OHCS in the selection of officers who attend CPA/DPA programmes in GIMPA and trainings organized by the Civil Service Training Centre. The connection among performance appraisal, Ministry capacity and training and development should reflect in training plans. The OHCS had therefore provided a template for the preparation of Training Plans for the Ministries. Generally, the 2019 Training Plans were satisfactory, with a few prepared on a Directorate basis. Some were restricted to mandatory Civil Service trainings that had linkage with the performance appraisals. They had been forwarded to the OHCS and had been approved.

Monthly reporting on Daily Staff Attendance improved significantly in 2019. More information was provided, trends and their implications for work were better analysed and recommendations were made. Reporting on discipline also improved. Queries were issued to staff who reported late to work. Reports highlighted various efforts made to ensure the maintenance of discipline in Ministries apart from the punitive measures. These included:

- Discussions of disciplinary issues at durbars;
- Issue of circulars; and
- In some cases, one-on-one discussions between the CD and offending officers.

Reports on staff movements also improved significantly in 2019. There was strong analysis of the implications of postings, promotions, retirements and resignations in the Ministry. Ministers commented on issues about staff who stay in Ministries for more than four (4) years without being posted out while some staff are frequently being moved out and posting of staff after they have been trained to handle specific technical aspects of work which affect Ministries. Unfortunately, some reports on staff movements were not submitted to the CDs before the evaluation sessions.

The OHCS's policy on postings needs to be implemented objectively since there were comments about the use of the policy subjectively.

Promotion registers were available and forwarded to OHCS. CDs were penalised for late submission of registers.

3.6.2.4 Key Result Area 4: Functional Ministerial Advisory Boards

The requirement for Ministries to have Ministerial Advisory Boards (MAB) had largely been met, even by the new Ministries. Most had held meetings but had not met the requirement of four (4) quarterly meetings. Some CDs stated the difficulty they had encountered in seeking approval from Ministers for meetings to be convened. Some Ministers were not able to attend meetings due to time constraints. Generally, the MABs were said to be playing useful roles in the management of the Ministries.

The Extra-Ministerial entities did not have MABs because of their structure and purpose. This was considered and marks were adjusted for Schedule 2.

3.6.2.5 Key Result Area 5: Client Service Initiatives

Service Charters of most of the Ministries had been prepared with assistance from the Management Services Department (MSD) and no outdated Charters were proffered. Under the Public Sector Reform Programme, one of the activities to be undertaken was the review of the template for Client Service Charters. This is managed by the

OHCS on behalf of Civil Service institutions. Ministries which had their Charters in draft form were advised not to have them printed. Consequently, the Evaluation Team advised OHCS to issue a circular to that effect.

Very few reports touched on the quality of Service Delivery Standards included in the Charters and it was obvious that Client Service staff were ignorant of the contents of the Charters. It is hoped that the OHCS would provide guidance and relevant feedback to the Ministries on this and train officers of Client Service.

Most Organizations had Client Service Units. The OHCS should visit the CSUs of Ministries in order to assess them and take further action.

The Evaluation Team acknowledged Charters of Sector Ministries along with Agencies and Departments under them. Some Ministries were unable to provide Charters or Informational Material on associated Agencies and Departments. The OVIs therefore need to be expanded to include such Departments and Agencies.

To facilitate public information dissemination, all the Ministries had functional, interactive websites and most deployed social media, particularly "Facebook". Most Ministries regularly updated their websites and provided reports on their efforts to keep information current. Concerning support from National Information Technology Agency (NITA), CDs indicated that it could be further improved.

"Meet the Press" events were the main strategy adopted by CDs and Ministries to the public on their services. Others cited the Ministries' press events and soirees and participation in National Policy Fairs. However, "Meet the Press" and "Policy Fairs" lay outside the control of the Ministries and had occasionally posed problems for the Ministry of Information because Ministries scheduled to take part in such programmes had at times failed to attend.

Ministries had newsletters most of which were intended to come out bi-annually but were constrained by resources. A number of Ministries had brochures and had resorted to electronic means to post publications on websites.

3.6.2.6 Key Result Area 6: Work Improvement Initiatives

The issue of innovation to enhance efficiency in organizational operations continues to be a challenge to CDs. For instance, a CD having to work with staff of disjointed units and expected to be efficient. There were also a number of electronic initiatives such as electronic mail management systems and the use of WhatsApp. The Evaluation Team assessed such measures tactfully, especially as the CDs felt that they had indeed improved efficiency in operations. CDs did not repeat measures, which had been identified in previous years.

Assessment of Ministerial activities as they impacted at the sub-national level had a range of responses. These primarily focused on the following:

- Reports from Departments which operate at the sub-national level;
- Interaction with the District Assemblies on projects taking place in the Districts; and
- Monitoring reports from the implementation of programmes and projects taking place at the sub-national level, which involved interaction with the public.

The issue of data gathering and associated analysis is yet to feature overtly in reports relating to this OVIsand it may need to be looked at critically in future.

Most CDs produced newspaper-cuttings as evidence of tracking and analysis of public opinions. The Research, Statistics and Information Management (RSIM) Directorates of Ministries were to undertake analysis of such information, which could then be used by the PPME Directorates to assist in policy development.

There was evidence of management/staff engagements peculiar to each Ministry. Some Ministries had weekly management meetings, others were able to do all twelve (12), though not one in every month as expected. It might be possible for the CDPA to recognize two (2) types of management meetings – one chaired by Ministers and the other chaired by CDs and both should be accepted for this OVI.

Ministries managed to conduct staff durbars, some of them, two times in the year. This event was also affected by the availability of Ministers to participate in these events. The minutes of these durbars showed that staff were able to make contributions as well as ask questions on activities relating to the work of the Ministries.

The issue of gender inclusiveness measures was to ensure that CDs led the effort to provide an enabling work environment for men and women. A Ministry is preparing a Gender Policy and another on Sex Abuse. Definitely these are issues which should be of service-wide interest. It may thus be necessary for the OHCS to consider the preparation of policy instruments for such topics, which would be applicable to the whole Civil Service.

The OHCS may also have to consider the question of gender desk officers and provide some guidelines on their roles. In most cases where they exist, gender desk officers are mainly female.

CDs were able to demonstrate a range of initiatives to promote the health and well-being of staff. The activities included organizing of health checks of various sorts; health education; health walks; assistance provided to members of staff to procure various aids. Some Ministries have developed Welfare Policies to address the welfare needs of their staff. This is also one issue, which the OHCS may need to consider in the development of a Welfare Policy for the whole Civil Service.

Notice boards were easily available and information posted on them. However, what seems to be the most common and seemingly effective way of sharing internal information is through the various WhatsApp platforms developed in the Ministries. These may be at different levels depending on the nature of the information to be shared. Such platforms have even been developed for such bodies as the MAB, ETC and AC.

Engagement with the Public Records and Archives Administration Department (PRAAD) was undertaken by most Ministries to address their records management issues. Apart from the usual services of classification, cataloguing and decongestion, a few Ministries and the Birth and Death Registry had engaged PRAAD in the issue of electronic records management. Training continued to be undertaken by PRAAD though it is wished that this would not be limited to Records Officers but practically every Civil Servant. PRAAD should seriously gear itself up to support Ministries in organizing their records better with the Right to Information Act currently operational.

Management of the physical environment continues to be of interest to all the Ministries with efforts having been made since 2018 to improve cleanliness of washrooms, painting of offices, safety measures and improved security. However, disability-friendliness interventions were not commonly achieved or improved especially for the old Ministries in the Ministrial Enclave. A number of Ministries have moved into new permanent building or are in the process of moving.

3.6.2.7 General Comments

This Schedule provides the administrative and operational framework within which CDs are to work and it is a measure of how successfully a CD is able to ensure the effective management of his/her Ministry. The scores obtained ranged from 29.8 to 12.973. Using 70% of the total score as the pass mark, the minimum score expected of CDs would be 21. Four (4) CDs, namely,

- Monitoring and Evaluation;
- Water Resources and Sanitation;
- Fisheries and Aquaculture; and
- Regional Reorganisation and Development

Did not meet this minimum threshold. An examination of their detailed results would provide information on the areas they failed to perform well in.

3.7 Schedule 3 – Chief Director's Personal Capacity Development Plan

3.7.1 General

One critical tool available to CDs is that of continuous learning for them to appreciate emerging trends with respect to the Ministries they are responsible for so as to address any skills or competency gaps they may have or to increase their current knowledge. While acquiring technical and managerial knowledge was deemed important, it was also critical for CDs to avail themselves of opportunities to network with their colleagues and others in the public and private sectors. A number of avenues were open to CDs to develop their capacities.

The scores obtained by CDs for this Schedule are indicated in Table 5 below:

Table 5: Summary of Results on Schedule 3 - Chief Director's Personal Capacity Development Plan - Total Score 10

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES					TOTAL SCORE
				1	2	3	4	5	
1	Levina Owusu	Chief Director	Environment, Science, Technology & Innovations	2	2	2	2	2	10
2	Charles K. Dondieu	Chief Director	Local Government & Rural Development	2	2	2	2	2	10
3	Desmond Boateng	Ag. Chief Director	Railways Development	2	2	2	2	2	10
4	Christiane Edmund	Ag. Chief Director	Aviation	2	2	2	2	2	10
5	Frank Sofo	Ag. Chief Director	Fisheries & Aquaculture Development	2	2	2	2	2	10
6	Gifty Biyira Mahama	Ag. Chief Director	Inner City and Zongo Development	2	2	2	2	2	10
7	Kwabena Adjei-Boakye	Ag. Chief Director	Monitoring and Evaluation	2	2	2	2	2	10
8	Marian Kpakpah	Chief Director	Planning	2	2	2	2	2	10
9	Eric K. Armo Himbson	Chief Director	Special Development Initiative	2	2	2	2	2	10
10	Patrick Yaw Nimo	Ag. Chief Director	Trade and Industry	2	2	2	2	2	10
11	Mabel Sagoe	Ag. Chief Director	Transport	2	2	2	2	2	10
12	Kizito Ballans	Chief Director	Employment and Labour Relations	2	2	2	2	2	10
13	Noah Tumfo	Chief Director	Water Resources and Sanitation	2	2	2	2	2	10
14	Prof. Patrick Agbesinyale	Chief Director	Lands and Natural Resources	2	2	2	2	2	10
15	Benjamin Gyasi	Chief Director	Education	2	2	2	2	2	10
16	Magdalene Ewurasi Appenteng	Chief Director	Communications	2	2	2	2	2	10
17	Evans Aggrey-Darkoh	Chief Director	Parliamentary Affairs	2	2	2	2	2	10
18	Alhaji Hafiz Adams	Chief Director	Business Development	2	2	2	2	2	10
19	Edmund Offei-Annor	Ag. Chief Director	Roads and Highways	2	2	2	2	2	10
20	Benjamin Afful	Chief Director	Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs	2	2	2	2	2	10
21	Dr. Evans Dzikum	Chief Director	Defence	2	2	2	2	2	10
22	Samuel Abu-Bonsrah	Ag. Chief Director	Senior Minister	2	2	2	2	2	10
23	Dr. Afisah Zakariah	Chief Director	Gender, Children and Social Protection	2	2	2	2	2	10

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES					TOTAL SCORE
				1	2	3	4	5	
24	Adelaide Anno-Kumi	Chief Director	Interior	2	2	2	2	2	10
25	Robert P. Ankobia	Ag. Chief Director	Agriculture	2	2	2	2	2	10
26	Lawrence Apaalse	Chief Director	Energy	2	2	2	2	2	10
27	Alhaji Ahmed Suleman	Chief Director	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice	2	2	2	2	2	10
28	Henry Wood	Ag. Chief Director	Office of the President	2	2	2	2	2	10
29	Nana Kwabena Adjei-Mensah	Chief Director	Health	2	2	2	2	2	10
30	Patrick Nomo	Chief Director	Finance	2	2	2	2	2	10
31	Ing. Godwin J. Brocke	Chief Director	Office of the Head of the Civil Service	2	2	2	2	2	10
32	Frank Quist	Chief Director	Youth and Sports	2	2	2	2	2	10
33	Mamle Andrews	Chief Director	Information	2	2	2	2	2	10
34	Solomon Asoalla	Chief Director	Works and Housing	2	2	2	2	2	10
35	Alhaji Abudulai Yakubu	Chief Director	Tourism, Arts and Culture	2	2	2	2	0	8
36	Dawanorba Baeka	Chief Director	Regional Reorganisation and Development	2	2	2	0	0	6
37	AMB. Albert Yankey	Chief Director	Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration	N/A					

3.7.2 Comments on Schedule Three

With the exception of CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development(3) and Tourism, Arts and Culture (4), all CDs were able to identify five (5) initiatives to improve their capacities to address specific competency/skills gaps. The major means for achieving this were in the following areas:

- Participation in meetings of professional bodies to which they belong;
- Participation in programmes organised by the Public Services Commission;
- Participation in the quarterly meetings of CDs where lectures on specific topics are given;
- Training programmes specific to their sectors;
- Internet (webinar) learning;
- Mentoring of staff; and

- Resource persons at diverse training programmes.

During the evaluation sessions, some CDs provided insights into how their capacity development programmes had enhanced their work.

CDs were expected to provide evidence of their capacity building activities to address gaps that they had identified while on their jobs. The evidence was provided in many forms including:

- Certificates of participation/attendance;
- Reports of conferences, workshops, training programmes or meetings; and
- Lecture notes or presentation they had made themselves.

3.8 Overall Scores/League Table

3.8.1 General

The CDPA provides a holistic system for addressing the performance of Ministries as part of the performance management system for the Ministry.

The Overall Scores/League Table provides the following:

- Excellent - Fourteen (14)
- Very Good - Fifteen (15)
- Good - Four (4)
- Unsatisfactory - Three (3)

The details of the Overall Scores/League Table are provided in Table 6 below:

Table 6: Overall Results of Chief Directors for 2019

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	SCORE PER SCHEDULE			TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT	RANK
				S 1	S 2	S 3			
1	Patrick Nomo	Chief Director	Finance	60	29.65	10	**99.65**	**1st**	**Excellent**
2	Benjamin Gyasi	Chief Director	Education	60	29.375	10	**99.375**	**2nd**	
3	Solomon Asoalla	Chief Director	Works and Housing	59.54	29.76	10	**99.3**	**3rd**	
4	Edmund Offei-Annor	Ag. Chief Director	Roads and Highways	59.5	28.32	10	**97.82**	**4th**	
5	Dr. Afisah Zakariah	Chief Director	Gender, Children and Social Protection	58.8	28.225	10	**97.025**	**5th**	
6	Alhaji Ahmed Suleman	Chief Director	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice	58	28.995	10	**96.995**	**6th**	
7	Ing. Godwin J. Brocke	Chief Director	Office of the Head of the Civil Service	57.33	29.586	10	**96.916**	**7th**	
8	Adelaide Anno-Kumi	Chief Director	Interior	56.4	29.8	10	**96.2**	**8th**	
9	Nana Kwabena Adjei-Mensah	Chief Director	Health	58.1	27.95	10	**96.05**	**9th**	
10	Kizito Ballans	Chief Director	Employment and Labour Relations	57.8	28.18	10	**95.98**	**10th**	
11	Alhaji Hafiz Adams	Chief Director	Business Development	60	24.44	10	**94.44**	**11th**	
12	Prof Patrick Agbesinyale	Chief Director	Lands and Natural Resources	57	27.425	10	**94.425**	**12th**	
13	Dr. Evans Dzikum	Chief Director	Defence	55.6	28.550	10	**94.15**	**13th**	
14	Mabel Sagoe	Ag. Chief Director	Transport	53.9	29.025	10	**92.925**	**14th**	
15	Magdalene Ewurasi Appenteng	Chief Director	Communications	51.3	27.795	10	**89.095**	**15th**	**Very Good**
16	Benjamin Afful	Chief Director	Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs	52.7	25.775	10	**88.475**	**16th**	
17	Patrick Yaw Nimo	Ag. Chief Director	Trade and Industry	53	25.305	10	**88.305**	**17th**	
18	Robert P. Ankobia	Ag. Chief Director	Agriculture	52.052	26.12	10	**88.172**	**18th**	
19	Evans Aggrey-Darkoh	Chief Director	Parliamentary Affairs	52	25.197	10	**87.197**	**19th**	
20	Eric K. Armo Himbson	Chief Director	Special Development Initiative	50.8	26.27	10	**87.07**	**20th**	
21	Levina Owusu	Chief Director	Environment, Science, Technology & Innovations	49.4	27.470	10	**86.87**	**21st**	

No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	MINISTRY	SCORE PER SCHEDULE			TOTAL SCORE	ORDER OF MERIT	RANK
				S 1	S 2	S 3			
22	Mamle Andrews	Chief Director	Information	50.2	25.745	10	**85.945**	**22nd**	
23	Alhaji Abudulai Yakubu	Chief Director	Tourism, Arts and Culture	53.4	24.16	8	**85.56**	**23rd**	
24	Frank Quist	Chief Director	Youth and Sports	47.7	27.17	10	**84.87**	**24th**	
25	Marian Kpakpah	Chief Director	Planning	48	24.86	10	**82.86**	**25th**	
26	Noah Tumfo	Chief Director	Water Resources and Sanitation	53.1	19.59	10	**82.69**	**26th**	
27	Kwabena Adjei-Boakye	Ag. Chief Director	Monitoring and Evaluation	51.4	20.775	10	**82.175**	**27th**	
28	Christiane Edmund	Ag. Chief Director	Aviation	43.6	27.425	10	**81.025**	**28th**	
29	Gifty Biyira Mahama	Ag. Chief Director	Inner City and Zongo Development	45.8	24.743	10	**80.543**	**29th**	
30	Henry Wood	Ag. Chief Director	Office of the President	42	27.713	10	**79.713**	**30th**	**Good**
31	Lawrence Apaalse	Chief Director	Energy	42.35	26.815	10	**79.165**	**31st**	
32	Charles K. Dondieu	Chief Director	Local Government & Rural Development	44.5	22.405	10	**76.905**	**32nd**	
33	Desmond Boateng	Ag. Chief Director	Railways Development	40	25.15	10	**75.15**	**33rd**	
34	Samuel Abu-Bonsrah	Ag. Chief Director	Senior Minister	34.07	24.316	10	**68.386**	**34th**	**unsatisfactory**
35	Frank Sofo	Ag. Chief Director	Fisheries & Aquaculture Development	42.6	14.983	10	**67.583**	**35th**	
36	Dawanorba Baeka	Chief Director	Regional Reorganisation and Development	48	12.973	6	**66.973**	**36th**	
37	AMB. Albert F Yankey	Chief Director	Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration	**N/A**					

3.8.2 Comments

The League Table provides an indication of the appreciation of the CDPAs, the implementation of the CDPAs and the preparation for the exercise by the CDs. This may also be juxtaposed against the quality of the TPAs. Are the TPAs and associated Targets such that they could easily be achieved leading to the scores obtained? Are the Ministries well-organised in such a way that the operational and administrative deliverables can easily be achieved? Are the scores an indication of the performance management system or culture within a particular Ministry or Extra-Ministerial Organisation?

Scores from the current exercise recognise the efforts that the CDs have made in ensuring that their CDPAs are implemented to the best of their abilities based on factors such as:

- Available resources – human and financial;
- Innovative or "out of the box" ways of getting things done;
- Support of the staff of the Ministry who have been made to buy into the implementation of the CDPA; and
- Making the CDPA a "living document" within the Ministry and guiding its activities.

All CDs have made serious efforts towards the implementation of their CDPAs, sometimes under very trying conditions. A special mention has to be made of CDs who encountered CDPAs which had been prepared for them by officers who were no longer at post and they had to take responsibility for them and see to their implementation.

CHAPTER FOUR

4.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

4.1 RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1.1 Introduction

Performance management plays a critical role in the management and survival of institutions and the Civil Service is no exception. The 2019 Evaluation of the CDPAs has been part of the process for instilling this important management tool in the Civil Service. Definitely, the evaluation exercise could not have been concluded without coming out with issues, which would help in making the CDPA a very critical exercise in the development of the performance management culture in the Civil Service and ultimately the country as a whole.

4.1.2 Suspension of the Performance Management Agreement for 2020

Ghana has been affected by the coronavirus pandemic and this is going to affect the development agenda of the country. The 2020 Budget will definitely be reviewed and Government will come out with other interventions. This means that CDs are not likely to be aware of the TPAs for their sectors until these measures are spelt out.

It is also noteworthy that the Civil Service Council through the OHCS is looking at the review of the CDPA to move away from the output-based Targets to more outcome-based ones. The instrument for this is currently under development. The review is also going to affect the Instrument used for evaluating Directors/Heads of Analogous Grades and Heads of Departments.

Consultants have been identified to be used by Ministries in the evaluation of Directors/Analogous and Heads of Departments but these officers are likely to undertake the evaluations in ways that they deem fit and which would not provide consistency in results.

The implementation of the current Staff Appraisal Instrument is not yielding the expected results based on discussions during the evaluation sessions and in private with some Civil Servants covered by the Instrument.

The following are, therefore, being recommended for consideration by the OHCS and subsequently the Civil Service Council within 2020:

- The 2020 CDPA should be suspended and efforts made towards the finalisation of the new Performance Management Instrument for CDs;
- Guidelines be developed for consultants who have to evaluate Directors/Analogous Grades and Heads of Departments to have some uniformity in their evaluations; and
- A critical examination be made of the current implementation of the Staff Appraisal Instrument, bottlenecks identified and appropriate measures taken to have these addressed. The exercise should cover not only the Ministries but also their Departments.

4.1.3 Reviewing the Performance Agreement Process

While recognizing that the new CDPA Instrument will likely affect the current Schedules, the following issues are still being brought up for consideration.

Schedule 1: Institution-Specific Outputs and Deliverables

- A major issue raised in previous Evaluation Reports relates to the fact that many Targets tend to be routine and not challenging enough. CDs should start looking at Targets which could change, for instance, the development agenda in their sectors;
- Targets for TPAs should be SMART and, as usual, concentrate on issues over which the CDs have control. Associated roles to achieve the Targets should be succinct enough and not ambiguous. They should ensure that appropriate MOVs are provided for the activities to be undertaken;
- The number of Targets to be associated with each TPA should not be more than five (5);
- CDs, in crafting their targets, should take account the functions of Ministries, namely, policy formulation, monitoring and evaluation. Implementation is not a function of Ministries though Ministries have responsibility for monitoring implementation activities to ensure that they are being undertaken as expected; and
- CDs should ensure that the Means of Verification are synchronized with the activities being undertaken for the various targets.

Schedule 2: Key Result Area 1: Performance Reporting

- Under this KRA, CDs are to act on Action Plans. However, no evidence has been provided as to how the OHCS uses this information. It is necessary to remove this OVI and associated mid-year review from the CDPA;
- In view of their national and global importance, performance on the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan (NACAP) and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) should be included as anOVI under this KRA.

Key Result Area 2: Financial Management

- As recommended in the 2019 Evaluation Report, it may be necessary to review the inclusion of such deliverables as the Procurement Plans and Final Accounts/Expenditure Returns in the CDPA since they are routine requirements under the Public Financial Management (PFM) Act/Ghana Integrated Financial Management Information System (GIFMIS) Arrangements.
- The OHCS should link up with the CAGD to roll out the electronic assets register component of GIFMIS. This will eliminate most of the current challenges with this OVI.

Key Result Area 3: Human Resources Management

- CDs should provide reports on the implementation of their Organisational Manuals and leave other aspects of this OVI to Directors;
- While the template for Training Plans may be deemed important, there should be analysis by CDs of the links between staff performance appraisal, identification of capacity gaps and development needs and reflection of these in Training Plans. Training Reports should detail how training has affected the work of the Ministries. This will also make it possible to determine if the training being offered accurately address the needs of officers;
- The OHCS should apply its posting policy objectively to ensure that postings are done in accordance with the policy. Where specific officers have to stay in their current positions for

more than the prescribed four (4) years, they should be notified accordingly so that they are aware of the reasons for which they are not being posted.

Key Result Area 4: Functional Ministerial Advisory Boards

- These have generally been accepted as useful instruments. The question that comes up iswhether there will not be conflict of interest when the Minister is the Chair of the MAB and is also responsible for the membership. With the Civil Service Law being revised this may need a second look.

Key Result Area 5: Client Service Initiatives

- The template for Client Service Charters is being reviewed under the auspices of the OHCS. Every effort should be made to have this concluded this year;
- The revised Charters should be able to help in producing objective reports on how Standards in the Charters are being adhered to after the Client Service staff are been adequately trained;
- The Ministerial Charters should be publicised for the public to be aware of the services offered by the various Ministries and consequently their expectations;
- The appropriate Directorate of the OHCS should monitor the operations of the CSUs through random visits and critical examination of the reports submitted;
- Departments and Agencies under the Ministries should be encouraged to develop their own Charters as part of the Ministries relationship with the public;
- The services offered by NITA still pose a problem for internet connectivity by a number of Ministries and the consequent need for officers to use the gov.gh addresses for their emails. Officers should be directed not to use other types of email addresses for official business. The OHCS may need to discuss the issue with NITA.
- As indicated in the 2019 Evaluation Report, Ministries must be encouraged to utilize their electronic resources to share information about their organizations more intensively. There are several opportunities that are under-utilized. Ministries should be assisted to develop reader-friendly and easily accessible informational material such as FAQs that the public can utilize quickly.

Key Result Area 6: Work Improvement Initiatives

- The question of innovation to improve efficiency in organisational operations has been subject to a number of interpretations by CDs. It may be necessary to provide some guidelines on this if this OVI still has to be part of the CDPA.
- With Ministries mostly operating at the national level and their policies and programmes being national in nature, it is important for linkage to be established between the Ministries and the sub-national level on how their activities impact at the sub-national level. The IMCC on which on which both the Head of the Local Government Service and the Head of the Civil Service are members provide such a forum but that may be considered the policy level. There should be an operation where CDs and RCDs should be able to meet to discuss issues at the practical level. CDs and RCDs should meet at least twice a year to discuss the impact of Ministerial activities at the sub-national level while the CDs continue with their own specific interests on this issue.

- RSIMs should be encouraged to undertake serious analysis of issues in the media on their Ministries to help their PPMEs to develop appropriate policies to have these addressed. The routine press cuttings will provide the basis for what the RSIMs will be doing.
- Management meetings and durbars are critical tools to get commitment of staff to the implementation of Ministerial agenda, get views of staff on issues and address their needs and efforts should be made by CDs to meet this KRA. Where Ministers are not available, CDs should be able to manage these meetings and brief the Ministers later.
- Issues of gender, health and well-being of staff are very important to promote work in Ministries. In this regard:
  - ✓ Gender desk and welfare officers, with appropriate job schedules, should be appointed for all Ministries;
  - ✓ While recognising that these job schedules may not occupy the officers fully, they should be in addition to other schedules; and
  - ✓ Appropriate yearly action plans should be developed by these officers with annual reports being prepared.
- Information sharing among all staff on issues relating to the Ministry is very important for staff to realise that they are integral parts of the Ministry. For instance, if a Minister is to take part in some important public function, it will be important for a staff of the Ministry to know about this in advance than after the event. CDs must be encouraged to explore other ways of sharing internal information beyond notice boards.
- The importance of good records management cannot be over-emphasised. CDs must be encouraged to continue to invite PRAAD to undertake regular, routine assessments of their records every year with recommendations being provided on the way forward.
- All members of staff should be made aware of the importance of good records management in the Ministries.
- Efforts should be made towards the development of electronic records management systems for easy records storage and retrieval most especially in view of the enactment of the Freedom for Information Act.
- The environment in which staff work is very important and creates a conducive atmosphere or otherwise for productive work. At the moment a number of Ministries have moved or are planning to move into new premises. Those in the old offices are having these made as conducive as possible based on the availability of resources. A major issue which pertains to the old Ministerial buildings is disability-access and this must be addressed.

Schedule 3: Personal Capacity Development

- CDs have adopted this and made conscious efforts to address their skills/competency gaps through various means. CDs are encouraged to continue to improve their knowledge in current trends in management as well as in issues relating to their professions and sectors.

4.1.4 Chief Directors

- CDs should take the CDPA as “living documents” guiding them in their day-to-day activities;
- CDs should be interested in all documents and actions that have to take place towards the implementation of their CDPAs;

- CDs should ensure that their roles towards the attainment of Targets are clearly undertaken with the relevant MOVs being made available to support the activities;
- CDs should ensure that reports that get to them are with appropriate recommendations which should help in decision taking;
- CDs should ensure that their Research, Statistics and Information Management (RSIM) Directorates become more active by undertaking relevant research activities to support the policy and decision-making function of the Ministries;
- CDs must take the mid-year review seriously and advise the HCS on any changes they need to make to their CDPAs.

4.1.5 Recommendations for the Office of the Head of the Civil Service

The following recommendations from the Evaluation Report of the 2018 CDPA are still deemed relevant and are being repeated:

- OHCS must invest further efforts in the pre-signing review of Performance Agreements since it is difficult for an Evaluation Team to critique deliverables of CDs after they have been agreed and approved by OHCS and the Sector Minister.
- OHCS provides coordinated standards of quality; therefore, there must be consistency in requests it sends to MDAs. Trends and changes that occur, as well as reasons and implications for them must be clarified. MDAs must be informed of other areas where information they send to the OHCS is used apart from being used for Annual Report. Trends and changes that occur, as well as reasons and implications for them must be clarified. The Team observed improved levels of responsiveness and coordination from OHCS, though feedback was unclear so was not useful in decision making.
- OHCS should be able to produce, manage and maintain Service-Wide Human Resource Records, for easy placement and provision of information on all Civil Service employees. Whether the prodigious amounts of HR information OHCS solicits from the Ministries (establishment levels, training information, staff movements etc.) is used to regularly update OHCS records or vice versa was not clear; OHCS must ensure consistency between its records and those of individual Ministries.
- OHCS must review all formats of required documents in order to harmonize information of the OHCS and that of MDAs so as to reduce pressure on MDAs. OHCS must analyse information it collects as this will help to improve service delivery in the Civil Service.
- OHCS plays an important role in fostering capacity enhancement and shared learning for CDs. Apart from instituting a regular professional education programme, OHCS should collaborate with the OHLGS, PSC and Cabinet to organize joint events that will build leadership capacity in the public sector.
- Though OHCS produces status reports and feedback on the Civil Service to MDAs, the Office must give serious consideration to how it can add value to the Ministries.
- There must be an entity that will serve as the focal point to initiate research, coordinate implementation research and analyse collected data. This entity should adopt a perspective that transcendscampaign promises and initiatives associated with political tenures.

In addition to the above,

- The OHCS should build the capacity of the RSIM Directorates of the Ministries for them to be able to provide the necessary research support that the Ministries need;
- The OHCS should provide proper records with respect to all documents received to ensure that Ministries meet deadlines. In additional all reports received should be analysed and feedback provided;
- The OHCS should consider making the Evaluation process as paperless as possible by making CDs make most of their documents available electronically during their evaluation sessions.

4.1.6 Recommendations for the Civil Service Council

- The Civil Service Council should support the proposal to suspend the CDPA for 2019 for the actions proposed in **4.1.2 above** to be undertaken;
- As indicated in the 2019 Evaluation Report, the Civil Service Council must own and champion the CDPA exercise, advocating it for the attention of the highest level of Government.

4.1.7 Recommendations for Hon Ministers

Ministers are witnesses to the CDPAs but their roles should not just be limited to this. It is important for CDs to assist Ministers to keep abreast of issues that relate to the Sector and for them to also be briefed at least quarterly on progress of work with respect to the implementation of the CDPAs. For instance, a Minister should know the implications of not holding MAB or Management meeting.

4.1.8 Recommendations for the Office of the President/Chief of Staff

With the Civil Service being the Secretariat of the Executive, it is expected that the Office of the President will have great interest in the performance of the Civil Service, hence the CDPA. To this end,

- The Chief of Staff should take personal interest in the CDPA process and most especially in the Evaluation Report;
- The Chief of Staff (CoS) should encourage Ministers to take a strong interest in the Performance Agreements: their content, extent of implementation and periodically review these with their Chief Directors;
- The CoS should encourage Ministers to appreciate their important roles with respect to the Ministerial Advisory Boards (MABs) and their involvement in Management/Staff Engagements.

4.2 CONCLUSION

The Evaluation of the 2019 CDPAs has been conducted successfully with the cooperation of the CDs and support of the OHCS. As was mentioned during the exercise, its value did not lie so much in the interaction with the CDs and their staff as much as in the lessons learnt. Definitely, the Evaluation process is a continuous learning activity with its associated quality improvement in operations. Basically, the exercise may be described as a learning tool highlighting guidelines to improve efficiency and effectiveness in the use of resources to achieve specific goals. These goals help in the socio-economic development of Ghana.

There has been value addition each year since the evaluation exercise started and from the scores, CDs have found ways and means of achieving their objectives as outlined in their CDPAs and this calls for the setting of challenging targets. Furthermore, although CDs are constrained by budgetary allocations, it should be possible for them to find alternative means to address the budgetary issues. More insight is needed on how to improvise and achieve better results with limited resources.

One issue that has come out of the Evaluation exercise is the amount of paper generated. Suggestions have been made towards reducing the amount of paper by making some documents electronically available to the Evaluation Team in advance or their being electronically displayed during the evaluation sessions. There would be challenges but the proposal is worth trying especially as the CDPA Instrument currently in use is the subject of a review process. There will thus be a new Instrument and a new approach to the Evaluation exercise.

The evaluation exercise for CDs may not reflect the performance management system in particular Ministries. Definitely, a lot would have to be done to transfer what happens with the CDs into the total culture of the Ministries they are responsible for. It is hoped that a review of the current CDPA instrument and those for Directors/Analogous Grades and Heads of Departments and a critical examination of the implementation of the Staff Appraisal instrument for other staff would go a long way towards instilling the performance management culture into the totality of the Civil Service.

PART 2

5.0 FINDINGS FOR THE 2019 CHIEF DIRECTORS' EVALUATION

5.1 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Aviation

5.1.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 7 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **43.6** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 7: Performance of Ag. CD, Aviation in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Establishing a Home Based Carrier	1. Complete negotiations with on Shareholder Agreements with Strategic Partner	• Facilitate the negotiations with Strategic Partner	**Target achieved** Negotiations completed on Shareholder Agreement, Management & Strategic Partnership Contract, Secondment Agreement and Technical Services Contract". Draft contract documents forwarded to AG's office for review and advice. Meeting with Ethiopian Airline held but no minutes were available. Stakeholder Workshop report with Strategic Partners was not available.	10	9

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		2. Cabinet Memo on Shareholder Agreements prepared and submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Review Cabinet memo for approval to sign Shareholder and Management Agreements	**Target achieved** Cabinet Memo submitted on. 12th November, 2019.		
2.	Strengthening the Regulatory framework	Aviation Policy reviewed and Master Plan developed.	• Constitute a team to develop Terms of Reference (TOR) for the engagement of a Consultant • Review of TOR • Procure the services of a Consultant (s) to review Aviation policy and develop a Master Plan • Review reports from Consultant	**Target not achieved** Aviation Policy was not reviewed and Master Plan not developed. Evaluation of Expression of Interest (EOI) completed and approval received from Entity Tender Committee (ETC) to request for proposals from shortlisted firms. Six (6) companies out of fourteen (14) were shortlisted to submit their proposals but the Ministry is yet to write to them. Consultant yet to be engaged. The Evaluation Team advised the Ag. CD on the quality of memos forwarded.	10	4.5
3.	Improving Bilateral Relations	2 Bilateral Air Services Agreements (BASA) negotiated &	• Seek and consolidate comments from stakeholders on draft agreement	**Target achieved.** Seven (7) BASAs negotiated andinitialled with	10	9.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		initialled and 2 signed with contracting states	• Facilitate the Negotiation and Initialling of BASAs with 2 Contracting States • Organize/facilitate signing of 2 BASA agreements	Malta, Namibia, Belgium, Finland, Saudi Arabia, Colombia and Mozambique and Two (2) BASAs signed with Benin and Mauritius. Report/minutes on negotiations and signing was not sighted however, pictorial evidence was available.		
4.	Aviation Infrastructure Development and Management	1. Facilitate the construction of Phases II of the Kumasi Airport expansion project (20% of works to be completed) 2. Commence construction of phase II of Tamale airport expansion project (30% of works to	• Facilitate monitoring of works and review reports. • Organise sod-cutting ceremony for works to commence. • Facilitate Site visit/Monitoring progress of works and review reports • Facilitate 2 meetings with domestic air operators. • Organize ceremonies to commission the Ho and Wa	**Target achieved** Construction work progressing steadily. Concrete works on the sub and super structures have been completed. Construction of Phases 2&3 of the project was 20% completed. Only two (2) out four (4) quarterly monitoring reports were available. **Target not achieved** No physical work on the project had started. Contractor mobilized to site and H.E the President had performed the sod	10	6.1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		be completed) 3. Wa and Ho airports operationalized.	airports • Facilitate/organise sod cutting ceremony for the commencement of works • Facilitate monitoring of works and review reports	cutting for work to commence. Preliminary design was 20% completed**.** Construction of site yard/offices, acquisition of plant & machinery, etc. was ongoing. No site visits undertaken. **Target partially achieved.** Commercial operations have begun at the Wa airport. However, the Ho airport is yet to be operationalized due to difficulty in getting airlines to go there. Minutes of one (1) meeting with domestic operators seen. Pictorial evidence of the Deputy Minister and Team being welcomed by the Regional Manager of GACL and officials from the Upper West Regional Coordinating Council during the AWA maiden flight to Wa.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		4. Commence construction works on the northern apron of KIA and new headquarters building for GCAA. Works to be 20% and 25% complete respectively		**Target not achieved.** The GCAA headquarters building was about 10% completed while work on the Northern Apron was 10% completed. The sod-cutting ceremony for the construction of the Northern Apron at KIA and GCAA headquarters building was performed on 5th March, 2019 by the Hon. Minister**.** One (1) monitoring report sighted with evidence of review by the CD.		
5.	Aviation Infrastructure Development and Management Aviation Safety and Security Management	1. Facilitated the construction of ANS building (90% of works complete) 2. Establish an Accident Investigation Bureau (AIB)	• Facilitate the monitoring of works and review reports • Facilitate the passage of the Aircraft Accident and Serious Incident Regulations, 2019. • Organize workshop to sensitize Stakeholders on the	**Target not achieved** Construction work was 70% completed. Four (4) visits planned but only one (1) report sighted with no evidence of CD's Review. **Target achieved** The Aircraft Accident and Serious Incident Regulations, 2019 was passed by Parliament and assented to by the President in March, 2019. LI 2375, 20th	10	6.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			establishment of the Accident Investigation Bureau (AIB) • Set up and equip office for AIB • Develop an aircraft accident and serious incidents manual for the AIB	March, 2019 Stakeholders' workshop organised and minutes available. AIB established in March, 2019 at the Ministry. Manual developed for the AIB.		
6.	Development of regional aerodromes	Site for the construction of airport in the Western Region identified and secured	• Organize visit to land site in the Western Region • Facilitate follow-up survey by GCAA to determine the suitability of land for airport infrastructure • Facilitate the surveying and plotting of the land by Lands Commission	**Target partially achieved** A site has been identified and survey conducted on the suitability of the land at Apowa-Mpohor in the Ahanta West District in the Western region. Land acquisition process is on-going with Lands Commission. Land is yet to be secured. Survey conducted by GCAA to determine the suitability of land for airport infrastructure and report available. Lands Commission yet to finalise the surveying and plotting of land.	10	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
Sub-Total					**43.6**	

5.1.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **27.425** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 8: Performance of Ag. CD, Aviation in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed b. Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report d. Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced	• SectorAnnual Action Plan prepared and submitted via e-mail dated 2nd April to OHCS instead of February, 2019. • Mid-Year self-assessment report prepared and submitted via e-mail dated 15th August, 2019 to OHCS. • Follow up actions on issues identified in the Mid-Year CDs self-assessment report undertaken. • Memo dated 18th Sept. 2019 forwarding Mid-Year Sector Performance Review meeting held from 6th – 7th August, 2019. • 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report prepared and forwarded to OHCS on 16th January, 2019	**4**	3.8

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	Five (5) meetings held. • Minutes of meetings held on 28th March, 31st July, 30th Sept. 28th Nov., 17th Dec. at the Board room of the Ministry sighted. • Report of summary of actions taken to address audit queries not available.	**5**	5
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• The Plan has been prepared and reviewed Electronic printout from PPAs website. • Minutes of 8th meeting of the Entity Tender Committee meeting held on Friday, 2nd August, 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated	• An electronic updated Assets Register completed, signed by the Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor. Some pages not numbered. Auditor signed only on the first page.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Letter dated 28th Feb. 2019 forwarding expenditure returns to Audit Service and copy sent to CAGD.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	Organizational manual dated July, 2017 with evidence of implementation; • Updated staff list as at 31st December, 2018 available • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of letter dated 28th November, 2019forwarded to OHCS However, the PMU is being established but not in the org. manual and therefore would have to be reviewed	**10**	**9.25**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• Letter dated 5th Feb, 2019 to OHCS forwarding Composite analysed report on 2018 Appraisals. • Reports on Planning stage and Mid-year available. • Forwarding letter dated 6th May, 2019 of composite report on the signing of Agreements demonstrating the linkages between the CDs deliverables and the TPAs of the various HoDs/Directors/Analogous Grades prepared and copies sent to OHCS • Composite evaluation report submitted to OHCS on 5th February, 2020. • Forwarding letter dated 1st April, 2019 of Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process has been developed. • Letter dated 26th August, 2019 on Mid-year report on the implementation of the 2019 Training Plan available and copy forwarded to OHCS. End of year report not available. • Monthly reports from Jan-Dec, 2019 on daily staff attendance indicating trends & actions taken prepared • A query issued to an officer for lateness and truancy (Officer did not respond but nothing was done to officer) • Copy of Composite **analysed** reports on staff movements (recruitments, replacements, promotions, postings, retirements and resignations) for the year, 2019 is available with implications for the effective functioning of the Organisation • Forwarding letter to OHCS dated 9th Dec. 2019 on submission of 2020 Promotion register instead of November 2019		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of 9 Member Ministerial Advisory Board members is available. The Board was set up and inaugurated on March, 2017. • There (3) meetings held; Minutes of meeting held on 15th May, 23rd May, 23rd Dec, 2019 at the Ministry's Board room.	**2**	**1.625**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Client Service Charter available dated 2019 • Department Charter not available • No designated office but reception is used for Client Service activities • Officer received at the Civil Service Training Centre • Mid and end of year client service report available (8th July, 2019 and 8th January, 2020) respectively forwarding to OHCS • Functional interactive website Facebook • No updates available • Newsletters, brochures, flyers etc. available	**4**	**3.25**
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Innovations in organisational operations (electronic, administrative, management) through the introduction of an official email for all staff and a WhatsApp group platform for staff. • Current dealings with the sub-national level relate to the siting of airports and the Ministry has been relating with the relevant RCCs and traditional	5	**4.5**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	authorities.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Letter dated 10th July, 2019 to Ministry of Information on rebuttal of false information on social media of a brawl between the Hon. Minister and management of GACL. Generally, there is tracking of news items in the media though there is no analysis.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Nine (9) Management meetings held and copies of minutes available. • Three (3) Staff Durbars held and copies of minutes of meeting available • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness – no report • Report on measures to promote health and well-being of staff is available (Resource persons were invited by the Ministry to discuss various topics including; Insurance, Food Safety and mental health were discussed) • Use of notice boards and WhatsApp for internal communication		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available – diverse communication • Evidence of training for records officer trained in excel		
e. Management of physical environment	• Clean environment • Good quality of washrooms • Disability-friendly access – lifts available • Security post available • Fire extinguishers installed		
Overall Total		**27.425**	

5.1.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 9 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 9: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Aviation.

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD'S PERFORMANCE
1	Deeper understanding of the Yamoussoukro Decision	Participate in workshop	• Participated in a workshop on the Yamoussoukro Regulatory Texts and Experts' session of the fifth meeting of the ministerial working group on operationalization of a Single African Air Transport Market (SAATM) from 18th – 22nd February, 2019 in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. • Back to office report available.
2	Upgrade knowledge in contemporary developments within Air Transport industry	Participate in workshop	• Participated in a the First UNWTO/ICAO Ministerial Conference on Tourism and Air Transport in Africa from 27th -29th March, 2019 in Santa Maria, Sal Island, Cabo Verde. Back to office report available. • Participated in the Second Session of the African Union Specialized Technical Committee on Transport, Transcontinental and Interregional Infrastructure, Energy and Tourism (STC-TTIIET) Conference from 14th – 18th April, 2019 in Cairo, Egypt. • Back to office report available
3	ICT - Use of Advanced Excel in reporting	Refresher training programme	• Undertook twelve-hour in-house hands on training in Advanced Excel over a six-week period. The training built my capacity in the use of excel in generating financial report and common excel errors and how to avoid or spot them quickly in order to create more accurate data report.
4	Corporate Governance	Refresher training programme	• Participated in the 10th Annual Conference of Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and Chief executives of the Ghana Public Service held from 17th – 20th October 2019 at Capital View Hotel, Koforidua under the theme "Value Creation and Efficient Service

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD'S PERFORMANCE
			Delivery in Public Service Organizations in the Era of Ghana Beyond". Back to office report available
5	Advance Conflict Resolution & Management Skills	Participate in advance Conflict Management skills training/workshop	• Participated in the African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM) 40th Annual Roundtable Conference from 3rd – 6th December, 2019, in Cairo, Egypt.
6	Advance Conflict Resolution & Management Skills	Participate in Air Services negotiations	• Participated in the 50th anniversary of the African Civil Aviation Commission (AFCAC) and 20th anniversary of the Yamoussoukro Decision celebration held from 13th – 14th November, 2019 in Dakar, Senegal. Back to office report available
Sub-Total			**10**

5.1.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **81.025** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.1.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD admitted that her officers had not taken the writing of back to office reports seriously and for this reason there was virtually nothing on record for staff to learn from others. However, she stated that this was being rectified. She also stressed on the importance of signing the Agreement and the evaluation exercise as she saw it as a learning opportunity each time she had gone through.

Team's Remarks

The Evaluators also explained that the exercise gave them an opportunity to learn each time and that the process should not be seen by the Ag. CD as a punishment but rather a means to:

- Ensure that the core values are achieved;
- Help one to recognize potential and improve the performance management culture in the Service;
- Guide the timely implementation of deliverables stated in the Agreement.

Finally, the Evaluation team advised the Ag. CD to see the Agreement as a living document should be in control of the process and pay attention to all deliverables in the Agreement.

Meeting with the Hon. Deputy Minister

The team met with the Deputy Minister Yaw Afful MP for Jaman South. After a brief by the evaluators on the process, the Hon. Deputy Minister informed the Team that though he was aware of the work of the Ag. Chief Director, he would prefer the Hon. Minister, who was out of town, to address the issue of the performance of the Ag. CD. He indicated that he would arrange for the Team to meet with the Hon. Minister later. Unfortunately, this did not happen.

5.1.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Complete negotiations with on Shareholder Agreements with Strategic Partner	• Letters dated 2nd May, and 7th May, 2019 inviting GCAA/GACL/AG & MoF to participate in a workshop to review draft partnership and Management Agreements in respect of proposed Partnership with ET airlines on the establishment of HBC. • A letter dated 15th July, 2019 forwarding the reviewed draft Partnership and Management Agreements to AG's office and MoF for review.
	Cabinet Memo on Shareholder Agreements prepared and submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Letter dated 12th November, 2019 signed by Director F&A submitting 60 copies of Cabinet Memorandum on the operationalization of the HBC. • Copy of Cabinet Memo dated 12th November. 2019 signed by the Hon. Minister. • Copy of Agreements between the Republic of Ghana and Ethiopian Airlines content; Shareholders Agreement, Management & Strategic Partnership Contract, Secondment Agreement.
2.	Aviation Policy reviewed and Master Plan developed	• Invitation letter dated 3rd May, 2019 submitted to GCAA and GACL to nominate senior level officers to assist in the preparation of draft TOR for the development of Ghana Aviation Master Plan and Aviation Policy. • Attendance sheet dated 13th May, 2019. • Copy of revised TOR and Memo dated 14th May. 2019 from Snr. Planning Officer to Ag CD submitting comments on reviewed and final TOR. • A letter dated 11th June, 2019 submitted to GCAA and GACL requesting for final review and comments on draft TOR – draft TOR for Aviation strategic policy and master plan attached. • Copy of adverts in Ghanaian Times and Daily Graphic dated 2nd July, 2019 and 16th July, 2019 respectively on consultancy for review of existing aviation policy and development of a national aviation master

		plan – GR/MOAV/CS/0001/2019 and the PPA and Ministry's websites. • Letter dated on 24th July, 2019 forwarded to PPA requesting for single sourcing of individual consultant for the development of a business plan and advisory services for the establishment of HBC. • Letter dated 8th August.2019 received from PPA granting approval. • Evaluation report dated August, 2019 available. • Letter dated 9 August, 2019 forwarded to Robert Watts on notification of award for the development of a business plan and advisory services for the establishment of HBC. • Minutes of the 9th ETC meeting dated 19th December. 2019 conveying approval of EOI evaluation report signed by Secretary. • Copy of attendance sheet dated 19th December. 2019.
3.	Bilateral Air Services Agreements (BASA) negotiated & initialled and 2 signed with contracting states	• A letter dated 11th January. 2019 received from MFA inviting the Ministry to the 1st preparatory meeting for the 3rd session of Ghana-Namibia PJCC. • Letter dated 15th February. 2019 forwarded to MFA submitting the Ministry's nomination to the 3rd session of Ghana-Namibia PJCC to be held from 25th – 26th February. 2019. • A letter dated 7th March, 2019 submitting to MFA Ghana's comments on the commencement of technical negotiations aimed at concluding Ghana-Malta BASA attached. • Letter dated 20th August. 2019 forwarded to GCAA, GACL & AG's office for comments on issues raised by the Aeronautical Authorities of Colombia on Ghana's draft non-Yamoussoukro Decision (YD) Air Services Agreement. • E-mail dated 27th November, 2019 from a member of the BASA team forwarding revised Air Services Agreement/MoU between Ghana and Finland and Colombia. • A letter dated 28th January, 2019 received from MFA inviting Ghana to commence Technical negotiations aimed at concluding Ghana-Malta BASA • Letter dated 27th February, 2019 to MFA requesting for assistance to obtain entry visa to Malta for Ghana's negotiating Team. • Letter dated 3rd April, 2019 received from MFA on the transmission of MoU on aviation, signed during the State visit of the President of the Republic of Ghana to Malta from 25th to 26th March, 2019. • Copy of initialled BASA with the Republic of Malta and signed MoU dated 26th March, 2019 at Valletta, Malta. • Copy of initialled BASA between the Gov't of the Republic of Ghana and the Government of the Republic of Namibia and Records of discussion between the Aeronautical Authorities of the Republic of Ghana and the Republic of Namibia dated 25th February. 2019.

		• Memo dated 5th November. 2019 from Deputy. Director F&A to Ag. CD requesting for approval to arrange travel logistics for participants at the Ministry to participate in the 2019 ICAN meeting from 2nd – 6th December. 2019 in Aqaba, Jordan. • Letter dated 11th November. 2019 forwarding to GCAA, request for sponsorship for the Ministry's participants at the ICAN, 2019 conference from 2nd – 6th December. 2019 • Copies of initialled BASAs between the Governments of the Republic of Ghana and the Republic of Colombia, Kingdom of Belgium and Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. • Copy of group picture after initialling BASA. • Letter dated 30th July, 2019 submitted to MFA on approval for signing negotiated and initialled BASAs between Ghana and other contracting States including Benin, Mauritius, Cameroon, Tanzania, Sudan, Netherlands in respect of Curacaos and Lebanon. • Letter dated 9th October. 2019 received from MFA informing the Ministry of Aviation of the Republic of Benin's request to sign BASA between the Republics of Ghana and Benin. • Letter dated 11th November. 2019 forwarded to MFA proposing 21st – 23rd November. 2019 for the signing of BASA between Republics of Ghana & Benin. • Letter dated 18th November. 2019 to GCAA requesting for support to cater for the travel expenses of the Ministry's participants. • Copies of signed BASAs between the Government of the Republic of Ghana and the Republic of Benin and the Government of the Republic of Mauritius. • Copy of group picture after signing BASA
4.	Facilitated the construction of Phases II of the Kumasi Airport expansion project (20% of works to be completed)	• Monitoring report dated March - May, 2019 prepared by Snr. Planning Officer and submitted to Ag. CD. • Memo dated 5th May, 2019 from Snr. Planning Officer through Director F&A to Ag. CD submitting copy of quarterly site reports on the development of Kumasi airport phase 2 & 3. • Monitoring report dated October-December. 2019 prepared by Snr. Planning Officer and submitted to Ag. CD. • Memo dated 20th December. 2019 Snr. Planning officer to Ag. CD submitting monitoring report.
	Commence construction of phase II of Tamale airport expansion project (30% of works to be	• Letter dated 7th June, 2019 to the office of the President from Hon. Minister, invitation to perform sod-cutting ceremony for the development of Tamale airport phase 2 project. • Letter dated 24th July, 2019 from Director F&A forwarding the draft

	completed)	speech to the office of the President for the sod-cutting ceremony. • Report of sod cutting ceremony signed and dated 22nd August, 2019 prepared by Dep. Director. F&A. • Memo dated 23rd Aug. 2019 from Dep. Director F&A to Ag. CD submitting report. • Copy of CD reviewed speech. • No physical works on project has started.
	Wa and Ho airports operationalized.	• Letter dated 27th June, 2019 signed by Director F&A, inviting to a meeting. with domestic operators; GCAA, GACL, AWA, PASSION and UNITY AIR scheduled for 1st July, 2019 at the Board room of the Ministry of Aviation, NCA, Tower, 3rd floor. • Minutes of meeting with domestic airline operators held on 1st July, 2019 at the Ministry to discuss the operationalization of the Ho and Wa airports. • Memo dated 5th July, 2019 submitting minutes of meeting to Hon. Minister through Ag. CD. • Copy of attendance sheet dated 1st July, 2019. • Picture of the Hon. Deputy Minister and a Team from GCAA/GACL being welcome by the Regional Manager of GACL and officials from the Wa Regional Coordinating Council during AWA's maiden flight to Wa.
	Commence construction works on the northern apron of KIA and new headquarters building for GCAA. Works to be 20% and 25% complete respectively	• Letters dated 2nd January and 5th February. 2019 forwarded to GCAA and GACL, sod-cutting ceremony for the construction of the GCAA new headquarters and KIA Northern Apron project. • Letter dated 4th January. 2019 to office of the President signed by the Hon. Minister, invitation to sod cutting ceremony for the construction of the GCAA new headquarters and KIA Northern Apron project. • Letter dated 22nd January, 2019 from the Office of the President on invitation to sod cutting ceremony for the construction of the GCAA new headquarters and KIA Northern Apron project. • Letter dated 12th February. 2019 to the Committee Clerk, Parliamentary Select Committee on roads and Transport on invitation to sod cutting ceremony for the construction of the GCAA new headquarters and KIA Northern Apron project. • Copies of pictures during the sod cutting ceremony held on 5th March, 2019. • Memo dated 4th December. 2019 from Director PPME to Ag. CD seeking approval to undertake monitoring visit to the projects site at KIA on 12th December. 2019. • Report of monitoring visit to projects site signed and dated 19th December. 2019. Memo dated 20th December. 2019 from Asst. Development Planning

		Officer (ADPO) to Ag. CD submitting monitoring report.
5.	3. Facilitated the construction of ANS building (90% of works complete)	• Report on familiarization visit signed and dated 23rd July, 2019 submitted to Ag. CD. • Memo dated 26th July 2019 from ADPO to Ag. CD submitting a report on the familiarization visit of the on-going construction of the ANS building at KIA. • Memo dated 4th Dec. 2019 from Director PPME to Ag. CD seeking approval to undertake monitoring visit to the projects site at KIA on 12th December. 2019. • Report of monitoring visit to projects site signed and dated 19th December. 2019. • Memo dated 20th December. 2019 from ADPO to Ag. CD submitting monitoring report.
	4. Establish an Accident Investigation Bureau (AIB)	• Letter dated 8th January. 2019 to Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justicesigned by Hon. Deputy Minister on the Aircraft Accident and Serious Incident Regulations. • A letter dated 11th February. 2019 to the Office of the President signed by the Hon. Minister, requesting for Executive Approval for the proposed GCAA Act, 2004 (Act 678). • A letter dated 14th February, 2019 received from AG's office on the Aircraft Accident and Serious Incident Regulations, 2019. • Copy of a Memo dated 14th February, 2019 from ADPO through Director PPME to Ag. CD submitting meeting report with the Parliamentary Select Committees on Subsidiary Legislation & Roads and Transport Legislation and Drafting team from AG's office. • Soft copy of the reviewed draft Aircraft Accident and Serious Incident Regulations, 2019. • Letter dated 18th March, 2019 signed by Hon. Minister inviting stakeholders on the establishment of an independent AIB. • Memo from Secretary, AIB to Ag. CD dated 28th March, 2019 submitting minutes of the stakeholders' engagement on the establishment of AIB. • Minutes dated and signed 24th March, 2019 • Attendance sheet dated 22nd March, 2019 • Copy of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed on 27th March, 2019 between MoA and GCAA for cooperation in aircraft accident investigation and provision of tools and equipment assistance. • Picture of the AIB office • Letter dated 20th February. 2019 to GCAA, requesting for assistance to develop APIM • Memo dated 25th February. 2019 from Ag. CD to all Committee members constituting a Team to review and finalize draft APIM. • Memo dated 8th March, 2019 seeking, approval to hold two-day workshop

		on AIB. • APIM developed and approved by the Hon. Minister on 25th March, 2019 • Pictures during working sessions on the development of the APIM.
6.	Site for the construction of airport in the Western Region identified and secured	• Letter dated 7th February. 2019 forwarded to GCAA and GACL inviting them for a visit to proposed land in the Western Region. • Report of site visit to the western region signed and dated 8th March, 2019 • Memo dated 14th March. 2019 from Snr. Planning Officer to Ag. CD submitting site visit report. • Letter dated 10th April, 2019 forwarded to GCAA, requesting to survey the proposed site in the Western region for the construction of an airport. • Memo dated 31st May, 2019 from Snr. Planning Officer to Ag. CD submitting the survey Report to Ag. CD • Report signed and dated 28th May, 2019 • Letter dated 14th Jan. 2019 forwarded to GACL signed by Director. F&A requesting for payment to lands Commission to undertake survey and preparation of the acquisition plans for the land. • Letter dated 18th July, 2019 to GACL informing that the Hon. Minister of Western region has negotiated for an agreed 15% discount on the invoice submitted earlier by Lands Commission

5.2 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Business Development

5.2.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 10 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table. The CD obtained the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 10: Performance of CD, Business Development in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Developing Entrepreneurship Policy	Launch the National Entrepreneurship Policy.	• Coordinate the stakeholder's consultation meetings of the policy development process. • Submit final draft to cabinet subcommittee for approval. • Facilitate the printing of the Policy • Dissemination of the Policy.	**Target achieved.** Stakeholders' consultation meetings completed and report available with evidence of CD's review. Policy received approval from Cabinet. Document launched by distributing it to all critical stakeholders.	12	12
2.	Promoting Business Growth and Entrepreneurship	Entrepreneurship Challenge Competition organised and 3000 successful winners awarded. Trained 10,000 Entrepreneurs in Entrepreneurship and Business Plans.	• Facilitate the work of the NEIP in the selection of Entrepreneurs. • Facilitate the release of funds • Review reports of NEIP and submit to HM for approval • Facilitate award ceremony	**Targets achieved.** Entrepreneurship Challenge Competition organised and three thousand (3000) young entrepreneurs supported. **Target achieved.** Twelve thousand (12,000) start-ups trained.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Presidential Pitch for start-ups organised and 10 successful winners awarded.		**Target achieved.** Presidential Pitch organised. Report on Presidential Business Support programme available with CD's review. Two hundred and fifty (250) physically challenged women supported. Report on Promoting Business Growth and Entrepreneurship available. Report on the Presidential Pitch Season 2 available.		
3.	Implementation of the Greening Business Management Initiative	Complete 60% of a 32- Hostel for the Green House Estate	• Facilitate the release of funds. • Facilitate the improvement of facilities at the site eg. Road network, water supply system. • Complete at least 60% of the Hostel at the site.	**Target achieved.** Funding released for the completion of the 32-Hostel for the Green House Estate. Report on the improvement of facilities at the site available. Financial clearance received from OHCS to recruit staff.	12	12
4.	Implementation of School Entrepreneurship Initiative	Extend initiative programme to 40 more SHS Schools and	• Facilitate release of funds • Coordinates the launch of the	**Target achieved.** Extended initiative programme to sixty-one (61) more SHS	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
	to be extended to Vocational, Technical and Tertiary Institutions	launch the initiative in 20 Tertiary Institutions.	initiative and programmes to Schools.	Schools and launched the initiative in 20 Tertiary Institutions. Report dated 10/12/2019 available with evidence of CD's review.		
5.	Promotion of Women Entrepreneurs hip	Set up Seed capital Fund to support women owned businesses.	• Facilitate release of funds • Facilitate the distribution of funds raised to physically challenged women in business • Organise workshop to enhance financial literacy among women	**Target achieved.** Seed capital Fund to support women owned businesses set up. Six hundred (600) physically challenged women supported. Workshop to enhance financial literacy among women organised Report on the Presidential Empowerment for Women Entrepreneurs with Disability (PEWED) available with CD's review.	12	12
Sub-Total						**60**

5.2.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **24.44** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 11: Performance of Chief Director, Business Development in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 25th March, 2019 instead of February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 15th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 3rd September, 2019 and approval granted on 17th September, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Letter dated 31st July 2019 submitting Mid-Year Performance Report to OHCS.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 14th January, 2020.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries. b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved. c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• No AC available. • Actions taken to redress audit queries not available. • Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 8th January, 28th June, 27th Sept., and 20th December, 2019. • Updated Assets Register available, not signed by the Estate Officer but authenticated by Internal Auditor, though not on each page. • 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 16th March, 2019.	**5**	**2.25**
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Organization Manual dated 30th April, 2019 available. • Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff available. • Establishment levels indicating variance available. • 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to	**10**	**10**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	OHCS on dated 15th January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning, mid-year and end-year phases of the appraisal instrument were available and forwarded to OHCS on 28th January, 2020.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• No Director available. • No evaluation report.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 7th February, 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on 25th June, 2019 and 8th January, 2020 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available. • Internal Memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 31st December, 2019, available.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analyzed reports dated 30th December, 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 28th November, 2019.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• MAB not available. • Not meetings held.	**2**	**0**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation **b.** Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Draft Client Service Charter dated November, 2019 available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • No Charter for NEIP. • Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC – training report available. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 22th August and 31st December, 2019 respectively. • Functional website, engagement with Media Facebook and WhatsApp platform available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Newsletters, brochures, and flyers available.	**4**	3.5
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Regular staff meetings and supporting them in their work. Introduced knowledge sharing activities. Electronic	**5**	**4.79**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	communication. • Feedback from beneficiaries encouraging the Ministry for work done. CSOs/NGOs seeking to partner the Ministry in some of the on-going activities. Monitoring and Evaluation report available. • Media Tracking - Newspapers cuttings available but not analysed. Post on Facebook and website. • Minutes of seven (7) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Report dated 30th December, 2019 on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. • Report on Medical Screening of staff organized by Health Aid Medicare available. And organized health walk. Report on staff welfare scheme available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards. • Letter dated 20th May, 2019 requesting for assistance from PRAAD available. • No evidence of training or any other records management activities.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. Management of physical environment	• Signed contract with Private Security and Cleaning Service. Quality of washrooms improved and overhead tanks renovated.		
Overall Total		**24.44**	

Note: Since the Ministry did not have Directors at post as well as any Departments, they could not be scored for issues relating to the Performance Agreements with Heads of Departments and Directors/Analogous Grades. The sub-total score should thus be based on 8.5. To get a score relating to 10, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 10/8.5, that is, 1.18.

5.2.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 12 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 12: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Business Development

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Policy Analysis	Workshop Workshop Training	Participated in the Institute for Democratic Governance (IDEG) Conference on Strengthening the Sub-District Structures in a reformed decentralized Local Governance System in Ghana on 19th June, 2019. Participated in the 2nd Evidence to Action Conference for Chief Directors organised by Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation at ISSER, UG on 11th July, 2019. Participated in Writing Effective Policies and Procedures Course organised by Anderson, Executive Development Centre held in Dubai, UAE from 17th – 21st November, 2019 – certificate of completion available.
2	Budgeting	Workshop	Participated in a Workshop on the 2020-2023 Budget Guidelines organised by Ministry of Finance held at

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
			MENSVIC Hotel, Accra on 29th August, 2019.
3	Strategic Management	Training	Participated in a course in Strategic Management in a Public Sector organised by Inter-Africa Consulting, London, UK from 16th – 27th September, 2019.
4	Public Sector Financial Management	Workshop	Participated in a Workshop on International Public Sector Accounting Standards for Chief Directors organised by the Controller & Accountant-General's Dept. in Accra on 4th June, 2019.
5	Procurement	Workshops	Participated in a Forum for micro, small and medium-sized local enterprises to provide valuable insights on success factors in procurement organized by the Ministry of Public Procurement on 24th July, 2019.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.2.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **94.440** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.2.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Chief Director acknowledged the importance of the exercise and indicated that he and his team had learnt a lot. He was appreciative of the feedback provided and suggested that the exercise should be extended to cover non-civil servants who were working in the Civil Service and report to the CD. He was of the view that the Civil Service Council should have a discussion on the issue. He emphasised on the need for collaboration among all staff to ensure increased productivity and improvement of service delivery. The CD hoped that the Ministry's performance would improve going forward since the staff had learnt a lot during the exercise and now appreciated the essence of timely reporting on key assignments.

Team's Remarks

The Team made officers aware that the exercise should be seen as a good experience and not be seen as a punitive measure. It should be viewed as holding people accountable for increased productivity and effectiveness of services provided to the citizens. The assessment also made room for one to recognise his/her strengths and weaknesses and capitalising on the opportunities to strengthen the performance culture that the Service needed. They were hopeful that the concept of performance management would permeate through all levels of the Civil Service.

The Team finally mentioned that the evaluation process always gives the CD and his team an opportunity to assess their own operations. The CD should make the CDPA a "living document" all year round and ensure all timelines for the deliverables are adhered to and continuously monitored.

5.2.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Launch the National Entrepreneurship Policy.	• Letter dated 1st March, 2019 inviting stakeholders in Accra for engagement on the Policy. • Letter dated 5th April, 2019 inviting stakeholders in Kumasi for engagement on the Policy. • Report dated 18th April, 2019 on the stakeholders' engagement. • Memo dated 31st October, 2019 from the Deputy Director to the CD forwarding report on the stakeholders' engagement on the draft Policy. • Draft Policy dated May, 2019. • Letter dated 18th November, 2019 submitting a Cabinet Memo for the Policy to Cabinet. • Letter dated 2nd December, 2019 communicating approval from Cabinet to the Ministry.
2.	Entrepreneurship Challenge Competition organised and 3000 successful winners awarded.	• Memo dated 18th January, 2019 from the Ag. CD to Hon Minister for release of funds to support entrepreneurs. • Report dated 19th July, 2019 on promoting Business Growth and entrepreneurship. • Guidelines for the challenge competition available.
	Trained 10,000 Entrepreneurs in Entrepreneurship and Business Plans.	• Memos dated 18th January, 2019 and 17th June, 2019 for release of funds for capacity building of entrepreneurs.
	Presidential Pitch for start-ups organised and 10 successful winners awarded.	• Memo dated 9th September, 2019 to CD for release of funds to pay beneficiaries of Presidential Pitch. • Memo dated 21st November, 2019 submitting report to Chief Director. • Letter dated 10th July, 2019 nominating persons to serve as judges for the Presidential pitch. • Letter dated 1st August, 2019 for the selection young entrepreneurs to pitch before the President. • Report dated 7th August, 2019 on thePresidential pitch season 2 available. • Letter dated 12th February, 2019 to MoF requesting for release of

		funds. • Letter dated 17th June, 2019 to the Ministry from MoF responding to the financial request. • Memos dated 16th October, 2019 and 12th December, 2019 to CD for release of funds for beneficiaries. • Payment vouchers. • Memo dated 21st November, 2019 from the Deputy Director, submitting report to CD for review. • Brochure for award ceremony available. • Report dated 7th August, 2019 on the Presidential Pitch Season2. • Report dated 19th July, 2019 on Promoting Business Growth and Entrepreneurship.
3.	Complete 60% of a 32- Hostel for the Green House Estate	• Memo dated 27th February, 2019 from CEO NEIP requesting for release of funds to extend water supply system to the Greenhouse. • Report dated 29th June, 2019 on the improvement of facilities at the site. • Memo dated 16th September, 2019 requesting for release of funds. • Letter dated 2nd October, 2019 from OHCS granting the Ministry financial clearance to recruit these staff in March, 2020. • Memo dated 6th November, 2019 from the Deputy Director submitting report on the Greening Business Management Initiative to CD for review.
4.	Extend initiative programme to 40 more SHS Schools and launch the initiative in 20 Tertiary Institutions.	• Memo dated 9th April, 2019 to Chief Director requesting for release of fund for campus pitch launch. • Various invitation letter dated 15th April, 2019 on the launch of Student Entrepreneurship Initiative (SEI) Tertiary. • The SEI Tertiary launched. • Release letter dated 17th June, 2019 from MoF to the Ministry. • Memo dated 26th July, 2019 to Hon Minister requesting for release of funds for supply of SEI Secondary handbooks. • Memo dated 12th December, 2019 submitting report dated 10th December, 2019 to CD for review.
5.	Set up Seed capital Fund to support women owned businesses.	• Memo dated 29th April, 2019 for release of funds available. • Letter dated 24th September, 2019 from the MoF to the Ministry releasing funds. • Payment vouchers. • Invitation letters to various stakeholder dated 24th April, 2019 on the launch of the initiative. • Memo dated 22nd July, 2019 submitting mid-year report on the

		Presidential Empowerment for Women Entrepreneurs with Disability (PEWED) to Chief Director for review. • Memos dated 1st August and 21st November, 2019 inviting staff to the 2nd and 3rd disbursement of funds to women entrepreneurs with disability. • Memos dated 15th November, 2019 to Chief Director requesting for release of funds to train selected women entrepreneurs with disability. • Memos dated 20th November, 2019 to Chief Director requesting for release of funds to train 600 women entrepreneurs with disability. • Memo dated 24th December, 2019 to Chief Director for release of funds to distribute to beneficiaries. • Memo dated 22nd November, 2019, submitting report to CD for review.

5.3 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs

5.3.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 13 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **52.7** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 13: Performance of CD, Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Resourcing the Chieftaincy Institutions	6 Regional Houses of Chiefs for the newly created regions (established).	• Liaise with the National House of Chiefs on the constitution of the 6 Regional House of Chiefs • Liaise with the Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justiceon finalisation of Legislative Instrument on the Membership of the Houses of Chiefs	**Target not achieved.** Legislative Instrument on Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs laid before Parliament as at 31st December 2019. Forty (40) vehicles, made up of twenty (20) Toyota Land Cruises and Twenty (20) Nissan Pickups presented to the various Houses of Chiefs to enhance Chieftaincy Administration in the Country. (Pictures available)	12	8.4
2.	Minimizing Chieftaincy Disputes in the Country	10 % of all cases pending adjudicated by Judicial Committees	• Facilitate the release of funds • Ensure timely submission of reports by the Houses of Chiefs • Review Reports	**Target achieved.** Report on cases disposed-off available No. of cases = 406 Cases disposed =	12	10.2

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Revised handbook on Chieftaincy published and distributed.		66 % of cases disposed of = 16.34%. **Target not achieved.** Revised Handbook with publishers.		
3.	Strengthening education and awareness of Traditional Authorities and Religious bodies	Workshop for Traditional Authorities and Religious Bodies on National Development Organised	• Facilitate the organization of workshops. • Review workshop reports	**Target achieved.** Meeting held with Traditional Authorities and Religious bodies in the Adansi and Bekwai Traditional areas in the Ashanti Region on Illegal Mining and other Environmental issues. Report available but with no evidence of who prepared it as well as review by the CD. The Ministry, in collaboration with University for Professional Studies, Accra (UPSA) organised training for both Traditional and Religious leaders and Registrars.	12	11

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				Training report available with evidence of review by CD.		
4.	Developing and Strengthening Inter-Faith Coexistence for peace and National Development	One (1) workshop for Religious bodies on peaceful co-existence organised	Facilitate the content and draft of the Handbook	**Target achieved.** The Ministry in collaboration with the National Security Ministry and Ghana Muslim Association held a one-day dialogue on peaceful co-existence at the Alisa Hotel on interfaith values and report available.	12	11.1
		Draft National Policy on Religion forwarded to key stakeholders for review		**Target achieved.** Draft National Policy on Religion available. Parliamentary Select Committee on Youth, Sports and Culture engaged on the National Policy on Religion Chief Imam and National Chief Imam of the Al-Sunnah engaged.		
		Three (3) Pilgrimages Organised		**Target achieved.** Five (5) pilgrimages held for over 200 pilgrims and report		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
		Guidelines on Christian Pilgrimage Developed		available **Target not achieved.** Guidelines on Christian Pilgrimage at drafting stage.		
5.	Codifying of Lines of Succession to Stools and Skins	11 draft legislative instruments on line of succession to stools/skins finalised and submitted to Parliament	• Liaise with the National House of Chiefs on the L.I's • Liaise with MOJAGD	**Target achieved.** Eleven (11) draft L.Is forwarded to Parliament. Eight (8) new draft Legislative Instruments on lines of succession to stools/skins covering Adjaade, Brong Ahafo (Bono East), Avatime (Volta), Bulsa (Upper East), Kumbungu (Northern), Techiman, Brong Ahafo (Bono East), Western Nzema (Western), Mim (Brong Ahafo) and Osudoku (Greater Accra) submitted to OAJMOJ	12	12
Sub- Total					**52.7**	

5.3.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **25.775** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 14: Performance of Chief Director, Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance – Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 22nd March, 2019 instead of February 2019.	**4**	**3.9**
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 16th August 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• No revision done.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report on a two (2) day retreat from 31st October - 3rd November 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 24th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Minutes of two (2) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 14th and 28th May, 2019 sighted. • There was a report on actions taken to address issues arising	**5**	**3.5**

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	from meetings of the committee.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 7th February, and 24th December, 2019		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory of items provided and dates of acquisition not indicated for all items. Documents not signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 24th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.25**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Revised Organization Manual dated July, 2019 available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated but not submitted to OHCS.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 15th February, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of		

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	the appraisal instrument was available and forwarded to OHCS on 15th February and 13th August, 2019 respectively. • Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 4th June 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 20th February, 2020. • 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 7th March 2019. • End year report available and submitted to OHCS 12th February, 2020. Mid-year report not available. • Monthly reports from January – December available. • Internal Memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 22nd July, 2019, available. • Composite analyzed report available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 12th December 2019 instead of November 2019		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available • MAB in place and minutes of three (3) meetings dated 28th	**2**	**1.625**

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	June, 23rd October and 24th December, 2019 available		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Draft Service Charter dated September, 2019 available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • No Departmental Charter available.	**4**	**3.25**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC from 11th – 13th November, 2019. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 10th July 2019 and 14th January 2020 respectively		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Website not functional, Facebook available • Quarterly updates on website not available • Newsletters available		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• No activities undertaken to promote efficiency in operations.	**5**	**4.25**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring reports from the National and Regional Houses of Chief available. • Media Tracking- press cuttings of Newspapers and matrix available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of nine (9) Management Meetings sighted.		

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives e. Management of physical environment	• Minutes of three (3) Staff durbars sighted. • Training cuts across the sexes. • Medical Screening and Sensitization of staff reports available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards. • Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available. • Evidence of report on decongestion exercise available. • The Ministry is preparing to relocate to its new office in April 2020. However, physical environment management of current location is by the Office of the President – Household Unit.		
Overall Total		**25.775**	

5.3.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 15 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 15:Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Leadership programme	Attend Workshop	Participated in the Ghana Bar Association conference from 8th – 13th September, 2019.

			Back to office report available.
2	Course in leaders in Transforming Public Service Delivery.	Attend retreat	Facilitated a 3-day management retreat at Aqua Safari in November, 2019. Back to office report.
3	Alternate Dispute Resolution	Attend Seminar	Participated in Two Seminars held on Alternative Dispute Resolution and other matters at the University of Ghana on the 26th – 28th June, 2019 and Wednesday 3rd July 2019 at the Central Hotel, Ridge.
4	Risk management	Participate in training session	Participated in a Legal risk management training from 7th – 9th August, 2019 at the La-palm Beach Hotel. Back to office report.
5	Capacity building and enforcement	Conference and Seminar	Organised and facilitated training programme – on; Work environment and Ethics, Legal Framework of the Chieftaincy Institution, Administrative Processes, and Judgement writing at Ada, Koforidua and Legon. Copies of presentations available.
Sub-Total			10

5.3.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **88.475** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.3.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD confirmed that the exercise was useful and all suggestions made would be considered going forward. Issues of dating, ownership of reports as well as forwarding reports for the CD's review were critical and well noted for future consideration. The CD requested that he should be permitted to invite some of the officers from the Regions to participate in the exercise in future to enable them appreciate the need for submission of reports anytime the Ministry made such requests. It was also important to develop a system by which officers who attended training programmes could share their newly-acquired knowledge and experiences with their colleagues.

Team's Remarks

The Evaluators drew the attention of officers to take responsibility for jobs assigned to them and also attach great importance to them since failure to do so could negatively affect the CD's performance. They urged the CD's team to see the exercise as a learning opportunity and, if utilised, would strengthen the Performance Management Culture of the Civil Service, improve institutional efficiency and, ultimately, national development.

Meeting with the Hon. Minister

The Minister thanked the Evaluation Team for making time to interact with him and indicated that the CD had done a good job by ensuring that most of their activities had been undertaken considering the fact that the Ministry had funding problems. He reiterated that one had to be innovative to get things done since the issue of funding would forever remain a challenge. He cited the successful organisation of the Christian Pilgrimage, which the Chief Director was actively involved in and ensured the resolution of long standing conflicts among some churches. He stated that considering the work done by the Chief Director, it was his hope that the CD would perform better during the evaluation.

The Team thanked the Minister for his time and explained that the exercise was not a punitive measure but mainly to assist the CD and his team learn more about things that they were not doing right to help improve on the institutional performance of the Ministry.

5.3.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	6 Regional Houses of Chiefs for the newly created regions established.	• Letter dated 10th July, 2019 addressed to the Secretary to Cabinet on the establishment of Regional House of Chiefs in the Six (6) newly created Regions. • Ministry's letter dated 18th September, 2019 addressed to the Secretary to the President expressing the Houses appreciation for the vehicles available. • Regional Registrars per the Ministry's letter dated 29th April, 2019 given additional responsibilities over new regions to facilitate the process. • Meeting held with the Parliamentary select Committee on Subsidiary legislation on Wednesday 14th November, 2019 to consider the Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional House of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019. • Letter dated 22nd March, 2019 submitting the Revised Draft Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional House of Chiefs) Instrument 2019 to the Ministry. • National House of Chiefs' letter dated 8th April, 2019 submitting Minutes of Meeting of the NHC Held on 27th February 2019 to the Ministry.

		• Minutes of meeting of the National House of Chiefs held on Wednesday 27th February 2019 which discussed the review of the Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instruments 2017 (L12207) and other related matters. • Letter dated 11th November, 2019 addressed to the President of the National House of Chiefs requesting for update on the subsequent submission of the draft membership of the Regional House of Chiefs instrument. • Ministry's letter dated 25th November, 2019 requesting the National House of Chiefs to conclude the draft processes of the Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs Instrument, 2019 signed by the Chief Director. • Ministry's Letter dated 8th January, 2019 submitting draft Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019 to OAGMOJ. • Letter dated 15th February, 2019 received from the Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice submitting draft Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019. • Ministry's Letter dated 26th March, 2019 submitting draft Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019 received from the NHC to OAJMOJ. • Ministry's Letter dated 16th April, 2019 forwarding NHC Letter dated 10th April, 2019 for a change of name of a Traditional area in the Volta Region (From Etodome Traditional Area to Tongor Traditional Area) to OAGMOJ. • Letter dated 29th April, 2019 received from the Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice on the draft Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019. • Letter dated 7th May, 2019 received from the Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice on their response per our request for a change of name of a Traditional area in the Volta Region (From Etodome Traditional Area to Tongor Traditional Area). • Ministry's Letter dated 8th July, 2019 resubmitting revised draft Chieftaincy (Membership of Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019 to OAGMOJ and copied to the Hon. Minister, Ministry of Regional Reorganisation and Development. • Letter dated 8th July, 2019 from the OOP requesting the Ministry to establish RHC in the 6 newly created regions. • Final Revised draft of the Chieftaincy (Membership of

		Regional Houses of Chiefs) Instrument, 2019 submitted to OAGMOJ per ministry's letter dated 6th September, 2019 and signed by the Hon. Minister of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs. • Various letter dated 26th August, 2019 from the Ministry Handing over the vehicles to the NHC. • Media brief. • Vehicle distribution list.
2.	10 % of all cases pending adjudicated by Judicial Committees	• Memo dated 10th July, 2019 from the Senior Research Officer addressed to the Director F& A through the Acting Head RSIM forwarding the Mid-year report on cases. • Memo dated 30th April, 2019 from the Senior Research Officer addressed to the Director F& A through the Acting Head RSIM forwarding the First quarter report on cases with CDs review. • Memo dated 10th July, 2019 from the Senior Research Officer addressed to the Director F& A through the Acting Head RSIM forwarding the Second quarter report on cases available. • Various letters dated 27th September, 2019 addressed to Registrars of the various Houses of Chiefs to submit data on chieftaincy cases for the Third Quarter. i.e July to September, 2019. • Memo dated 7th October, 2019 from SRO to Director – F&A submitting the 3rd quarter report. • Letter dated 5th November, 2019 for the NHC to the CD submitting the existing Procedure Rules and Regulations in preparation of the engagement with the Chiefs to review the document.
	Revised handbook on Chieftaincy published and distributed.	• Ministry's letter dated 5th April, 2019 signed by the Hon. Minister and addressed to the Hon. Minister of Finance requesting for review of quarterly grants to the Houses of Chiefs. • Ministry's letter dated 6th May, 2019 addressed to CAGD on the implementation of Budget Allotment ceiling for second quarter 2019. • Letters dated 8th April, 2019 signed by the Acting head RSIM requesting for data on chieftaincy cases from the Houses of Chiefs. • Letters dated 18th June, 2019 signed by the Acting head RSIM requesting for data on chieftaincy cases from the Houses of Chiefs.

		• Draft Handbook on Chieftaincy – revised edition 2019.
3.	Workshop for Traditional Authorities and Religious Bodies on National Development Organised	• Letter dated 10th January, 2019 addressed to the Director, Institute of African Studies, University of Ghana requesting for Training Session for Selected Chiefs and Queen mothers. • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from the Director F&A forwarding the training report to CD. • Meeting report with the Traditional Authorities in Wassa Amenfi and Wassa Fiase Traditional areas. • Letter dated 17th October, inviting all stakeholders to the meeting.
4.	One (1) workshop for Religious bodies on peaceful co-existence organised	• Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from the Director F&A forwarding a brief on interfaith dialogue.
	Draft National Policy on Religion forwarded to key stakeholders for review	• Draft National Policy on Religion dated 2019 available held on 16th May, 2019 at Alisa Hotel, Accra to CD. • Draft National Policy on Religion forwarded to some key stakeholders for their inputs per letter dated 12th July, 2019. • Letter dated 18th November, 2019 engaging the Chief Imam. • Ministry's letter dated 2nd December, 2019 signed by the Chief Director requesting the Select Committee's inputs in finalising the draft. **Responses From Stakeholders** • From the Ministry of Health per letter dated 25th November, 2019. • Ghana Pentecostal and Charismatic Council (GPCC). • Ahmadiyya Muslim Mission, Ghana per letter dated 9th December, 2019. • Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice per their letter dated 18th October, 2019. • Environmental Protection Agency per letter dated 12th September, 2019. • Ghana Health Service. • Ahlussunna Wal Jama'a per letter dated 6th December, 2019. • Catholic Church.
	Three (3) Pilgrimages Organised	• Ministry's Letters dated 12th February, 2019 addressed to various stakeholders on the organisation of the 2019 Pilgrimage to the State of Israel – May and August 2019. • Minutes of the 1st General Meeting of the Pilgrimage Committee held on Wednesday 20th February, 2019.

		• Letter dated 10th July, 2019 from the Ministry to the CEO of One People Travels expressing appreciation of the Ministry. • Memo dated 16th December, 2019 from Director PPME forwarding the midyear report on Christian pilgrimage to the CD. • Ministry's letter dated 16th September, addressed to the Chief of Staff notifying her of the Ministry planned 4th and 5th pilgrimages. Letter signed by the Hon Minister of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs.
	Guidelines on Christian Pilgrimage developed	• Ministry's Letter dated 30th January, 2019 requesting for assistance from Stakeholders to print and publish materials. • Letter dated 6th February, 2019 from the BoG acknowledging receipt of the letter from the Hon. Minister. • Ministry's Letter dated 11th April, 2019 on the Roadmap for Christian Pilgrimage addressed to various faith based organisations requesting for their inputs available. • Copy of draft guidelines available.
5.	Draft legislative instruments on line of succession to stools/skins finalised and submitted to Parliament	• National House of Chiefs letter dated 7th March, 2019 on the Declaration of Customary Law Instruments addressed to OAGMOJ through the Ministry. • OAGMOJ's Letter dated 26th March, 2019 addressed to the Ministry on the Declaration of Customary law instruments. • National House of Chiefs Letter dated 2nd April, 2019 addressed to the Ministry on the Declaration of the Customary Law Instrument. • National House of Chiefs Letter dated 24th June, 2019 addressed to the Ministry on the Declaration of the Customary Law Instruments. • Ministry's Letter dated 3rd July, 2019 resubmitting Declaration of Customary law instruments to the OAGMOJ. • Letter dated 24th September, 2019 letter signed by Director F&A. • Ministry's letter dated 29th November, 2019 forwarding comments from the National House of Chiefs on the Declaration of Customary Law Instruments 2019 for Lipke, Lambussie, Bawku, Twifo, Hemang and Breman Asikuma.

5.4 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Defence

5.4.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 16 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **55.6** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 16: Performance of CD, Defence in Schedule 1

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Legislation and Cooperation	Operationalise LI 1332 to extend the tenure of Non Commissioned Officers	• Circulate LI for review of GAF Council members • Collate comments of GAF Council members • Seek approval of GAF Council • Forward claims to Ministry of Finance for payment	**Target achieved.** Views collated and Armed Forces Council's approval sought. LI 1332 fully executed by MoD/GAF.	10	10
		Operationalise DIHOC – Defence Industries Holding Company	• Seek replacement of two (2) Board members • Prepare Plan of Action for 2019 • Organise four (4) Board Meetings • Facilitate participation of Board Members in Military Fairs • Facilitate the inspection of Military industries for	**Target achieved.** DIHOC operationalized. Four (4) Board Meetings held in 2019. Signed MOU dated 28th May, 2019 between MOD and various foreign companies for the supply of armoured vehicles, medical equipment and tools and office complex for DIHOC. Signed MOU dated 28th May, 2019 between DIHOC and NOMP and FZC for		

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			partnerships	industrial cooperation. Familiarization visit to GAF land at Prang in Bono East Region undertaken. A number of other activities also undertaken.		
2.	Housing of GAF Officers/Men	Barracks Regeneration: Completion of Phase I of Project Complete the financial and commercial agreements for the new Military Housing Project (MATS and other	• Conduct quarterly Project Implementation meetings • Undertake and review four(4) site monitoring reports • Facilitate payment for works done • Facilitate the commissioning of Project • Review Proposal/Agreement • Finalize draft Financial Terms/agreement • Seek Attorney-General's legal opinion • Facilitate approval of Project by PPA • Facilitate submission of joint memo on Financial Agreement to Cabinet (MOF/MOD)	**Target achieved.** Project completed. Monitoring reports with pictures of completed project available Handing over by contractors expected in 2nd quarter 2020 for commissioning in the 3rd quarter of 2020. **Target achieved.** Agreement reviewed. Financial and Commercial Agreements including tax waiver finalized by Parliament. Project commissioned by the H.E the President of the Republic. Pictures of the project available.	10	10

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Garrisons)	• Seek approval of Parliament for financial and commercial Agreement			
3.	Enhancing Productivity	Construct an FOB in Ezuilibu, Western Region Acquire Seven(7) aircrafts	• Facilitate two (2) financial releases from MoF • Facilitate the handing over of site for the Project • Constitute Technical Committee for the Project • Review and finalize draft Financial Terms • Source for funds from Ministry of Finance • Brief Minister on progress • Review inventory • Conduct inspection of vehicles • Seek Minister's approval of date and programme for commissioning • Facilitate the acquisition of spare parts for vehicles • Obtain financial approval from the Ministry of Finance (MoF) • Obtain legal advice from Attorney-	**Target not achieved.** FOB not constructed Contractor procured. Funds for project sought. Project Technical Committee established. Project has commenced Sod cutting ceremony for Project undertaken by H.E the President on 16th December, 2019. **Target not achieved.** Contract to procure seven (7) aircraft signed with Messrs Rosoboronexport and aircraft yet to be acquired. Funding sought for project. Aircraft yet to be delivered. HM briefed and	10	8.6

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Facilitate the commissioning of vehicles including 50 buses for GAF Procure thirty (30) cobra 4x4 armoured vehicles	General's Office • Review Attorney-General's comments • Facilitate award of contract	report available with CD's review. **Target achieved.** Buses commissioned by H.E. the President of the Republic and inspection report available with CD's review. **Target achieved.** Contract awarded. Vehicles commissioned and supplied to GAF.		
4.	Defence Health Initiative	Complete and commission the 500 Bed Military Hospital in Afari, Kumasi	• Regularise new sub-contractor • Facilitate the release of payments to Contractor • Conduct quarterly Project Implementation meetings • Seek Cabinet approval • Obtain approval from PPA • Review proposal of Contractor	**Target not achieved.** Hospital not completed. Project implementation: • Core Hospital Civil Works – 95% and Overall – 73% • Ancillary facilities Civil Works – 85% and Overall – 75% • Road and Landscaping Roads – 75% Landscaping – 28% Delays in obtaining equipment from China. Process initiated for recruitment of required personnel	10	7

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Commenced Phase III of the 37 Military Hospital Project		for Hospital. **Target not achieved.** Final designs ready. Progress report with CD's review available. Cabinet memo not submitted for necessary approval.		
5.	Security of GAF Lands/Assets	Initiate the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding for the development Teshie Shooting Range into a Waterfront Community Procure a transactional advisor for the construction of the C-in-C Sports Stadia in Tamale	• Facilitate the development and signing of MOU between MOD and Company • Obtain approval from PPA/CRB/ETC • Facilitate award and signing of contract • Facilitate release of funds (mobilisation) • Facilitate sod cutting ceremony	**Target achieved.** MOU signed with Radi Group. **Target achieved.** All contracts signed. Transactional advisor procured Project commissioned by H.E the Vice President in Tamale on 3rd May, 2019.	10	10
6.	Peacekeeping activities	Continue the implementation of the earned dollar payment policy for deployed	• Call for estimates of financial outlay for entitled personnel for 2019 • Forward requests for funds to MOF	**Target achieved.** Policy on payment to troops at various peacekeeping missions to be continued.	10	10

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		troops Deploy Military troops for Internal Peacekeeping Operations	and CAGD • Call for estimates of financial outlay for entitled personnel for 2019 • Forward requests for funds to MOF and CAGD • Collaborate with Inter-Ministerial Committee on Illegal Mining	**Target achieved.** All estimates collated from GAF duly submitted to and other stakeholders for payment. Troops deployed.		
Sub-Total					**55.6**	

5.4.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **28.55** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 17: Performance of CD, Defence in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**4**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• SectorAnnual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Directors Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS 26th February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-Year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS in 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on	• Letter dated 5th Sept., 2019 from CD to HCS requesting for		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
mid-year CDs self-assessment report	reviews. • Mid-year review session held and submitted to OHCS on 30th July, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report on follow-up actions available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• The team sighted minutes of four (4) audit committee meetings dated 2nd April, 24th May, and 4th and 18th December, 2019. • Summary of action report dated 4th April, 2019 available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement Plan available • Minutes of seven (7) Entity Tender Committee meetings dated 26th February,9th May,3rd July,29th August,5th September,10th October, and 19th December, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Updated electronic assets register available as at 31st December, 2019.		
d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• 2018 Financial Statement and covering letter forwarding dated 28th February, 2019 available.		
KRA 3 Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.8**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4	• Dated Organisational Manual dated 1st December, 2019		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Staff list updated.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Job schedule available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available letter dated 31st July, 2019 forwarded to OHCS.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Report submitted to OHCS on 14th January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Memo dated 15th July, 2019 submitting the Planning and Mid-year report to CD.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Report submitted on 22nd May, 2019 to OHCS • Evaluation report dated 7th Feb., 2020 available instead of January 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan submitted to OHCS on 20th February, 2019. • Mid and End-of-year Reports completed and submitted 18th February, 2020.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly report on staff attendance available. • Various query letters dated 10th May, 1st March, 3rd and 18th Dec., 2019, submitted to CD. • A memo from CD drawing attention of staff to official working hours. • Undated report giving summaries on effect on movements.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Promotion Register submitted to OHCS dated 26th November, 2019.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of members available • Four (4) meetings held on and minutes available 16th May, 2019 16th September, 2019 31st October, 2019 16th December, 2019	**2**	**2**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter available. • No Department Charter available – written to the Agencies to develop them.	**4**	**3.5**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated CSU office available. • CSU Officers trained at the CSTC with back to office reports available. • Mid and end year report available submitted to OHCS on 24th June and 26th December, 2019 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website available. • Official Facebook, WhatsApp platforms set up. • An annual report showing quarterly updates of the website available. • Newsletter – Defender Vol. I - III		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Eighty (80) computers and printers procured to enhance productivity. • Rapidscan 620SR Security X-ray System procured and installed on 28th March, 2019 to enhance security at MOD for	**5**	**4.25**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	the safety of Staff and visitors.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring and evaluation reports/sector reviews including the effects of sector policies, programmes and activities on stakeholders (with evidence of data gathering and analysis) on 12th June, 2019. • Press cuttings available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of thirteen (13) management meetings held. • Minutes of two (2) staff durbars available. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness. • GAF at 60 programme (Eight women awarded). • Draft Gender Policy available. • Report on measures to promote health and well-being of staff; • -Keep-fit exercise on 4th March and 24th December, 2019. • -In-house Gym under construction to benefit Staff • -free health services from the 37 Military Hospital accessible to staff • -Osmosis Water distillation machine installed to purify well water, safe for drinking by Staff • -Office fumigated • Internal Newsletters, memos posted on notice board		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• No engagement with PRAAD • Three-day workshop for registry staff on Electronic Records Management on 29th July, 2019 at CSTC (Report available)		
e. Management of physical environment	Verification of: • Cleanliness of office environment • Beautification of the work		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	environment • Daily cleaning of offices • Compound mowed and plants tendered weekly (New mower procured 2019) • Disability-friendly accesses		
Sub-Total		**28.55**	

5.4.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 18 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 18:Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Defence

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Leadership Skills	Attend Orientation	Participated in the orientation programme for new Chief Directors at CSTC, Accra from 1st to 2nd April, 2019 organized by OHCS ***(Pictures).*** Participated in the Africa Endeavour at Movempick Ambassador Hotel from 19th - 22nd August, 2019 organized by the USA Embassy , Accra ***(Report dated 26th August, 2019)***
2	Business Promotion	Visit an Industry	Visited Equipos Industriales De Mantención SA in Spain from 10th to 14th April, 2019 ***(Report dated 16th April, 2019).*** Participated in Defence and Security 2019 Exhibition Conference and Networking in Bangkok, Thailand from the 18th to 20th November, 2019 ***(Report dated 25th November, 2019).*** Visited two (2) industries in Indonesia - PINDAD Military Products & SIMREX Military Uniforms ***(20th -21st November, 2019 Report/Pictures/Media).***
3	Management in Labour and Governance	Attend Conference	Participated in the 108th Session of the International Labour Conference in Geneva from 10th to 22nd June, 2019 ***(Pictures/Report)***.

			Attended in-house workshop/seminar on Ghana's Labour Law dated 6th -7th August, 2019 ***(Memo dated 18th July, 2019 from the HR directorate/Report).***
4	Financial Management Dialogue	Attend Conference	Participated in the 2019 International Auditors Conference in California, USA from 7th to 10th July, 2019 ***(Report dated 7th – 10th July, 2019).*** Participated in the 2019 International Auditors Conference in Luxembourg, from 18th to 20th September, 2019 ***(Certificate /Report 18th to 20th September, 2019).***
5	Public Sector Evaluation	Attend Conference	Attended the Ghana Navy at 60 years-International Maritime Defence Exhibition and Conference (IMDEC) at Kempinski, Accra from 24th - 25th , July, 2019 ***(Video about the conference/report).***
Sub-Total			**10**

5.4.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **94.15** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.4.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD thanked the team and elaborated on some of the lessons learnt:

- Being diligent and taking critical look at all incoming and out-going documents;
- The importance of dating documents;
- Keeping records chronologically to enhance delivery of service;
- The benefits of working as a team; and
- Review of reports very essential.

He saw the exercise as meant to encourage Civil Service staff to perform to the satisfaction of their diverse clients. The CD emphasized the need for a solid team to achieve success. He appreciated the support of his team in this regard.

Team's Remarks

The Team emphasised that this was a useful exercise, which would help everyone know their weaknesses and strength. All staff must endeavour to support the CD to achieve the goals of the Ministry. Team building should be critical and the Agreement should be seen as a living document and constantly monitored to determine the extent of implementation for optimum results to be obtained.

5.4.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Operationalise LI 1332 to extend the tenure of Non-Commissioned Officers	• MOD letter dated 13th February, 2019 submitting report on review of the career progression plan for soldiers commensurate with 30yrs Service to Council members ***(Copy of report attached).*** • GAF Council dispatch list. • The Office of the President (OoP) letter dated 4th March, 2019 acknowledging submission of the report. • New issues for 8th GAF Council Meeting. • Matters arising from the 8th GAF Council meeting held on Thursday, 13th June, 2019. • Programme: dated Thursday, 13th June, 2019 for Armed Forces Council Meeting at Addo Kuffuor Conference Room, the Square. • Programme: dated Thursday, 9th August, 2019 for Armed Forces Meeting at Addo Kuffuor Conference Room, the Square. • MOD letter dated 10th June, 2019 inviting Council members to the 8th GAF Council Meeting. • Minutes of meeting dated 13th June, 2019 of the 8th GAF Council Meeting on Thursday, 13th June, 2019 and New Issues ***(see p. 6, 7& 8).*** • Confidential Initial Engagement Certificate of Recruits Undertaking form. • Confidential GAF Re-Engagement Certificate 25-30-year forms. • Document revised with feedback from Council members. • MOD letter dated 1st October, 2019 submitting revised documents to AG for changes to the Regulation. • AG's letter dated 2nd December, 2019 to MOD to incorporate it advice to the changes. • MOD letter dated 19th December, 2019 submitting updated version of LI 1332 to the AG's for action. • MOD letter dated 31st July, 2019 requesting for approval of career progression Plan to H.E the President. • Fair Wages and Salaries Commission letter dated 1st October, 2019 submitting recommendation for salaries Review for GAF to MOD. • MOD letter dated 4th October, 2019 requesting for salary review for GAF to H.E the President for approval and implementation. • MOD letter dated 13th February, 2019 on submission of the report to Hon. Minister of Defence for his comments and action. • MOD letters dated 22nd February, 2019 for submission of career progression plan to **MoF, Ministry of National Security and National Security Advisor for their consideration.**
	Operationalise DIHOC – Defence Industries Holding Company	• MOD letter dated 12th February, 2019 seeking the appointment of Governing Body of DIHOC Board to OoP. • Letter dated 26th February, 2019 on approval for the two (2) members from the OoP. • Agenda for Board of Directors Meeting scheduled for 10th April, 2019at the Addo Kufour Conference Room, the Square.

		• Agenda for Board of Directors Meeting scheduled for 21st August, 2019 for DIHOC members at the Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square. • Memo dated 12th August, 2019 submitted by PPBME to CD for his further action on report of presentation dated 21st August, 2019 on the challenges and recommendation of DIHOC Footwear to the Chairman of DIHOC. • Agenda for Board of Directors Meeting dated 31st October, 2019 at the Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square. • Schedule of activities from November 2019-February, 2020 for incorporation of Joint Venture between Kenaki and DIHOC. • Minutes of Meeting dated 21st August, 2019 of DIHOC Board Meeting at the Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square ***(see P. 2).*** • Minutes of Meeting dated 10th April, 2019 of DIHOC Board Meeting at the Addo Kufuor Conference Room, the Square ***(see P. 2-4).*** • DIHOC letter dated 5th December, 2019 requesting for clearance to register a liability company for Kenaki and others. • DIHOC letter dated 9th December, 2019 submitting business plan with Kenaki to MOD. • MOD letter dated 10th December, 2019 submitting request for registration for company to the Ministry of Interior. • Convening Order for Board Directors Meeting (DIHOC) on 10th April, 2019 at the Addo-Kuffuor Conference Room at the Square. • Agenda for Board of Directors Meeting scheduled for 10th April, 2019 at the Addo Kuffuor Conference Room, the Square. • MOD letter dated 4th April, 2019 on Convening Oder for Meeting of Board of Directors of DIHOC. • Minutes of Meeting dated 10th April, 2019 of DIHOC Board Meeting at the Addo Kufuor Conference Room, the Square. • MOD letter dated 19th August, 2019 on Convening Oder for Meeting of Board of Directors of DIHOC. • Agenda for Board of Directors Meeting scheduled for 21st August, 2019 for DIHOC members at the Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square. • Attendance meeting forms dated 21st August, 2019. • Agenda for Board of Directors Meeting scheduled for 31st October, 2019 at the Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square. • MOD letter dated 29th October, 2019 on Convening Oder for Meeting of Board of Directors of DIHOC. • Minutes of Meeting dated 21st August, 2019 of DIHOC Board Meeting at the Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square ***(see P. 2)*** • Draft agenda for Maiden Kenaki-DIHOC Board Meeting dated 4th December, 2019 at Ofusu-Appeah Conference Room. • MOD letter dated 11th February, 2019 inviting Hon. Minister to participate in the Aero India 2019 in India from MFARI letter 3rd December, 2018 seek entry visas. • MOD letter dated 22nd February, 2019 informing MFARI of official visit to Spain by CD and others to seek diplomatic arrangements. • MFARI letter dated 11th April, 2019 on invitation to the IDEP 2019 in

		Istanbul. • GULHAN-DEARSAN JOINT VENTURE letter dated 2nd April, 2019 on to the Minister of Defence to the IDEP 2019. • MOD letter dated 29th April, 2019 on invitation to the Defence Industry Fair (IDEP 2019) to the OoP for approval. • MOD letter dated 15th August, 2019 on presentation to the TRB products and collaboration to manufacture products in Ghana. • GHQ letter dated 2nd December, 2019 on the invitation for the CDS to attend the 11th Edition of DEFEXPO India-2020. • Trecadis letter dated 10th June on official invitation to Romania for meeting with Defence Industry and Officials. • MOD letter dated 20th May, 2019 inviting parties signing MOU with the Egyptian Military and Companies. • Defence Attaché letter dated 20th June, 2019 on visitation to Egypt by Hon. Defence Minister on MOU between MOD and Egyptian organizations. • MFARI letter dated 3rd June, 2019 on proposal for Holding of 1st Defence Industry Cooperation between the MOD of Ghana and the Presidency of Defence Industries of Turkey. • GHQ letter dated 2nd July, 2019 on visit of Defence Minister to Egypt. • Memo dated 12th August, 2019 submitted by PPBME to CD for his further action on report of presentation by eight (8) groups of investors on their specific business to DIHOC members. • MOD letter dated 28th November, 2019 to Turkey for official visit to Turkey. • Sinclair and Wide letter dated 13th November, 2019 submitting Tri-Service Defence and Security Exhibition Conference in Thailand and Indonesia 18th-23rd November, to MOD. • MOD letter 8th November, 2019 submitting acceptance for the invitation to the Tri-Service Exhibition. • MOD letter to OoP seeking permission to participate in the Defence and Security 2019 Exhibition, Conference and Network in Thailand. • MOD letter dated 25th November, 2019 submitting appreciation Indonesia.
3.	**Barracks Regeneration: Completion of Phase I of Project**	• Memo dated 11th March, 2019 submitted by PPBME for date for two (2) PIU meetings to CD for his consideration. • Memo dated 3rd September, 2019 submitted by PPBME for date for PIU meetings to CD for his action. • Memo dated 14th June, 2019 on site visit report by PPBME to CD ***(CD's minute)*** • Memo dated 23rd August, 2019 for site report dated 21st August, 2019 on site visit by Director PBME to CD ***(CD's minute).*** • MOD letter dated 21st August, 2019 to GHQ on a working visit to BRP sites at Burma Camp. • Memo dated 17th October, 2019 for site report by PPBME to CD ***(CD's minute).*** • Memo dated 23rd October, from PPBME proposing date to CD for Hon. Minister Itinerary for Monitoring of projects (Attached letter to OoP on

		Minister's itinerary). • MOD request for payment letter dated 8th March, 2019 to MOF for release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project ***(document attached).*** • MOD request letter for payment letter dated 6th May, 2019 to MOF for release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project. • MOD request letter for payment letter dated 27th May, 2019 to MoFfor release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project ***(document attached).*** • MOD request for payment letter dated 30th May, 2019 to MoFfor release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project ***(document attached).*** • MOD request for payment letter dated 18th July, 2019 to MoF for release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project ***(document attached).*** • MOD request for payment letter dated 2nd October, 2019 to MoF for release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project (***document attached).*** • MOD request for payment letter dated 10th October, 2019 to MoF for release of funds for payment for work done for BRP project. • Letters dated 6th, 13th, 23rd September, 2019 from MoF releasing funds to MOD. • Memo dated 18th December, 2019 from PPBME to CD on review of progress for the revised date for the commissioning of BRP.
	Complete the Financial and Commercial Agreements for the new Military Housing Project (MATS and other Garrisons)	• MOD letter dated 9th January, 2019 forwarding the revised proposal from the Poly Technologies Inc. China to MOF for further action ***(Copy of Poly Technologies letter attached).*** • Memo dated 2nd January, 2019 from PPBME submitting report on the 100 Million Housing Project to CD for action. • Letter dated 28th February, 2019 for the proposed visit to Ghana by Poly Technologies Inc.for Mil. Housing project. • MOD letter dated 4th March, 2019 for the proposed visit to Ghana by Poly Technologies Inc. for Military Housing project. • MOD letterdated 10th January, 2019 forwarding MOU approval by Cabinet for the Mil. Housing Project to MOF for further action. • MOD letter dated 4th March, 2019 forwarding a revised draft contract (copy attached) of the Mil. Housing Project to MOF for consideration and implementation. • Signed Agreement dated 8th March, 2019 between MOD and Poly Changda and Poly Technologies for the project. • MoF decision to MOD on funding for its projects and programmes ***(No. 5).*** • MOD letter dated 17th July, 2019 forwarding a Tax Waiver application (copy attached) from Poly Changda to the Consultant for his necessary action ***(Tax Waiver Application attached).*** • MOD letter dated 31st July, 2019 forwarding a Tax Waiver application from Poly Changda to MoF for the execution of the project.

		• MOD letter dated 15th January, 2019 to the AG's for draft Agreement for the Mil. Housing Project for legal comments ***(Draft Agreement attached).*** • MOD letter dated 22nd January, 2019 to the AG's forwarding the draft general conditions of contract of the Mil. Housing Project for legal comment. • AG's letter dated 5th February, 2019 submitting it advice for the contract document for the project. • MOD letter dated 22nd February, 2019 to the AG's acknowledging it observations and recommendations. • MOD letters dated 15th January, and 26th February, 2019respectively to PPA for approval for the Mil. Housing Project. • PPA approvals letters dated 24th January and 8th August, 2019for both the Poly Changda and Messrs CAAD and CAD as contractor and consultant respectively. • MOD letter dated 8th March, 2019 forwarding a Joint Parliamentary Memoranda for the Mil. Housing Project to MOF for Parliamentary approval. • MOD letter dated 19th March, 2019 forwarding Parliamentary Memoranda (Commercial Agreement) (copy attached) for the Mil. Housing Project to Parliament for its approval. • Parliament invitation letters dated 29th and 22nd March, 2019respectively from Parliament to MOD for meetings to consider memoranda submitted. • Parliamentary Service letter dated 10th April, 2019 communicating its approval for the agreement with attached report dated April, 2019 (copy of the report attached). • Parliamentary Order Paper dated 9th April, 2019 adopting the agreement. • Parliamentary letter dated 23rd December, 2019 submitting Finance Committee of Parliament approved report minuted approved dated 20th December, 2019 on request for Tax Waiver of import duties etc.
	Construct FOB in Ezinlibu, Western Region	• MOD letters dated 5th February, 2019 to MoF requesting for application to release funds for the construction FOB to Messrs Hawkmoor Ltd. (Company document attached). • MOD letters dated 5th February, 2019 to MoF requesting for application to release funds for the construction FOB to Messrs Amandi Holding Ltd. (Company document attached). • MoF letter dated 25th March, 2019 on the release of funds to MOD for initial payment. • MoF decision to MOD on funding for its projects and programmes ***(No. 2).*** • Letter dated 13th November, 2019 from the MoF approving a multi-year commitment for the construction of a forward operation base. • Amandi letter dated 29th November, 2019 for advance payment bonds (copy of the letter attached). • MOD letter dated 20th December, 2019 to MoF for release of funds to Messrs Amandi. • MOD letter dated 23rd December, 2019 to MoF for release of funds to

		Messrs Hawkmoor. • MOD letter dated 23rd December, 2019 to MoF for release of funds to Messrs Vuluux. • Memo dated 14th August, 2019 submitting a report on site visit to CD from PPME. • Picture on visitation to site. • Site Maps, drawings and design. • MOD letters dated 2nd, 12th and 18th April, 2019 to Amandi Holding on Vuluux participations as the local content partner for the project. • MOE letter dated 30th August, 2019 to MOD requesting for information on land for the project. • GHQ letter dated 30th August, 2019 on request for update on site plan for the project to MOD. • Vuluux letter dated 3rd August, 2019 to MOD requesting for an urgent Joint meeting with stakeholder. • MOD letter dated 9th September, 2019 submitting the land information to MOE. • MOD letters dated 11th September, 2019 on invitations for meeting with stakeholders at Mahama Iddrisu Conference Room, the Square. • MOD letter dated 8th October, 2019 to Messrs. Hawkmoor on the process for the project. • MOD letters dated 29th November, 2019 to GHQ and others for preparation and invitation for sod cutting ceremony. • Consultant letter dated 27th November, 2019 for site Handover report. • MOD letter dated 29th November and 9th December, 2019 to major stakeholders on invitation for sod cutting ceremony by H.E the President of the Republic. • Memo dated 3rd July, 2019 on the formation of Technical Committee members to CD by Dir. PPME for approval to the chairman of the Committee ***(list attached)***. • MOD letters dated 4th July, 2019 for nomination to members to serve on FOB PIU ***(copy of membership list attached).***
	Acquire Seven (7) aircraft	• MOD letter dated 30th April, 2019 for introduction of Sovekstech LLC to the AG's for determination to replace Joint Stock Company ***(Copy of the letter attached).*** • MOF letter dated 21st May to National Security to conduct due diligence on Sovekstech LLC. • The AG's letter dated 29th May, 2019 on the necessary action required by MOD to undertake. • Joint Stock Company letter dated 26th July, 2019 to MOD on abrogation of contract with MOD & proposal to accept fresh contract with Corporate Unity Ghana Ltd. • Corporate Unity GH Ltd. Letter dated 22nd July, 2019 submitting information on the draft contracts of Sovekstech LLC to supply aircraft to GAF. • MOD letter dated 7th August, 2019 for the termination of contract with Joint Stock Company. • MoF decision to MOD on funding for its projects and programmes ***(No.4).***

		• Memo dated 8th July, 2019 submitting brief report to CD to brief Hon. Minister on progress of the contract. • MOD letter dated 17th December, 2019 to Rosoboronexport on the progress of work and payment under the contract.
	Facilitate the commissioning of vehicles including Fifty (50) buses for GAF	• Memo dated 31st January, 2019 submitting review report from PPME on acceptance Board report for 50 buses received from China dated 1st November, 2018 to CD including bills of lading from the port. • Picture of buses at the Tema port. • Memo dated 30th January, 2019 submitting report on the inspection of buses at the port of Tema. • GHQ letter dated 21st January, 2019 for GAF programmes for 2019 to MOD for further action. • MOD participation letter dated 23rd January, 2019 to the OoP. • Letter dated 4th February, 2019 to GHQ on the Official visits of H.E. to commission the buses and other vehicles for the participation of H.E. the President. • Speech delivered by H.E the President. • GHQ letter 8th April, 2019 requesting for spare parts specification to MOD. • MOD letters dated 25th March and 30th April, 2019to PPA to grant approval to procure spare parts. • PPA approval letter dated 16th May, 2019. • Signed contract dated May, 2019 for the procurement of spare part for the buses between MOD & Messrs C. 2 Stars Ltd. • C-2 Stars letter dated 7th October, 2019 requesting for payment for the supply of spare parts. • MOD letter dated 8th November, 2019 for payment for advance mobilization for the procurement of the spare parts ***(Copy of notice of bank of bank account).*** • GHQ letter dated 13th November, 2019 for transfer of funds to the Supplier.
	Procure thirty (30) cobra 4x4 armored vehicles	• MOD letter dated 25th February, 2019 to MoF submitting revised draft contract consideration and approval for the supply of cobra 4x4 vehicles ***(copy of the draft agreement attached).*** • MOD letter dated 2nd April, 2019 for payment of advance mobilization to MoF for the supply of cobra 4x4 armored vehicles. • MoF decision to MOD for funding for its projects and programmes ***(copy No. 3).*** • MOF issuance of irrevocable letter dated 21st May, 2019 letter of credit from MOF to the CAGD to pay for the vehicles. • Bank of Ghana letter 9th August, 2019 on shipping documents of the vehicles. • MOD letter dated 14th August, 2019 forwarding the shipping document GHQ for further action. • MOD letter 13th November, 2019 for submission of acceptance board report for final payment to MoF. • Williefel Company letter dated 21st requesting for release of advance

		payment guarantee for the completion of the contract. • MOD letter dated 2nd December, 2019 for release of advance payment bond to Messrs Williefel. • MOD letters dated 8th and 21st February, 2019 to the AG for legal advice for the contract for the supply of armoured vehicles to GAF. • MOD letters dated 4th March, 2019 noting the advice and comments by the AG to the AG (Copy of attachments). • AG's letter dated 14th February, 2019 to MOD to take note of its comments for the supply of cobra 4x4 buses. • AG's letter dated 28th January, 2019 to MOD to take note of its comments for the supply of cobra 4x4 buses. • AG's letter dated 7th March, 2019 to MOD to take note of its comments for the supply of cobra 4x4 buses. • Memo dated 6th February, 2019 form the JAG's to CD for comment and action. • MOD letter dated 12th March, 2019 for notification of awards to the contractor. • Williefel letter dated 13th March, 2019 for acceptance of Contract to MOD. • Signed contract dated March, 2019 between MOD and Messrs Williefel. • Letter dated 11th June, 2019 reporting on Pre-shipment inspection on OTOKAR Cobra and II Vehicle in Turvey from 26th – 31st May, 2019. • Report of acceptance board for 30 OTOKAR Cobra 4 * 4 armoured vehicles and spare parts.
4.	**Complete and commission the 500 Bed Military Hospital in Afari, Kumasi**	• Memo dated 22nd January, 2019 from JAG to CD submitting Technical assessment of the new contractor for consideration and action. • -Euroget -De-Invest (EDI) S. A. letter dated 30th January, 2019 to MOD submitting contract addendum to for action ***(contract attached).*** • MOD letter dated 31st January, 2019 submitting review of the new sub-contractor to AG's office to regularize it appointment. • EDI letter dated 1st February, 2019 submitting copies of the contract between MOD & EDI & the new sub-contractor for action. • EDI letter dated 5th February, 2019 submitting non-objection note to MOD for further action. • Memo dated 13th February, 2019 from JAG submitting assessment report to CD for his advice. • AG letter dated 15th February, 2019 advising MOD on what require for new process to appoint new sub-contract. • MOD letter dated 18th February, 2019 on reconciliation of reports for the new sub- contractor for the continuation of the 500- Bed at the military hospital to GHQ. • MOD letter dated 18th February, 2019 to the consultant on the reconciliation of report for the new sub-contractor to continue construction to the consultant. • MOD letter dated 1st March, 2019 to the Chairman and CEO of Euroget De Invest for the submission addendum No.4 ***(copy attached).*** • MOD letter dated 5th March, 2019 to EDI for the appointment of the new sub-contractor.

		• -Letter dated 31st May, 2019 on notice of question from Parliament No. 587 ***(Answer to parliamentary questions number 587 attached).*** • MoF letter dated 3rd June, 2019 on credit agreement for the submission of addendum No.4 to MOD. • MOD letter dated 22nd March, 2019 for payment certificate from MOD EDI to pay the contractor. • MOD letter dated 22nd March, 2019 submitting payment certificate to EDI to pay the contractor. • MOD letter dated 22nd July, 2019 submitting payment to EDI pay the consultant. • MOD letter dated 22nd July, 2019 submitting payment of consultant to EDI. • MOD letter dated 25th July, 2019 submitting payment certificate to EDI to pay the contractor. • Minutes of PIU meeting dated 15th January, 2019. • Minutes of PIU meeting dated 28th February, 2019. • Agenda for PIU meeting dated 13th June, 2019. • Minutes of PIU dated 26th August, 2019. • Minutes of meeting dated 18th December, 2019 at the Addo Kuffuor Conference room. • Mil. Hospitals Advisors letter dated May, 2019 to MOD for working visit to Afari by Advisors. • GHQ letter dated 8th July, 2019 submitting report of Mil. Hosp. Advisors to MOD. • PIU reports dated 23rd and 26th August, 2019 for visit to construction site at Afari. • MOD letter dated 3rd September, 2019 inviting PIU members for site visit. • PIU report dated 27th and 29th December, 2019 for the visit to construction site. • MOU between MOD and China Shipbuilding Trading Co. Ltd. on cooperation on 37 military hospital extension (phase III) project. • Agreement of cooperation between MOD and China Shipbuilding Trading Co. Ltd. on cooperation on 37 military hospital extension (phase III) project. • Progress report available dated 5th September, 2019. • Various correspondence to MoF seeking financial clearance to recruit.
	Commenced Phase III of the 37 Military Hospital Project	• Drafted Cabinet Memorandum. • MOD Letter dated 11th February, 2019 submitting draft contract agreement for legal advice of the Phase III of the 37 Mil. Hosp. Agreement to the AG's office. • Report dated 10th October, 2019 on technical visit to China Shipbuilding Trading Company (CSTC) facilities from 21st to 30th September, 2019. • MOD letter dated 28th February, 2019 requesting for a meeting to discuss the Phase III of the 37 Mil. Hosp. Agreement to the AG office • MoF decision on the construction of 37 military hospital between the

		Government of Ghana and SUMEC. • Memo dated 7th May, 2019 from JAG to the CD on the review of the contract documents for the construction of the 37 Mil. Hosp. (*as per the attached draft contract, technical specification, and other contract proposals* with SUMEC.). • MOD letter 14th November, 2019 to MOF for interest for long term credit insurance ***(Copy attached).*** • MOD letter dated 16th December, 2019 submitting letter of intent to CSTC. • Contract Agreement – No. 2019-3/EPC-Phase III of 37 Military Hospital-GOG-SUMEC. • Conditions of Contract for Plant and Design-Build. • Technical specification contractor's proposal. • Conceptual Design of Ghana Hospital.
5.	**Initiate the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding for the development Teshie Shooting Range into a Waterfront Community**	• MOD letter dated 14th January, 2019.on the draft Memo on the Teshie shooing Range into a Waterfront Community. • GHQ Letter dated 18th January, 2019 submitting a signed copy of the MOU to MOD. • MOD letter dated 25th January, 2019 for discussion with Radi Group after the MOU has been signed to GHQ. • Memo dated 20th November, 2019 from PPBME submitting report on the project to CD for his action after signing of MOU.
	Procure a Transactional Advisor for the construction of the C-in-C Sports Stadia in Tamale.	• CTRC letter dated 15th February, 2019 granting approval to award contract to Messrs Beads and Sons Company for the construction of the sports centre to MOD ***(PPA letter dated 30th November, 2018 attached).*** • CTRC letter dated 20th February, 2019 granting approval to award contract to Messrs Beads and Sons Company for the construction of the sports centre to MOD, following MOD's response addressing concerns raised by the Committee. • Memo dated 5th March, 2019 from Director, P & SCM to CD on approval to award contract for comments. • MOD letter dated 29th March for notification of award of consultancy contract to consultant Messrs Joe Kingsley Hackman. • MOD letter dated 26th April, 2019 to GHQ communication the services of the consultant for the construction of the sports centre at Tamale. • MOD letter dated 30th May, 2019 forwarding the contract document for consultancy services to GHQ for action. • Consultant acceptance letter dated 1st April, 2019 to MOD for the construction of sport centre in Tamale. • Signed contract document dated April, 2019 on the design and construction supervision for the construction of sports centre at Garrison, Tamale between MOD and the consultant. • Memo dated 20th March, 2019 from P & SCM to CD for approval to pay advance mobilization to the contractor. • GQH letter dated 23rd April, 2019 submitting payment certificate for release of funds to MOD ***(Consultant request attached).*** • GHQ letter dated 3rd July, 2019 submitting payment certificate for consultancy service to the consultant.

		• MOD letters dated 1st August, 2019 to NLA for payment of interim payment certificate ***(Consultant request attached).*** • Memo dated 26th March, 2019 from PPME to CD submitting dates for the sod cutting programme. • MOD letter dated 27th March, 2019 submitting information on the project to GHQ for the sod-cutting preparation. • MOD letter dated 23rd April, 2019 submitting sod cutting programme to the H.E. the Vice President ***(programme attached).*** • OoP letter dated 24th April, 2019 confirming the Vice President participation for the sod-cutting ceremony in Tamale. • Letter dated 3rd July, 2019 from the Office of the Chief of Staff – Certificate of payment. • Letter 1st August, 2019 from MOD to the National Lottories Authority requesting for payment of consultancy service for design and construction supervision for the construction of sports centre at 6 Garrison, Tamale for the GAF.
6.	**Continue the implementation of the earned dollar payment policy for deployed troops**	• GHQ letter dated 11th January 2019 for request for MINUSMA GHANENG COY 6. • Memo dated 14th January, 2019 from CD to Hon Minister for release for funds from the UNPKO Inflows. • MOD letter dated 16th January, 2019 for request for Transfer of Funds from the UNPK inflows. • GHQ letter dated 17th January, 2019 for the Transfer of Funds from PKO Account to MONUSCO GHANBATT IMPREST ACCOUNT (Congo). • MOD letter dated 18th January, 2019 for Request for Transfer of Funds from the UN inflows. • MOD letter dated 24th January, 2019 for request for funds for MINUSMA GHANENG Coy 7. • Memo dated 24th January, 2019 for Release for Funds for MINUSMA GHANAENG COY7. • MOD letter dated 29th January, 2019 for Request for Transfer of Funds from the UN inflows. • MOD letter dated 12th February, 2019 for Outstanding Financial Request and Release for the UN peace keeping Operation. • GHQ letter dated 19th February, 2019 for Transfer of Funds to Peacekeeping Operation account to Peacekeeping support operation Account. • GHQ letter dated 28th February, 2019 on the request for additional Funds – MONUSCO GH 14. • GHQ Letter dated 28th February, 2019 for the Transfer of Funds from Peacekeeping Operation Account to GHANCOY IMPREST account. (SOUTH SUDAN) • Memo dated 27th February, 2019 for the request for the release of funds from the UNPKO Account. • MOD letter dated 1st March, 2019. On Re: Transfer of Funds from the Peacekeeping Operation account to GHANCOY IMPREST account.

		• GHQ letter dated 1st March, 2019 to Transfer Funds from Peace Keeping Operation Account to MONUSCO GHANBATT IMPREST (Congo). • GHQ letter dated 7th March, 2019 to Transfer Funds from Peace Keeping Operation Account to MONUSCO GHANBATT IMPREST (Congo). • MOD letter dated 21st March, 2019 on the Transfer Funds from the Peacekeeping Operation Accounts. • MOD letter dated 9th May, 2019 on Re: Request for Transfer of Funds to UNIFIL GHANBATT. • MOF letters dated 30th May, 2019 requesting CAGD to transfer funds for troop's maintenance. • Memo dated 6th June, 2019. On the Approval to Release Funds from the PKO Imprest account to enable GHQ meet expenses for a trip to the democratic republic of Congo. • GHQ letter dated 6th June, 2019. On Re: transfer of funds UNIFIL GHANBATT in Lebanon. • GHQ letter dated 7th June, 2019 on Cash Payment Advice request for Funds for MONUSCO GH 15. • MOD letter dated 27th June, 2019. On Re: Transfer of Funds to UNIFIL GHANBATT in Lebanon. • CAGD letters dated 1st July, 2019 requesting CAGD to transfer funds for troop's maintenance. • MOD letter dated 5th July, 2019 on the Re: Transfer of Fund. • MOD letter dated 9th September, 2019 on the Re: Payment of troops allowance for Ghana contingent as part of the Ecowas mission in Gambia (ECOMIG). • GHQ Letter dated 30th September, 2019. On the Transfer of Funds from PKO's dollar account number to UNIFIL GHANBATT IN LEBANON. • Memo dated 14th October, 2019. On the request for the release of funds from the UNPKO Dollar account for Peace keeping Missions. • GHQ letter dated 14th October, 2019. On the Request for Transfer of funds from PKO's Dollar account number to GHNCOY Imprest Account (South Sudan). • GHQ letter dated 14th October, 2019. On the Request for Transfer of funds from PKO's Dollar account number to MONUSCO GHANBATT IMPREST ACCOUNT (CONGO). • MOD letter dated 14th October, 2019 request for the Transfer of Funds. • MOD letter Dated 8th November, 2019. On the Payment of Troops Allowance for Ghana Contingent as part of the ECOWAS mission in the Gambia (ECOMIG). • GHQ letters dated 11th December, 2019. On Cash Payment Advice for the request for the funds for MINUSMA GHANENG COY 7. • GHQ Letters dated 11th December, 2019. On Cash Payment Advice for the request for the funds for ECOMIG 3. • MOD letter dated 14th January, 2019 requesting for financial estimates for entitle personnel on Peace Mission and Personnel/ Logistics Requirement for troops to GHQ. • GHQ outstanding financial request and release of funds as at March 2019. • GHQ outstanding funds letter dated 1st February 2019 on the financial

		request and release for UN Peace Keeping to MOD. • MOD letters dated 12th March, 23rd April and 8th July all in 2019 requesting for release of funds for troops to MoF. • MOD letter dated 8th October and 17th December, 2019requesting for the release of funds for troops to MOF.
	Deploy Military troops for Internal Peacekeeping Operations	• MOD letter dated 14th January, 2019 requesting for financial estimates for entitle personnel on Peace Mission and Personnel/ Logistics Requirement for troops to GHQ. • MOD letters dated 23rd April, 16th June, and 6th June all 2019 requesting for funds to MOF to pay personnel for internal peacekeeping exercise. • MOD letters dated 21st and 25th February, 2019 to the National Security for release of funds requesting for funds to pay personnel for internal peacekeeping exercise. • -MOF letter dated 5th May, 2019 releasing an amount to pay troops. • -Statement on Operation Vanguard disbursement. • -MOD letter dated 28th June, 2019 on operation Vanguard, logistics/ sustenance requirement for ninth Quarter, 1st August – 31st October 2019. • Letter dated 4th September, 2019 on the update on the logistics requirement for operations CALM LIFE, CONQUERED FIST AND GONGONG. • -MOD letter dated 12th September, 2019. On the request for the release of funds to sustain operations calm life, conquered FIST and GONGOG. • MOD letter dated 4th October, 2019. 0n Re: Ghana Armed Forced Financial Requirement to support Internal Security Operations. • MOD letter dated 8th November, 2019. On RE: operation Fist revise operation concept. • MOD letters dated 5th March, 2019 requesting for funds to pay personnel for internal peacekeeping exercise. • MOD letter dated 27th March, 2019 submitting report on operation vanguard activities for the month of February 2019 to the Chairman of the Inter-Ministerial Committee on illegal Mining. • GHQ letter dated 18th September, 2019. On the Ghana Armed Forces Financial Requirement to support Internal Security Operations. • MOD letter dated 4th October, 2019 on GAF financial requirement to request for support for internal security operations. • MOD letter 24th December, 2019 to National Security for distribution of ammunition.

5.5 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations

5.5.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 19 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **57.8** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 19: Performance of CD, Employment and Labour Relations in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Score	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Strengthening legislative framework of the employment policy environment	National Labour Migration (NLM) Policy submitted to Cabinet. Domestic Workers Regulations (DWR) submitted to Cabinet for approval. National OSH Policy & Bill finalised and submitted to Cabinet	• Review Cabinet Memo and submit to Cabinet. • Review Cabinet Memo and submit DWR to Cabinet for approval. • Review Cabinet Memo and submit OSH Policy and Bill to Cabinet for approval.	**Target achieved.** Cabinet Memo for NLM Policy prepared with evidence of the CD's review and submitted to Cabinet**.** **Target not achieved.** DWR Joint Cabinet Memorandum prepared and forwarded to the Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection for the Hon. Minister's signature**.** **Document yet to be submitted to Cabinet.** **Target achieved.** Cabinet Memo for OSH Policy and Bill Prepared and submitted to Cabinet. Though Target	12	9.8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Score	
					Total	Awarded
				related to the submission of the documents to Cabinet, in the CD's role, it was indicated that the documents were to be submitted to Cabinet "for approval". This was definitely a decision that could not have been made by the CD since it was beyond him to decide on the action of Cabinet. The CD was accordingly penalised for this.		
2.	Operationalistion of Ghana Labour Market Information System (GLMIS)	Published the number of jobs created in 2019 through Government interventions GLMIS in five (5) additional pilot regions operationalized	• Review data collection templates • Forward data collection templates to MDAs • Collate information on number of jobs created • Submit information on number of jobs created to Minister for review • Publish the report • Facilitate Steering & Technical Committee	**Target achieved.** Published 1,637,122 jobs created through the following Government interventions, among others,**:** **NABCO (**100,000); **YEA (**125,200**);** **NEIP (**21,500) **;** **SSNIT (**611,397); **and PFFJ (**700) **Target achieved.** Functional Ghana Labour Market Information System (GLMIS) available and operationalised in five (5) Regions - Gt. Accra, Eastern, Ashanti, BA and Western. Also	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Score	
					Total	Awarded
		2018 Statistical Report developed and disseminated	meetings • Validate and approve request for logistics • Facilitate the distribution of logistics • Facilitate meetings of production team • Facilitate validation of draft 2018 Statistical Report • Review and approve draft statistical report • Approve printing and dissemination of 100 copies of 2018 Statistical Report	piloted in Central, Northern, Upper East and West and Volta regions. **Target achieved.** 2018 MELR Statistical Report published and disseminated to stakeholders**.**		
3.	Increasing employment opportunities for the youth across sectors	Facilitated implementation of the KOICA project for selected Farmer-Based Cooperatives in three (3) Northern regions	• Facilitate organisation of project steering meeting • Review project progress report	**Target achieved.** KOICA Project Implementation activities facilitated and progress reports reviewed. One hundred and five (105) Farmer-Based Co-operatives provided with farm equipment and start-up capital in the three (3) Northern regions.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Score	
					Total	Awarded
				Fifteen (15) officers trained in Korea. Eighty-three (83) Farmer-Based Co-operatives participated in a pre-harvest exhibition in Tamale.		
4.	Enhancing labour administration and promoting harmonious labour relations	Facilitated the implementation of EU GESP Programme Facilitated the construction of the Ghana-German Centre for Jobs, Migration and Reintegration commenced implementation of the GIZ project	• Facilitate the four (4) training programmes for staff under the project • Facilitate the procurement and distribution of equipment and refurbishment of selected offices • Review bi-annual project progress reports • Facilitate the construction of the Centre • Facilitate the training of staff under the project • Facilitate the procurement and distribution of equipment and refurbishment works • Facilitate the	**Target achieved.** Four (4) training programmes organised in batches for one hundred and twenty-seven (127) labour inspectors/officers. Nine (9) Public Employment Centres refurbished and Computers supplied**.** **Target achieved.** Ghana-German Centre for Jobs, Migration and Reintegration constructed and GIZ project commenced. Some project staff attended training in Abuja, Nigeria. List of items for distribution was available. Copy of power-point presentation on bi-annual progress report to steering	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Score	
					Total	Awarded
		Facilitated activities for the elimination of worst forms of child labour 2020 NDMW with National Tripartite Committee determined	review of bi-annual progress reports • Commemorate World Day against child labour in Ghana • Facilitate National Child Labour Steering Committee meeting • Facilitate NTC meetings • Review and disseminate Communiqué	committee meeting sighted. Reports on only the first meeting was available. **Target achieved.** World Day against child labour in Ghana commemorated. Two (2) Steering Committee meetings held and minutes available. **Target achieved.** 2020 NDMW and BP determined by the NTC. Four (4) NTC meetings held with minutes available. Copy of signed Communiqué verified.		
5.	Expanding access to labour protection services	Facilitated the establishment of one (1) regional pensions office in Sunyani Facilitated the establishment of the National Tripartite Committee (NTC) Secretariat	• Prepare draft speech for the Hon. Minister for the inaugural ceremony. • Assign Acting Head of the NTC Secretariat • Facilitate training for	**Target achieved.** Regional Pensions Office established in Sunyani with inaugural ceremony undertaken by the Hon. Minister. **Target achieved.** National Tripartite Committee Secretariat established.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Score	
					Total	Awarded
			Ag. Head of the NTC Secretariat	Acting Head of the Secretariat appointed and trained.		
Sub-Total					**57.8**	

5.5.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **28.18** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 20: Performance of Chief Director, Employment and Labour Relations in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 22nd August, 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 22nd August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 10th October, 2019 and approval granted on 15th October, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated July, 2019 available.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries. b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved. c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Three (3) Audit Committee meetings held and minutes dated 12th March, 30th July, and 30th December, 2019 available. • Summary actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee available. • Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Five (5) Entity Tender Committee Meetings dated 19th Feb., 11th March, 25th July, 27th July and 8th August, 2019 available. • Assets Register signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor available. • 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 22nd February, 2019.	**5**	**4.75**
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Organization Manual dated August, 2017 available. • Updated staff list available.	**10**	**9.35**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
• Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available. • Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 4th November, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 11th January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Reports and forwarding letters not clearly done. Documents submitted were not reports of the two phases.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 24th May, 2019 • Evaluation report submitted on 10th January, 2020 to OHCS		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 3rd May, 2019. • Mid and end year training implementation reports submitted to OHCS on 31st July, 2019 and 8th January 2020 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available. Not dated and not authored. • Queries issued to enforce discipline available.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite report available		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	but not authored and dated. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 7th November, 2019		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of three (3) meeting dated 31st May, 19th September, and 23rd October, 2019 available.	**2**	**1.625**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter (November, 2019) available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Service Charter for Labour Department and Factories Inspectorate available	**4**	**3.975**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available • CSU officers trained at the CSTC and EU. Back to office report available • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 1st July 2019 and 9th January 2020 respectively		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Facebook, Instagram and Twitter available. • Reports on quarterly website		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	updates available but not dated and authored. • Brochures available		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements	• The Ministry has installed an Electronic Records Management and Clock in System and enforced the wearing of name tags. • Activity undertaken through progress report received from Decentralised Departments and copies of reports available. • Media Tracking - early warning systems in place. • Minutes of eight (8) Management Meetings sighted out of twelve (12). • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. The Team advised the Ministry to work with the OHCS towards the development of a policy document on Gender Inclusiveness in the Civil Service. • Medical Screening held during the Civil Service Week celebration on 6th November, 2019. Report on nutrition on 19th July, 2019 held at the Ministry. • Internal information posted on notice boards, WhatsApp.	**5**	**4.58**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available. • No training or other records management activities undertaken.		
e. Management of physical environment	General improvement in the physical environment of the Ministry, including • Fire extinguishers serviced for safety; and • Electronic door fixed for improved security.		
Overall Total		**28.18**	

5.5.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 21 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 21:Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Employment and Labour Relations

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Change Management	Participate in a seminar	Participated in Sector Retreat on change management and improving performance with the EU TAT held in Sunyani, Ghana on 12th and 13th August, 2019.
2	Negotiation skills	Attend conference	Participation in 108th International Labour Conference (ILC) of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) held in Geneva from 10th – 21st June, 2019. Back to office report available.
3	Understanding Labour Migration Governance,	Participate in training	Participated in Capacity Development Training Programme on Labour Migration with GIZ held in

	Employment.		Mannheim, Germany, on 13th to 19th October, 2019.
4	Experience Sharing	Attend seminar	Attended this special event to share views on Ghana's action against child exploitation with JICA held in Yokohama, Japan, on 28th August, 2019.
5	Public policy	Participation meeting	Participated in the Inter-Ministerial Coordinating Committee (IMCC) on Decentralisation Meetings held in Sogakope, Ghana, on 18th to 19th July, 2019.
Sub-Total			10

5.5.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **95.980** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.5.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Chief Director mentioned that the exercise was useful and was glad his staff participated in it. He believed that their presence will let them appreciate some of the issues he had always raised during their working sessions. The CD stated that the Evaluation Team should take into consideration challenges faced by the Ministries which affected their work output. He informed the Evaluation Team that he had requested for two (2) Directors but OHCS was yet to take action on his request. This was having an effect on the work of the Ministry. He thanked the Evaluation Team for their comments which he promised he would take into account in his work.

Team's Remarks

The Evaluation Team advised staff to support the CD to succeed. They emphasized that collective effort was required for the attainment of institutional goals. The Team stressed on the importance of ensuring that documents were well prepared by providing for ownership and situating them through dates and wished the staff well for the 2020 reporting year.

Meeting with the Hon. Deputy Minister

The Deputy Minister was grateful for the Evaluation Team's presence and explained that the current substantive CD ensured the following:

- Daily briefing and de-briefing sessions to discuss issues with the political leadership which meant that the Hon. Minister and his Team were always abreast with issues relating to the Ministry;
- Worked with the Hon. Minister for the attainment of the goals of the Ministry;
- Meticulous records keeping of issues relating to the Ministry;

- Regularly organised management meetings and staff durbars with the participation of either the Minister or his Deputy; and
- Very proactive and interested in staff welfare and their motivation.

The Hon. Deputy Minister expressed his joy at having such a CD who contributed immensely towards the efficient management of the Ministry.

5.5.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	National Labour Migration (NLM) Policy submitted to Cabinet	• Letter dated 8th November, 2019, submitting Cabinet Memo on the draft NLM Policy to Cabinet for approval. • Cabinet Memo of the draft NLM dated 6th November, 2019.
	Domestic Workers Regulations (DWR) submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Memo dated 16th April, 2019, submitting Cabinet Memo on the DWR dated 23rd May, 2019, to Minister for review. • Evidence of review sighted. • Letter dated 27th August, 2019, submitting Cabinet Memo to Ministry of Gender for signing.
	National OSH Policy & Bill finalised and submitted to Cabinet	• Invitation letter dated 5th April, 2019, and Attendance Sheet of the validation meeting available. • Memo dated 8th May, 2019, submitting Report on stakeholder validation meeting. • Memo dated 8th July, 2019, submitting Cabinet Memo to Minister for review. • Letter dated 19th November, 2019, submitting Cabinet Memo dated 13th November, 2019, to Cabinet for approval.
2.	Published the number of jobs created in 2019 through Government interventions	• Copy of data collection templates. • Memo dated 4th March, 2019 requesting approval from Chief Director for employment data collection. • Letter dated 5th March, 2019 requesting MDAs to submit employment data. • Copy of summary sheet on number of jobs created across sectors for 2017 to 2019. • Memo dated 11th June, 2019 submitting the preliminary data on number of jobs created by various sectors between 2017– 2019. • Meet-The-Press Statement dated 15th August, 2019, by Hon. Minister announcing the number of jobs created across sectors.
	GLMIS in five (5) additional	• Letter dated 25th June, 2019 nominating representatives for the

TPAs	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	pilot regions operationalised	GLMIS Steering Committee. • Letter dated 25th June, 2019 inviting members for a GLMIS Technical Sub-Committee meeting. • Memo dated 4th July, 2019 handing over GLMIS logistics and distribution list for items received from the GIZ. • Memo dated 17th July, 2019, and 25th September, 2019, approving release of funds for GLMIS activities. • Letter dated 26th September, 2019, inviting stakeholders to review the usage of the GLMIS. • Memo dated 3rd September, 2019, submitting GLMIS Roadmap. • Minutes of meetings held between MELR and the Labour Department on the GLMIS dated; 28th June and 3rd October, 2019.
	2018 Statistical Report developed and disseminated	• Memo dated 18th January, 2019 inviting Directors and Units Heads for the 2018 Statistical Report preparatory meeting. • Letter dated 18th January, 2019 inviting Heads of Departments/Agencies for preparatory meeting. • Copy of draft 2018 MELR Statistical Report. • Invitation letter dated 9th December, 2019, inviting members for a validation meeting. • Memo dated 10th December, 2019, requesting CDs approval to print 2018 Statistical Report. • Letter dated 16th December, 2019, distributing printed copies of 2018 Statistical Report. • Evidence of review not available.
3.	Facilitated implementation of the KOICA project for selected Farmer-Based Cooperatives in three (3) Northern regions	• Letter dated 20th March, 2019, inviting project steering committee for a meeting. • Minutes of first Project Steering Committee meeting to review project implementation activities 3rd April, 2019. • Minutes of second Steering Committee meeting to review project implementation activities 26th September, 2019. • Memo dated 4th July, 2019 submitting progress report for review. • Copy of training report on sustainability of agricultural cooperatives in Ghana submitted for review. • Copy of training manuals – capacity development of farmer-based cooperatives farmer-based organization (FBOs) in Northern Ghana.
4.	Facilitated the implementation	• Letter dated 8th January, 2019 inviting members for training.

TPAs	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	of EU GESP Programme	• Copies of five (5) Training Reports available (sector performance management, Cabinet Memo writing, capacity building training, 9 PECs refurbished. • Memo dated 21st April, 2019 indicating distribution list of logistics (furniture, Vehicles and Motorcycles) to be procured. • Letter dated 20th May, 2019 nominating officers as Evaluators on the Evaluation Committee. • Email – dated 22nd July, 2019 notifying members of tender opening. • Copy of Project 2nd Progress Report and Memo dated 24th April, 2019, submitting report to CD for review. Evidence of review sighted. • Copy of 3rd Progress Report and Memo dated 3rd September, 2019, submitting report to CD for review.
	Facilitated the construction of the Ghana-German Centre for Jobs, Migration and Reintegration commenced implementation of the GIZ project	• Letter dated 4th April, 2019 on commencement of construction works after site inauguration with the schedule. • Memo dated 28th June, 2019 submitting back-to-office report on Trainer of Trainers (TOT) held in Abuja, Nigeria. • Memo dated 4th July, 2019 GIZ readiness to hand over equipment, with lists of items and distribution list. • PowerPoint presentation dated 19th August, 2019 presenting bi-annual progress report to steering committee. • Bi-annual progress report for first meeting sighted. • Bi-annual progress report for second meeting not sighted.
	Facilitated activities for the elimination of worst forms of child labour	• Minutes of 30th April, and 29th August, 2019 of the National Steering Committee on Child Labour. • Memo dated 4th February, 2019, submitting brief on the review of the Ghana Child Labour with evidence of review by CD. • Monitoring System and development of criterion for assessment of child labour free zones. • Report of 12th June, 2019 on the commemoration of world day against child labour with evidence of review by CD. • National Plan of Action II on elimination of worst forms of child labour.
	2020 NDMW with National Tripartite Committee determined	• Invitation Letters dated 25th March; 11th April; 23rd August; and 19th December, 2019, available. • Four (4) NTC Minutes available dated 1& 16 Apr; 26 Aug; and 23 Dec, 2019. • Copy of signed Communiqué of NDMW and BP.

TPAs	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
5.	Facilitated the establishment of one (1) regional pensions office in Sunyani	• Memo dated 10th June, 2019, submitting draft inaugural speech to Minister for review. • Press cutting of 5th July, 2019, from the Ghanaian Times for the inauguration of the Sunyani regional pension's office.
	Facilitated the establishment of the National Tripartite Committee (NTC) Secretariat	• Letter dated 11th April, 2019, appointing Acting Head of the NTC Secretariat. • Two (2) back-to-office training reports of the Ag. Head of the NTC Secretariat.

5.6 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Energy

5.6.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 22 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **42.35** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 22: Performance of Chief Director, Energy in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Strengthening the institutional and legislative framework	Revised National Energy Policy completed and submitted to Cabinet o Comments on draft policy submitted by team members o Final review meetings organised o Final draft submitted to Minister o Cabinet Memo Prepared and submitted for approval Gas Bill developed and submitted to Cabinet for approval o ToR finalized o Drafting sessions	• Review Committee's report and Cabinet Memo • Provide logistics for committee's work • Ensure provision of logistics to drafting committee • Review committee's Reports • Review Cabinet Memo	**Target not achieved.** Draft revised National Energy Policy available. Yet to be approved by Management and subsequent submission to Cabinet. **Target not achieved.** Drafting of the Gas Bill completed with the AG's Office and finalised.	10	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		o completed o First draft Gas Bill developed o Draft Bill finalized and submitted to Cabinet for approval National Petroleum Products Trade Policy and Implementation Plan developed o Hub Committee constituted o Draft Policy developed and circulated to stakeholders for comments o Stakeholder consultative meetings held o Draft Policy revised and finalized o Policy submitted to Cabinet for approval		However, Gas Bill not submitted to Cabinet. **Target achieved.** Policy aims at the establishment of a Petroleum Hub. Policy developed and submitted to Cabinet. Policy approved by Cabinet. Work going on with respect to the Bill to establish a Hub Development Corporation.		
2.	Upgrading power transmission and distribution network	Kumasi - Bolga-330kV transmission line completed and commissioned Aboadze-Prestea	• Review progress reports	**Target partially achieved.** The Aboadze - Prestea Line (Lot 1) is 100% complete.	10	7.9

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		330kV transmission line Project completed and commissioned		Kintampo- Tamale-Bolga Transmission line(Lot 2) 100% Complete. The Kumasi - Kintampo line (Lot 3) is lagging due to delays in payment of compensation to project-affected persons. CD's reviews available.		
3.	Increasing access to electricity	500 communities connected to the national electricity grid	• Facilitate release of funds • Review monitoring reports	**Target not achieved**. 445 communities connected to the national electricity grid as at December 2019: • SHEP 4 – 80 • SHPE 5 – 5 • CWE PHASE – 195 • HUNAN PHASE 1 – 106 • WELDY LAMONT – 59	10	6.7
4.	Increasing penetration of Renewable Energy in power generation mix	1.60kW Tsatsadu hydropower constructed • Construction at 30% completion	• Review monitoring reports • Review Monitoring Report • Facilitate	**Target achieved.** 60kW Tsatsadu hydropower constructed. Project in use. Tsatsadu mini hydropower project	10	7.75

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		• 60% completion • Project commissioned 2.Three (3) mini-grids in island communities in Ada completed and commissioned • EPC contractor procured • Construction at 50% completion • Technical commissioning • Official Commissioning 3.Procured and distributed 20,000 solar lanterns in poor off-grid rural communities • 20,000 lanterns procured • 8,000 lanterns distributed • 12,000 lanterns	release of funds • Approve requests from beneficiaries • Facilitate release of funds at MoF • Review monitoring reports	status report available with CD's review, dated June, 2019. **Target not achieved.** Contract initialled for the three (3) mini-grids in island communities Project not started due to delays in getting guarantee. **Target not achieved.** Distributed 16,587 and list available. Procurement processes initiated for 100,000 solar lanterns.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		distributed 4.Installation of 65kWp solar system Ministry at the Energy Building completed • Procurement process completed • Commence installation • Technical commissioning • Project commissioned		**Target achieved.** Installation of 65 KWp Solar System at MoEn Office Building completed and operational. Project commissioning undertaken. Pictorial evidence available.		
5.	Instituting competitive bidding process in the award of petroleum blocks	Five (5) Petroleum Blocks awarded on competitive basis to competent Companies • Bids from pre-qualified companies received • Bids evaluated • Negotiations and signing of agreement completed • Contract Agreement submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Provide Logistics for Committee	**Target not achieved.** EOI from prequalified Companies opened on 25th May and three (3) Companies submitted bid: • ENI Ghana Exploration and Production Ltd. • Aker Energy Ghana Ltd. • TULLOW Ghana Ltd. Process on-going towards award of blocks .	10	7

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
6.	Facilitating access to safe, clean, adequate, reliable and cost effective petroleum products such as LPG for domestic, commercial and industrial use	CRM implemented on a pilot phase in Kumasi and in Accra • CRM pilot phase commenced in Kumasi • CRM second pilot commenced in Accra	• Review Monitoring Reports on Pilot projects from NPA • Ensure Ministry's participation at committee meetings	**Target not achieved.** Areas for the pilot phase changed to Kade and Kwaebibirim. Stakeholder sensitisation consultations have been undertaken. No reports available	10	5
Sub –Total					**42.35**	

5.6.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **26.815** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 23: Performance of Chief Director, Energy in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement available and forwarded to OHCS on 25th April, 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 8th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs	• Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
self-assessment report	self-assessment and submitted to OHCS on 30th August, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan undertaken. Report dated 19th August, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4.75**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Three (3) meetings held and Minutes dated 5th March, 29th May and 5th September, 2019 available • There was a report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 8th Feb: 8th July and 3rd December 2019, available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Assets Register updated and signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 10th May, 2019		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.75**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual dated 2018 available		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available		
• Individualised job	• Individualized job schedules for		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	all staff available • Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 3rd January, 2020.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 30th April, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Planning Phase report dated 31st January and mid-year phase report dated 28th June, 2019 available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 28th May,2019. • Evaluation report submitted to OHCS on 19th February 2020 instead of January 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 5th March, 2019. • Mid and end year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 10th January, 2020.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January - December available • Internal memo on efforts to enforce discipline dated 10th January, 2020 submitting a report to CD, available (query on misconduct).		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analysed reports dated 10th January, 2020 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 11th December instead of November 2019.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of one (1) meeting dated 3rd May, 2019 available.	**2**	**0.875**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation **b.** Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Service Charter available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Department Charter – not available. • Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers not trained. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS 26th June, 2019 and 2nd January, 2020 respectively. • Functional website, WhatsApp platform, Twitter, Instagram, face book, corporate email, Info-graphics available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Flyers, brochures available.	**4**	**3**
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Shared folders created on their server and assigned access right to each Directorate to ease work at the Ministry. • Monitoring reports through comments from clients on Twitter, Facebook. Reports on Cylinder redistribution and solar lanterns at the sub-national level, available. • Media Tracking-, newspaper cuttings and analyses available.	**5**	**4.54**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of seven (7) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of two (2) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. • Organized Free Eye screening for Staff and education on Glaucoma on 10th April, 2019, Health Education on Health Spine and Healthy for Life on 13th June 2019, Health talk on 22nd October 2019 and report available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available – letter dated 24th March and 30th August, 2019 on decongestion and transfer of records. Memo dated 18th March, 2019 from Dir., GM requesting for part-payment on the decongestion and transfer of records to PRAAD. • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Memo dated 24th December, 2019 on Report on the Management of the Physical Environment – Installation of the Solar Panels, tiling of floors, cleaning of the environment.		
Overall Total		**26.815**	

5.6.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 24 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 24:Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Energy

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Legal Principles in Maritime Boundary Delimitation	Participate in meeting	Led the Technical Aspects of Maritime Boundaries Delimitation Negotiations with Togo and Cote d'Ivoire and learn the Legal Aspects in the meetings throughout the year as follows: i. Technical Sub-committee Meeting in Aflao on 29th January, 2019. ii. 4th Meeting in Lome from 29-30 April, 2019. iii. 5th Meeting in Accra from 22-23 August 2019. Partnered International Legal Brains to research and publish papers on Boundary negotiations and delimitation throughout the year.
2	Management	Attend training	Induction Course for Newly Appointed Chief Directors organised by Office of the Head of the Civil Service (OHCS) from 18-22 March Civil Service Training Centre.
3	How to protect the Deep Sea • Understanding the role of Regional Environmental Management Plan (REMP) & Regulations for Exploitation of Mineral Resources in the Area	Attend conference	Attended the 25th Session of the Council of International Seabed Authority (ISA) from 25th Feb. – 5th March, in Kinston, Jamaica.
4	Management of the Maritime Domain of Ghana for safe exploration of the Seabed Resources	Participate in conference	Attended the 20th Session of United Nationals Open – ended Informal Consultative Process on Oceans and the Law of the Sea 10-14 June New York. Attended 29th Meeting of States Parties to UNCLOS (SPLOS/L.80) 17-19 June 2019.
5	Understanding Renewable Energy Technologies	Attend symposium	Attended Ghana Renewable Energy Fair & Energy Symposium Accra, 7th to 11th October 2019.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.6.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **79.165** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.6.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD mentioned that in the Agreement wishes were sometimes provided as achievable targets and this had definitely affected the deliverables with respect to Schedule 1.There was also the problem of getting documents together for the evaluation exercise and he hoped that in coming years, every effort would be made to get things better organised. The staff with the CD expressed their appreciation of the exercise and said they had learnt, at least, that all Directorates had to ensure that targets set were duly achieved. Up to date reports would need to be made available to the CD who would then ensure that these were appropriately reviewed in line with the Agreement.

Team's Remarks

The Team advised the CD that realistic targets should be set and subsequently take advantage of mid-year to review them if necessary. The Agreement should be used as a living document rather being referred to only during the mid-year and evaluation exercises. Dates for deliverables should be monitored to ensure that due dates for activities as well as targets were adhered to. They indicated that the evaluation process made one understand and appreciate the importance of team work and it was critical for every member of staff to understand his/her role in the attainment of the goals of the CD as set out in the Agreement. The exercise should not be viewed as punitive but one aimed at determining the strengths and weaknesses of staff as a means of improving the performance management culture in the Civil Service.

5.6.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Revised National Energy Policy completed and submitted to Cabinet • Comments on draft policy submitted by team members • Final review meetings organised and final draft submitted to Minister • Cabinet Memo prepared and submitted for approval	• Draft National Energy Policy from Energy Commission dated 12th April, 2019 submitted to Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 20th May, 2019 from CD submitting comments and requesting EC to provide logistics for policy team. • Memo dated 16th May, 2019 from Co-ord. PMU to CD and Hon Minister submitting comments on draft energy policy. • Copy of track changes on draft Policy. • Letter dated 21st August, 2019 to the Energy Commission requesting for sponsorship for a retreat to finalize work on the final draft of 2019 National Energy Policy. • Memo dated 6th September, 2019 from Co-ord. PMU to CD informing members of the meeting on final draft of the National Energy Policy. • Memo from C/PMU dated 12th December2019 requesting date for presentation to Management on

		the Revised Policy. • Memo dated 6th January, 2019 for presentation to Management. • Copy of Presentation of the Policy to Management.
	Gas Bill developed and submitted to Cabinet • ToR finalised • Drafting Sessions completed • First Draft Developed • Bill Finalised and submitted to Cabinet	• Email dated 9th April, 2019 to Committee Members calling meeting on TOR. • Letter dated 20th June, 2019 from Ministry to Ghana Gas informing them to nominate Technical Committee for the preparation of Gas Bill. • Copy of drafting instructions – Gas Act for Ghana from the Consultant. • Copy of memo dated 26th June, 2019 from Director Legal to CD, copy to Hon. Minister forwarding the first draft Bill. • Letter dated 9th July, 2019 from the Ministry to the AGs Office requesting for an Attorney to serve on a technical committee Email dated 5th July 2019 to committee members calling meeting on draft Bill. • Email dated 13th August 2019, to committee members to conclude discussion with the consultant on the sections that concerns them. • Email dated 27th August from legal department to committee members to submit comments. • Letter dated 30th September, 2019, to AG for review and drafting of the Bill. • Memo dated 9th April, 2019 from legal secretariat to Director Administration requesting for logistics for committee's work. • Memo dated 16th July, from legal secretariat to director admin. Requesting for logistics for committee's work. • Memo dated 15th August, 2019 from legal secretariat to General Admin. Requesting for water.
	National Petroleum Products Trade Policy and Implementation Plan developed • Hub committee constituted • Draft policy developed and circulated to stakeholders for comments • Stakeholders consultative meetings held	• Transmittal letter dated 22nd January, 2019 requesting for approval from Cabinet on the establishment of Petroleum Hub in Ghana. • Copy of Cabinet Memo dated January, 2019. • Letter dated 15th February, 2019 from OOP to Hon. Minister on approval of the establishment of Petroleum Hub. • Publication on13th March, Daily Graphic on the establishment of a petroleum hub.

	• Draft policy revised and finalized • Policy submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Copy of Cabinet Memo with draft Policy Document • Letter dated 28th February, 2019 from the Ministry submitting the draft Ghana Petroleum Hub development corporation Bill – Request for review. • Letter dated 18th March, 2019 to the MoF requesting for the release of funds for Petroleum Hub activities. • Letter dated 1st August, 2019 from the Attorney-General to the Hon. Minister forwarding comments on the petroleum Hub Development Corporation Bill, 2019. • Copy of AG's comments on Bill. • Copy of draft Petroleum Hub Development Corporations Bill dated 1st August, 2019. • Minutes dated 7th August, 2019. • Letter dated 26th September, 2019 from LUSPA to the Hon Minister on development of Petroleum Hub in Ghana – revised Budget for the preparation of Spatial Plans. • Letter dated 15th October, 2019 from EPA to the Ministry submitting a revised budget and workplan for the strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) of the petroleum infrastructure master plan. • Letter dated 11th December, 2019 to the PPA requesting for approval to single source consumer bureau ltd and land resource management center (A joint venture) for the development of petroleum Hub in Ghana. • Response letter dated 28th December, 2019 from the Ministry to the Touchstone Capital Partners submitting a letter of appreciation for expressing interest for the Ghana Petroleum Hub product.
2.	Kumasi - Bolga-330kV transmission line completed and commissioned	• Letter dated 16th April, and 10th July, 2019 from GRIDCO forwarding first and second quarter progress Report on Kumasi – Bolgatanga transmission line to the Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 25th June, 2019 from GRIDCO forwarding notification of completed projects to the Hon. Minister. • Review Comments and actions by CD – dated 25th April and 16th July, 2019. • Letter dated 21st June, 2019 from MoF (MOE) to OoP requesting for approval for Gov't guarantee to

		cover GRICO's obligations. • Letter dated 16th July, 2019 from OoP to MOF approval request. • Memo dated 7th August, 2019 from D/Distribution to CD on monitoring report. • Letter dated 8th August, 2019 from Parliamentary Service to MoF (MOE) communicating approval of First Demand Guarantee Request. • Letter dated 7th October, 2019 from GRIDCO to Hon. Minister on notification of completed project dated 24th December, 2019. • Letter dated 23rd October, 2019 on quarter 3 Progress Report. • AGs letter dated 23rd October, 2019 on Legal Opinion on GRIDCo's opinion on AFD facility. • Letter dated 28th November, 2019 from MoF to the Ministry on the submission of Joint Cabinet Memo on first demand government guarantee to cover GRIDCO's obligations under the AFD Credit Facility for counter signature. • Memo dated 21st November, 2019 from D/G&T to CD On third quarter progress report. • Memo dated 4th December, 2019 on first demand Guarantee GRIDCo/AFD. • Joint Cabinet Memo for Government Guarantee GRIDCo & AFD) Cabinet ref MoF letter dated 19th December 2019. • Memo dated 18th December, 2019 from G&T to CD on fourth quarter site monitoring.
	Aboadze-Prestea 330kV transmission line Project completed and commissioned	
3.	500 communities connected to the national electricity grid • SHEP 4 – 80 • SHPE 5 – 5 • CWE PHASE – 195 • HUNAN PHASE 1 – 106 • WELDY LAMONT - 59	• Memo dated 18th June, 2019 from Director, Audit on supply of materials. • Letter dated 27th June, 2019 to Minister for Finance on Advance Payment Guarantee on SHEP. • Letter dated 3rd July, 2019 to Minister for Finance on Advance Payment Guarantee on SHEP. • Minutes of 7th, 8th, 9th, 10th, 11th, 12th, 13th& 14th site monthly progress meetings held on 12th April, 17th May; 21st June, 19th July, 23rd August, 12th September, 25th October, 22nd November, & 28th November, respectively.

		• Request for Logistics for Material Inspection and Factory Acceptance Test in India (Memo dated 13th September, 2019). • Letter dated 6th August, 2019 on material and equipment delivery at warehouse. • Letter dated 2nd October, 2019 from the Ministry to the Hon Minister MoF submitting Financing proposal for rural electrification project in Volta, Oti, Bono East, Bono, Ahafo and Ashant Regions – priority projects. • Letter dated 10th& 22nd October, 2019 to MoF with invoices for supply of materials for streetlight projects. • Memo dated 23rd October requesting for logistics for Commissioning of SHEP Projects in the Northern Region. • Memo dated 14th November, 2019 from DD, General Administration to CD requesting for logistics for inspection of conductors and Pole top accessories at MMU, Kpone-Tema. • Memo dated December 23, 2019 from Director, distribution to CD on summary of completed electrification projects for 2019. • Memo dated 14th November 2019 on logistics for inspection of conductors and accessories at MMU. • Letter dated 9th July, 2019 forwarding reports on the 9th site Monitoring meeting – CDs minutes dated 10th July, 2019 available. • Letter dated 12th September, forwarding letter on 11th site meeting – CD's minute dated 17th September 2019. • Letter dated 8th August, 2019 forwarding reports on 10th site monitoring meeting – Ag. CDs minute 13th August 2019. • Letter dated 12th November, 2019 forwarding reports on 13th site monitoring meeting – Ag. CDs minute dated 15th November 2019. • Letter date 16th December, 2019 forwarding letter on 14th site monitoring meeting – CD"s minute 19th December, 2019. • Letter 18th June, 2019 from MOE to MoF requesting payment for the supply of the 150 LED.

4.	60kW Tsatsadu hydropower constructed • Construction at 30% completion • 60% completion • Project commissioned	• Memo dated 4th July, 2019 from D. Ren. & Alt. Energy, to CD, CC Dep. Min. Power, forwarding progress report on the Tsatsadu Hydro Power project – CDs minutes dated 4th July. • Copy of status Report from BPA dated July, 2019. • Letter dated 9th August, 2019 from Ministry to Eunitack Services Ltd. inviting them for a meeting to discuss contract termination and other matters. • Memo dated 17th September, 2019 from DD/General Administration to CD requesting logistics for inspection. • Memo dated 26th September, 2019 from DD/General Administration to CD requesting logistics for inspection. • Letter dated 29th October, 2019 from MOEN to office of the president requesting for date of commissioning. • Memo dated 12th November, 2019 from Ag. Dir Ren. & Alt energy to CD requesting for streetlights and fixtures.
	Three (3) mini-grids in island communities in Ada completed and commissioned • EPC contractor procured • Construction at 50% completion • Technical commissioning • Official Commissioning	• Emails between April and June, 2019 from SECO to Ministry, giving 'No objection' to the supply and installation of the Mini Grid. • Presentation prepared by the Ministry to the 5th Mini-Grid Action Learning Ghana Clean cooking Forum – Thursday 27 June. • Copy of opening remarks by the Dep. Minister for Energy during the 5th World Bank Mini Grid Learning Event. • Key note Addresses by Hon. Senior Minister and the Hon. Minister. • Closing remarks by CD. • Letter 14th June, 2019 from the Ministry to the Hon Minister MoF on design, supply and installation of 65KWP Solar PV for Ministry of Energy – Invoice for payment in favour of Elecnor SA. • Email dated 11th July, 2019 from SECO to GEDAP forwarding their comments and request further adjustment. • Memo dated 17th September, 2019 from GEDAP Coordinator to Hon. Minister. CC CD requesting for grant from ARB APEX Bank residual fund. – CD's mint. Dated 24th sept. 2019.

	Procured and distributed 20,000 solar lanterns in poor off-grid rural communities • 20,000 lanterns procured • 8,000 lanterns distributed • 12,000 lanterns distributed	• Memo dated 28th August, 2019 from D/Ren & Alt. energy to Hon. Min. through CD on procurement of solar lamps. • Letter dated 23rd July, to Paul Asare Ansah responding to the request for solar lights – receipt dated 24th July, 2019. • Memo dated 8th August, 2019 for distribution of old stock. • Procurement processes for 100, 000 solar lanterns initiated as per memo dated 28th August, 2019. • Sample Request letters for issuance of solar lanterns, approval letters, payment receipts and distribution list (Memo dated 8th August, 2019). • Report on Impact assessment on distribution of Solar Lanterns in the Western Region: Amenfi West District.
	Installation of 65kWp solar system Ministry at the Energy Building completed • Procurement process completed • Commence installation • Technical commissioning • Project commissioned	• Presentation to management on the completion of 65KWp solar system installation dated July 2019. • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from Director Ren to CD, requesting for payment for the installation of 65kWp project. • Letter dated 14th June, 2019 to MOF requesting for requesting for release of Funds on the supply and installation of 65kWp Solar PV.
5.	Five (5) Petroleum Blocks awarded on competitive basis to competent Companies • Bids from pre-qualified companies received • Bids evaluated • Negotiations and signing of agreement completed • Contract Agreement submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Memo dated 18th January, 2019 from Coordinator, LRC to Hon Minister through CD reporting o evaluation of application for EOI and Pre-qualification under the 2018/2019 Licensing round. • Letter dated 21st January, from the Ministry to Total Petroleum and ENI acknowledging receipt of their EOI. • Letter dated 13th February from the Ministry to Aker Energy Ghana Ltd. inviting them to submit proposal on Blocks 5 & 6. • Letter dated 7th March, 2019 to Tullow Ghana. Acknowledge receipts on enquires. • Memo dated 25th June from Dir. Government Relations to Hon. Min. through CD submitting report on Evaluation of the bids. • Letter dated 26th June, 2019 from Ministry to AGs Office request for Gazette Publication of bidders. • Memo dated 5th July, 2019 from Director

		Government. Relation to Hon. Minister through CD submitting Guidelines on Licensing Round. • Pictorial evidence on the opening of the bids. • Ghanaian Times publication dated 4th July, 2019 on ENI & Vitol, First E&P win oil blocks • Letter dated 21st March, 2019 from CD to Hon. MoF requesting for approval to use fees accruing from licensing round. • Responds from MOF as per letter dated 31st May, 2019. • Memo dated 30th September, 2019 from GA to CD requesting for launch – CD's minute - 30th sept. 2019. • Letter dated 2nd October, 2019 from the Ministry to the HM MoF on sharing of revenue accrued from the 2018/2019 Oil and Gas Licensing round.
6.	CRM implemented on a pilot phase in Kumasi and in Accra • CRM pilot phase commenced in Kumasi • CRM second pilot commenced in Accra	• Letter dated 10th January, and 12th April, 2019 from NPA inviting the Ministry to a review of risk assessment meeting. • News Papers publications on stakeholder engagement in 19th July, 2019. • Letter dated June 3, from NPA inviting the Ministry to a stakeholder meeting. • Memo dated 5th July, from DD Downstream to CD forwarding the 2019 1st and 2nd quarter monitoring reports – CDs comments available. • Minutes of meetings of National LPG policy implementation committee dated; 14th March, 27th March and 2nd July, 2019. • Email threads of meetings on bulk cylinder procurement strategy on 7thMarch 2019. • Report on status national LPG promotion policy. Memo dated 25th October, 2019.

5.7 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation

5.7.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 25 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **49.4** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 25: Performance of CD, Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Link research output to industry and commerce	Ecosystem study and Business case for the Ghana Innovation and Research Commercializatio n (GIRC) Centre developed.	• Facilitate the engagement of a consultant to prepare the ecosystem analysis and business case study reports for the Centre • Ensure the organization of two (2) stakeholder consultations	**Target achieved.** TOR for procurement not dated. Each consultation merited a mark of 2.5. Only one (1) stakeholder consultation was organized and report with evidence of CD's review available.	10	7.4
2.	Provide a National Research and Development (R&D) facility for big Data analysis	High Performance Computers (HPC) Centre Operationalized	• Facilitate at least 3 technical committee meetings on the establishment of the HPC Centre. • Ensure the installation of the High Performance Computers (HPC).	**Target not achieved.** The Centre not yet been operationalized due to technical challenges associated with the supply of High Voltage Power equipment. Hence Target not achieved. Three (3) technical	10	5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Coordinate the launch of the HPC Centre.	meetings were held and computers cleared from the Team port but yet to be installed.		
3.	Environmentally sound management of E-waste	1.Contractor to construct the Hand Over Center (HOC) selected 2. Steering committee for (FC) Project set up	• Review tender document for selection of contractor • Consider and approve proposed Evaluation Panel • Invite MDAs NGOs/CSOs to nominate reps to serve on Steering Committee • Constitute and inaugurate Steering Committee for FC component of E-waste project • Ensure the	**Target not achieved since the contractor for the project was not selected although** Tender documents were forwarded to the Development Partners for no-objection. Evidence of review of the Tender Document sighted. An evaluation panel for the review of Tender documents was constituted and approved. **Target achieved.** The CD established the Project Steering Committee. Committee was inaugurated and One (1) meeting organized. All relevant documentation sighted.	10	8.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			organization of 1 project Steering Committee meetings.			
4.	Sustainable land and Water resources Management (SLWM)	1. SLWM technologies implemented in the 5 Northern Regions	• Ensure project Steering Committee meetings are convened • Facilitate the release of funds for project activities • Review project quarterly reports • Facilitate the procurement process	**Target achieved.** SLWM technologies deployed to beneficiary farmers in the 5 Northern Regions. One (1) Project Steering Committee meeting organised with minutes available. Funds released for approved project activities. Project progress reports for all four (4) quarters reviewed and approved. It will be necessary to be more specific with this Target in future. The number and types of technologies will need to be indicated.	10	10
		2. Farm inputs for farmers to carry out sustainable	• Facilitate the release of funds for procurement	**Target achieved.** Contracts signed with various suppliers for the		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		land and water management technologies procured.	of farm inputs • Review reports on technologies being applied by farmers	procurement of Farm Inputs and documents available. Minutes of Entity Tender Committee (ETC) available. CD facilitated the release of funds and evidence of review of reports on technologies being applied by farmers available.		
5.	Work with National and International partners to leverage funds to implement climate change in Ghana	1. Ghana Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC) investment forum organised and Ghana NDC implementation and investment plan launched 2. Sectoral Monitoring Reporting and Verification (MRV) systems developed in line with the UNFCCC reporting structures for two highest	• Ensure the conduct of the forum and meeting to launch investment plan • Review TOR for recruitment of a consultant • Sign Contract with selected consultant • Review and approve report on established sectoral MRV system	**Target achieved.** Concept Note and report on Forum prepared. Investment plan launched and report available. **Target achieved** ToR developed with evidence of review by CD. Consultant procured and contract signed. Report on the established Monitoring Reporting and Verification (MRV) system reviewed and approved.	10	9.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		priority NDC sectors 3. Economy-wide Ghana NDCs mitigation targets for two highest priority NDC sectors disaggregated and refined. 4. Dams rehabilitated, channels repaired and water sources desilted	• Organise validation workshop on the reports on the established sectoral MRV systems • Review TOR for recruitment of a consultant • Sign Contract with selected consultant • Review and approve report on Disaggregated and refined economy-wide NDC mitigation targets • Organize validation workshop on the reports on Disaggregated and refined economy-wide NDC mitigation targets • Review TOR to facilitate the participation of the Hon. Minister in the commissioning	Validation workshop organized and report available. **Target achieved.** TOR for recruitment of a consultant reviewed. Contract with consultant signed. Validation Workshop report on Disaggregated and Refined economy-wide NDC mitigation targets reviewed and approved. **Target achieved** though it would have been more appropriate to have had a Target which was more specific indicating location/numbers of dams and water sources. Undated ToR for consultant for the commissioning of the Dams prepared and reviewed by the CD awaiting the Hon. Minister's approval.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			of the dams and channels for rehabilitation and repairs • Review and approve report of rehabilitated dams and channels	Report on rehabilitated Dams and Channels available but not dated.		
6	Promote good Environmental governance in the oil and gas industry	1. Working session for Parliamentary Select Committee on Environment organised. 2. Communication Strategy for Environmental Management Policy for oil and gas developed	• Sign letters inviting Hon. MPs • Approve Memo for the release of funds • Sign letters to invite stakeholders to workshop • Approve Memos for release of funds	**Target achieved.** However, Target not clear on what was the aim of the working session. The Ministry submitted the policy document on Good Environmental Governance in the Oil and Gas Industry to the Parliamentary Select Committee. Report on the working session was available but not dated. **Target achieved** Communication Strategy for Environmental Management Policy for oil and gas developed. Workshop report	10	9

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				available but not dated.		
Sub-Total					**49.4**	

5.7.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **27.47** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 26: Performance of Chief Director, Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**4**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 15th January 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 15th July 2019 and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 15th August 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 28th August 2019 and approval granted.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated June, 2019 available.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January 2020.		
KRA 2- Financial Management		**5**	**4.25**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Team sighted minutes of three (3) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 5th February, 21st May and 27th August 2019. • There was report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 20th June 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory of items provided and dates of acquisition not indicated for all items. Documents signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 27th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.7**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual Dated (2017) available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	to OHCS on 12th December 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisal Report available and forwarded to OHCS on 2nd April instead of January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument were available and forwarded to OHCS on 4th July 2019.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 22nd May 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 4th February 2020 instead of by 30th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 5th March 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on 8th July and 18th December 2019 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available. • Internal Memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 31st July, 28th November and 29th November 2019, available.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analysed reports dated 2nd April, 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 9th December instead		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of one (1) meeting dated 12th June 2019 available.	**2**	**0.875**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Letter dated 28th October 2019 requesting for approval from the Civil Service Council available. • Service Charter for EPA available copy forwarded to OHCS on 20th November 2019.	**4**	**3.975**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 25th June 2019 and 6th January 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Report on Environmental Days celebrations, Pictures on Minister's engagement with Media and WhatsApp platform available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available but not dated. • Newsletters, brochures (MESTI DIGEST, January - June) and flyers available.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**4.67**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• The Ministry has installed an Electronic clocking system for staff.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring report dated January, 2019 on the SLWM Project was available. • Media Tracking - Content Analysis of Newspapers was available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of ten (10) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of two (2) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. • Report on Medical Screening and Sensitization of staff available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available. • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Quarterly reports on the management of the physical environment were sighted. Security lights installed and painting done.		
Sub-Total		**27.47**	

5.7.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 27 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 27:Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	**PLANNED ACTIONS**	**CD's PERFORMANCE**
1	Knowledge in environmentally sound and socially responsible options for E-waste recycling in Ghana	Attend Workshop on Recycling Options and Fund Management for E-waste	Participated in workshop on Recycling Options and Fund Management for E-waste, in Aburi. Lessons Learnt – Economically feasible options for management of the National E-waste fund. • Letter of invitation to workshop participants • Attendance sheet • Workshop report dated May, 2019
2	Improved knowledge in Globally Harmonized System (GHS) of Chemical classification and labelling	Participate in Workshop on Implementation of Globally Harmonized System of Classification and Labelling of Chemicals in Ghana	Participated and Chaired Opening Session of workshop on Implementation of Globally Harmonized System of Classification and Labelling of Chemicals in Ghana, Accra in January 2019 Lesson Learnt – The need for, and the advantages to Ghana in adopting the Globally Harmonized System of classifying and labelling chemicals used in the country. • Workshop report dated January, 2019 • List of participants

3	Acquire knowledge in the work of a Chief Directors	Participate in a 5-day induction course for newly appointed Chief Directors	Participated in induction course, Accra in March 2019 Lessons Learnt - Orientation to the work of a Chief Director. e.g how to relate with political leadership; Performance management; Managing resources of the Sector. • Certificate of Participation • Report on Induction Course dated April, 2019
4	Knowledge in Sustainable and optimal recycling chains for E-waste	Participate in Policy dialogue on E-waste Collection and recycling in Ghana	Participated in IAIA Conference on Cumulative Impacts of human /development activities on the environment in Brisbane, Australia 29th April - 2nd May 2019 Lessons Learnt – Need for greater public / community engagement in IA. Need for stricter environmental regulations and policies to promote environmental enforcement and compliance. • Certificate of Training • Back to office report
5	Knowledge in Policy Dialogue	Participate in a Policy dialogue on E-waste collection, Disposal and Recycling	Took part in a Policy Dialogue for E-waste collection, Disposal and Recycling at the Ibis Hotel, Accra in October 2019 • Report on Policy Dialogue
Sub-Total			**10**

5.7.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **86.870** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.7.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD mentioned that the exercise was successful and had taken note of the feedback provided. She indicated that the mid-year monitoring was useful since it helped her team to organise their documents for the end of year evaluation. She thanked the Evaluation Team for their time and effort.

Team's Remarks

The Team was appreciative of the level of preparedness of the CD and her team and advised on the following:

- Issues raised during the exercise should be taken seriously and addressed;
- Officers should be encouraged to work harder to exhibit their full potential in order to improve upon the performance of the Ministry;
- In spite of the limited resources, the CD should endeavour to be innovative to enable her meet institutional goals/targets.

5.7.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MoVs)
1.	Ecosystem study and Business case for the Ghana Innovation and Research Commercialization (GIRC) centre developed.	• Reviewed ToR for procurement of Consultant not dated. • Forwarding memo from Director (STI) to Ag. CD dated 11th December, 2018. • Five (5) Institutions invited to submit proposals for Consultancy. Letters dated 2nd January, 2019 on request for Expression of Interest to five (5) institutions signed. • Contract between MESTI and STEPRI dated 25th February, 2019 to prepare the Ecosystem analysis report. • Contract between MESTI, Consultants and Funding partners dated 25th April, and 29th April (for Ghana) and 13th May, 2019 (for Kenya). • Letter of invitation to workshop dated 29th March, 2019. • Memo dated 17th April, 2019 forwarding Workshop report to CD. • Workshop Report dated 3rd April, 2019. Evidence of CD's review.
2.	High Performance Computers (HPC) Centre Operationalized	• Memo from Director (STI) to CD dated 28th January, and 19th November, 2019 for funds for TC meetings. • 3 Minutes of TC meetings dated 31st January, 13th June, and 29th November, 2019 • Participants' attendance sheets. • Memo from Director (STI) to CD dated 16th January, 2019 for release of funds for levy on shipment of HPC. • Memo dated 28th March, 2019 from Director (STI), through CD to Minister submitting Interim report on HPC.

		• Interim report to Minister. • Memo from Director (STI) through CD to Minister dated 15th August, 2019 submitting HPC installation requirements. • Memo dated 2nd September, 2019 submitting estimates for power cooling and fire suppression installations.
3.	a. Contractor to construct the Hand Over Center (HOC) selected b. Steering committee for Project set up	• Reviewed Tender documents for selection of contractor. • Email dated 11th December, to KfW requesting for NOB for Tender Documents. • Memo approving Evaluation Panel dated 18th December, 2019. • Draft contractor advert for the Dailies –invitation for Bids. • Letter dated 7th March, 2019 inviting MDAs/NGOs/CSOs for nominations on to SC. • Invitation letters dated 7th June, 2019 for inaugural meeting of SC. • Minutes of SC meeting of 19th June, 2019. • Invitation letter dated 13th November, 2019 to SC meeting. • Minutes of SC meeting of 21st November, 2019.
4.	a. SLWM technologies implemented in the 5 Northern Regions b. Farm inputs for farmers to carry out sustainable land and water management technologies	• Minutes of meeting dated 2nd May, 2019. • Letters inviting SC members to meeting dated 26th April, 2019. • Signed memos from Director (Environment) to CD for the release of funds for project activities dated 5th March, 26th March, 23rd July, 27th August, 2019 etc. • Reviewed 1st 2nd 3rd and 4th quarter project progress reports dated April, July, October, 2019 and January, 2020 respectively. • Signed memos dated 11th April, 12th July, 11th October, 2019 and 14th January, 2020 from Director (Environment) to CD forwarding the 4 quarterly reports respectively. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee dated 20th June, 2019. • Contracts between MESTI and New Spirit Agro Chemicals for procurement of inputs dated 26th June, 2019. • Contract Agreements dated 11th and 12th June, 2019 between MESTI and

	procured.	Hengrave Ventures and Kejaw Enterprise respectively. • Signed Contract Agreement dated 20th August, and 2nd October, 2019 between MESTI and Calm Bridge Enterprise and East Light Limited respectively. • Signed Memos dated 5th March, 2019, 9th April, 2019, 23rd July, 6th August, etc. for release of funds. • Reviewed report on technologies being applied by the farmers dated July, 2019. • Reviewed report on Farm Inputs supplied to farmers in 2019 dated July, 2019. • 2 Memos from Director (Environment) to CD both dated 15th July, 2019 submitting report on Adopted SLM Technologies and also Farm Inputs Supplied.
5.	a. Ghana Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC) investment forum organised and Ghana NDC implementation and investment plan launched. b. Sectoral Monitoring Reporting and Verification (MRV) systems developed in line with the UNFCCC reporting structures for two highest priority NDC sectors. c. Economy-wide Ghana NDCs mitigation targets for two highest priority NDC sectors disaggregated and refined.	• Concept note for launch dated 12th February, 2019. • Forwarding memo from Dir (Environment) to CD dated 14th February, 2019. • Report on forum and launch of Ghana's NDCs dated March, 2019. • CD's statement for opening and closing one of the Sessions dated 18th and 22nd March, 2019 respectively. • Reviewed TOR for recruitment of Consultant **not dated.** • Meeting with consultant on 3rd January, 2019. • Signed Contract (Addendum) between MESTI and Dr. Albert Ahenkan dated January, 2019 (Original) and 1stApril, 2019 (Addendum) for consultancy services to develop MRV systems. • Reports on established Sectoral MRV systems dated April, 2019. • Workshop report dated 23rd October, 2019.

	d. Dams rehabilitated, channels repaired and water sources desilted.	• ToR for recruitment of consultant. • Memo from Dir (Environment) to CD forwarding ToR dated 18th December, 2018. • Signed contract between MESTI and Dr. George Manful original dated 2nd January, 2019 and extension dated 1st April, 2019. • Inception and Actual report on disaggregated NDCs dated January and October, 2019 respectively. • Validation Workshop held on 11th October, 2019. Workshop report dated 23rd October, 2019. • ToR for commissioning, rehabilitation and repair of dams and channels not dated. • Report on rehabilitated dams and channels from 3rd – 7th March, 2019. Report not dated.
6.	a. Working session for Parliamentary Select Committee on Environment organised. b. Communication Strategy for Environmental Management Policy for oil and gas developed	• Signed invitation letters dated 11th February 2019. • Memo from Director (Environment) to CD for release of funds dated 11th February 2019. • Invitation to a workshop dated 26th February, 2019. • Statement by Deputy Minister. • Signed memo from Director (Environment) to CD dated 28th February, 2019 forwarding Report on Parliamentary Select Committee meeting – **not dated**. • Copy of Invitation letter dated 7th November 2019. • Memos from Dir (Environment) to CD for release of funds dated 6th August and 25th October 2019 for Expert Review and the development of Communication Strategy respectively. • Copy of Final Communication Strategy **(Not published).** • Workshop reports reviewed dated 22nd November, and 31st December, 2019, **not dated.**

5.8 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Finance

5.8.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected eight (8) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of seven point five (7.5). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 28 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table. The CD obtained the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 28: Performance of CD, Finance in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Improving revenue mobilisation	At least 90% of the revenue target collected Quarterly revenue mobilization review meetings with the GRA organized	• Coordinate the quarterly revenue mobilization review meetings with GRA to improve revenue performance	**Target achieved.** End of year revenue target met. 90% of the end of year revenue performance target met. Revenue performance reports (presentations) available. The 2019 domestic revenue target was GH¢45,270 million, of which the projected outturn is GH¢42,381 million. Quarterly revenue mobilization review meetings with the GRA organized and action point arising out of the meetings available.	7.5	7.5
2	Benchmarking Petroleum Revenue for Annual Budgeting	2020 Benchmark Petroleum Revenue Report developed Prepare 2019 Annual Report	• Constitute the benchmark revenue estimation committee. • Review technical committee report	**Target achieved.** 2020 Benchmark Petroleum Revenue Report developed and available. Technical committee report available.	7.5	7.5

		on Petroleum Funds and submit to Parliament Petroleum revenue distributed on a timely basis	• Engage an Independent Consultant to certify Petroleum Benchmark Revenue. • Submission of the Report of the Consultant regarding certification of the Petroleum Benchmark Revenue • Consultant report on the certification of the Petroleum Benchmark Revenue received	2019 Annual Report on Petroleum Funds prepared and submitted to Parliament on 13th November 2019 with the 2020 Budget Statement and Economic Policy. Petroleum revenue distributed on a timely basis throughout the year and report available. Independent consultant to certify petroleum benchmark revenue engaged and report from the consultant available.		
3.	Enhancing the preparation of a credible national budget	Ministries engaged in Technical Hearings organized to ensure coverage of Government priority areas in the 2020 Budget Fiscal Strategy Document prepared and submitted 2020-2023 Budget Guidelines	• Coordinate the organization of budget implementation reviews and technical hearings to receive inputs from MDAs • Request input into 2020 budget statement • Review draft Fiscal Strategy Document(FSD) and submit to HM for approval	**Target achieved.** Ministries engaged in technical hearings organized from 3rd -20th September 2019. Report available. Review meetings held with MDAs implementing the 16 priority programmes from 11th – 20th June 2019 Fiscal Strategy document, 31st May, 2019, prepared and submitted to Cabinet. 2020-2023 Budget Guidelines prepared and issued to all MDAs.	7.5	7.5

		prepared and issued Mid-year review of the 2019 Budget prepared 2020 Budget finalized, published and distributed to key stakeholders	• Submit the 2020 FSD to Cabinet for approval. • Review draft Budget Guidelines for 2020 -2023 • Coordinate the preparation of the initial draft 2019 mid-year review document • Finalize the 2019 mid-year budget review document • Review and publish the 2020 Budget	2019 Mid-year Budget Review prepared and submitted to Parliament on 29-07-19 and published on the MoF website by 31st July 2019. 2020 Budget Statement and Economic Policy presented and distributed to Parliament as required by law on 13th November 2019 and published on the MoF website the same day. Budget implementation review meetings and technical hearings organized from 11th – 20th June 2019 and 3rd -20th September 2019 respectively and reports available. Draft fiscal strategy document reviewed and submitted to HM for approval. 2020 FSD submitted to Cabinet for approval. 2020-2023 Budget Guidelines prepared and issued to all MDAs. Initial draft of 2019 mid-year budget review document prepared and available. 2019 mid-year budget review document		

				finalized and presented to Parliament on 29-07-19. 2020 Budget finalized and presented to Parliament on 13-11-19. Document available.		
4.	Improving the structure of Public Debt	2020-2023 MTDS collected, collated and prepared 2020-2023 MTDS Report finalized and published on MoF website	• Set up a team to collect, collate, and prepare 2020-2023 MTDS • Review draft MTDS and forward to Hon. Minister for approval • Submit draft 2020-2023 MTDS to Cabinet • Publish MTDS on MoF website	**Target achieved** Draft 2020-2023 MTDS prepared and submitted to Cabinet on 29-11-19 2020-2023 MTDS document finalized and published on MoF website on 31-12-19 Team set up to prepare the 2020-2023 MTDS Draft 2020-2023 MTDS Report submitted to Cabinet for approval. Approval from Cabinet available. 2020-2023 MTDS published on MoF website on 31-12-19.	7.5	7.5
5.	Enhancing participatory budgeting	Inputs from CSOs and the public on the 2020 budget solicited 2020 Citizens Budget prepared, published. Organize public fora to	• Solicit inputs from CSOs and the public for the 2020 Budget • Approve adverts in the National Dailies requesting for inputs into the preparations of the 2020 budget statement	**Targets achieved.** Inputs for the 2020 budget solicited from CSOs and the public and report available. 2020 Citizens Budget prepared and published on 13-11-19 Six public fora organised to disseminate the 2020 budget including: o Engagement with	7.5	7.5

		disseminate of the 2020 Budget	• Set up a team to draft the Citizen's budget • Review draft Citizen budget and submit to Hon. Minister for approval • Facilitate public fora to disseminate the 2020 Budget • Dissemination Report on the 2020 budget.	Government communicators on 12-11-19; o Engagement with members of the Institute of Financial and Economic Journalists on 18-11-19; o Engagement with Parliamentary Press Corps on 18-11-19; o Brown Bag Seminars for MoF staff from 21-26/11/19; o Engagement with Parliamentarians; and o Media engagements by member of the Economic Management Team. Adverts soliciting inputs from CSOs and the public placed in selected national dailies on 21-08-19. Dissemination report on the various public fora prepared and available. Citizens' Budget 2020 produced and available.		
6.	Enhancing citizen participation in decisions around resource extraction along the value chain	2017/18 GHEITI reports for mining and oil/gas sectors produced. 2018 petroleum reconciliation report produced and submitted to	• Sign contract with consultant on behalf of the Ministry to produce 2017/18 GHEITI reports on mining and oil/gas sectors • Coordinate the production of the annual petroleum	**Targets achieved.** 2017/18 GHEITI Reports for mining and oil/gas sectors submitted by consultant in December 2019. 2018 Petroleum Reconciliation Report produced and submitted	7.5	7.5

		Parliament	reconciliation Report. • Submit reconciliation report to Parliament	to Parliament by 29th March, 2019. Contract of Consultant to produce the 2017/18 GHEITI reports on mining and oil/gas sectors signed on 17th September, 2019. Annual Petroleum Reconciliation Report produced. Annual Petroleum Reconciliation Report submitted to Parliament.		
7.	Reporting to parliament on the status of public debt	Collect and collate data for 2018 Annual Public Debt Report	• Set up a Team to collect and collate data for 2018 Annual Public Debt Report • Submit draft Report to Cabinet for consideration • Review 2018 Public Debt report and forward to Hon. Minister for approval • Submit 2018 Annual Public Debt Report to Parliament	**Target achieved.** Team constituted to collect and collate data for the 2018 Annual Public Debt Report 2018 Annual Public Debt Report submitted to Cabinet.	7.5	7.5

8.	**Developing and publishing a fiscal risk statement**	2018 Fiscal Risk Statement developed and published on MoF website	• Collect and collate data for 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement • Constitute a technical team to validate inputs for the 2018 Fiscal Risk • Review draft report and forward it to HM for approval • Publish fiscal risk statement and upload onto the website	**Target achieved.** 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement developed and published on MoF website on 15-09-19 Data for Fiscal Risk Statement collected Technical team to validate inputs for the 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement constituted 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement reviewed 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement published on the website by 31st March 2019	7.5	7.5
Sub-Total						**60**

5.8.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **29.65** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 29: Performance of CD, Finance in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 26th June, 2019 instead of February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 15th July 2019 and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 29th August 2019 and approval granted		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated February, 2020 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 14th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Five (5) meetings held and minutes dated 17th April, 13th June, 30th August and 31st October, 2019 and 27th December, 2019 available. • Report dated June 2019 on actions taken to address issues		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	arising from meetings of the committee available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of eleven (11) meetings available		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Assets Register signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.75**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Revised Organization Manual Dated June 2019 with evidence of MSD's participation available. • Updated staff list dated 5th September 2019 available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff dated April 2019 available. • Establishment levels available.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 31st January 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases dated 4th March and 28th August 2019 respectively available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of	• Composite signing report dated		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	8th May 2019 available and submitted to OHCS on 29th May 2019. • Soft copy of evaluation report emailed to OHCS on 31st January 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process emailed to OHCS on 11th March 2019 • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 5th July and 19th December 2019 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• 1st and 2nd Quarter reports on staff attendance were available. 3rd and 4th Quarter reports not available • 2019 Annual Report on staff discipline dated 30th December, 2019 available. Copies of queries to security officers on duty attached.		
g. Report on staff movements	• 2019 Annual Staff Movement Report dated 30th December 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 29th November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meeting dated of 1st February 2019, 1st July, 8th October and 3rd December, 2019 available	**2**	**2**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	**4**
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter dated December 2019 available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Service Charter for GRA and Securities and Exchange Commission available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained by L'Aine Services Limited and report dated November 2019 available. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 5th July 2019 and 13th January 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Facebook, Twitter, Google plus, LinkedIn, YouTube. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Ghana Ministry of Finance Newsletter (March-April, 2019) available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives	• Innovations in organizational operations continue to be introduced such as Divisional / Unit WhatsApp platforms; Document Management and Workflow System has been developed and went live in September, 2019.	**5**	**5**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations			
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Re-introduction of MoF staff ID system to simultaneously simplify employee and visitor identification.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Roll out of MoF physical access control system to automate staff attendance and ensure enhanced security is 80% complete. • Analysis of annual Budget Implementation reports submitted by MDAs and MMDAs; and Minutes of monthly meetings with GRA to track / monitor revenue policies. • Media Tracking- Daily news compilations on finance and economic issues. Bi-weekly news summaries on trending issues • Press releases and rejoinders issued on topical issues relating to the Ministry; and Responses to Parliamentary Questions by Hon. Minister. • Physical Decentralisation Unit liaises with the District Assemblies on Budget Implementation. • Municipal Finance Bill being drafted • Minutes of weekly Management Meetings sighted • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen - Gender steering committee formed to coordinate a draft gender policy for the Ministry • Employee well-being policy dated December 2018 available • Report on employee well-being programme 2019 available (organised seminars on lifestyle, health walk and aerobics, breast cancer and HIV/AIDS Awareness, health screening and blood donation exercise).		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards • Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available - MoF engaged PRAAD for record survey and transfer of files to the National Records Center – letter dated 28th May 2019 from PRAAD – Response To The Ministry's Request for Inspection and Advice on Decongested Records • Letter from MOF to PRAAD dated 17th May, 2019 • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Report on the management of the physical environment was sighted. Security lights installed and painting done, among other things.		
Overall Total		**29.65**	

5.8.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 30 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 30: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Finance

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Presentation on Budget Implementation	Attended a Workshop	Gave a presentation on critical issues in Budget Implementation for Chief Directors at the Civil Service Training School in March 2019.
2	Regulatory Impact Assessment Leadership and Management Seminar	Attended a Seminar	Participated in a seminar on Regulatory Impact Assessment organized for Chief Directors in April 2019.
3	High Performance Leadership	Attended a Seminar	Attended a seminar on High Performance Leadership at Oxford University London United Kingdom in May 2019.
4	Annual Meetings of the IMF/World Bank	Attended a conference	Attended the 2019 IMF/World Bank Annual Meetings in Washington D.C. USA from 14-20 October 2019.
5	Topical Issues	Participated in MoF Brown bag seminars	Participated in brown bag seminars organized within the Ministry.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.8.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **99.650** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.8.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD thanked the team and OHCS for their continuous support in promoting the concept of performance management in the Civil Service. CD indicated that the exercise was useful and it provided opportunity for staff to keep their eyes on the job. The process helped with internal team building since Officers were made aware of the fact that their inactions could affect the performance of the Chief Director and hence the Ministry. Officers present mentioned the extensive support received from the OHCS Team during the mid-year review thereby making the collation of documents and report writing much easier.

Team's Remarks

The Team thanked the CD for the able manner that he had organised himself for the exercise. They reiterated the importance of performance management to ensure the survival of institutions. They saw the exercise as helping to promote teamwork and also as a means of improving efficiency and the performance management culture in the Civil Service.

5.8.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	At least 97.5% of the revenue target collected Quarterly revenue mobilization review meetings with the GRA organized	• Signed letters dated 7th January, 2019, 28th June, 2019, 15th August, 2019 and 22nd October, 2019 inviting the Commissioner-General and his team to review revenue performance in January, May, July and December 2019 respectively. The meetings were held on the 3rd floor conference room of MoF. • Signed four individual letters of invitation to the GRA dated 7th January, 2019, 28th June, 2019, 15th August, 2109 and 22nd October, 2019. • Reviewed Action Points of the previous meetings to ensure that MoF had executed all the tasks assigned to it during the quarterly meetings. • Approved the agenda for the meetings through memos from Head, Tax Policy Unit to Chief Director on the subject "Invitation to Revenue Meeting". The memos are dated 8th January, 2019, 28th June, 2019 15th August, 2019 and 30th October, 2019.
2.	2020 Benchmark Petroleum Revenue Report developed Prepare 2019 Annual Report on Petroleum Funds and submit to Parliament Petroleum revenue distributed on a timely basis	• Approved eight individual memos dated 5th March, 2019, 8th April, 2019, 13th May, 2019, 6th August, 2019, 7th August, 2019, 25th September, 2019, 2nd December, 2019 and 27th December, 2019 from Head, EPU to the Hon. Deputy Minister(s) requesting approval to authorize the CAGD to distribute the petroleum revenues that have accrued to the state as communicated by the national oil company, GNPC, in letters dated 21st February, 2019, 19th February, 2019, 9th April, 2019, 7th May, 2019, 7th August, 2019, 26th September, 2019, 2nd December, 2019, and 30th December, 2019. • Technical Committee to estimate the benchmark revenues constituted. • Signed a letter dated 29th July, 2019 nominating and inviting members to a working session at Mensvic Hotel East Legon. • Technical committee report dated 25th August, 2019 reviewed. • Approved memo dated 26th August, 2019 from Head, EPU to the Chief Director forwarding the referenced document for review.

		• Independent consultant to certify petroleum benchmark revenue engaged. • Advertisement was placed in the Ghanaian Times on 15th May, 2019 to request expression of interest for the assignment. • Consultant's report certifying the Petroleum Benchmark Revenue received. • The referenced report dated 31st August, 2019 was received on 2nd September, 2019 and included in the 2020 budget.
3.	Ministries engaged in Technical Hearings organized to ensure coverage of Government priority areas in the 2020 Budget Fiscal Strategy Document prepared and submitted 2020-2023 Budget Guidelines prepared and issued Mid-year review of the 2019 Budget prepared 2020 Budget finalized, published and distributed to key stakeholders	• Approved a memo from the Economic Strategy and Research Division dated 31st May, 2019 requesting approval from Hon Minister to forward Fiscal Strategy Document to Cabinet for approval as required by the PFM Act 2016 (Act 921). • Letter dated 13th August, 2019 signed by the Hon. Minister forwarded the 2020–2023 Budget Guidelines to all MDAs. • Authorized a memo dated 21st May, 2019 and letter from the Ag. Director of Budget to the Coordinating Director (Operations) titled "Invitation to Meeting: 2019 budget implementation review". • The meetings were held on the 3rd floor conference room MoF and the attendance sheets are attached. • Report capturing discussions and agreements prepared by the Budget Team was ready by 28th June, 2019. • Approved memo from Head, FPU dated 31st May, 2019 on the subject "Submission of 2020 FSD" requesting approval and submission of Fiscal Strategy Document to Cabinet. • Signed letter dated 31st May, 2019 transmitting the 2020 FSD to Cabinet for approval. • Letter dated 13th August, 2019 signed by the Hon. Minister forwarded the 2020 – 2023 Budget guidelines to all MDAs. • Approved memo dated 24th June, 2019 from Head Budget Development to Chief Director and signed memo to Directors requesting data and write-ups for the mid-year review. • Signed memo dated 26th June, 2019 inviting Directors and Heads of Units to attend a meeting to review the inputs submitted. • Signed two memos dated 16th July, 2019 and 22nd July, 2019 on the subject "Finalization of 2019 mid-year fiscal policy review invitation to off-site workshop" inviting Directors to finalize the document. • Signed memo dated 28th October, 2019 inviting Directors and other technical officers to a workshop to finalize the draft 2020 Budget. • 2020 Budget published on the MoF website on 13th November, 2019.
4.	2020-2023 MTDS collected, collated and prepared	• Letter dated 9th September, 2019 sent out requesting data from stakeholders. • Technical committee constituted through letter dated 18-09-19

	2020-2023 MTDS Report finalized and published on MoF website	which requested nominations and invited nominees to a working session at the Ministry of Finance Conference Room from 1st October, 2019 to 8th October, 2019. • Draft MTDS reviewed and forwarded to Hon. Minister for approval through memo dated 22nd November, 2019. • Signed transmittal letter dated 10th December, 2019. • Cabinet approval granted for the 2020-2023 MTDS on 24th December, 2019.
5.	Inputs from CSOs and the public on the 2020 budget solicited 2020 Citizens Budget prepared, published. Organize public fora to disseminate of the 2020 Budget	• Adverts soliciting inputs from CSOs and the public placed in selected national dailies on 21st August, 2019. • Signed memo and letter dated 26th August, 2019 inviting stakeholders to a meeting on the 2020 budget scheduled for 30th August, 2019 at the Holiday Inn Hotel, Airport. • Signed memo and letter dated 26th September, 2019 and 27th September, 2019 respectively inviting business leaders to a breakfast meeting on 2nd October, 2019 at the Movenpick Ambassador Hotel. • Team set up to draft the citizens' budget through a memo dated 28th October, 2019. • Draft citizen budget reviewed by Hon. Minister. • Invitations extended to the under-listed stakeholders inviting them to a workshop to disseminate the 2020 budget. o Government Communicators. o Members of the Institute of Financial and Economic Journalists. o Parliamentary Press Corps. o Mof Staff. o Parliamentarians. o Media engagements.
6.	2017/18 GHEITI reports for mining and oil/gas sectors produced. 2018 petroleum reconciliation report produced and submitted to Parliament	• Authorized the signing of letter dated 22nd January, 2019 inviting the Technical team working on the Reconciliation Report to a workshop at Mensvic Hotel from 30th January, 2019 to 1st February, 2019.
7.	Collect and collate data for 2018 Annual Public Debt Report	• Signed letter dated 31st December, 2018 requesting nominees to constitute technical team. • Authorized Coordinating Director (Operations) to sign a letter dated 18-01-19 requesting data for the preparation of the report. • Signed letter dated 23rd November, 2018 to relevant stakeholders requesting inputs for the 2018 fiscal risk statement. • Letter dated 12th December, 2018 signed by Coordinating Director (Operations) requesting nominees and inviting them to

		a workshop to validate inputs into the 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement. • Approved memo dated 13th March, 2019 from Head, FRU on the subject "Publication of 2018 Fiscal Risk Statement" to HM forwarding the draft report for approval.

5.9 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture

5.9.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 31 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **42.6** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 31: Performance of Ag. CD, Fisheries and Aquaculture in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1	Sustaining Fisheries Resources Management	1. Two-Months Closed Season for Industrial Fleets implemented 2. One-Month Closed Season for Artisanal fleets observed	• Write correspondence to stakeholders and Facilitate logistics for stakeholders' sensitization on Closed Season and Co-Management Policy • Review stakeholders' engagement and Closed Season Committee reports • Facilitate production of short documentaries on Fisheries Resource Management for broadcast on GTV • Inform Cabinet and Parliament on the Closed Season • Facilitate announcement of 2019 Closed Season	**Target achieved** for Two-Months Closed Season (July - August) for Industrial Fleet. Stakeholder's engagement held on 5th February, 2019 and report available. A documentary on fisher-folks showing their bumper harvest after the closure was available. **Target achieved** for One-Month Closed Season (15th May - 15th June) for Artisanal fleets. Report on 4-day closed season monitoring in the Central and Western Regions available.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
		3. Co-Management Policy finalized and submitted to Cabinet	• Submit Cabinet Memo to purchase patrol boat and research vessel for MCS operations • Submit Cabinet Memo for the establishment of Data Centre • Submit Co-Management Policy to Cabinet • Gazette Co-Management Policy	**Target achieved** with Draft Co-Management Policy prepared and submitted to Cabinet for approval. The Ministry has received feedback and the Minister is to appear before the appropriate Cabinet sub-committee. Team noted that the purchase of the Research Vessel and the establishment of the Data Centre had no direct bearing on the Target		
2.	Ensuring effective and efficient distribution, sale and administration of Premix fuel	1. Landing beaches restructured and number of landing beach committees reduced by 50% 2. Premix diversion and inappropriate distribution prevented	• Review NPF Committee minutes and reports • Undertake Field visits to Landing Beach Committee Sites	**Target not achieved** since no evidence was provided on the reduction in the number of Landing Beach Committees as well as the restructuring of the Landing beaches. **Target achieved.** Premix Fuel Secretariat established with a Committee to reduce incidence of diversion of the premix fuel.	12	3.6

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		3. Premix Fuel Database improved		Committee meetings held and minutes sighted with no evidence of review by CD. Tracking devices installed in the vehicles transporting premix fuel to reduce diversion. **Target not achieved** No evidence provided on this Target. The field visits were not undertaken. Generally, the CD's roles did not address all the Targets.		
3.	Reviewed and consolidating fisheries regulations into a harmonised Act	1. Consolidated Bill submitted to Cabinet by the end of the year	• Constitute Legal Review Coordinating Committee • Facilitate the work of the committee • Review final report from FAO Legal Consultant • Request cabinet for review of the law • Organise stakeholder consultations on draft bill	**Target not achieved.** Legal Review Coordinating Committee constituted and 2 meetings held. This project is donor funded with support from USAID and FAO. Technical report from FAO "A review of fisheries and related legislation in Ghana"	12	3

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Review and submit draft report to Attorney-General • Organise stakeholder validation on AG's report • Forward bill to cabinet	available. Due to the different views of the reports from USAID and FAO, the Ministry has decided to procure a consultant to study the reports and come up with recommendations for Cabinet consideration.		
4.	Developing Aquaculture	1. Aquaculture for Food and Jobs (AFJ) Programme implemented i. James Town Prison Camp supported ii. Pilot farms and institutions identified	• Write sponsorship letters • Facilitate the selection of sites • Review report on site selection • Review AFJ implementation report • Facilitate implementation process and activities • Field visits to farms	**Target achieved.** Pilot Phase of AFJ is being implemented – pictorial evidence available. **Target achieved** James Town Prison Camp supported with 3,000 fingerlings and 235 bags of fish feed. Two (2) additional ponds of $400m^2$ constructed. **Target achieved** Beneficiary Institutions are: James Town Prison Camp, Two second cycle institutions (T.I. Ahmadiyya & Osei Tutu SHS) and three Youth Associations (Wenchi Youth, Daboase Youth &	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
		ii. Pilot youth trained in Aquaculture		Adansi Pentecost Youth Associations) 321 youth have so far been trained in aquaculture. The Team advised the CD to develop a Strategic Framework for the Implementation of Aquaculture Project at Manso-Mim (Ashanti Region). It was also necessary to document properly the experiences being gathered from the pilot projects to guide future developments.		
5.	Developing Fisheries Infrastructure	1. Construction of James Town Mini-Harbour commenced by end of the year	• Supervise activates of Landing sites construction committee • Facilitate necessary logistics for both projects • Review project reports from consultants • Supervise signing of Implementation	**Target achieved.** Preliminary works completed including the signing of implementation Agreement and in-depth design. Contractors have been engaged (China) and project handed to the Ministry of Transport (GHAPOHA)	12	**12**

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
			Agreement			
		2. Phase one of Anomabo Fisheries College Project completed	• Facilitate clearing of harbor project site • Facilitate travel documentations and facilities for Chinese personnel • Facilitate project sites visits • Review/reconstitute implementation steering committee of Anomabo Fisheries College	**Target achieved.** Collaborating with UCC to ensure admission starts by September with modular programmes. Evidence of review/reconstitution of Implementation Steering Committee provided.		
Sub-Total					**42.6**	

5.9.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **14.983** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 32: Performance of CD, Fisheries and Aquaculture in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance – Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	1.9
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Not submitted.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Submitted on 3rd September, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Not available.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Not available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• Submitted on 20th instead of 15th January, 2019.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		5	2.5
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Minutes of meetings dated 26th Feb., 18th Sept., 2019. • No report for summary of actions.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement Plan available. • Minutes of ETC meeting dated 20th Feb., and 5th Aug., 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated			

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• Inventory available. • Submitted to CAGD on 28th Feb., 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate. • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline	• Organizational manual dated 2016 available. • Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules available. • Establishment Level available but not well prepared. It showed just the list of staff not the variance. • Not available. • Planning phase report not available but mid-year report sighted. • Directors did not sign Agreement. • Directors Evaluation Report not submitted. • Plan available emailed to OHCS on 8th March 2019. • Training implementation report not available. • Monthly attendance report available. • Enforcement of Discipline – queries available. • Available but not sighted by the CD and quality not acceptable.	**10**	**5**

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
g. Report on staff movements	Did not address impact of movements. • Promotion Register available dated 5th Nov., 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List available • Minutes of meeting dated 29th January, 2019	**2**	**0.875**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Draft Charter available. • Department Charter not available. • CSU available. • No training for staff of CSU. • Mid-year report available dated 20th August, 2019. • End of year report – not submitted. • Website functional. • No website updates. • Have brochures and flyers but could not show copies as evidence.	**4**	2.5
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements	• Evidence of innovation not available. • Report on Monitoring of sub-national level activities not available. • Media Tracking report not available • Two (2) Management meetings held and minutes dated 31st Jan., and 15th March, 2019 available. • Two (2) staff Durbars held –	5	2.208

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives e. Management of physical environment	11th Jan., and 23rd Dec., 2019. • Gender Inclusiveness- Has a focal person but report on activities not available. • Supported staff to pay medical bills. • Internal newsletters not available but use of notice board. • No engagement with PRAAD. • Evidence of training for records officers available. • Satisfactory • Clean washrooms • Security office available • Ministry in new premises		
Sub-Total		**14.983**	

5.9.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 33 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 33: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Fisheries and Aquaculture

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Financial skills	Training	Participated in Finance for non-finance executives organized by the State Interests and Governance Authority at City Escape Hotel, Prampram on 23rd November, 2019 and Certificate available.
2	Policy Analysis & Stakeholder Engagement	Stakeholder's engagement	Participated in the 6th National Policy Summit, from 26th -27th May, 2019 and Certificate available.

3	Project Governance	Meeting	Participated in the Anomabo Steering Committee meeting dated 18th October, 2019 and Certificate available.
4	Cooperate Governance	Participate in Workshop	Participated in the Ghana Extractive Industry, Biodiversity and Transparency, Aqua Safari 12th -13th October 2019 and Certificate available.
5	Cooperate Governance	Participate in Conference	Participated in the 28th African Cooperate Governance Conference, South Africa and Certificate available.
Sub-total			**10**

5.9.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **67.583** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.9.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD acknowledged that the exercise was useful and also provided Officers an opportunity to:

- know more about their strengths and weaknesses;
- learn during the interactions through the sharing of experiences;
- gather ideas on how to organise documents for future evaluation exercises as well as to help with their own work;
- implement programmes and projects effectively;
- appreciate the importance of detailed documentation and proper records keeping;
- work harder towards the attainment of goals; and
- value team work.

Team's Remarks

It was obvious the Ag. CD had not sighted most of the documents tendered in as evidence. The Agreement should be a living document and a daily reference manual for the Ag. CD. A schedule officer should be put in charge of the document for the effective management of the process. It was important for the Ag. CD to review all documents relating to the Agreement before these were sent out and future exercises should be taken more seriously with more diligent preparation.

5.9.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1	Two-Months Closed Season for Industrial Fleets implemented One-Month Closed Season for Artisanal fleets observed Co-Management Policy finalized and submitted to Cabinet	**Artisanal** • A report on the stakeholder's engagement on the implementation of the 2019 close season on 5th February, 2019. • Letter dated 4th April, addressing them about the proposed closed season. • A symbolic closure of the sea. • A report on 4-day closed season monitoring in the Central and Western Region on 25th -28th May, 2019. • Letter dated 11th June, 2019 to stakeholders on the Ceremonial opening of the 2019 Closed Season at Prampram. • Documentary evidence of the closer and opening. • Letter dated 10th May, 2019 requesting for support for the implementation of the 2019 closed season with budget estimates attached. • Letters dated 15th May, 2019 requesting support for the 2019 Closed Season. • Letter dated 20th March, 2019 received from NAFPTA to support the 2019 Closed Season. • Appreciation letters dated 2nd July, 2019 to stakeholders on the implementation of 2019 Closed Season. • Letter dated 20th March, 2019 received from NAFPTA to support the 2019 Closed Season. • Letters dated 10th&15th May, 2019 requesting support for the 2019 Closed Season. • Memo dated 12th March, 2019 submitting report on stakeholder engagement on. **Industrial Fleets** A directive was issued as part of a meeting at Tema and the dates were announced for closed season. **Co-management Policy** • Co-management policy dated February, 2019. • Letter dated 3rd July, 2019 submitting it to Cabinet.

2	Landing beaches restructured and number of landing beach committees reduced by 50% Premix diversion and inappropriate distribution prevented Premix Fuel Database improved	• Memo dated 15th May, 2019 forwarding the first quarter report from the administrator of National Premix fuel secretariat to the CD. • Minutes of meetings by the committees dated 20th September, 19th November, 13th December, 2019 and an emergency meeting on 27th October, 2019. • Premix committee's report.
3	Consolidated Bill submitted to Cabinet by the end of the year	• Memo dated 4th June, 2019 appointing members of Committee from Deputy Minister to CD. • Letter dated 12th July, 2019 to USAID - SFMP requesting for support toward the preparation of the New Fisheries Bill. • Memo inviting members of Committee to meeting. • Minutes of meeting dated 7th August, 2019 – Legal Review Coordinating Committee.
4	a. Aquaculture for Food and Jobs (AFJ) Programme implemented i. James Town Prison Camp supported ii. Pilot farms and institutions identified iii. Pilot youth trained in Aquaculture	• Letter dated 4th July, 2019 and 5th March, 2019 requesting for financial support to implement the Aquaculture for Food for Jobs (AFJ) programme. • Pictorial evidence. • August and September – 2019 reports on visits by coordinator to – Ekumfi Atarkwa, Ekumfi Esuehyia Dam,Wenchi site inspection.
5	Construction of James Town Mini-Harbour commenced by end of the year	• Memo dated 12th April, 2019 to Hon. Minister proposing for the reconstitution of Steering Committee.

	Phase one of Anomabo Fisheries College Project completed	• Letters dated 15th April, 3rd October, inviting Committee members to meetings. • Minutes of 11th March, 4th June, 10th, 13th, 14th May 2019 - Landing Site Construction Committee. • Letter dated 27th March, 2019 to EPA requesting for information on waste management. • Letter to Electricity Company of Ghana Limited requested for information power supply to power requirements of Jamestown harbour. • Letter dated 13th June, 2019 to Ministry of Finance requesting for Commencement Certificate of GHS3, 000,000.00 for construction of Access and Internal roads of the Fisheries College. • Minutes of 26th June, 2019 – meeting with Project Manager to sign Technical Plan of Jamestown harbour. • Letter to Attorney-General's Department for advice on Agreement. • Letters dated 21st, 27th March, on travel documentations of Chinese Personnel to Ghana Immigration Service, EPA, and PDS. • Memo dated 28th March, 2019 from the Head of Internal Audit Unit submitting report on on-going fisheries projects including the Fisheries College. • Letter dated 22nd February to ATTACHY CONSTRUCTION LTD on the clearing of Project Site.

5.10 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Agriculture

5.10.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected nine (9) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with three (3) TPAs were each assigned a score of six point six-six (6.66). The six (6) other TPAs were each assigned a score of six point six-seven (6.67). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 34 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **52.052** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 34: Performance of Ag. CD, Agriculture in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Reducing importation of poultry and poultry products	40,000MT of poultry produced	• Facilitate the release of funds • undertake monitoring field visits to the Breeding Stations • Supervise procurement and distribution	**Target achieved.** 79,390.70MT poultry produced Draft Report – 2019 Agricultural Facts and Figures available. Monitoring reports available	6.67	6.67
2.	Improving Agricultural Productivity and Farmer Income.	"Rearing For Food and Jobs" campaign launched. Supported: 750 farmers with 7,500 sheep; 1,200 farmers with 6,000 pigs; 3000 farmers with 30,000 cockerels and 3 breeding stations with 10,000	• Facilitate the release of funds • undertake monitoring field visits to the Breeding Stations • Supervise procurement and distribution • Facilitate the release of funds • Review	**Target achieved.** "Rearing For Food and Jobs" campaign launched and report available. **Target not achieved.** Supported 684 farmers with 6,845 small ruminants; 909 farmers with 16,583 cockerels. No information provided on other animals. List of beneficiary	6.66	3.832

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		guinea fowls	monitoring reports • Facilitate release of Funds • Review monitoring Reports	farmers from: Birim Central Municipal Assembly, Atiwa East, Atiwa West, Nandom, Sissala West, Jirapa, Asante Akim Central, Asante Akim South, Asokore Mampong, Ahafo Ano North and Ejura Sekyere Dumasi Quarterly monitoring reports available.		
		Produced and supplied 800 species of pigs, sheep, goats, cattle and rabbits		**Target not achieved.** Produced and supplied 162 breeding stock of various species from Livestock Breeding Stations Though the Ag. CD promised to produce details of the species produced and supplied this did not materialise.		
		Collected and analysed 42 samples of poultry feed/feed ingredients for quality assurance		**Target not achieved.** 35 feed samples collected and analysed across the country. Monitoring reports for 3rd and 4th quarters available		
		Produced and administered 5million doses of ND-I² vaccines		**Target not achieved.** 2.8 M doses of NDI2 produced and administered. Annual		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				report available. No monitoring reports available.		
3.	Improving Agricultural Productivity and Farmer Income.	340,000MT of subsidized fertilizers (both organic and inorganic) supplied under PFJ Supported 750 farmers to develop and adopt conservation practices 200,000 cashew grafts produced and distributed Ten (10) newly developed crop varieties recommended for release.	• Facilitate the procurement and award of contracts • Facilitate the release of funds • Review monitoring reports • Facilitate the release of funds • Review monitoring reports • Facilitate access to improved planting materials • Facilitate the release of funds • Review of monitoring reports • Facilitate access to improved planting materials	**Target achieved.** 331,354MT of subsidized fertilizer supplied (NPK 248,100 and Urea 82,900 quantity distributed). Reviewed monitoring reports available. **Target achieved.** 14,539 farmers from 36 communities from 12 districts trained in watershed management planning. Reviewed monitoring reports available. **Target achieved.** 260,000 cashew seedlings distributed to 2,166 farmers and report available. Reviewed monitoring report available. **Target achieved.** 6 variety maize, 5 varieties cassava and 1 variety rice developed and released. Report available.	6.66	6.66

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
4.	Supporting Youth employment in Agriculture	Trained 120 youth in GHT in groups of 30 quarterly at Dawhenya training centre	• Facilitate the release of funds • Quarterly monitoring visits • Facilitate the admission of 30 youth per quarter for training • Participate in the opening and closing ceremonies of the training programmes • review training reports	**Target achieved.** 120 youth trained in Greenhouse Technology. Reviewed monitoring and training reports available.	6.66	6.66
5.	Recognition, Attraction and Motivation of Farmers and the Youth.	Organized and coordinated the 35th National Farmers' Day. Organised and coordinated 39th World Food Day	• Review the composition and functions of National Planning Committee (NPC) • Facilitate the launch of 35th NFD • Facilitate the release of funds (GoG, DPs & NGOs). • Facilitate the	**Target achieved.** 35th National Farmers' Day organized at Ho in the Volta Region on 6th December, 2019. Reviewed report available. **Target achieved** 39th World Food Day celebrated in Accra on 16th October, 2019 the Forecourt of the Parliament House. Reviewed report	6.67	6.67

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			meetings of the National Planning Committee.	available.		
		Planting for Export and Rural Development (PERD) and GhAIP launched.	• Facilitate the organization of National Farmer's Forum • Review report	**Target achieved.** Planting for Export and Rural Development programme successfully launched in June, 2019 Monitoring report available.		
		Organised six (6) Agric-sector Working Group (ASWG) meetings	• Review Composition and functions of Planning Committee • Review of Minutes of Planning Committee	**Target achieved.** 7 ASWG meetings held and minutes available. Monitoring reports from meetings not expected for them to be reviewed by the Ag. CD.		
		Held two (2) Agribusiness Promotion seminars	• Facilitate the release of funds (GOG, DPs & NGOs) • Coordinate the occasion. • Review Reports • Facilitate the release of funds • Review monitoring reports • Facilitate the release of funds • Review	**Target achieved.** Two (2) Agribusiness Seminars held Report on 4th Ghana Mango Week – Mango Ghana's Green Gold – Opportunities in Value Addition available. Report on 2nd Seminar held during 2019 National Farmers' Day Held at Ho Jubilee Park available. **Target achieved.**		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Prepared and finalised Core census report Prepared 2018 edition of Agriculture in Ghana Facts and Figures document	monitoring reports • Facilitate the release of funds • Review monitoring reports • Review Reports • Review Reports	2017/2018 Ghana Census of Agriculture – National Report – June finalized by Census Board. **Target achieved.** 2018 Facts and Figures report available.		
6.	Legislation and Policy Effectiveness	Held briefing sessions with Parliamentary Select Committees on Draft Meat Inspection Regulation.	• Constitute and facilitate the work of the team • Submit the Draft Meat Inspection Regulation to Office of Parliament	**Target achieved.** Briefing sessions with Parliamentary Select Committee on Draft Meat Inspection held.	6.67	6.67
7.	Capacity Building	Trained 100 AEA's, 300 fruits and Vegetable producers on Good Agricultural Practices (GAP) and marketing quality standards. Inspected and certified 1,500 ha of cereals (Rice and Maize), Legumes Seed (Groundnut,	• Review training materials • Review Reports • Review training materials • Review Reports	**Target achieved.** 100 AEAs and 300 vegetable producers trained on Good agricultural Practices (GAP) and report available. Evidence of review by Ag. CD available. **Target achieved.** Inspectors dispatched to processing centres to monitor activities for certification of 1,380 hectares	6.67	6.67

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Cowpea and soya bean) fields, and 500 ha root and tuber (Yam and Cassava) planting material.		cereals and 532 ha root and tuber (Yam and Cassava). Reviewed quarterly reports available.		
8.	Improving Agriculture Infrastructure to support effective and efficient production of food crops.	4,203.85 ha (additional 1,206 ha[2]) land put under irrigation: • Boreholes for irrigation sank • 13 small dams in the 3 northern regions constructed • Tanoso breached dam rehabilitated	• Facilitate release of funds	**Target not achieved.** 3,630 ha of land cultivated and commencement certificates issued for construction of 13 small dams. Funds released for the activity. No information provided on the sinking of the boreholes and the rehabilitation of the Tanoso breached dam. Only one (1) out of three (3) Targets worked on.	6.67	1.55
9.	Promoting Mechanisation and use of modern equipment for smallholder farmers	Imported and distributed tractors and equipment to large and smallholder farmers. Trained 120 Females in tractor operation, maintenance and management and	• Facilitate the delivery and distribution of agricultural machinery and equipment under the 2nd tranche of the Brazilian More Food International Programme (MFIP).	**Target, though not specific, achieved.** 230 tractors and equipment to large and smallholder farmers imported, 168 distributed. **Target achieved.** 182 females trained in tractor operation. Reviewed report available.	6.67	6.67

No	Top Priority Area	Targets For The Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		120 male tractor operators, mechanics and AMSECs managers on proper handling of agricultural machinery and equipment at Adidome and Wenchi Agricultural Mechanisation Training Centres.	• Facilitate parliamentary approval for 10million Euro Czech facility supplier credit agreement. • Facilitate release of funds • Undertake monitoring visits to the centres • Review reports			
Sub-Total					**52.052**	

5.10.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **26.12** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 35: Performance of Ag. CD, Agriculture in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.0**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement available but not forwarded to OHCS.		
~~b.~~ Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	OHCS on 13th September, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Not available.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated June, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Two (2) meetings held and Minutes dated 25th April & 18th May, 2019 available. • There was a report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee.	**5**	**4.0**
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 21st January, 28th March, 10th May, 8th July, 9th September, 12th September, 20th December, 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated	• Assets Register updated		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	but not signed by the Estate Officer however signed by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.95**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Organization Manual Dated (2017) available. • Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff available. • Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 16th December 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 16th May, 2019 instead of January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Planning Phase report dated 20th February and mid-year phase report dated 15th July, 2019 available		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 3rd May,2019 • Evaluation report submitted on 31st January, 2020		
e. Training programmes			

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 10th April, 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on 16th August, 2019 and 3rd December, 2020 respectively. • Monthly reports from January – December available • Internal memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 8th January, 2020 submitting a report to Ag. CD, available (queries, lateness etc.). Some disciplinary cases being handled. • Composite analysed reports dated 6th January, 2020 available • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 13th December instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of one (1) meeting dated 2nd January, 2019 available.	**2**	**0.875**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards	• Service Charter available	**4**	**3.975**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
and brochures of the Organisation	with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Service Charter for Ghana Irrigation Development Authority available		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available • CSU officers trained at the CSTC • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS 6th January 2020 respectively. Mid-year report submitted late.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, WhatsApp platform available. Web-portal and call centre available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Newsletter, brochures and flyers on various activities, e.g. 2019 National Farmers' Day celebrations, available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• E-Agriculture platform, to monitor the distribution of inputs. Initiated the digitization of the entire sector. Phyto-Cert. being used to communicate to stakeholders. A dashboard of database of all farmers. Info@mofa.gh.	**5**	**4.32**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring reports of Departments at the sub-national level.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	• Media Tracking-, newspaper cuttings and analyses, meet the press series, PSB assessment tour. Memo dated 2nd Jan., 2020 from the PRO to the Ag. CD submitting analysed report on coverage for 2019.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of four (4) Management Meetings sighted • Minutes of two (2) Staff durbars sighted • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen (set up gender committee, capacity building activity). Developed draft Gender specific strategy for Agricultural Colleges in Ghana- 2019 -2023. Reviewed admissions to include more women. • Organized 'Health Talk, conducted eye test' for staff. – no report available • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available – a visit by PRAAD for a discussion on digitization of records • Evidence of training for records officers available.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. Management of physical environment	Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted. • Annual report on the management of the physical environment was sighted. Work station installed for staff, provided Security Guards with uniforms, renovation of the conference rooms.		
Overall Total		**26.12**	

5.10.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 36 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 36: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Agriculture

NO	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Transformation and modernization agenda for the Agricultural sector	Attend Conference	Participated in the African Green Revolution Forum hosted by Ghana and designed to showcase examples of Agricultural transformation and action. From 3rd to 6th September, 2019.
2	Strategies for ensuring value addition	Attend Conference	Participated in the 10th Annual Conference of the Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and Chief Executives of the Ghana Public Services from 17th to 20th October, 2019 at Koforidua.
3	Change for Management	Attend training	Participated in a day modular leadership seminar at the Nathan Quao Auditorium, CLOGSAG on 8th November, 2019.

			Obtained certificate.
4	Managing emotions in stressful situation	Participate in training	Participated in in-house training for Directors on the importance of emotional intelligence as a critical leadership skill in the management of organization on 14th November, 2019. Obtained certificate.
5	Procurement Management	Attend training	Participated in Ghana Commercial Agricultural Project (GCAP) sponsored World Bank Procurement Clinic, at the Ministry's Resource Centre on 12th December, 2019. Obtained certificate.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.10.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **88.172**out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.10.5 Conclusion

Ag. CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD mentioned that in view of the technicalities of the mandate of the Ministry, the presence of the Directors during the exercise was very important to help in clarifying some of the information provided as well as issues arising during the discussions. Unfortunately, a number of the Directors were on another programme outside Accra. He was grateful to both the Evaluation Team and his staff and indicated that the process was based on leadership and accountability. The lessons and knowledge acquired were very appreciative. He had learnt how important it was to pay attention to details.

The staff present appreciated the exercise and promised to improve the services they were providing their clients to add value to whatever they did. They had learnt so much from well experienced panel of evaluators. The line of questioning was apt and this would help move the Service forward. It was realised that if each one of them did not play his/her role well, then the overall performance that they all yearned for would not be achieved.

Team's Remarks

The Team reiterated that the exercise provided an opportunity for all to learn. It was good to work as ateam in order to achieve so much. They appreciated the fact that whatever one's background it was always difficult to manage a technical institution. However, what was important was the ability to get others to do the work through the direction of the Ag. Chief Director and for the staff to appreciate the Chief Director's role as a leader.

5.10.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	40,000MT of poultry produced	• Monitoring Reports
2.	"Rearing for Food and Jobs (RFJ)' campaign launched	• Launch document titled "Official Launch of RFJ-Self Sufficiency in Meat Production, a must" dated 24th June, 2019 available. • Speech by H.E the President on the Launching dated 24th June, 2019 available. • Concept paper – Rearing for Agriculture dated April, 2019. • Programme for the launch – Theme "Self-Sufficiency in Meet Production-a Must". • Daily Graphic, Tuesday 25th June, 2019 – President Launches Rearing for Food, Jobs. • CDs Letter dated 26th April, 2019 to MOF - Rearing for Food and Jobs- Request for Commencement warrant. • Minutes of 2nd National Organising committee on rearing for food and jobs meeting held on 23rd May, 2019. • Various letters to the MoF applying for release of funds to procure improved sheep stock.
	Supported: 750 farmers with 7,500 sheep; 1,200 farmers with 6,000 pigs; 3,000 farmers with 30,000 cockerels and 3 breeding stations with 10,000 guinea fowls	• Memo dated 21st August, 2019 from APD to CD – Submission of First and Second Quarter Reports. • Memo dated 9th December, 2019 from Director, APD submitting monitoring report on rearing for food and jobs. • Letter dated 8th January, 2020 forwarding APD 3rd and 4th quarter report 2019. • Memo dated 20th January, 2020 from Director APD submitting Annual Progress Report. • List of beneficiary farmers from Birim Central Municipal Assembly, Atiwa East, Atiwa West, Nandom, Sissala West, Jirapa,Asante Akim Central, Asante Akim South, Asokore Mampong, Ahafo Ano North and Ejura Sekyere Dumasi. • CDs Letter dated 26th April, 2019 submitting request for commencement warrant to MoF. • Contract for the procurement of 2,000 improved breeding stock of seep, pigs, guinea fowls and cockerels between MOFA and Messrs. VBP LTD dated 19th February, 2019.

		• Contract for the procurement of 3,000 improved breeding stock of seep, pigs, guinea fowls and cockerels between MOFA and Messrs.CR72 Ghana LTD dated 19th February, 2019. • Contract for the procurement of 2,000 improved breeding stock of seep, pigs, guinea fowls and cockerels between MOFA and Messrs. FA BAWUAH ENT dated 20th February, 2019. • Various letters to the MoF applying for release of funds to procure improved sheep stock.
	Produced and supplied 800 species of pigs, sheep, goats, cattle and rabbits	• Request Letter from Ministry dated 30th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance- Application for the release of funds. • Release Letter from Finance dated 2nd May, 2019 for Goods and Services for 2nd Quarter available. • 3rd and 4th quarter report 2019 available. • Letter dated 21st August, 2019 from APD to CD – Submission of First and Second Quarter Reports. • Contracts for procurement dated February 2019.
	Collected and analysed 42 samples of poultry feed/feed ingredients for quality assurance	• Letter dated 30th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance, Application for the release of funds. • 2nd quarter report from Ministry's Directorates available.
	Produced and administered 5 million doses of ND-I^2 vaccines	• Letter dated 30th January, 2019 from Hon. Minister to Ministry of Finance, requesting for the release of funds. • Release letter from Ministry of Finance to Ministry dated 2nd May, 2019. • Memo from Accra Veterinary Laboratory dated 15th July, 2019 submitting mid-year report on 2019 New Castle 1-2 Vaccine production available. • VSD Annual Report. • Memo dated 15th July, 2019 to Chief Veterinary Officer – Report on Mid-Year 2019 Newcastle 1-2 Vaccine Production.
3.	340,000MT of subsidized fertilizers (both organic and inorganic) supplied under PFJ	• Contracts document for procurement dated January 2019 available. • Letter dated 4th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance- Application for the release of funds for payment of fertilizer. • Reminder Letter from Ministry to Finance dated 31st January, 2019 requesting for funds to pay 2016 Fertilizer Subsidy Arrears.

		• Request letter from Ministry to Finance dated 21st January, 2019 for the payment of seeds supplied under the PFJ for 2018. • Application for commencement certificate for PFJ dated 4th January, & 29th March, 2019. • Daily Graphic – Nov, 2018 Pre-Qualification of Fertilizer Suppliers. • Letter dated 9th January, 2020 submitting 3rd and 4th quarter report. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Aglovelex ENT dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Yara Ghana Ltd. dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Dfaky Company Limited dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Glofert Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Gofertz Company Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Chemico Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Demeter Ghana Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Centriod Supplies & Logistics Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Afcott Ghana Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Beft Agro Consult Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Lumba Production Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. HRH54 Mercantle Company Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Iddisal Company Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contract for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Prime Pacific Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Letter dated 4th Contracts for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Joyful Agro Services Ltd dated 31st January, 2019.

		• Contracts for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. Omnifert Ltd dated 31st January, 2019. • Contracts for the Supply of Fertilizer between MoFA and Messrs. B. Kaakyire Agro Chemicals Ltd., Dated 31st January, 2019. • CDs Letter dated 11th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance-Application for the release of funds for payment of fertilizer supplied. • CDs Letter No. TD239/404/01 dated February, 2019 to Ministry of Finance-Application for the release of funds for payment of fertilizer supplied.
	Supported 750 farmers to develop and adopt conservation practices	• Letter dated 30th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance-Application for the release of funds. • Technical Report on Modernization of Agriculture in Ghana (MAG) Programme from Directorate of Crop Services. • Report on Training and Selection of Farmers to implement payment for environmental Services (Conservation Agriculture dated January to June, 2019. • Letter dated 30th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance-Application for the release of funds. • Letter dated 9th January, 2020 submitting report dated April, 2019 – Sustainable Land and Water Management Project (SLWMP).
	200,000 cashew grafts produced and distributed	• Contract document dated 31st January, 2019 available. • Letter dated 30th January, 2019 to Ministry of Finance, Application for the release of funds. • Technical Report on modernization of Agriculture in Ghana, 2019. • Technical report on Modernizing Agriculture in Ghana (MAG) Programme from Directorate of Crop Service. • Letter dated 9th January, 2020 submitting a report dated December, 2019 – Annual Report on Cashew Activities.
	Ten (10) newly developed crop varieties recommended for release.	• Letter dated 6th May, 2019 to the chairman of the National Seed Council, on the recommendation by National Variety Release and Registration Committee (NVRRC) for the release of six (6) maize varieties. • Letter dated 6th May, 2019 to the chairman of the National Seed Council, on the recommendation by National Variety Release and Registration Committee (NVRRC) for the release of five (5) cassava and Ex-Baika Rice

		varieties. • Contract document dated 31st January, 2019 available. • Minutes of National Variety Release and Registration meeting held 1st November, 2019.
4.	Trained 120 youth in GHT in groups of 30 quarterly at Dawhenya training centre	• Request Letter dated 28th June, 2019 to Ministry of Finance on Application for the funds for the construction of Greenhouse Capacity Building and Training Centre (IPC 5). • Admission List of 30 students sighted. • List of graduates for course 7 dated 12th April, 2019. • Progress report of training dated 3rd May, 2019 by AgriTop Ltd. • Construction of Ghana capacity building and training centre progress report for Course No. 8 at Dawhenya dated 26th August, 2019 to CEO of GIDA. • Publications made in Ghanaian Times and Daily Graphic dated 15th and 22nd March, 2019 on training. • 2019 facilitated interviews/ interview reports available. • Letter dated 3rd May, 2019 from AGRITOP LTD to the CE of GIDA – progress report for course No. 7 at Dawhenya. • Letter dated 26rth August, 2019 from AGRITOP LTD to the CE of GIDA – progress report for course No. 8 at Dawhenya. • Interview report on course No. 8. • List of graduates for course No. 7. • Admission list for course No. 8. • CDs Letter dated 28th June, 2019 to Ministry of Finance. Application for the release. • Letter dated 30th December, 2019 from AGRITOP LTD to the CE of GIDA and HHDMD – progress report for course No. 9 at Dawhenya. • Letter dated 30th December, 2019 from AGRITOP LTD to the CE of GIDA and HHDMD – progress report for course No. 1 at Akumadan. • Letter dated 30th December, 2019 from AGRITOP LTD to the CE of GIDA and HHDMD – Report on Interview for Course No. 1 at Bawjiase and No. two 2 at Akumadan. • Publications made in Ghanaian Times and Daily Graphic in 15th and 22nd March, 2019 – facilitated interviews-interview reports. • 3rd quarter monitoring report – Greenhouse Capacity and

		Training Centre Development Project.
5.	Organized and coordinated the 35th National Farmers' Day.	• Planning committee has been composed. • National best farmer screening and selection team duly constituted. • Four national planning committee meetings have been held to plan the event. • Minutes of Planning Committee meetings dated 10th July, 17th July, 30th July and 21st August, 2019. • CDs Letter dated 2nd May, 2019 to Ministry of Finance, Application for the release of funds • Memo dated 14th August, 2029. • Farmers' day brochure dated Friday 6th December, 2019. • 35th National Best Livestock Farmer Screening and Selection Report dated 6th December, 2019. • 35th National Best Farmer Screening and Selection Report.
	Organised and coordinated 39th World Food Day	• List of Committee Members – letter dated 26th August, 2019 – Observation of World Food Day – National Planning Committee. • Letter dated 18th September, 2019 Request for Naval Rating and Navy Band, the use the Forecourt of the State House, for Police Permission and Protection, for Ambulance Service to ST John Ambulance. • Letter dated 13th September, 2019 – Special Request for Support – Cowbell Company GH Limited – Pepsi Cola GH Ltd – Twellium Industrial Company Ltd – Blue Skies Company GH Ltd – Wienco Ghana – Accra Brewery Ltd – Shoprite – KFC Ghana – Papaye Fast Food – Frankies - Kasa Preko Company GH Ltd. • Letter dated 30th September, 2019 – Special Appeal for Support – Icejoy Ghana Ltd – Calli Ghana – MTN Ghana – Magi Fresh Miners – Cocoa Processing Company – Cocoa Marketing Company. • Letter dated 2nd October, 2019 to State Protocol Department - Request for Dais, Chairs and two flag post. • Letter dated 4th October, 2019 – Invitation to deliver a welcome address at the Flag Raising Ceremony. • Letter dated 4th October, 2019 – Hon. Minister, Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture - Invitation to make short remarks at the Flag Raising Ceremony. • Letter dated 4th October, 2019 – Parliamentary Select Committee - Invitation to the Flag Raising Ceremony.

		• Letter dated 4th October, 2019 – FAO Deputy Regional Representative for Africa – Invitation to the Flag Raising Ceremony. • Letter dated 7th October, 2019 – United Nations Resident Coordinator Accra – Invitation to Present the UN Secretary Generals, message at the Flag Raising Ceremony. • Letter dated 7th October, 2019 - Director General, Broadcasting Corporation – Request for Live Transmission. • Letter dated 7th October – from St John Ambulance – Re-Request for Ambulance Service. • Letter dated 8th October, 2019 Rev. Emmanuel Foadey – Invitation to offer the opening prayer at the Flag Raiding Ceremony. • Letter dated 9th October, 2019 – from ABLn Bev – Re-Special Appeal for Support. • Letter dated 11th October, 2019 – The Chief Director, Office of the President, Jubilee House – Request for the use of the Efua Sutherland Children's Park.
	Planting for Export and Rural Development (PERD) and GhAIP launched.	• Programme outline for the launch dated 23rd April, 2019 verified. • Release letter dated 2nd May, 2019 from Ministry of Finance on application for the release of funds. • Request Letter dated 30th January, 2019 to MoF for the release of funds. • Invitation Letter dated 1st April, 2019 to 2018 National Best farmer for launch of PERD. • Speech by both H.E the President and the Minister for the launch. • CSD Technical Report on modernization of Agriculture in Ghana-Programme Status Report available. • Daily Graphic and the Publisher dated 24th April, 2019 available.
	Organised six (6) ASWG meetings	• Request Letters dated 30th January and 2nd May, 2019 to Ministry of Finance – Application for the release of funds. • Minutes of ASWG meeting held at the MoFA Resource Centre on 30th January, 2019 • 18th February, 20th March, 17th April, 22nd May, 18h July and 26th September, 2019. • Memos dated 20th May, 19th August, and 19th November, 2019 from Director PPMED forwarding the first, second

		and third quarters reports to the Ag. CD.
	Held two (2) Agribusiness Promotion seminars	• Request letter dated 2nd May, 2019 to Ministry of Finance – Application for the release of funds. • Memo dated 31st July, 2019 from the Director, PPMED to Ag. CD submitting report on the 4th Ghana Mango Week. • Memo dated 31st December, 2019 from the Director, PPMED to Ag. CD submitting report on the 2019 National Farmers' Day celebration held at the Jubilee Park in Ho, Volta Region.
	Prepared and finalized core census report	• Letter dated 4th September, 2019 from the Director SRID submitting Agriculture in Ghana, Facts and Figures 2018. • Letter dated 15th April, 4th June, 9th September, 4th December, 2019 from the Director SRID submitting modernization of Agriculture in Ghana – first, second, third and fourth quarters report. • 2017/2018 Ghana Census of Agriculture – National Report.
	Prepared 2018 edition of Agriculture in Ghana Facts and Figures document	• Letter dated 6th August, 2019 – Submission of a Draft Copy of Facts and Figures Report.
6.	Held briefing sessions with Parliamentary Select Committees on Draft Meat Inspection Regulation.	• Submission of Inputs from Briefing meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on subsidiary legislation dated 15th April, 2019 to AG Dept. • Report on Inputs from Briefing meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on subsidiary legislation dated 11th April, 2019. • Meat Inspection Regulation, 2019 from AG & Ministry of Justice to Chairman, PSC on subsidiary legislation dated 16th May, 2019. • Response from PSC to Minister, AGMoJ on draft Meat Inspection Regulation, 2019 dated 6th June, 2019. • Letter dated 1th May, 2019 – Submission of Subsidiary Legislation – Meat Inspection Regulation, 2019 to Parliamentary Select Committee. • Request letter dated 30th January, 2019 to MoF for release of funds. • Release letter dated 5th May, 2019 from Finance to Ministry.
7.	Trained 100 AES's, 300 fruits and Vegetable producers on Good	• Letter dated 29th July, 2019, forwarding training report from Plant Protection and Regulatory Services Directorate

	Agricultural Practices (GAP) and marketing quality standards.	to CD. • Letters dated 4th April, 1st July, 7th October, 2019 and 29th January, 2020 from Director PPMED forwarding the first, second and third quarters reports to the Ag. CD. • Training Manual. • Report from Plant Protection and Regulatory Services Directorate – Submitted to CD dated 29th July, 2019.
	Inspected and certified 1,500 ha of cereals (Rice and Maize), Legumes Seed (Groundnut, Cowpea and soya bean) fields, and 500 ha root and tuber (Yam and Cassava) planting material.	• Letter dated 29th July, 2019, forwarding report from Plant Protection and Regulatory Services Directorate to CD on Seed Certification and Activity Work plan. • Request letter to MoF dated 13th May, 2019 on application for release of funds for payment of Agro-Chemicals supplied for the management of Fall Armyworm under the PFJ Programme, 2019. • PowerPoint presentation on "A guide to good Agricultural practices and sanitary phyto sanitary procedures for vegetable production" dated 29th August, 2019.
8.	4,203.85 ha (additional 1,206 ha^2) land put under irrigation: • Boreholes for irrigation sank • 13 small dams in the 3 northern regions constructed • Tanoso breached dam rehabilitated	• Request letters dated 30th January, 6th, 15th, 28th February and 13th May, 2019 to Ministry of Finance - Application for the release of funds. • Award letters for the construction of thirteen (13) small dams dated 29th March, 2019 issued to the following companies: (Akabi Ltd, Handosky Int. Ltd, Alzak Ltd, Waale Ltd, Badsum Ent., Quality Asad Engineering Co. Ltd, Multi Tridax, Ashcal Investment and the De-Group A Ltd). • Commencement certificates have be issued for construction of thirteen (13) small dams.
9.	Imported and distributed tractors and equipment to large and smallholder farmers.	• Letter dated 14th January, 2019 – from Ministry of Finance – Implementation of Budget Allotment Ceiling for First Quarter 2019. • Request letter dated 12th April, 2019 for application of release of funds for clearing and haulage service of Agricultural machinery. • Letter dated 29th March, 2019. • Allocation letters dated 18th June, 2019, 15th May, 2019, 11th March, 2019, 12th April, 2019. • Waybills No. 0000401, dated 21st May 2019 0000402, dated 21st May, 2019 0000403, dated 21st may, 2019 0000404, dated 24th May, 2019 0000405 March, 2019, 0000254 dated 11th March, 2019.

		• List of beneficiaries submitted – letter dated 15th July 2019. • Payment receipt No. 18/2064007, 18/2064008, 14/3111574, 14/3111997. • Parliamentary approval latter dated 14th February, 2019 from Parliamentary Services to MOFA. • Letter dated 23rd October, 2019 allocating 1 New Holland Tractor with accessories under the 2nd Tranche of the Brazilian more International Food (MFI) Programme.
	Trained 120 Females in tractor operation, maintenance and management and 120 male tractor operators, mechanics and AMSECs managers on proper handling of agricultural machinery and equipment at Adidome and Wenchi Agricultural Mechanisation Training Centers.	• Request letter dated 14th February, 2019 to Hon. Minister, Finance on suppliers Credit Agreement between GoG and Knights A.S. of the Czech Republic for an amount of Ten Million Euros for the supply of 300 sets of Global Multipurpose Mini tractors. • Letter dated 18th June, 2019 from the Ministry to BOK NAMKIM Golf Club on allocation of resources on tractor mounted slasher only under the 2nd Tranche of the Brazilian Max Ford International programme. • CDs Letter dated 30th January, 12th April 2019 – Release of funds. • Letter dated 4th September, 2019 submitting Training Reports on women in Tractor Operations, maintenance and management.

5.11 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Information

5.11.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 37 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **50.2** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 37: Performance of CD, Information in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Enhancing access to information.	Draft RTI Bill submitted to Parliament Pre-implementation activities for roll out of the RTI policy undertaken • Engage stakeholders • Develop roadmap and budget • Develop Cabinet Information Paper • Award consultancies for key activities • Set up National RTI Secretariat • Organize sensitization programmes • Recruit, train and deploy Information Officers	• Facilitate payment of funds involved in the sensitization programme • Issue letters to stakeholders • Review stakeholder report • Review Cabinet Information Paper	**Target achieved.** The RTI Bill passed into Law (ACT 989, 2019) on 21st May, 2019 and a copy available. **Target achieved.** A number of pre-implementation activities for roll out of the RTI ACT, 2019 (ACT 989) undertaken: • Stakeholders' engagement undertaken – Parliamentary Select Committee (RTI, Roadmap) and reports available. • Roadmap and a budget developed and available. • Cabinet Information Paper developed and submitted to Cabinet – June 2019. • Awarded contracts – Data mapping and for the development of information manuals,	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				Mistry shopping, IT solution, computers and accessories etc. • National RTI Secretariat set up. • Two (2) sensitization programmes organized with CDs and report available. • Advertised for the recruitment of RTI officers. Almost 526 persons applied.		
2.	Improving transparency and public access to information.	Meet the Press events for 25 MDAs organized. 60 Press Briefing sessions organized	• Facilitate the release of funds • Facilitate the organization of meetings • Review draft reports	**Target not achieved.** Organised meet the press for 22 MDAs. Report on Meet the Press with pictures (Jan-Dec 2019) available: Ministries of Business Development, Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration, Employment and Labour Relations, Lands and Natural Resources, Gender, Children and Social Protections, Communications, Railway Development, Chieftaincy, Youth and Sports, Tourism, etc.) **Target not achieved.** Forty five (45) Press Briefing sessions organized. – Press briefings on the following: • Attempted destabilization	10	7

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				of the country • Government Support for Illegal Miners • Presidents Tour of the Bono, Eastern and Ashanti Regions • PDS concessionaire • President's Tour to the Volta Region • At Peduase • On the Telcos Common Platform. Etc. • Progress report on Press Briefings with pictures (Jan-Dec 2019) available.		
3.	Deepening sector policy engagement with key stakeholders	Two (2) National Policy Summits organized	• Facilitate the release of funds • Facilitate the organization of the summits • Review reports	**Target not achieved.** One (1) National Policy Summit organized at the University of Cape Coast, Central Region on the SDGs with emphasise on Fisheries and Sanitation and report available.	10	7
4.	Fostering regular policy interactions between government and citizenry	Eight (8) Regional Town Hall meetings (Local) organised	• Facilitate the release of funds • Issue invitation letters for various	**Target not achieved.** Three (3) Regional Town Hall Meetings (local) were organised in the Volta, Bono East, and Upper East regions.	10	6.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Two (2) Diaspora Town Hall Meetings (Foreign) organised	events • Review draft reports of the events	*Diaspora Town Hall Meeting*– **Target not achieved.** One (1) Diaspora Town Hall Meetings (Foreign) was organised in UK. Undated and not authored concept paper developed and available. Reports reviewed available.		
5.	Repositioning Information Sector Agencies for efficiency	Memos/Papers submitted to Cabinet on: - Transformation of ISD - Recapitalization of NTC & - Recapitalization of Ghana Publishing Company - Common Platform Technology for Information Management	Review Cabinet Memos and submit to Hon. Minister for approval	**Target achieved.** Reform strategies and Cabinet memos for the transformation agenda of the three (3) agencies as well as on the Common Platform completed and submitted to the Cabinet. • ISD – Cabinet Memo – 7th November 2019. • Common Platform – Cabinet Memo – 3rd September 2019. • NTC – Business Plan and cash flow forecast - cabinet Memo – 3rd September 2019. • Recapitalisation of Ghana Publishing Company - 19th August 2019.	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
6.	Enhancing capacity of the media to play watchdog role	Framework for strengthening capacity of media developed	• Review draft documents • Forward documents to Cabinet for consideration	**Target achieved.** Framework for strengthening capacity of media developed and Cabinet Memo submitted to Cabinet. An undated and not authored Framework document available.	10	9.7
		Draft programme on the National Coordinating Mechanism for Safety of Journalists developed		**Target achieved.** The Programme developed and Memo submitted to Cabinet. Held stakeholder engagement on the Framework on National Coordinating Mechanism on Safety of Journalists and report available.		
		Memo submitted to Cabinet on Broadcasting Bill for policy approval		**Target achieved.** • Concept note developed and available • Cabinet memo on the broadcasting bill submitted to Cabinet available		
Sub-Total					**50.2**	

5.11.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **25.745** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 38: Performance of Chief Director, Information in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**2.4**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 16th, March 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Nil.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Nil.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan dated 16th August, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Four (4) meetings held and minutes dated 24th April, 17th October, 21st November and 19th December, 2019 available. • Report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee **not**		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of three (3) meetings dated 2nd October, 18th and 22nd November, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Electronic Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor available.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.8**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual dated 2017 available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Updated staff list dated December, 2019 available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff dated 2019 available. • Establishment levels submitted to OHCS on 1st August, 2019 available.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 1st August, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases dated 31st January and July, 2019 respectively available.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• Composite signing report on October, 2019. • Soft copy of evaluation report emailed to OHCS on 10th March, 2020 instead of January 2020. • 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process emailed to OHCS on 7th March 2019. • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 13th Feb, 2020. • Monthly reports on staff attendance were available. • Reports on various disciplinary actions available. • 2019 Annual Staff Movement Report submitted to OHCS on 10th January, 2020 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 12th November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • Minutes of two (2) meeting dated of 17th July and 19th November, 2019 available.	**2**	**1.25**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Draft Service Charter dated 2019 available. • No Service Charter for Department.	**4**	**3.5**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU training for officer and back to office report dated 18th November, 2019. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 2nd July 2019 and 4th January 2020 respectively. • Website under reconstruction, Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, WhatsApp platforms. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Brochure, handbook for PRs - available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements	• Developed staff ID cards and a clock-in-system. Report dated December, 2019 available. • At the sub-national level the Ministry related with clients mainly through the 22 Press Briefings. Conducted various surveys to ascertain the awareness of citizen during the meet the press series. Also reports from District and Regional Information Officers through the Information Services Department. • Media Tracking- Daily news briefing and Press Briefings available. • Minutes of ten (10) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of three (3) Staff durbars sighted.	**5**	**4.795**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen – created the Gender Desk Office and assigned a staff to handle the Desk. • Organized stress and depression management, security and safety, breast cancer awareness, etc for Staff - report available. • Catalogue of Information posted on notice boards, WhatsApp groups.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available - Ministry engaged PRAAD for inspection of the Records Unit dated 17th October, 2019 and PRAAD's response dated 22nd November, 2019. • Reports on records management training available dated 11th – 13th March, 2019.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Security access. • Refurbishment of the Ministry. • On-going landscaping. • Fire drill organized for staff and extinguishers refilled. • New Air conditioners installed.		
Overall Total		**25.745**	

5.11.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 39 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 39: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Information

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	**PLANNED ACTIONS**	**CD's PERFORMANCE**
1	High productivity and enhanced performance in contemporary public sector management and key government policies	Participate in Induction Programme for newly appointed Chief Directors.	Participated in March, 2019 at the Civil Service Training Centre.
2		Participate in conference of Chief Executives.	a. Participated in Conference of Chief Executives from 17th – 20th October, 2019 at Capital View Hotel. b. Participated in quarterly meetings of Chief Directors.
3		Participate in 2019 Evidence to Action Conference.	Participated in the 2019 Evidence to Action Conference from 9th – 12th July, 2019 at ISSER, University of Ghana.
4	Knowledge of the information and communications landscape	Participate in seminars on the role of PROs in the Public Service.	Participated in the Conference on 23rd October, 2019 at the Movenpick Ambassador Hotel, Accra.
5		Participation in the Climax of the National Cyber Security Awareness Month 2019.	Participated in the Home Coming Programme of PROs organized at the Ministry of Information on 27th August, 2019.
6			Participated on 22nd October, 2019 at the Kofi Annan International Peacekeeping Training Centre.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.11.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **85.945** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.11.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The exercise was a very important learning opportunity for all staff. It was very educative and would help staff to improve upon their work. The staff present noted generally about the importance of proper documentation in all aspects of their work. They also realised that it was good to be on top of one's job so that when called to speak one will not be found wanting. The staff were happy working with CD and they had learnt so much from her in the short time she had been with them.

The CD noted that it took a lot to be a good CD. One had to comply with a lot of regulations and rules to ensure the appropriate things were done. She was grateful to the Minister and all staff for the support. She indicated that she was still learning from the staff and was glad all had the opportunity to join in the exercise so that when reports on activities were being requested from them they would appreciate it.

Team's Remarks

The exercise should be seen as a useful activity meant to help and improve the way work was done. It was a very important learning exercise and they were happy other members of staff participated in it. It was hoped that through the exercise there would be an increase in effectiveness and efficiency and ultimately an improvement in the performance management culture of the Ministry and the Civil Service.

Meeting with the Hon. Minister

The leader of the team briefed the Minister of the purpose of the exercise.

The Minister indicated that the CD was a very organized person and that made the Ministry very appreciative of her. She had a good understanding of the rules and regulations of the Civil Service and that had helped the Ministry in that direction. He was glad to have her on board.

5.11.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS O VERIFICATION
1.	1. Draft RTI Bill submitted to Parliament 2. Pre-implementation activities for roll out of the RTI policy undertaken • Engage stakeholders • Develop roadmap and budget • Develop Cabinet Information Paper	*RTI Bill* • Letter to Majority Leader dated 5th February, 2019 on proposed Amendments to the RTI • Copy of the RTI ACT, 2019 (ACT 989). *Stakeholder Engagements* • Various letter dated 22nd May, 2019 to a stakeholders' workshop on the implementation of the RTI. • Letter dated 25th July, 2019 to GBC on meeting with

	• Award consultancies for key activities • Set up National RTI Secretariat • Organize sensitization programmes • Recruit, train and deploy Information Officers	Parliamentary Select Committee on the RTI. • Report on meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on 27th July, 2019 at Capital View Hotel. • Letter dated 31st July, 2019 to a meeting: operationalization of RTI Law addressed to the Commissioner Data Protection Commission, Head of the Civil Service, PRAAD. • Minutes of meeting held between MOI, DPC, OHCS and PRAAD on the implementation of the RTI Law on 8th August, 2019. • Letter dated 18th September, 2019 to US Ambassador on collaboration on the implementation of the RTI. • Report on the stakeholder workshop on the implementation of the RTI Law held at Oak Plaza Hotel, Accra. ***<u>Development of Roadmap and Budget</u>*** • Letter dated 4th June to MoF on request for creation of budget sub programme on the RTI. • Letter dated 26th June to MoF on 2019 implementation roadmap and RTI. • Letter dated 27th August, 2019 to MoF on vetting request for implementation budget for RTI. • Letter dated 2nd September, 2019 to the Coalition on the RTI, Ghana on request for update on the RTI law implementation roadmap. • Letter dated 16th October, 2019 to MoF on request for release of funds. • Roadmap for implementation of the RTI Act. ***<u>Develop Cabinet Info Paper</u>*** • Cabinet Information Paper on operationalization of RTI Law dated June, 2019. ***<u>Award consultancies for key activities</u>*** Consultancy contracts signed with: • Top Archive on - Design of Templates for Data Mapping and Development of Information Manuals.

		- Building, Deploying and Providing Training on an IT Led Solution for Archiving and Retrieving Information under the RTI Act. • Windsor Capital on Mystery Shopping Services to Pilot the Retrieval of Information from Public Institutions under the RTI Act. • IT Market on Supply of Computers and Accessories, Printers and UPS. • Klataa Engineering Solutions Ltd on Supply of Vehicles. ***Set up National RTI Secretariat*** • Letter dated October 29th, 2019 to the Office of the President on request for engagement on the set up of the RTI Commission and Governing Body. ***Organize sensitization programmes*** • Letter dated 28th August, 2019 to all sector Ministers and all regional Ministers on a meeting on operationalization of RTI Law. • Letter dated 29th August, 2019 to Commissioner, Data Protection Commission to a 2nd meeting on operationalization of RTI Law. • Letter dated 5th September, 2019 to Heads of Service (OHCS & OHLGS) on RTI. • Letter dated 5th September, 2019 to Chair of Constitutional, Legal& Parliamentary Affairs committee on RTI. • Report on meeting with Chief Directors/Regional Coordinating Directors held on 11th September, 2019 on the implementation of RTI Law at the Civil Service Training Centre. • Letter from Min of Transport dated 7th November, 2019 on request for briefing on the RTI. • Letter dated 19th December, 2019 to the OHCS on operationalization of right to information law. • Report on meeting with Chief Directors on transition procedure for the implementation of the RTI Act, 2019 (ACT 989) held on 27th December, 2019 at the Civil Service Training Centre. • Letter dated 30th December, 2019 on transition procedure for the implementation of the RTI Act, 2019 submitting a Dossier on RTI transitional arrangement for processing requests for access to information.

		Recruit, train and deploy Information Officers • Letter dated 17th October, 2019 to the OHCS on request for recruitment of RTI Officers. • Transmittal letter dated 23rd October, 2019 from the OHCS to Ministry of Finance on request for recruitment of RTI Officers. • Adverts dated 3rd December, 2019 in Ghanaian Times page 07 and Daily Graphic page 40 inviting applications for the positions of Assistant RTI Officers, Principal RTI Officers and an RTI Divisional Director. • The list of over five hundred applications were received. • Forwarding letter dated 6th January, 2020 on financial clearance for RTI Officers dated 27th November, 2019 was received from OHCS on 8th January, 2020.
2.	1. Meet the Press events for 25 MDAs organized. 2. 60 Press Briefing sessions organized	***Meet the Press Events*** • Invitation letter dated January 16th, 2019 from the Ministry of Information to all Ministers on the subject 'Commencement of Meet the Press 2019'. • 22 reports on the 'meet the press'. ***Press Briefing Sessions*** Report on Press Briefings with pictures (Jan-Dec 2019).
3.	Two (2) National Policy Summits organized	• Various letters dated 16th, 20th, 21st, 22nd May, 2019 from the Ministry of Information to Ms. Ama Ofori-Antwi, and other stakeholders on the first 2019 National Policy Summit. • Report on 6th National Policy Summit (Sunday 26th and Monday 27th May, 2019). • Handbook on activities in 2019.
4.	1. Eight (8) Regional Town Hall meetings (Local) organised 2. Two (2) Diaspora Town Hall Meetings (Foreign) organised	*Volta Regional Town Hall meeting(28th June, 2019)* • Letters dated 11th June, 2019 to the Volta Regional Minister on the Regional Town Hall meeting. • Letters dated 12th June, 2019 to four (4) speakers. • Letter dated 21st June, 2019 to the Director General GBC requesting for live coverage of Town Hall Meeting. • Letter dated 24th June, 2019 to the acting VC of Ho Technical University.

		• Report and pictures on Volta Regional Town Hall meeting. <u>*Bono East Regional Town Hall meeting(9th September, 2019)*</u> • Letter dated 27th August, 2019 to the Minister of Employment and Labour Relations inviting him to the Town Hall Meeting at Bono East Region. • Letters dated 28th August, 2019 to five (5) speakers. • Letter dated 2nd September, 2019 captured Press Release to the Bono East Regional Coordinating Council on the Regional Town Hall meeting. • Report and pictures on Bono East Regional Town Hall meeting. <u>*Upper East Regional Town Hall meeting(30th September, 2019)*</u> • Invitation letter dated 6th September, 2019 to 31 Ministries to Regional Town Hall meeting. • Invitation letters dated 6th September, 2019 to four (4) speakers. • Invitation letter dated 12th September, 2019 to stakeholders. • Letter dated 24th September , 2019 on press release to the Upper East Regional Coordinating Council on the Town Hall meeting' • Report and pictures on Upper East Regional Town Hall Meeting <u>*Diaspora Town Hall Meeting*</u> • Letter dated 12th June, 2019 to Minister for Foreign Affairs on request for visa support for Town Hall meeting in Chicago, USA scheduled for 26th July, 2019. • Letter dated 26th March, 2019 to the Chief of Staff on request for representative for maiden Diaspora Town Hall meeting scheduled for 6th April, 2019 at London, UK. • Memo from Head of Information, Ghana High Commission UK to ISD, Accra dated 4th April, 2019 on Town Hall Meeting with Ghanaians Based in the UK. • Pictures of the two (2) Diaspora Town Hall Meetings.
5.	Memos/Papers submitted to Cabinet on: - Transformation of ISD - Recapitalization of NTC & - Recapitalization of Ghana	<u>*Transformation of ISD*</u> • Concept Paper on transformation programme for Information Services Department. • Cabinet Memo dated November, 2019 on transformation programme for Information Services Department.

	Publishing Company - Common Platform Technology for Information Management	• Letter dated 7th November, 2019 submitting the Cabinet Memo to the Secretary to Cabinet *Recapitalization of NTC* • Cabinet Memo on proposal for the recapitalization and restructuring of the New Times Corporation dated 13th August, 2019 • Letter dated 3rd September, 2019 to the Secretary to Cabinet on submission of Cabinet Memo. *Recapitalization of Ghana Publishing Company* • Cabinet Memo on proposal to reinvest in Ghana Publishing Company Ltd. to enhance its operations to become competitive and undertake high security printing dated 1st July, 2019. • Letter dated 19th August, 2019 to the Secretary to Cabinet on submission of Cabinet Memo dated 1st July, 2019. *Common Platform Technology* • Concept paper. • Cabinet memo on Proposed Common Platform Technology for Information Management. • Letter dated 3rd September, 2019 to the Cabinet Secretary.
6.	1. Framework for strengthening capacity of media developed 2. Draft programme on the National Coordinating Mechanism for Safety of Journalists developed 3. Memo submitted to Cabinet on Broadcasting Bill for policy approval	*Strengthening Capacity of Media* • Minutes of the review meeting of the working committee on media capacity enhancement programme held on 18th June, 2019. • Concept Note on Media capacity enhancement programme 2019. • Cabinet Memo on Media Capacity Enhancement Programme dated November, 2019. *Mechanism for Safety of Journalists* • Framework for the National Coordinating Mechanism on safe and responsible journalism in Ghana. • Report on stakeholder engagement on the framework on National Coordinating Mechanism on Safety of Journalists dated 19th July,

		2019. • Cabinet Memo on the co-ordinated Mechanism for Safety of Journalists dated October, 2019. • Transmittal letter dated 15th October, 2019 to the Secretary to Cabinet submitting Cabinet Memo on the Coordinated Mechanisms for Safety of Journalists dated October, 2019. • Various letters inviting CD and stakeholders to an induction of the National Coordinating Committee on the Safety of Journalists in Ghana and sponsorship letters. *Broadcasting Bill* • Letter dated 3rd September, 2019 submitting the Cabinet memo on the Broadcasting Bill to Cabinet

5.12 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Inner-City and Zongo Development

5.12.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 40 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **45.8** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 40: Performance of Ag. CD, Inner-City and Zongo Development in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Strengthening the Legal and Institutional Framework	**Draft LI laid in Parliament** **Facilitate the recruitment of Staff for the Secretariat in Collaboration with PSC** **Operations of the Secretariat Monitored**	• Facilitate review meetings among stakeholders • Submit Draft LI to Parliament • Facilitate acquisition of financial clearance • Facilitate the recruitment of staff for the Secretariat in collaboration with PSC • Review quarterly reports • Review monitoring reports	**Target was achieved**. The draft LI was laid in Parliament. **Target achieved.** Draft Scheme of Service prepared and forwarded to the Fair Wages Commission. The Ministry is yet to receive feedback from the Commission and as such evidence of review by the Ag. CD was not available. **Target not achieved** The Secretariat was operational but the Ag. CD was not able to undertake the monitoring as expected. Monitoring reports on the operations of the Secretariat were, therefore, not available.	12	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
2.	Promoting Economic livelihood interventions in selected Inner-City and Zongo Communities	**500 Zongo cuisine sellers in Business Development Trained** **600 youth with entrepreneurial/ vocational skills training in ICT provided.** **Scholarship and bursaries to 15 brilliant but needy youth in tertiary provided.**	• Facilitate the release of funds and other logistics • Review training reports	**Target achieved** Six hundred and thirty-two (632) women trained in business development. Some of the training reports submitted were not authored and dated. **Target not achieved** The Ministry in collaboration with the Zongo Coders trained two hundred (200) youth in entrepreneurial/ vocational skills in ICT. **Target achieved** Scholarship and bursaries were provided for sixteen (16) brilliant but needy youth in tertiary institutions. A status report prepared on projects documentary being compiled was submitted.	12	10
3.	Promoting Infrastructure Intervention in selected Inner-City and Zongo Communities	**Infrastructure needs in 5 regions identified.**	• Facilitate the release of funds • Facilitate the provision of resources • Review	**Target achieved** Infrastructure needs in 9 regions identified. Validation reports dated 3rd July and 1st August 2019 for the Oti, Volta, Upper East, North East, Upper West, Northern,	12	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			Monitoring reports	Savannah, Bono, Bono East, Ahafo Ashanti, Eastern, Greater Accra, Central, Western and Western North Regions were submitted.		
		Provided 52 households in Accra with toilets.		**Target achieved** Two hundred and fifty-two (252) Household Toilets constructed and in use.		
		15 boreholes provided.		**Target achieved** Sixteen (16) boreholes completed and pictorial evidence provided		
		Waste segregation project in 4 communities implemented (Nima, Mamobi, Ruga and Madina)		**Target not achieved** Stakeholder engagement held in April but no further activities undertaken. Team suggested the need for the Target to have been reviewed during mid-year monitoring exercise.		
4.	Improving security and reducing crime incidence	**2 Zongo for peace and Development (ZoPAD) conferences organized.**	• Facilitate the release of funds. • Review back to office report	**Target not achieved** Only one (1) ZoPAD Conference held on 8th January 2019 and report submitted but not dated.	12	9.8
		2 public anti-vigilantism		**Target achieved** One (1) soccer league		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		programmes undertaken.		held among Zongo communities to promote peace. Stakeholder consultations held on 29th June – 10th July 2019 and report dated 19th July was verified. Video Documentary titled "Awareness creation to fight against vigilantism in the Zongo Communities across Ghana" available.		
5.	Improving conditions in slum communities through upgrading	**Recruit Community Liaisons for beneficiary communities - Nima, Agboblogshie and Akweteyman** **Prepare Terms of References for planning and engineering works on the Nima/Maamobi storm drain**	• Constitute Evaluation Team • Review evaluation report and submit to Project Coordinating Unit • Review site inspection report • Review Terms of Reference and submission to Project Coordinati	**Target achieved** The Ag. CD constituted an Evaluation Team and Liaisons Officers engaged to undertake sensitization programmes in beneficiary communities. Evidence of review of the evaluation report by the Ag. CD was not sighted. **Target not achieved** ToR for consultation services for Community Liaisons prepared. Negotiations for	12	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
			ng Unit	Community Liaison Consultant for Nima and Agboblogshie Communities for the Greater Accra Resilient and Integrated Development Project was held with Ministry of Works and Housing and Reports dated July and November, 2019 were available. Evidence of review of the above documents by the Ag. CD was not sighted. **There were no site inspection reports.**		
Sub-Total					**45.8**	

5.12.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **24.743** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 41: Performance of Ag. CD, Inner-City and Zongo Development in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	3.4
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Available and forwarded to OHCS on 15th March instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Available and forwarded to OHCS.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Report on follow-up actions not available.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated September, 2019 was available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• Available and forwarded to OHCS on due date 15th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**3**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• AC inaugurated in April, 2019. • Minutes of meeting dated 8th August, and 5th and 27th December, 2019. • Summary of actions		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan uploaded and available. • ETC meeting held to approve Procurement Plan.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Available but no indication as to when the assets were acquired. Not signed and authenticated by Internal/external auditors.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Available and forwarded to CAGD on 28th February, 2019		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	8.673
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	Organizational manual available dated May, 2019 • Undated Staff list available • Individualized job schedules available but not circulated to all staff • Establishment levels available		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Composite appraisal report submitted to OHCS.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Planning and mid-year phase reports available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and	• No Directors so could not sign and evaluate. • Evaluation report not		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	available. • Training plan available and submitted to OHCS 19th February 2019. • Mid and end of year reports submitted on 16th August, and December, 2019 respectively. • Composite report available. • No disciplinary measures taken. Ministry has preventive measures (notices, etc.) • Staff movement report not available. • 2020 promotion register available and submitted to OHCS.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List available. • 2 meetings held on 11th April, and 15th August, 2019 with minutes available.	**2**	1.25
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Draft Client Service Charter available. • No Department. • CSU Office Space available. • CSU Officer trained. .Mid and end of year reports on operations and compliance available • Functional interactive	**4**	4

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	website, active social media platforms, Facebook and WhatsApp. • Quarterly reports on the website updates available. • Draft newsletter available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Intranet set-up and project picture book available.	**5**	4.42
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Town Hall meetings organized, field visits by officers to interact with stakeholders and get feedback on projects. Community entry and exit at the regional/district level. Use of social media group to monitor sub-national level activities. • Press cuttings with analysis		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of ten (10) management meetings available. • Minutes of two (2) staff durbars available. • Ensure gender parity in all programmes organized by the Ministry. • Health Screening organised (Breast Screening). • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Letter dated 13th September, 2019 from PRAAD to set up the records unit. • Memo dated 4th July, 2019 from Records officer,		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. Management of physical environment	submitting report on Records Management Training. • Physical environment satisfactory		
Overall Total		**24.743**	

NOTE: Since the Ministry did not have Directors at post, the OVI relating to the signing of Directors Agreements as well as their subsequent evaluation are not applicable. The applicable total score for this KRA is, therefore, 8.5. The score obtained is to be multiplied by 10/8.5 (1.18) to obtain the equivalent score relating to 10 for this KRA.

5.12.3 Schedule 3:Ag. CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 42 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 42: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Inner City and Zongo Development

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Networking and Leadership Skills	Training	Dialogue on issues pertinent to the development of Ghana through deeper discussions on the engines of growth in Ghana on 11th December, 2019
2	Refresh knowledge on Corporate Governance	Workshop	Sensitization Workshop on International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) on 15th May, 2019. Training manual available
3	knowledge on Leadership Change and Organizational Renewal	Participate in a conference	Participated in the AAPAM conference from 3rd to 6th December, 2019 Pictures available
4	Knowledge sharing	Conduct training	Conducted in-house training for staff on well-being.
5	Refresh People Management		Participated in the Zongo for Peace and Development Conference (ZOPAD) on

	and Engagement Skills	Participate in conference	8th January, 2019
Sub-Total			**10**

5.12.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **80.543** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.12.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD admitted that all observations the Evaluators had made were a true reflection of what was being done in the Ministry and was glad all staff participated in the evaluation exercise to hear these. According to the Ag. CD, valuable lessons had been learnt and the staff would now understand and appreciate the regular concerns raised in relation to their work areas. She further emphasized that the exercise had been very educative and finally thanked the Evaluators for allowing her staff to be part of the learning process.

Team's Remarks

The Team indicated that the exercise was not meant to be punitive but was to help officers discover their strengths and weaknesses as well as improve their effectiveness and efficiency. It was also meant to hold staff accountable for their actions and promote the concept of performance management culture in the Service.

The Team further noted that the atmosphere in which the exercise had been conducted had been good and advised the Ag. CD to see the performance agreement as a living document – not one to be set aside and visited only during the mid and end of the year exercises. All Officers were advised to take their roles seriously since their inefficiencies could negatively affect the Ag. CD's Performance. Documentary evidence was key to the process and reports should always be dated and authored.

5.12.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGETS	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MOVs)
1.	Draft LI laid in Parliament Facilitate the recruitment of Staff for the Secretariat in Collaboration with PSC	• Letter dated 6th February 2019 from CD to the AG submitting the draft L.I. and inviting AG for a meeting on the draft Zongo Development Fund Regulations. • Letter dated 22nd May, 2019 from CD to the AG expressing gratitude with regards to the swift response in reviewing the draft. • Letter dated 24th July, 2019 from AG to Hon. Minister submitting revised Regulations and Comments for consideration. • Letter 14th October, 2019 from the Parl. Service to the Hon. Minister on a Business meeting with the majority leader and Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. • Letter dated 2nd April, 2019 from the Hon. Minister to the CEO, ZoDF informing him of interview to fill critical positions. • Draft Scheme of Service for ZoDF prepared and letter dated 28th November, 2019 forwarding same to FWSC for advice. • Quarterly reports not available. • Report dated 26th June 2019 on the Budget Implementation Review with (Ref. Page 4).
2.	500 Zongo cuisine sellers in Business Development Trained 600 youth with entrepreneurial/ vocational skills training in ICT	• MOUs dated December, 2018 between the MICZD and the NBSSI (Zongo Cuisine Programme) and IYD (Zongo Coders Programme), respectively. • Progress report dated 1st March 2019. • Inception report available. • Draft report final dated 1st August, 2019. • Invoice dated 21st August, 2019 from NBSSI. • Comments on progress report on the Zongo Cuisine Programme by PPBMED. • Comments on the progress report on the Zongo Coders Programme by PPBMED dated 17th October, 2019. • Pictorial evidence on the Zongo Cuisine. • Report on the Zongo Cuisine programme available. • Letters dated 8th April, 24th July, 18th September and 1st October 2019 to CD requesting for financial assistance. • Letter dated 9th August, 2019 requesting for sponsorship. • Cover Letter dated 6th June, 2019 from CD for a candidate applying for a Master's Programme to study in China. • Reports on labour market readiness and curriculum vitae preparation

	provided. Scholarship and bursaries to 15 brilliant but needy youth in tertiary provided.	workshop for (Kumasi, Sunyani, Takoradi and Tamale), available but not reviewed.
3.	Infrastructure needs in 5 regions identified. Provided 52 households in Accra with toilets. 15 boreholes provided. Waste segregation project in 4 communities implemented (Nima, Mamobi, Ruga and Madina*)*	• Validation report of priority projects – regional report for Oti and Volta Regions dated 3rd July, 2019. • Report dated 1st August, 2019 on Nationwide Validation of Priority Capital Projects. • Letter dated 20th March, 2019 from AMA to the Hon. Minister on submission of list of Phase One House-Holds identified for the provision of the toilet facilities. • Memo dated 2nd April, from Deputy Director, PPBMED to CD requesting resources for launch of HHT Project. • Letter dated 24th June, 2019 from GAMADA to Hon. Minister submitting list of households identified for Phase Two of the Household Toilets Facilities. • Joint Monitoring of Household Toilets Reports dated 15th May and 10th June, 2019 respectively. • Contract Completion Report dated 1st July, 2019 from Attachy Construction Ltd to the Hon. Minister. • Memo dated 24th September, 2019 from Deputy Director, PPBME to CD submitting field report on Phase 2 of the HHT. • Contract Completion Report dated 9 January, 2020 from Attachy Construction Ltd to the Hon. Minister. • Memo dated 29th January, 2019 from Deputy Director, PPMED to CD forwarding report on boreholes. • Waste Segregation Report; Two (2) communities completed. Funds requisition Memos dated 8th and 11th April, 2019 respectively with corresponding PVs dated 11th April on the Waste Segregation Programme in Nima and Mamobi.
4.	2 Zongo for peace and Development (ZoPAD) conferences organized. 2 public anti-vigilantism	• Zongo for Peace and Development (ZOPAD) Conference Report not dated. • Daily Graphic publication on 9th January 2019. • Zongo Soccer League Report. • Memo dated 24th July, 2019 forwarding report available.

	programmes undertaken	
5.	Recruit community Liaisons for beneficiary communities - Nima, Alogboshie and Akweteyman Prepare terms of References for planning and engineering works on the Nima/Maamobi storm drain	• Newspapers advertisement in the Ghanaian Times dated October 18, 2018. (Page: 2). • Memo dated 27th March 2019 to the CD constituting Evaluation Team for the recruitment of community liaisons. • Letter dated 27th June 2019 from Works and Housing to the Ministry on invitation for negotiation as Community Liaison Consultant for Nima Community, for the Greater Accra Resilient and Integrated Development Project. • Report dated 29th November, 2019. • Letter from the Ministry of Works and Housing dated 27th June, 2019 inviting the Ministry for negotiation as community liaison consultant for Agboblogshie Community. • Report dated July 2019 on reconnaissance visit on Greater Accra Resilient and Integrated Development (GARID) project.

5.13 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of the Interior

5.13.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 43 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **56.4** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 43: Performance of CD, the Interior in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Strengthening legislative framework of the Sector Agencies	NACOB Bill prepared and submitted to Parliament Cabinet Memorandum on the Public Order (Amendment) Bill submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Facilitate the engagement of Parliament with other stakeholders • Submit report to Parliament • Constitute Team to prepare Cabinet Memorandum • Facilitate Team's work • Review Cabinet Memo and submit to Hon. Minister for approval	**Target achieved**. NACOB Bill prepared and submitted to Parliament. Letter of 25th March 2019. NACOB Bill gazetted. **Target achieved.** Cabinet Memorandum on the Public Order (Amendment) Bill dated 10th October, 2019 submitted to Cabinet.	12	12
2.	Improving upon conflict resolution nation-wide	MMDCEs (Volta, Eastern, Central and Ashanti Regions) and Political Parties engaged Construction works on "Peace House"	• Facilitate the release of funds for work • Constitute a team to monitor activities • Submit report to	**Target achieved.** MMDCEs andPolitical Parties engaged and report available and submitted to Hon Minister. **Target achieved.** Materials for the construction have been	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
		commenced.	Minister • Constitute a monitoring team • Facilitate the release of funds for the renovation • Review report and submit to Minister	conveyed to site awaiting the Police to complete the investigation into the demolition of building on site. Site Plan for building available.		
3.	Maintaining law, order, security and preventing crime	1,000 officers recruited into the Security Services Logistics of the security services improved	• Facilitate recruitment into security services • Monitor recruitment process • Review report and submit to minister • Facilitate the release of funds for the procurement of appropriate logistics and equipment • Prepare and submit report to Minister • Facilitate the release of approved funding • Monitor	**Target achieved.** Facilitated recruitment into the Security Services. A total of 5,740 persons recruited in the Security Services. **Target achieved.** 668 vehicles and 122 Motorbikes procured for the Ghana Police Service. Modern communication and policing equipment procured for the Ghana Police Service. 11 command vehicles and four 32 Seater Mini Buses procured for the GNFS. Procured retrofitted marine patrol boat for	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Nsawam Project (50%) continued	progress of work • Review monitoring report and submit to Minister	the Marine Police. Status report available with CD's review. **Target achieved.** Nsawam Project continued with 55% completion. A monitoring report available with CD's review.		
4.	Ensuring general safety and security	Effective strategies to reduce incidents of flooding, fire and natural disasters developed Procure hydraulic platform to fight fire	• Facilitate the setting up of committee to develop strategic report • Facilitate the provision of funds • Prepare and submit report to Minister • Facilitate the release of funds for the procurement of the hydraulic platform	**Target not achieved.** Committee inaugurated. Work done focussing on earthquakes initially. Final report submitted to the Ministry. **Target not achieved.** Procurement process of two (2) hydraulic platforms completed. Suppliers yet to deliver.	12	8.4
5.	Sanitising the Migration Environment	Establishment of the Ghana National Migration Commission (GNMC) initiated	• Set up a Committee for the establishment of GNCM • Facilitate the provision of funds	**Target achieved.** The working group for theGhana National Migration Commission inaugurated. Two (2) meeting held with one (1) minutes of	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Migration Desk Offices in the Ministries set up	• Review report of Committee • Facilitate the setting up of Migration Desk Offices • Facilitate the training of desk officers • Prepare and submit report to Minister	meetings available. **Target achieved.** Twenty-five (25) Migration Desk Offices in the Ministries set up. Training conducted for the officers in charge and report available.		
Sub-Total					**56.4**	

5.13.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **29.8** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 44: Performance of CD, the Interior in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 19th March, 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 16th August, 2019.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment with memo dated 27th August, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Letter dated 19th September, 2019 submitting Mid-Year Sector Performance report to OHCS and report available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4.95**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Five (5) Audit Committee meetings held on 20th February, 2019, 19th March, 2019, 15th May, 2019, 22nd August, 2019, 30th September, 2019 and 28th November, 2019. Minutes available. • Memo dated 20th June, 2019 submitting summary of actions taken and attached report on Transport Policy and Risk Management Policy.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of four (4) ETC meetings organised on 14th March, 2019, 16th May, 2019, 11th September, 2019 and 15th October, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
2018 Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 10th April, 2019 instead of March 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.95**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual available dated 2015. Document under review.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec., 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and Letter dated 13th March, 2019 forwarding to OHCS available.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 31st January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Memo dated 6th January, 2019 and 12th June, 2019 submitting the planning and mid-year phases report to CD and letter dated 26th September, 2019 from the Ministry to the OHCS submitting reports on planning and mid-year phase of the staff performance appraisal.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 20th May, 2019. • Evaluation report submitted to OHCS on 29th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• Letter dated 20th February, 2019 submitting Training Plan to OHCS and 2019 Training Plan available		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Letter dated 26th June, 2019 from the Ministry to OHCS submitting mid-year report on the implementation of the training plan • Letter dated 10th January, 2020 from this Ministry to OHCS submitting end of year training report available		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January - December available • Internal Memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 12th August, 2019, available reminding staff on the clock-in-system, verbal cautioning of lateness to work, etc.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analysed reports submitted to CD with memo dated 8th January, 2020 available. • Letter dated 12th December, 2019 instead of November 2019 to OHCS submitting Promotion register and promotion register available.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • Minutes of four (4) meetings dated 29th May, 2019, 3rd July, 2019, 16th October, 2019 and 3rd December, 2019 available.	**2**	**2.0**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter available with evidence of	**4**	**4.0**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	MSDs participation in the review process. • Letter dated 9th April, 2019 requesting for validation meeting with OHCS. • Service Charter of Gaming Commission of Ghana available		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available • CSU officers trained at the CSTC (from 11th-13th November, 2019). Memo dated 15th November, 2019 from Assistant State Protocol Officer (ASPO) through Director, F&A to CD submitting training report available. • Letter dated 20th June, 2019 forwarding mid-year report to OHCS available. • Letter dated 8th January, 2020 from this Ministry to OHCS submitting end of year Client Service compliance report available.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Twitter, Face book. • Reports on quarterly updates of website available. Memos dated 29th March, 2019, 29th June, 2019, 30th September, 2019 and 31st December, 2019 submitting quarterly reports available. Also available is a report on sensitization of the public on client services with memo dated 31st July, 2019 to CD. • Newsletters, brochures and flyers available		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**5.0**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Scanning of documents at the records unit for easy referencing. • Pilot bulk SMS alert to applicants who want the Services of the Ministry introduced for Naturalisation and Private Security Organisation. • 25 Officers trained on warrant generation. Hitherto, the Sector relied on officers from the Ministry of Finance for that activity. Training report available.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring report of Agencies at the sub-national level available. • Evidence of tracking and analysis of public opinion available. Memos from PR through CD to Minister, dated 17th May, 2019, 31st May, 2019, 5th July, 2019, 12th July, 2019, 1st September, 2019 and 1st October, 2019.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of twelve (12) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Involved men and women in training(fire training for all staff) • Report on held talks by Tiens International on general healthy life style and Home Health Education Service on Nutrition and Good Health on 17th and 28th January, 2019 for staff Available		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	• Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Memo from Principal Records Supervisor through Dir F&A to CD dated 15th August, 2019 requesting for approval to engage PRAAD. • Letter dated 16th August, 2019 requesting PRAAD to assess Records Unit. • Letter dated 8th October, 2019 from PRAAD to this Ministry responding to request. • Memo from Principal Records Supervisor to Chief Director dated 6th November, 2019 on the cost involved in decongestion available. • Scanning of documents. • Records officer undertook training.		
e. Management of physical environment	• End of year Physical Environment Report available. • Office environment clean. • Disability friendly access to the Ministry building in place. • Fire sensors/ smoke detectors replaced.		
Overall Total		**29.8**	

5.13.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 45 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 45: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, the Interior

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Public Governance skills	Participate in local training on Public Governance	Participated in Policy and Governance Forum at the Kempinski Hotel Gold Coast City, Accra from Monday 19th to Tuesday, 20th August, 2019. Back to office report available.
2	Contemporary security matters	Participate in International and local Seminars, Workshops and Conferences on Internal Security	Participated in 57th Annual conference of the International Association of Police Women (IAWP) held at Anchorage, Alaska from 23rd to 27th September, 2019. Back to office report available.
3	Executive Leadership and Managerial Skills	Participate in local seminar on executive leadership skills	Participated in Boardroom Financing workshop in UK from 27th July, to 4th August, 2019. Back to office report available.
4	Contemporary Migration Issues	Participate in International programme on Migration	Participated in Migration Governance training workshop organised by the African Union at Fiesta Royale Hotel. 9th – 13th December, 2019. Back to office report available.
5	Contemporary legal matters	Participate in local seminars, workshops and conferences on legal matters	Participated in Seventh Annual Law and Religion in Africa Conference in Botswana from 19th to 21st May, 2019. Participated in Ghana Bar Association Conference from 9th to 13th September, 2019. Back to office report available.
Sub-total			10

5.13.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **96.200** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.13.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD indicated that exercise was a good management tool which must be encouraged and actively implemented. A lot of learning had taken place since the beginning of the exercise. She believed the work being done in the Ministry must have an impact on the society and that was what the exercise strove to achieve. She was thankful to her staff for the support that they gave her in the performance of her duties.

Team's Remarks

The Team remarked that the exercise was not meant to be a punitive measure but to discover strengths and weaknesses and to improve efficiency and effectiveness in the work of Ministries. They emphasised the importance of team work to achieve agreed results since no single officer could do all the work assigned to the Ministry and they were happy to see the level of involvement by the staff of the Ministry.

5.13.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	NACOB Bill prepared and submitted to Parliament	• Letter dated 18th February, 2019 from AG's office requesting Ghana Publishers to Gazette the Bill available. • Letter dated 25th March, 2019 from this Ministry to the Parliamentary Select Committee on Defence and Interior submitting the revised proposed amendments on the Bill. • Letter dated 9th April, 2019 from Parliamentary Service, acknowledging receipt of revised proposed amendment available. • Letter dated 7th May, 2019 on concerns raised by EaveDrop Resources Limited on the NACOB Bill. • Letter dated 16/5/2019 forwarding EaveDrop's concern to Parliament. • Letter dated 12th July, 2019 from Parliamentary Service on consultative meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on Defence and Interior available. • Memo dated 18th July, 2019 from PPBME Director, through CD to Minister, submitting consultative stakeholder's meeting report. • Letter dated 16th August, 2019 submitted NACOB's letter and

		revised aspect of Bill to AG's Department for consideration.
	Cabinet Memorandum on the Public Order (Amendment) Bill	• Letter dated 19th August, 2019 from the Ministry to AG requesting for an update on the Public Order Amendment Bill. • Letter dated 27th August, 2019 from AG submitting revised Bill to the Ministry available. • Memo dated 28th August, 2019 on the constitution of team to prepare Cabinet Memorandum. • Memo dated 17th September, 2019 from Director, PPME through CD to Minister submitting draft Cabinet Memo on Public Order Amendment Bill. • Memo dated 4th October, 2019 from the Director PPBME through Director F&A to Minister requesting for his signature on the Cabinet Memo and Public Order Amendment Bill available. • Letter dated 10th October, 2019 from the Ministry to Cabinet Secretariat submitting Public Order Amendment Bill available. • Public Order Amendment Bill available. • Cabinet Memo on the Public Order Amendment Bill available. • Acknowledgement letter dated 15th October, 2019 from Cabinet Secretariat received.
2.	MMDCEs (Volta, Eastern, Central and Ashanti Regions) and Political Parties engaged	• Invitation letter from NPC to the Ministry dated 17th January, 2019 to dialogue on vigilante menace in Ghana's Democracy and Concept Note. • Invitation letter from NPC to the Ministry dated 7th June, 2019 on dialogue, mediation and negotiation. Concept Note attached. • Memo from DD through Director F&A to CD dated 28th June, 2019 submitting report on dialogue, mediation and negotiation. • Memo dated 9th July, 2019 from DD through CD to Minister submitting reviewed report. • Memo dated 19th September, 2019 from Director, PPBME through CD to Minister submitting report on vigilante dialogue between the NDC and NPP available.
	Construction works of Peace House commenced	• Letter dated 21st May, 2019 from the National Peace Council to the Ministry on the demolition of bungalow No 29. Osu allocated to the NPC. • Project design. • Letter dated 8th July, 2019 from the Ministry to the IGP responding to the request for official search. • Memo dated 29th August, 2019 from Director, PPBMED to CD seeking approval to constitute a monitoring team available. • Memo dated 11th September, 2019 submitting monitoring report

		and report to the CD from the Director, PPBMED available. • Memo dated 17th September, 2019 from CD submitting reviewed monitoring report to Minister (and report) available. • Site plan of Peace House available. • Memo dated 12th December, 2019 from the Dir, PPBME through the CD to the Minister submitting status report on demolition of Peace House available.
3.	1,000 officers recruited into the Security Services	• Letter dated 14th January, 2019 from Prisons Service to MoF through the Ministry requesting financial clearance to recruit. • Letter dated 24th April, 2019 from this Ministry to MoF forwarding Prison Financial Clearance request. • Letter dated 12th March, 2019 from Fire Service inviting the Ministry to the passing out of 398 fire recruits 48. • Letter dated 1st April, 2019 from Fire Service informing the Ministry on progress of fire recruitment. • Letter dated 10th April, 2019 from Immigration Service inviting CD to graduation ceremony. • Letter dated 25th April, 2019 from the Ministry to MoF justifying the need for financial clearance for Ghana Immigration Service. • Letter dated 2nd July, 2019 from Prisons Service inviting the Minister to passing out. • Letter of appreciation from Prisons Service dated 8th August, 2019. • Police (276), Prisons (436), Fire (909) and Immigration (300) passing out brochures. • Memo dated 24th December, 2019 from CD to Minister submitting report on recruitments by the Agencies available.
	Logistics of the security services improved	• Letter dated 26th March, 2019 from the Ministry to MoF requesting for commencement certificate to execute work. • Letter from the Ministry dated 1st April, 2019 requesting Ministry of Finance to release funds to pay suppliers of Prisons Service. • Letter dated 1st April, 2019 from the Ministry requesting Ministry of Finance for commencement certificate to purchase vehicles for Police Service. • Letter dated 3rd April, 2019 from the Ministry to MoF requesting for release of funds for NADMO's 2018 CAPEX. • Letter dated 24th April, 2019 from MoF releasing funds to pay Capital Expenditure in favour of NADMO. • Letter dated 24th April, 2019 from the Ministry requesting commencement certificate from Ministry of Finance to purchase

		vehicles, motor cycles, computers and accessories for NADMO. • Letter dated 2nd May, 2019 from the Ministry to Ministry of Finance requesting for funds to pay for the supply of lights bars for the Police Service. • Letter dated 3rd may, 2019 from the Ministry to MoF requesting for additional funding to procure fumigation items for inmates. • Letter dated 6th May, 2019 from the Ministry to NADMO informing it of MoF's release of funds to pay Capital Expenditure. • Letter dated 13th May, 2019 from NADMO requesting for additional warrant for 2019 CAPEX. • Letter from Office of the President dated 21st May, 2019 approving NACOB's purchase of vehicle. • Letter from Ministry to NACOB dated 3rd June, 2019 informing OOP's approval to purchase vehicle. • Letter from the Ministry to MoF dated 20th June, 2019 and attachments requesting for commencement/virement for construction of armoury and procurement of weapons and ammunitions for Immigration Service. • Letter from Ministry to MoF and supporting documents on request for commencement warrant for emergency relief items dated 21st June, 2019. • Letter dated 1st August, 2019 from GIS submitting achievement of the Service. • Letter dated 7th August, 2019 from MoF granting authorisation for Police Service to procure vehicles and equipment. • Letter dated 26th August, 2019 from NADMO to Chief of Staff (COS) through MINTER on application to procure 36 vehicles available. • Letter dated 30th August, 2019 from this Ministry to COS submitting NADMO's request available. • Letter dated 6th September, 2019 from COS approving NADMO's request to procure a vehicle available. • Letter dated 17th September, 2019 from this Ministry to NADMO informing it of COS's approval to procure vehicles available. • Letter dated 19th August, 2019 from the Ministry to Finance requesting for virement within CAPEX, in favour of NADMO available. • Letter dated 9th October, 2019 from MOF to this Ministry approving NADMO's virement request available. • Letter dated 15th October, 2019 from this Ministry to NADMO informing it of MOF's approval to vire available.

		• Letter dated 26th September, 2019 from NADMO on Digital Development Strategy and Policy for Ghana available. • Letter dated 27th November, 2019 from this Ministry to the Central Tender Review Committee (MoF) forwarding NADMO's request available. • Letter dated 20th December, 2019 from the Central Tender Review Committee (MoF) approving NADMO's request available. • Letter from this Ministry to NADMO informing it of the Central Tender Review Committee's approval available. • Letter dated 28th October, 2019 from the National Peace Council requesting for funds available. • Letter dated 1st November, 2019 from this Ministry to the Ministry of Finance forwarding Peace Council's report available. • Letter dated 16th October, 2019 from this Ministry to Toyota Company notifying award of contract to supply vehicles. • Letter dated 16th October, 2019 from the Ministry to THP Ghana Limited notifying award of contract to supply vehicles. • Letter dated 31st October, 2019 from this Ministry to Ministry of Finance for the release of funds to purchase vehicles.
	Nsawam Project (50%) continued	• Letter dated 25th March, 2019 from Prisons Service requesting for funds to pay for works done. • Letter dated 1st April, 2019 to Ministry of Finance on request for funds to pay for work executed on the construction of Remand Prison Facilities in Nsawam. • Letter dated 1st April, 2019 from the Ministry to MoF requesting for Funds to pay for work done on Nsawam Project. • Letter dated 31st May, 2019 from the Ministry to Prisons Service on release of Funds from MoF. • Memo dated 11th September, 20199 from Director, PPBME submitting monitoring report to CD available. o CD's comment to summarise for Minister. • Memo dated 17th September, 2019 from CD submitting reviewed report to Minister available. • Memo dated 20th December, 2019 from Director, PPBME through CD to Minister submitting Nsawam Project monitoring report available.
4.	Effective strategies to reduce incidents of flooding, fire and natural disasters developed	• Letter dated 7th March, 2019 from the Office of the President for the formation of Earthquake Preparedness and Response Committee. • Letter dated 11th March, 2019 from the Ministry to Committee

		members indicating date for inauguration ceremony. • Letter dated 12th March, 2019 from the Ministry to committee members confirming the appointment. • Website dated 12th March, 2019 posting information on inauguration of Earthquake Committee. • Letter dated 13th March, 2019 from the Ministry requesting for funds from the Office of the President for the Earthquake Committee. • Letter dated 14th March, 2019 from Office of the President for additional committee member. • Letter dated 28th March, 2019 to Office of the President expressing appreciation for supporting Earthquake Committee. • Letter dated 29th March, 2019 from the Ministry to NADMO informing it of the additional committee member. • Letter dated 18th April, 2019 from NADMO requesting for extension of time to submit the earthquake report. • Letter dated 18th April, 2019 from NADMO inviting UNDP to a meeting on Earthquake • Summary report on committee's work available. • Letter dated 4th November, 2019 from the Ministry to the Earthquake Committee Chairperson requesting her to submit the Committee's report. • Letter dated 31st December, 2019 from the Ministry to the Earthquake Committee Chairperson reminding her to submit the Committee's report available.
	Procure hydraulic platform to fight fire	• Letter dated 11th July, 2019 from the Ministry to Fire Service on establishment of irrevocable and confirmed stand by letter of credit. • Letter dated 16th July, 2019 from the Ministry to Fire Service on establishment of irrevocable and confirmed stand by letter of credit. • Letter dated 31st December, 2019 to the Ghana National Fire Service requesting for status on the procurement of the hydraulic platform available.
5.	Establishment of the Ghana National Migration Commission (GNMC) initiated	• Memo dated 25th March, 2019 on the establishment of the Ghana National Migration Commission (GNMC) to Minister, from DD,MU, through CD to Minister. CD's minutes to Minister. • Memo dated 27th March, 2019 submitting proposed working group for the establishment of the Ghana National Migration Commission from DD (2) MU to CD. • CD's minutes giving approval. • Invitation letter from the Ministry to committee members for the

		GNCM establishment dated 23rd July, 2019. • Invitation letter for a meeting dated 4th November, 2019 from the Ministry to the working group available. • Memo dated 13th November, 2019 from DD, MU through CD to Minister requesting his availability to launch the working group available. • CD's comments available. • Minister's speech for inauguration available. • Meeting schedule for the working group available. • Minutes of meeting held on 21st November, 2019 available. • Invitation letter for a meeting dated 2nd December, 2019 to working group available. • Nomination letter to Chairperson of working group dated 3/12/19 available.
	Migration Desk Offices in the Ministries set up	• Response letter from MOF dated 16th January, 2019. • Response letters from AG's Dept and MELR dated 4th April, 2019. • Response letter from National Population Council dated 9th April, 2019. • Response letter from Ministry of Gender dated 17th April, 2019. • Response letter from Ministry of Information dated 18th April, 2019. • Response letter from Office of the President dated 29th April, 2019. • Memo dated 25th March, 2019 on implementation of the National Migration Policy from DD MU through CD to Minister. • CD's minutes for MU to proceed after approval from Minister. • Appeal for funds to International Organisation for Migration (OIM) from this Ministry, dated 3rd December, 2019, to organise workshop for Desk officers. • Invitation letters dated 11th December, 2019 to Desk officers on capacity building available. • Memo dated 24th December, 2019 from DD, MU through Head of MU to CD submitting report on desk officers' workshop available.

5.14 Performance of the Chief Director, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice

5.14.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 46 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **58** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 46: Performance of CD, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Generating evidence to support administration of justice	Article on the 2018 research findings prepared and published Research into any policy or socio-economic issue in the justice sector undertaken	• Review and approve the article for publication • Facilitate the release of funds and logistics for the Newsletter (i.e. Legal Bulletin) publication • Review and approve one topic/area for the research • Request, review and approve a synopsis on the topic from RSIM team • Facilitate the process and release of funds for data gathering and analysis • Review research report • Brief Hon. AG on	**Target achieved.** Article published on the Ministry's website and also in the Ministry's publication, Legal Bulletin, Issue 7, 2019. **Target achieved.** Research synopsis developed and reviewed by CD. Research Report on stakeholder perceptions on the effectiveness of the legal and justice sector reform programme available. CD's review available. Brief to the HM on the Research findings available.	12	12

			the research findings			
2.	Strengthening Ministerial Oversight of the Departments and Agencies	Meeting on 2018 end of year M&E findings organised	• Convene a meeting on the 2018 M&E report • Facilitate the release of logistics for the meeting • Review of the meeting report	**Target achieved.** Meeting held and report with CD's review available.	12	12
3.	Improving inter-agency and cross-sectoral legal coordination	Data on ICT infrastructure from Regional Offices for the Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) project collected	• Set up a team for the exercise • Facilitate the release of funds for the team to undertake the exercise • Review of the report	**Target achieved.** Report dated June, 2019 on ICT capacity and equipment needs assessment across the Regions available (E-Transform). At the implementation stage of the project. Taking delivery of scanners, printers, etc. Software developed.	12	12
4.	Enhancing public confidence, transparency and responsiveness of the justice and administrative systems	State Attorneys' Court attendance and status of cases in court for 2019 monitored and report produced All legal claims defended and	• Set up monitoring team for the exercise • Facilitate the provision of logistics and funds for the exercise • Review of mid and end of year court monitoring reports • Facilitate the	**Target achieved.** Monitoring team set up. Mid and end of year court monitoring reports with CD's review available. **Target achieved.** Summary report on	12	12

		reversed trends where huge monetary awards are made against the State	release of approved funding for State Attorneys to work • Review of the summary report of cases successfully defended	Civil cases successfully defended as well as petitions and legislation dealt with as of mid and end of year available.		
5.	Strengthening the machinery for fighting corruption and building public capacity to condemn and fight corruption	Data on the following generated: 1. Number of corruption cases reported to the OSP (60 cases targeted) 2. % of corruption cases OSP investigated (55% targeted) 3. % of corruption cases for which OSP initiated prosecutions (40% targeted) Ensured continued implementation of the Ministry's activities/roles under NACAP **Sub-target 2.1:** 120 various interest groups on Whistleblower's Act, 2006 (Act 720) and procurement standard clause sensitised	• Request data from OSP to update the Government Results Framework of High Priorities • Set up a committee to plan the sensitisation programme/workshop • Facilitate the mobilisation of resources • Facilitate the organisation of the sensitisation workshop • Review of report of sensitisation programme/workshop • Put together a team to produce a draft SHP • Facilitate the provision of logistics and funds for the exercise • Review of the draft SHP	**Target partially achieved.** Data from the Office of the Special Prosecutor (OSP) as of mid-year show as follows: 1. **13** corruption cases reported to the OSP. 2. **11** corruption cases under investigations constituting **84%.** 3. **2** corruption cases initiated for prosecution representing **15%.** **Target achieved.** End of year report on the implementation of Ministry's activities/roles under NACAP available. Over 120 various	12	10

			• Submit draft SHP document to Hon. AG	interest groups (reps from all Ministry, MMDAs, CEOs, media, police etc.) sensitised at separate workshops and reports with CD's reviews available. **Target partially achieved.** Team constituted. Draft Sexual Harassment Policy (SHP) with CD's review available. Draft SHP forwarded to the HM for review and directives. Policy yet to be published.		
		Sub target 2.2: Sexual Harassment Policy (SHP) developed and published				
Sub-Total					**58**	

5.14.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **28.995** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 47: Performance of Chief Director, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• SectorAnnual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Directors Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS 8th April, 2019 instead of February 2019.	**4**	**3.9**
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-Year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS on 14th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken and dated 16th September, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Mid-year review session held and Report available dated August, 2019. However there was no ownership of the report.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS on 14th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4.5**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• The team sighted minutes of four (4) quarterly audit committee meetings dated 28th March, 22nd August, 10th October, and 13th December, 2019. • Summary of action report dated 19th December, 2019 to address audit queries available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement Plan available. • Minutes of five (5) Entity Tender Committee meeting dated 1st April, 23rd July, 5th September, 16th and 31st October, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Updated assets register available signed by Estates Officer but **not** authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• 2018 Financial Statement and covering letter forwarding dated 28th February, 2019 available.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.97**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Dated organisational manual available dated 2019.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec., 2018	• Updated Staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Job schedule available but did not have all staff.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available letter dated July, 2019 forwarded to OHCS.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Report submitted on 26th July, 2019 to OHCS.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Reports on Planning and Mid-year on 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• No report on signing since Ministry did not have a Director. • No evaluation undertaken.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan submitted to OHCS 8th April, 2019. • Mid-year 1st August and End-of-year Reports completed and submitted 17th February, 2020.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly report on staff attendance available • Memo dated 31st December, 2019 submitting report on efforts. (letter to a Senior State Attorney to appear before a disciplinary committee)		
g. Report on staff movements	• Report submitted to CD on 31st December, 2019. • Promotion Register submitted to OHCS dated 17th December, 2019 instead of November 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational		**2**	1.625
a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up	• List of members available.		
b. Quarterly meetings organised	• Minutes of meeting dated 26th March, 1st October, and 5th November, 2019.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	**4**
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures	• Service Charter Draft available (August 2019).		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
of the Organisation	• Legal Aid, EOCO, Registrar General's Department available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated CSU office available. • CSU Officers trained at the CSTC. Back to office report available dated 7th November, 2019.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Mid and end year report available submitted to OHCS on 18th June, 2019 and 3rd January, 2020 respectively. • Functional website available Official Facebook. • Quarterly reports showing updates of the website. • Newsletter, brochures, flyers etc. available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**5**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Electronic Case Tracking System initiated. E-case Register developed. CCTV installed.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitor the sub-national activities of the Ministries through the Legal Aid, EOCO and Registrar General's Department operational in three (3) Regions. Memo dated 31st December, 2019 submitting monitoring report at the sub national level available. • Media Tracking- daily media scanning and analysed report developed.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of twelve (12) managements meetings. • Minutes of four (4) staff durbar available. • Report dated 30th December,		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	2019 available for a presentation on gender inclusiveness. • Report on Health Talk by the Pharmaceutical Society of Ghana held on 15th August, 2019 available. • WhatsApp group for all staff, notice board. • Evidence of engagement with PRAAD memo dated 5th November, 2019 for decongestion exercise in the Civil Registry by PRAAD. • Training for records officers' undertaken memo dated 18th November, 2019 submitting a back to office report.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Improvement in the washrooms, paintings undertaken and the car park rehabilitated.		
Overall Total		**28.995**	

NOTE: Since the Ministry did not have Directors at post as well as any Departments, they could not been scored for issues relating to the Performance Agreements with Heads of Departments and Directors/Analogous Grades. The sub-total score should thus be based on 8.5. To get a score relating to 10, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 10/8.5, that is, 1.18.

5.14.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 48 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 48: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Sharpen knowledge in policy making, implementation, and coordination in the public sector, including monitoring and evaluation	Attend workshop	Participated in a forum on the implementation of International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) on 4th June, 2019.
2	Sharpen knowledge in evidence generation and use in support of policy reform in the public service	Attend the 2nd Action to Evidence Conference and Exhibition 2019	Participated in the 2nd Action to Evidence Conference and Exhibition 2019 at the Institute of Statistical, Social and Economic Research (ISSER) of the University of Ghana, Legon from the 9th to 12th July, 2019.
3	Sharpen knowledge in change management, innovation and creativity for value added service delivery in the public service	Attend Conference	Participated in the 10th Conference of Public Service Chief Directors, Chief Executives and Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils at the Capital View Hotel, Koforidua from 17th to 20th October, 2019.
4	Continuous Legal Education	Attend Conference	Participated in the Annual Ghana Bar Association conference in Takoradi from the 9th to 13th September, 2019.
5	Improve knowledge, perception and skills for the effective management of the Ministry	Read one book: '	Report on the Book available. Copy of the book available. The Achiever's Secrets' by Bismark Adu Okyere.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.14.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **96.995** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.14.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD said he and his team had learnt new measures to improve performance. It was his aim to always get things done well and on time. Work done must be systematic and it was important to keep meticulous records on assignments for future reference. He was very appreciative of the exercise which he saw as ensuring that the concept of performance management was at the core of the Ministry's work.

Team's Remarks

In their remarks, the Team indicated that the exercise was not designed to be a punitive measure but to ensure work was properly done to achieve desired results. After all had been well captured, the performance management system culture would well ingrained in the work of all staff of the Ministry and ultimately the Civil Service. The Team encouraged the CD to challenge himself by setting much more challenging targets in the next Agreement to be signed.

5.14.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Article on the 2018 research findings prepared and published	• Memo dated 24th June, 2019 for publication of article on the website with CD's minutes. • Letters dated 18th February, 2019, 14th March, 2019, 29th April, 2019, 9th May, 2019 and 15th August, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods and services. • Procurement of office equipment— Memo dated 23rd December, 2019 has CD's approval for release of funds for Legal Bulletin Editorial Team.
	Research into any policy or socio-economic issue in the justice sector undertaken	• Memo dated 17th May, 2019 from RSIM team proposing three areas and recommended the Justice Reform Programme. CD's minutes indicate his review and approval. • Memo dated 26th July, 2019 submitting draft research synopsis has CD's minutes indicating his review and approval. • Letter dated 15th August, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods and services for third quarter—Memo dated 21st October, 2019 has CD's approval for release of funds for the conduct of the study. • Memo conveying the research report dated 4th November, 2019 has CD's minutes indicating his review. • Memo from CD dated 11th November, 2019 to AG on key

		findings of the research report.
2.	Meeting on 2018 end of year M&E findings organised	• Invitation letter for meeting signed by CD dated 6th February, 2019. • Letter dated 18th February, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods and services for the first quarter. • Memo conveying the meeting report dated 27th February, 2019 has CD's minutes indicating his review.
3.	Data on ICT infrastructure from Regional Offices for the Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) project collected	• Memo dated 6th May, 2019 setting up data collection team; and giving a status update on the IIMS project—with CD's minutes indicating his approval. • Letters dated 29th April, 2019 & 9th May, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods & services for the second quarter and procurement of office equipment. • Memo submitting the report on ICT capacity and equipment needs assessment dated 22nd August, 2019 has CD's minutes indicating his review.
4.	State Attorneys' Court attendance and status of cases in court for 2019 monitored and report produced	• Memo setting up court monitoring team with ToRs dated 28th February, 2019 to the CD Memos dated 29th July, 2019 and 27th December, 2019 has CD's approval for release of allowances for mid and end of year court monitoring exercise. • Memos dated 29th July, 2019 and 27th December, 2019 submitting mid and end year court monitoring reports have CD's minutes indicating his review.
	All legal claims defended and reversed trends where huge monetary awards are made against the State	• Letters dated 18th February, 2019, 14th March, 2019 & 29th April, 2019, 29th August, 2019, 15th August, 2019 & 15th October, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods & services and various letters on office equipment, fuel & book subsidy allowance to Attorneys, etc. • Memos dated 30th July, 2019 and 30th December, 2019 submitting mid and end of year summary report on cases successfully defended as well as petitions and legislation dealt has CD's minutes indicating his review.
5.	Data on the following generated: 1. Number of corruption cases reported to the OSP (60 cases targeted)	• Letter of 26th June, 2019 from the CD to the Special Prosecutor requesting for cases reported—Letter dated 8th July, 2019 from CD to the M&E Minister submitting the 2ndquarter performance report on the Ministry's high priority programmes.

	2. % of corruption cases OSP investigated (55% targeted) 3. % of corruption cases for which OSP initiated prosecutions (40% targeted)	
	Ensured continued implementation of the Ministry's activities/roles under NACAP **Sub-target 2.1:** 120 various interest groups on Whistleblower's Act, 2006 (Act 720) and procurement standard clause sensitised	• Memo dated 14th May, 2019 setting up a committee to plan the sensitisation workshops with CD's minutes—Minutes of meeting of Planning Committee dated 10th September, 2019 available. • Letters dated 29th April, 2019 22nd July, 2019, 15th August, 2019 and 15th October, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods and services and allowances for staff—Memos dated 04th September, 2019 and 27th November, 2019 on approval for release of funds for the workshops. • Invitation letters and memos dated 17th September, 2019, 16th September, 2019 and 28th November, 2019 signed by CD for the 1st and 2nd sensitisation workshops scheduled for 30th September, 2019 and 12th December, 2019 respectively. • Memos submitting the reports dated 8th October, 2019 and 20th December, 2019 on the 1st and 2nd sensitisation respectively have CD's minutes indicating his review.
	Sub target 2.2: Sexual Harassment Policy (SHP) developed and published	• Memo dated 24th June, 2019 on staff nominated for the SHP committee to the CD—Memo dated 16th May, 2019 from CD initiating the process—Minutes of meetings of the committee available. • Letters dated 29th April, 2019, 15th August, 2019 and 15th October, 2019 on MoF approval for release of funds for goods and services, allowances for the 2nd and 3rd quarters—Memos dated 15th July, 2019, 30th July, 2019, 21st August, 2019 and 4th September, 2019 on approval for release of funds for the SHP committee. • Memo dated 4th September, 2019 submitting draft SHP document has CD's comments indicating his review. • Memo dated 24th October, 2019 from CD conveyed the draft SHP document for Hon. AG's review and directives.

5.15 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection

5.15.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 49 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **58.8** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 49: Performance of CD, Gender, Children and Social Protection in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CDs Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1	Strengthening the Institutional and Legislative Framework	Social Protection Bill finalized and submitted to Cabinet for approval Aged Persons Bill finalised and integrated into Social Protection Bill	• Facilitate meetings for the finalisation of the SP Bill • Facilitate the release of resources • Develop and submit Cabinet Memo • Facilitate meetings for the finalisation of the SP Bill • Facilitate the release of resources • Develop and submit Cabinet Memo • Facilitate the preparation and Submission of Cabinet Memo • Review communication	**Target not achieved.** Held consultative meetings with key stakeholders, finalized the Bill and submitted to the Attorney-General's Department, where the Bill is currently. **Target achieved taking account of proposal from Consultative meetings**. Draft Aged Persons Bill reviewed and finalized by Consultant. Consultative meetings held with stakeholders. Decided that Aged Persons Bill should stand as separate document. Bill submitted to Cabinet. Undated and unauthored Position Paper available.	12	10.8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CDs Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Affirmative Action Bill resubmitted to Cabinet for approval. Advocacy and communication plan developed for the Affirmative Action Bill	and Advocacy Plan • Submit to HM for approval	**Target achieved.** Prepared and submitted Memo to Cabinet on 17th October, 2019. **Target achieved.** The Advocacy and Communication Plan developed. Workshop on the Affirmative Action Bill advocacy and communication strategy plan completed and report available.		
2	Promoting productive inclusion and decent work to	**350,000** Households enrolled on the LEAP Programme in all **252** districts of the country	• Facilitate the processing and release of funds from the MoF for implementation of the LEAP Programme • Facilitate and liaise with DPs for release of funds for implementation • Facilitate the payment of service charges and re-imbursables to Payment Service Provider (PSP)	**Target achieved.** 332,200 households enrolled on LEAP in all 252 Districts. Six (6) Payment cycles conducted with reports available. Quarterly reports available with reviews by CD.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CDs Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate the submission of quarterly and update reports to the Ministry of M&E • Review quarterly update reports and submit to the Ministry of M&E			
3	Strengthening inter-agency framework for Child Protection Information Management System (CPIMS)	Standard Operating Procedures for Inter-sectoral pathway referral Case Management developed	• Facilitate consultative meetings • Facilitate the release of resources • Review and add inputs to SOPs • Submit to HM for approval	**Target achieved.** Standard Operating Procedures for Inter-sectoral pathway referral Case Management finalized for implementation.	12	12
4	Promoting change in the socio-cultural norms and values inhibiting gender equality	International Women's Day commemorated National Dialogue, Media engagement, health walk and debate held	• Review concept note and plan of activities • Facilitate the release of resources • Review Report • Submit to HM • Facilitate the organisation of	**Target achieved.** Concept Note for the celebration prepared. International Women's Day commemorated and report available with review by CD. National Dialogue, Media engagement, health walk and debate held and report available.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CDs Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Nationwide community sensitisation on the 16 Days Activism organised Inter-schools debates on domestic violence organised "What do you know" quiz competition for schools organised	the sensitisation, debates and quiz competition • Facilitate release of resources • Review Reports • Submit to HM • Facilitate the release of resources. • Facilitate the preparation of support letters to CSOs and other Organizations	**Target achieved.** The 16 Days of Activism Against Gender-Based Violence organized to intensify awareness on issues of domestic/sexual and gender-based violence in the country between the 25th of November and 10th of December, 2019. Composite report on all activities with review by CD available.		
		Community Durbar to commemorate the World Day against Trafficking UN Day Commemorated	• Review concept note and theme • Review statement for Minister	**Target achieved.** Community Durbar to commemorate the World Day against Trafficking held from 9th – 10th July. **Target achieved.** UN Day commemorated from 15th – 24th July and report available. Statement to Parliament by Hon Minister on 24th July 2019 seen.		
5	Mainstreaming disability issues into MMDAs work plan	3 Training workshops on the document for MMDAs officials held	• Facilitate the organisation of the workshop & Sensitisation	**Target achieved.** Three (3) training sessions for MMDAs organised.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CDs Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Sensitize the general public on various radio/FM station on Act 715 and Ghana Accessibility Standards on the built environment 3% DACF for persons with disability monitored and evaluated	• Facilitate the release of resources • Review Reports • Submit to HM	Report on training workshops & pictures available. **Target achieved.** Training programme organised for the media Report on training workshop & pictures available. **Target achieved.** Monitoring and evaluation of 3% DACF for persons with disability undertaken. Report available showing total amount received and disbursed to beneficiaries.		
Sub-Total					**58.8**	

5.15.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **28.225** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 50: Performance of CD, Gender, Children and Social Protection in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• SectorAnnual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Directors Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS 9th April, 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-Year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS in 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken and dated September, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Mid-year review session held and Report available dated July, 2019.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• The team sighted minutes of six (6) quarterly audit committee meetings dated 22nd and 23rd January, 19th and 20th June, 21st and 22nd November, 2019. • Summary of action report available.	**5**	**4.5**
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement Plan available. • Minutes of one Entity Tender Committee meeting dated 13th August, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Updated assets register available **not signed** by Estates Officer but authenticated by Internal/External Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• 2018 Financial Statement and covering letter forwarding dated 26th February, 2019 available.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Dated organisational manual available dated 2018.	**10**	**9.95**
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualised job schedules available for all staff.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available letter dated July, 2019 forwarded to OHCS.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• Report submitted on 8th February, 2019 to OHCS. • Memo dated 17th July, 2019 submitting the Planning and Mid-year report to CD. • Report submitted on 30th May, 2019 to OHCS. • Evaluation report submitted to OHCS on 31st January, 2019. • 2019 Training Plan submitted to OHCS 26th March, 2019. • Mid-year report submitted to OHCS on 16th August 2019 and End-of-year Report completed and submitted 31st January, 2020. • Monthly report on staff attendance available. • Memo dated 30th Dec., 2019 submitting report on efforts. (Memo to all staff encouraging them about the working hours. Disciplinary action taken on a Driver who took a vehicle without authorization). • Report submitted on 21st January, 2020. • Promotion Register submitted to OHCS dated 12th December, 2019 instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of members available. • Minutes of meeting dated 16th April, 2019.	**2**	0.875

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	**4**
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter Draft available. • Draft Client Charter for Departments of Gender, Children and Social Protection available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated CSU office available. • CSU Officers trained at the CSTC. Back to office report available dated 6th November, 2019. • Mid and end year report available submitted to OHCS on 4/7/19 and 15th January, 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website available. • Official Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, WhatsApp platforms set up. • All four (4) quarterly reports showing updates of the website available. • Newsletter, brochures, flyers etc. available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**5**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Business meetings held with DPs, after which an Aide Memoire was developed leading to the introduction of the Annual Children's Summit.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Held quarterly meetings with the Departments at the sub-national level. The Social Welfare Department, though has the district staff not under the Ministry, their work is monitored. • Media Tracking- Newspaper cuttings available with evidence		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	of analysis through discussion on a weekly basis.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of thirty-one (31) managements meetings. • Minutes of four (4) staff durbar available. • Report available for the promotion of gender inclusiveness – created a WhatsApp platform for pregnant staff to share ideas. • Report on Health Talk by an eye clinic held on 23rd January, 2019 available. Training on first aid and emergency care in July, 2019 and report available. • WhatsApp group for all staff, notice board		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD dated 5th July, 2019 for an inspection. PRAAD undertook the assignment and submitted a report dated 24th July, 2019. • Training for records officers undertaken from 8th – 10th Oct. 2019. Back to office report available		
e. Management of physical environment	• Beautification of the Ministry. Regular fumigation. Disability friendly access.		
Overall Total		**28.225**	

5.15.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 51 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 51: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Gender, Children and Social Protection

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Upgrade knowledge in social inclusion through fiscal, wage and social protection policies	Attend conference	Participated in the 57th Session of the Commission on Social Development (CSocD57) from 11th to 21st February, 2019 in New York. Back to office report available.
2	Acquire knowledge in how social protection systems	Participate in conference	Participated in the Commission on the Status of Women conference in New York in 11th -23rd March, 2019. Back to office report available.
3	Gain first-hand experience of the problems encountered in the provision of Social Services in Ghana.	Conduct training	Participated in training workshop on Results-Based Planning, Management and Leadership for the Department of Social Welfare Directors. Presentation available.
4	Coordination skills	Attend summit	Participated in the 3-day 2019 summit 'Promoting Social Inclusion: Leave no one behind'. From 26th to 30th August, 2019 Pictorial evidence.
5	Public Administration and Management	Attend meeting	Attended African Association for Public Administration and Management Conference from 3rd – 6th December, 2019. Back to office report available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.15.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **97.025** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.15.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD was grateful to her team for the support that they had given her in the course of the year and encouraged all staff to work hard. She was appreciative of the evaluation team and mentioned that she noticed how the team paid attention to details. Other staff present were glad to be part of the exercise. They appreciated the fact that their inputs had implication on the performance of the CD and remarked that they would do their best to move the Ministry forward.

Team's Remarks

The Team indicated that the exercise was meant to help all staff to understand the need to support the CD as the Ministry implemented its mandate. It also helped to improve the performance management culture in the Civil Service. The Team further intimated that the Agreement should be used as a working document to ensure that all issues in it were addressed in a timely manner. They encouraged staff of the Ministry to see the Agreement as belonging to all of them and not just the Chief Director.

5.15.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Social Protection Bill finalize and submitted to Cabinet for approval	• Various invitation Letter to stakeholders dated 3rd May, 2019. • Memo dated 21st May, 2019 from the Ag. Dir. To CD submitting report on engagement with MDAs and their roles in the implementation of social protection bill. • Report on the stakeholder engagements with MDAs and attendance sheet dated 14th May, 2019. • Memo dated 30th May, 2019 from the Principal Accountant through the CD to Hon. Minister requesting for approval for the release of funds. • Memo dated 28th November, 2039 for the Director Social Protection to the Hon. Minister through the CD requesting for funds to organize a workshop to discuss the comments received form stakeholder consultations on the draft social protection bill from 10th – 13th November, 2019. • Memo dated 19th December, 2019 from the Dir. Social protection to CD submitting report on expert review of the explanatory memo and matrix. • Letter dated 20th December, form the Ministry to the AG's Office submitting the Matrix, the Explanatory memo, of the Social Protection Bill.

	Aged Persons Bill finalised and integrated into Social Protection Bill	• Copy of draft Report on Aged Persons Bill 2019. • Copy of draft Aged Persons Bill 2019. • Undated position paper. • Minutes of advisory committee on ageing and Key stakeholders meeting dated 25th June, 2019. • Minutes and attendance sheet dated 22nd January, 2019 on NAC and key stakeholders meeting submitted by Department of Social Welfare Programme Development Division Focal Person for Ageing (DSW/PDD/FPA). • Memo dated 21st May, 2019 from Assist. Director to CD requesting for funds to roll out activities for the Senior Citizen's Day celebration. • Various invitation letters to the Celebration to stakeholders. • Invitation Letter dated 22nd May, 2019 for NAC and Key stakeholders meeting. • Letter dated 2nd June, 2019 requesting for Venue for the organisation of the Second Quarter NAC and Key Stakeholders meeting. • Memo dated 22nd July, 2019 from Assist. Director, to CD requesting for funds to organize Parliamentary Consultative meeting on the Aged Persons Bill. • Letter dated 22nd August, 2019 requesting for funds to organise Parliamentary Consultative meeting on the aged person from Director, Project. • Memo dated 30th October, 2019 from the DD programmes Division to CD submitting service invoice on Aged activity meeting held at the Cleaver House Conference center. • Comments from the Parliamentary select committee on constitutional and legal consultative meeting on 9th November, 2019. • Report on the inter-ministerial coordinating committee on decentralization from October – November.
	Affirmative Action Bill resubmitted to Cabinet for approval. Advocacy and communication plan developed for the Affirmative	• Copy of letter forwarding Cabinet Memo dated 17th October, 2019. • Memo submitting Communication and Advocacy Plan to Chief Director. • Copy of Approved Plan. • Copy of the Affirmative Action (Gender Equality) Bill, 2019. • Letter dated 14th August, 2019 from the AG's Office

	Action Bill	submitting response to comments from AG on the Affirmative Action Bill. • Invitation letter dated 1st August, 2019 for a workshop on the Affirmative Action Bill Advocacy and Communication Strategy Plan. • Report on Workshop dated 8th August, 2019. • Memo dated 18th December, 2019 from the Ag. Director Gender to the CD submitting advocacy and communication strategy.
2.	**350,000** Households enrolled on the LEAP Programme in all **252** districts of the country	• Softcopy of beneficiaries list on a CD ROM. • Letter dated 14th January 2019 on transfer of funds to Ghana Interbank Payment and Settlements Systems (GhIS) from Fund Manager through CD to Hon. Minister. • Letter 5th April, 2019 submitting first quarter report on Government Priority Programme/Initiatives. • Letters dated 4th March and 14th May respectively requesting for funds for the first (1st) and second (2nd) Quarters. • Memo dated 17th May, 2019 from DD, LEAP to CD to Hon Minister requesting for payment for 58th payment cycle – batch 3. • Copy of Contracts for key staff positions dated 28th June, 2019. • Letter 8th July, 2019 submitting status of budget implementation for second quarter ending 30th June, 2019. • No objection emails from the World Bank dated 16th August, 2019 in relation to "The Engagement of Individual Consultants as Programme Specialist and consultants as MIS Specialist. • Memo dated 16th August, 2019 requesting for IFO Re-imbursables payment for 58th and 59th cycles. • Memo dated 29th November, 2019 from the AD, LEAP to CD to HM requesting for payment IFO reimbursable expenditure to GHIPSS for the supervising the 61st and 62nd payment cycle LEAP. • Letter dated 14th October, 2019 requesting for statutory funds for implementation of the LEAP programme for October – December. • Letter dated 21st October, 2019 submitting the third quarter report. • Letter dated 2nd December, 2019 requesting for funds – UNICEF support for LEAP electronic monitoring and

		reporting roll out.
3.	Standard Operating Procedures for Inter sectoral pathway referral Case Management developed	• Letter dated 15th March, 2019 inviting stakeholders to a 3-day workshop on intersectoral pathway referral for establishing a child and family welfare management information system. • 1st and 2nd Quarter reports dated 1st April and 30th June, 2019 submitted to the Ministry of M&E. • Forwarding Memo for the quarterly report on the Government Flagship Projects dated 5th April, 2019. • Letter dated 8th July, on the status of budget implementation for second quarter ending from CD to Hon. Minister. • Approval of budget and letters for review of referral forms on ISSOP. • Memo dated July 1st submitted for the Approval of budget and Invitation letters for validation meeting. • Memo dated August 8th 2019 submitted for Approval of validation meeting report. • Memo dated August 8th 2019 submitted for Approval of referral pathway report. • Invitation letter dated 15th March, 2019 for a stakeholder consultative meeting to be held on 1st to 3rd April, 2019 at Koforidua, Eastern Region. • Participated in Workshop to give inputs and Revised SOPs available - Attendance Sheet. • Memo dated 21st July, 2019 from Department on Children (DoC) to CD on the submission of documents relating to development of the manual. • Memo dated 16th December, 2019 from Ag. Dir. Children's Department to CD submitting report on the finalization of draft Intersectoral standard operating procedure (ISSOP) document.
4.	International Women's Day commemorated National Dialogue, Media engagement, health walk and debate held	• Letter dated 18th February, 2019 inviting DPs and other stakeholders to the celebration. • Memo dated 20th February, 2019 from Ag. Director to CD submitting the Concept Note on IWD. • Concept paper for International Women's Day and debate with evidence of review available. • Concept paper for the debate on the topic "Balance for better bridging of gender inequalities is a farce with evidence of review available. • Report on fitness walk and Health screening organised on

		2nd March, 2019". • Report on debate held on 4th March, 2019 between St. Mary's SHS and St. Thomas Aquinas College held at Ministries. • Memo dated 13th March, 2019 from the Ag. Director Gender to the CD submitting the final Report on IWD. • Memo dated 30th December, 2019 submitting the final Report on National Dialogue on the Ghanaian Woman held at the La-Palm Royal Beach.
	Nationwide community sensitisation on the 16 Days Activism organised	• Letter 14th October, 2019 inviting stakeholders to a meeting to discuss the 2019 16 Days of Activism against Gender based violence campaign.
	Community Durbar to commemorate the World Day against Trafficking UN Day Commemorated	• Memo dated 4th June, and 27th June, 2019 for request and release of funds for approval. Memos approved towards the commemoration. • Invitation Letters and agenda to stakeholders distributed dated 25th June, 2019, 9th July, 2019 and 10th July, 2019 for community durbar sensitization program towards the final day. • The reviewed and final Concept Note and theme ready as at 24th June, 2019 towards the commemoration. • Letter dated 27th June, 2019 inviting stakeholders to commemorate the UN World Day against Human Trafficking. • Key Note Address for the Hon. Deputy Minister's available. • Hon. Minister and Hon. Deputy Minister's speeches ready for the stakeholders conference on 23rd July, 2019. • Press release for the day and statement to be read on the floor of Parliament prepared and ready as at 24th July, 2019.
5.	3 Training workshops on the document for MMDAs officials held Sensitize the general public on various radio/FM station on Act 715 and Ghana Accessibility Standards on the built environment	• Three (3) Training of Trainers Sessions held on 19th, 20th June, 4th July and 8th August, 2019 respectively. • Report on sensitization meeting held on 14th June, 2019 for 12 Media persons.

	3% DACF for persons with disability monitored and evaluated.	

5.16 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Communications

5.16.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 52 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **51.3** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 52: Performance of CD, Communications in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Migrating from analogue to Digital Terrestrial Television (DTT).	1. Supply and provision of power to 5 (five) regions in the northern sector completed.	• Review completion of work report. • Facilitate monitoring visits to DTT sites	**Target achieved.** Power provided to Nineteen (19) DTT sites in five (5) regions in the northern sector and commissioned. Monitoring undertaken from 18th - 22nd March 2019 and Report submitted by NEDCO with evidence of review by CD available.	**10**	6.8
		2. Publicity and sensitisation activities on the migration intensified	• Constitute Publicity Committee and facilitate its meetings. • Review sensitization report	**Target not achieved.** Publicity activities could not start because of various challenges. However, a committee was set up, review meetings held and minutes of meeting available. Communications brief for the publicity campaign dated 19th March 2019 was available.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		3. Commenced analogue switch off.	Ensure nationwide broadcast /sensitisation	**Target not achieved.** Completed the coverage verification test of DTT signals nationwide. However, the Ghana Standards Authority did not accept the changes proposed but advised the Ministry to publish their specifications to include the CAS and Middleware and this affected the completion of the target.		
2.	Strengthening legislative framework	1. Passage of GMet Amendment Bill 2. Submit Cabinet memo on DTT Policy	• Facilitate GMet engagement with Ministry of Aviation, GAA, GCAA & MoF to agree on new charges stated in the Amendment Bill • Submit drafting instructions to Attorney-General • Review Draft cabinet memo • Forward cabinet	**Target achieved** GMeT Amendment Act passed in July 2019. Copy of Ghana Meteorological Agency Act 1002 (Amendment) Act, 2019 gazetted 24th September 2019 available. **Target achieved** Cabinet Memo on DTT Policy submitted to Cabinet on May 2nd 2019 and approval received on 23rd July 2019. Evidence of draft Cabinet Memo review by the CD	10	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			memo to Cabinet	was verified.		
		3. Cyber Security Policy and Strategy revised		**Target achieved** Cyber Security Policy and Strategy document consolidated and revised.		
			• Organise stakeholder consultation meeting • Review Draft Cyber Security Policy document	Evidence of draft document review by the CD was available.		
		4. Cyber Security Authority established		**Target not achieved.** The Bill, which provides for the establishment of the Authority, is currently with the Office of the AG.		
			• Organise stakeholder consultative meeting • Cabinet memo sent for Minister's review. • Cabinet Memo and Transmittal Letter sent to Cabinet • Seek funding • Invite conference participants • Review	One (1) day stakeholder engagement was held on 26th July 2019 and report available.		
		5. National Digital Roadmap Conference held to review the ICT4AD Policy		**Target not achieved** National Digital Roadmap Conference held in Accra on 15th-16th May, 2019 and draft report with evidence of review by CD available. Roadmap yet to be finalised.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			conference report			
3.	Promoting smart workplace platform	1. Seventy (70) staff members trained on the use of the smart workplace platform	• Analyse report of staff training on smart workplace system.	**Target achieved** Seventy-Six (76) officers were trained and training report with evidence of review by CD was verified.	10	10
4.	Girls-in-ICT Project	2. 600 Girls trained in coding	• Constitute relevant Committees • Review training report • Source for sponsors	**Target achieved** Five hundred and forty-nine (549) and Nine Hundred and Eighty (980) girls were trained in coding in the Western and Central Regions respectively. Training report for the Western Region with evidence of review by the CD was sighted. Draft report for the Central Region was not available. Climax event for 2019 Girls-In-ICT held on 5th November 2019 at the New Examination Centre at the University of Cape Coast and report reviewed by the CD was available.	10	9.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
5.	Operationalisation of the domain name registry	1. Migrated the 'gh' domains from private management to the Domain Name Registry	• Facilitate release of funding • Facilitate staff hiring • Review report on Domain Name registration	**Target not achieved** Discussions on-going with Dr. Quainoo for the transfer of the Ghana domain from private ownership to Government. Letter written for the composition of the Board. Staff recruited to assist NITA to develop a framework for the commencement of the process. Copy of Cabinet approval received on 23rd July 2019 for the operationalization of the Ghana Domain name registry was available. Financial issues yet to be finalised for the migration to be completed	10	7

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
6.	Implementing safer digital Ghana Programme	1. Safer digital Awareness Programme organised 2. Capacity building programme for about 20,000 stakeholders (public, private, business and children)	• Facilitate the organisation of awareness/sensitization meetings and review report. • Facilitate release of funds • Review content of training materials • Formally open training programmes	**Target achieved** Awareness creation programme held on 12th March 2019 and copy of activity report and concept note for the celebration was available. **Target achieved** Forty-two thousand and thirty-nine (42,039) stakeholders were trained with the breakdown of beneficiaries as follows: **39,880 - schools** **2,231 - other stakeholders** Training report was available.	10	10
Sub-Total						**51.3**

5.16.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **27.795** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 53: Performance of Chief Director, Communications in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA -1 Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 22nd March 2019 instead of February 2019.	**4**	**3.75**
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 15th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 27th December, 2019 and approval granted.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Undated report for 15th – 17th August, 2019 meeting available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 30th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Three (3) meetings held with minutes dated 30th January, 4th June and 16th October 2019 available. • Report on actions taken to	**5**	**3.75**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	address issues arising from meetings of the committee sighted.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA on 18th April, 2019. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 22nd March, 24th May, and 10th July, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Assets Register updated but not signed by the Estate Officer and not authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 22nd March, 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Draft Organization Manual available and forwarded to Council on 3rd January, 2019.	10	9.5
o Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
o Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
o Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 10th July, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 31st January, 2019.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades Training programmes Management of discipline Report on staff movements	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument was available. • Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 6th May 2019. • Evaluation conducted but report not available as at the time of reporting. • 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 6th February, 2019. • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 16th July, 2019 and 30th January 2020 respectively. • Monthly reports from January – December available with CD's comments. • Internal Memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 26th& 28th June and 28th & 29th November 2019 available. • Composite analyzed reports dated 27th Dec., 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 29th October, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meetings dated 9th January, 31st July, 13th August,	**2**	**2**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	and 23rd December, 2019 available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. Letter dated 28th October 2019 requesting for approval from the Civil Service Council available. • Service Charter for NCA and GIFEC available.	4	4
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the National Banking College. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 21st August 2019 and 10th February, 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, WhatsApp, platforms and You Tube available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Flyers available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• The Ministry has put in place a rewards system for recognising staff. • Created Directors' group email to share updates on work. • Introduced "ICT challenge" for the National Service Personnel to develop their skills.	5	**4.795**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Miss Geek initiative for girls.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Agencies platform created to share, discuss and decide on issues from the sub-national level. Clients send emails requesting for information and timely responses provided. • Media Tracking- Content Analysis of Newspapers was available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of eleven (11) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of three (3) Staff durbars sighted. • Measures to promote gender inclusiveness – equal opportunity for training and other benefits for all staff. • Report on Eye Screening, NHIS renewal and First Aid for staff. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards, issues discussed and disseminated at Directorates' meetings.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD letter dated 18th July, 2019 and PRAAD's response dated 19th August, 2019 available. Evidence of PRAAD's work done – Survey report available.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Physical environment satisfactory.		
Overall Total		**27.795**	

5.16.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 54 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 54: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Communications

No.	Competencies/Skills Gaps	Planned Actions	CD's Performance
1	Understanding the process for reviewing the sustainable development goals (SDG) and benchmarks	Attend training	Participated in the course "Strengthening stakeholder engagement for the implementation and review of the 2030 SDGs Agenda" online course by UNITAR & UNDESA in April, 2019. Back to office report available.
2	Highest decision-making	Attend ITU Council Meeting	Participated in ITU Council Meeting at Budapest – Hungary in September, 2019. Back to office report available.
3	Current developments in Africa and opportunities for growth on the Africa Continent.	Attend forum	Participated in the World Economic Forum from 4 – 6 September, 2019 Cape Town, South Africa. Back to office report available.
4	International meeting held to review and where necessary revise Radio Regulations	Participate in conference	Participated in the World Radio Communication Conference 2019 in **Sharm el-Sheikh, Egypt** from 28th Oct., – 22nd Nov., 2019. Back to office report.
5	Understanding global partnership development	Attend conference	Participated in the Global Conference on Total official support for sustainable Development (TOSSD) from 4th – 5th June, 2019. Programme available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.16.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **89.095** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.16.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Chief Director thanked the Evaluation team for their time as well as her Directors and other staff for being cooperative and supportive. She appreciated the exercise and had taken note of all the shortfalls and promised to improve upon her performance in the future. The exercise, according to her, had promoted effective team work among the staff.

Team's Remarks

The team mentioned that the exercise had been useful and were really impressed with the CD's efforts and level of preparedness for the evaluation. The workload of the staff was also recognised and the CD was advised to reward the officers adequately to motivate others. According to the Chair, since the inception of the exercise, each evaluation served as a learning opportunity for him because new things were learnt each time during the interaction.

The Team encouraged the staff to continue to work as a team to support the CD since her failure would affect the entire institution. The need to forward all reports to the CD was critical and the Directors were tasked to ensure that their reports were reviewed by the CD.

Meeting with the Hon. Minister

The Team met the Hon. Minister of Communications, Mrs. Ursula Owusu-Ekuful, and explained to her the purpose of the visit and gave an overview of the Performance Management System as being implemented in the Civil Service.

The Minister was impressed with the initiative and shared her thoughts on a number of issues. She was of the opinion that the Performance Management System will help staff improve on their efficiency for the attainment of organisational goals. Some of the concerns raised among others were:

- **High staff turn-over** – due to the technical nature of the Ministry's work, when officers were trained and then posted out of the Ministry, work output was adversely affected. She expressed her displeasure with this arrangement since continuous retraining of newly-posted staff came with high costs and posed a challenge to the work of the Ministry.
- **Restructuring of the existing line Directorates** – She was of the view that Ministries should have a legal department to help address legal issues.
- **Build technical skills** – the Minister explained that lack of technical expertise undesirably impacted on policy formulation and advised that continuous capacity should be built for the technical officers.

- **Upgrade the I.T Class** – She indicated the urgent need for the Head of the Civil Service to focus on upgrading the Information Technology Class to be able to attract the right calibre of staff.
- **Promote Paperless Office/Digital work environment** – The Minister explained that it was critical for the Civil Service to put in a conscious effort towards the change of mind-set of officers to effectively promote this agenda. There was the need to implement the document management system in the Service for effective tracking and information flow within institutions.
- **Confidentiality of documents** – She expressed worry at the rate at which sensitive documents were all over social media and was of the view that the OHCS should take this up seriously.
- **Use of personal email by Officers** – She lamented about the fact that some officers used their personal emails for official business instead of the Ghana.gov addresses. This, she said, exposed Government documents to third parties and had also contributed to the leakage of sensitive documents to the public.

In conclusion, she made the Team aware that her Ministry had signed a contract with Microsoft for software to make it possible to introduce the SMART Workplace system in the Civil Service. This would provide officers with the genuine Microsoft software for their work rather than the current situation where most officers were using pirated versions. Her Ministry would partner the OHCS to pilot the SMART Workplace application and she believed it will go a long way to help with the implementation of the Right to Information Law since all documents will be digitised for easy retrieval. She indicated that the Ministry was sourcing for funding to assist PRAAD's digitisation project to enable the preservation of our records.

She saw in the Chief Director somebody who was very disciplined and willing to learn. The two of them had a very good working relationship.

5.16.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Supply and provision of power to 5 (five) regions in the northern sector completed.	• Memo dated 13th March, 2019 on the subject planned visit for power commissioning of seventeen (17) DTT sites in the northern sector from Director PPME to Ag. Chief Director and copied Hon. Minister seeking approval for monitoring of DTT sites. • Memo dated 2nd April, 2019 on the subject "Inspection Report on Power Commissioning at nineteen (19) DTT sites in the northern sector" from Director PPME to Ag. Chief Director. Report reviewed. • Letter dated 9th April, 2019 on the subject, Invoice: Power Supply to Nineteen (19) DTT sites within NEDCO Operational Area. • Letter dated 10th April, 2019 on the subject, "Power Supply to Nineteen (19) DTT sites within NEDCO Operational Area Reminder for Payment of New Service Connection Fees" from NEDCO. • Memo dated 2nd May, 2019 on the subject "Request for final payment to NEDCO for the provision of dedicated transformers to DTT Sites in the northern sector" from Deputy Director PPME through Director PPME to Hon. Minister and copied Chief Director.

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	Publicity and sensitisation activities on the migration intensified	• Memo dated 4th February, 2019 on the subject "Approval to constitute DTT Publicity Committee" from Director PPME to Ag. Chief Director for approval. • Letter dated 5th February, 2019 on the subject "Review of Publicity Documents for the Digital Terrestrial Television Transmission" inviting various stakeholders to review Publicity Document. • Minutes of meeting for the review of the Publicity Document for the DTT television project held on 7th February, 2019. • Memo dated 19th March 2019 on the subject "Draft Communication Brief for DTT Publicity Campaign" from Director PPME for Ag. Chief Director's attention. • Letter sent to NCA on the cabinet approval and the requirements for the standards for the digital receivers – set-top boxes • Memo dated 3rd December 2019 on the subject "Challenges in completing some of the DTT activities" for 4th Quarter 2019 explains why the Publicity and Sensitization activities were not commenced in the 4th quarter.
	Commenced analogue switch off	• Memo dated 3rd December 2019 on the subject "Challenges in completing some of the DTT Activities" For 4th Quarter 2019 explains why the phased migration from analogue to digital could not commence by end 2019. • The phased migration from analogue to digital TV will be undertaken in 2020.
2.	Passage of GMet Amendment Bill	• Letter dated 6th February, 2019 on the subject "Request for Policy Approval for an Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, ACT 2004 (ACT 682)" to various stakeholders inviting them for a meeting. • Memo dated 12th February, 2019 on the subject "GMET, GACL & GCAA Meeting (Report)" from Joana Davis and Alfred Nortey through the Ag. Chief Director to the Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 28th February, 2019 on the subject "Request for Policy Approval for an Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, ACT 2004 (ACT 682)" inviting various stakeholders to a follow up meeting with H.E. the Vice President. • Memo dated 11th March, 2019 on the subject "Follow up Report on consultative meeting with His Excellency Dr. Mahamudu Bawumia, the Vice President of the Republic of Ghana at the Flagstaff House on 7th March, 2019" from Director PPME to Ag. Chief Director submitting meeting report. • Letter dated 29th January, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Cabinet Memorandum on request for Policy Approval for an Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, 2004 (ACT 682)" to the Secretary to Cabinet. • Letter dated 2nd April, 2019 on the subject "Request for Policy Approval for an Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, 2004

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		(ACT 682)" from the Secretary to Cabinet conveying approval of the Memorandum for the consideration of Parliament. • Letter dated 26th April, 2019 on the subject "Re: Amendment to theGHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, 2004 (ACT 682)" conveying cabinet approval to the Attorney-General for the necessary preparation for onward submission of Amendment Bill to Parliament. • Letter dated 31st May, 2019 on the subject "Re: Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, 2004 (ACT 682)" from the Attorney-General to Minister for Communications for comments on the Amendment Bill. • Letter dated 21st June, 2019 on the subject "Re: Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, 2004 (ACT 682)" to the Attorney-General forwarding the duly signed Amendment Bill for onward submission to Parliament. • Letter dated 9th July, 2019 on the subject "Re: Amendment to the GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY ACT, 2004 (ACT 682)" from the Attorney-General informing the Ministry that the Amendment Bill had been sent for its publication in the Gazette for introduction in Parliament. • Letter dated 30th July, 2019 on the subject "GHANA METEOROLOGICAL AGENCY (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2019" from the Attorney-General to the Chairman of the Parliamentary Select Committee on Communications and copied the Minister for Communications. • Newspaper publication in the Ghanaian Times of Wednesday, 7th August, 2019 page 27 on the passing of the GMeT Amendment Act.
	Submit Cabinet memo on DTT Policy	• Memo dated 18th April, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Cabinet Memorandum on DTT Policy" from Director PPME to Chief Director for review. • Memo dated 25TH April, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Cabinet Memorandum on DTT Policy" from Director PPME through Chief Director to Hon. Minister for her signature. • Memo dated 2nd May, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Cabinet Memorandum on DTT Policy" from Director PPME to Chief Director for signature. • Letter dated 2nd May, 2019 on the subject "Submission Of Cabinet Memorandum on request for approval of the Digital Terrestrial Television Policy to Guide the Migration from Analogue to Digital Terrestrial Television Broadcasting" signed by the Chief Director to the Secretary to Cabinet.
	Cyber Security Policy and Strategy	• Memo dated 10th April 2019 on the subject "Recommendations from the 2-Day National Cyber Security Technical Working Group (NCSTWG) Retreat" with Hon. Minister April 5-6, 2019 from Cyber Security Advisor through

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	revised	Chief Director to Hon. Minister. • Memo dated 15th April, 2019 on the subject "Review of National Cyber Security Policy and Strategy from the Cyber Security Advisor" to the Chief Director for review of the National Cyber Security Policy and Strategy. • Memo dated 1st August, 2019 on the subject "Report on the one (1) day workshop with the Heads of Security Agencies from Cyber Security Advisor" through the Chief Director to Hon. Minister.
	Cyber Security Authority established	• Memo dated 5TH August, 2019 on the Subject "Review of Cyber security Bill from Cyber Security Advisor" to Chief Director for review. • Memo dated 6th August, 2019 on the Subject "Brief on Cyber Security Bill (Cyber security Authority Bill & Lawful Interception Bill) from Cyber Security Advisor" to Hon. Minister through Chief Director. • Memo dated 20th August, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Draft Cyber Security Bill from Chief Director" to the Hon. Minister for her consideration. • Memo dated November 13, 2019 "Submitting draft Cabinet Memo" for Chief Director's attention.
	National Digital Roadmap Conference held to review the ICT4AD Policy	• Sponsorship letters on the subject "Request for Sponsorship for the Digital Roadmap Conference 2019 dated 13th March, 14th March and 1st April, 2019" to various institutions for sponsorship. • Invitation letters dated 6th, May, 2019 on the subject "Invitation to Participate in Digital Roadmap Conference 2019 Labadi Beach Hotel 15th And 16th March, 2019" inviting various stakeholders to the Conference. • List of Participants who attended the conference on the 15th and 16th May, 2019 at the Labadi Beach Hotel. • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Draft Report on Digital Roadmap Conference from Deputy Director F&A to Chief Director" submitting draft Conference Report for review. • Letter of Appreciation dated 22nd May, 2019 on the subject "Letter Of Appreciation Ghana Digital Roadmap Conference 2019" signed by the Chief Director to sponsors, speakers and moderators.
3.	Seventy (70) staff members trained on the use of the smart workplace platform	• Memo dated 15th July on the subject "Report on Smartworkplace Project of MOC" from Director IT to Chief Director for her review. • Memo dated November 13th 2019 submitting final SMARTWORKPLACE Training Report to Chief Director. • Contract awarded for the E-MOC which involves the full implementation of the SMARTWORKPLACE including the digitization of records, tracking of correspondence, use of internal emails, etc.

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
4	600 Girls trained in coding	• Memo dated 21st March, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Inception Meeting Report Western Region Girls-In- ICT Initiative" from Director PPME to AG. Chief Director. • Minutes of meeting held on Monday 29th April, 2019 to constitute the various subcommittees for the Girls-in-ICT planning. • Memo dated 3rd April, 2019 on the subject "2019 Girls-In-ICT Initiative Constitution of Planning Committee" from Director PPME to Chief Director seeking approval. • Memo dated 3rd April, 2019 on the subject "2019 Girls-In- ICT Terms of Reference for committee and subcommittees" from Director PPME to Chief Director seeking approval. • Three minutes of committee meetings held on 2nd May, 13th May and 12th June 2019. • Memo dated 14th May, 2019 on the subject "Progress of Work of the Girls-In-ICT Committee" from Deputy Director PPME through Director F&A to Chief Director. • Sponsorship letter dated 2nd April, 2019 on the subject "Support for the Celebration of the 2019 Girls-In- ICT Initiative in Western Region" to NCA seeking sponsorship. • Sponsorship letter dated 17th May, 2019 on the subject "Request for Sponsorship for the Climax of the 2019 Girls-In- ICT Day Celebration 27th May 2019, Takoradi, Western Region" to GIFEC. • Memo dated 24th April, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Report on the Training of the selected Girls – Western Region" from Director PPME to Chief Director for review. • Memo dated 25th June, 2019 on the subject "Submission of 2019 National Girls-In-ICT Celebration Report- Western Region" from Director PPME to Chief Director for her review and onward submission to Hon. Minister. • Memo dated 5th July, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Venue Inspection Report for 2019 Girls-In- ICT Central Region" from Director PPME through Chief Director to Hon. Minister. • Memo dated 30th July, 2019 on the subject "Submission of Inception Meeting and CICS Inspection Meeting Report for 2019 Girls-In- ICT Central Region" from Director PPME through Chief Director to Hon. Minister. • Memo dated 21st August, 2019 on the subject "Approval to Procure the Services of an Event Organizer" from Director PPME to Chief Director • Memo dated 10th September, 2019 on the subject "Request for Support for the National Girl's-In-ICT Celebration Central Region" from Director PPME submitting sponsorship letters through Chief Director for Hon. Minister's signature. • Memo dated 1st October, 2019 on the subject "Invitation Letters for Climax of

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		the National Girl's-In- ICT Celebration Central Region" from Director PPME submitting invitation letters through Chief Director for Hon. Deputy Minister's signature. • Memo dated 1st October, 2019 on the subject "Invitation Letters for Mentor for the Mentorship Day for the National Girl's-In-ICT Celebration Central Region" from Director PPME submitting invitation letters through Chief Director for Hon. Deputy Minister's signature.
5.	Migrated the 'gh' domain from private management to the Domain Name Registry	• Cabinet by a letter dated 23rd July 2019 approved funding from the National Communications Authority for the operationalization of the Ghana Domain Name Registry in the sum of GHC5, 370,000.00. • Letter dated 10th September, 2019 on the subject "Operationalization of the Ghana Domain Name Registry" to NCA conveying decision of Cabinet and requesting for release of funds for GDNR. • Memo to Chief Director dated 16th October, 2019 submitting "Draft MoU for the re-delegation of Ghana Dot Com and the Ghana Domain Name Registry" for review.
6.	Safer digital Awareness Programme organised	• Memo dated 21st January, 2019 on the subject "Safer Internet Day from Cyber Security Advisor" to the Ag. Chief Director informing of the Safer Internet Day and concept note slated for 5th February, 2019. • Memo dated 8th February 2019 on the subject "Safer Internet Day from Cyber Security Advisor" to Ag. Chief Director forwarding report on the celebrations. • Memo dated 8th March, 2019 on the subject "Child-In-Tech Conference, March 11-12, 2019" from Cyber Security Advisor to the Ag. Chief Director informing her of the proposed program outline. • Memo dated 12th March, 2019 on the subject "Child-In-Tech" Conference, at the Accra Digital Center from the Cyber Security Advisor to the Hon. Minister on the conference.
	Capacity building programme for about 20,000 stakeholders (public, private, business and children	• Memo dated 5th March 2019 on the subject "Upcoming Glacy+ Activities March 18-22, 2019" from Cyber Security Advisor to Chief Director informing of the upcoming event. • Memo dated 25th March, 2019 on the subject "Report on Glacy+ Activities March 18-22, 2019" from Cyber Security to Ag. Chief Director. • Memo dated 30th August, 2019 on the subject "Request for nomination" from the Ministry to the Planning Committee of the National Cyber Security Awareness Month (October) to Chief Director. • Memo dated 10th September, 2019 on the subject "Training Material for Cyber Security Awareness Month (October)" for Chief Director's review.

TPAs	TARGETS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		• Memo dated 17th October, 2019 submitting Draft Speech to be delivered by the Hon. Minister at the Climax of the National Cyber Security Awareness Month for Chief Director's review. • Memo dated 11th December, 2019 submitting draft report on the National Cyber Security Awareness Month including details on the capacity building programme for the attention and review of Chief Director.

5.17 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Education

5.17.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 55 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 55: Performance of CD, Education in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Improving Planning and Management Efficiency in the Delivery of Education	2019 Education Sector Performance Report Produced and Disseminated to relevant Stakeholders. 2019 National Education Week (NEW) Organised 2019 National School Census Organised	• Review Education Sector Performance Report • Facilitate the dissemination of the Report • Facilitate the Set-up of a committee • Facilitate release of funds • Review NEW report • Secure and release funding • Facilitate the organization of training workshop for data collectors • Facilitate Monitoring of the census • Review report and submit	**Target achieved.** Education Sector Performance Report published and distributed to stakeholders. **Target achieved.** 2019 National Education Week organised from 6th - 9th August 2019 at La Palm Beach Resort and report available with evidence of CD's reviews. Committee was set-up and funding sourced for the programme. **Target achieved.** The 2019 National School Census conducted and results published on the Education Management Information System	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		2019 President's Independence Day Awards to include Special Schools Organized	report to Hon. Minister • Constitute Committee to select Schools including Special Schools. • Review and submit committee's reports to Hon. Minister. • Facilitate awards ceremony.	(EMIS) website. Funding was secured and training organised for data collectors. **Target achieved.** 2019 President Independence Day Awards organised on 6th of March, 2019 in Tamale and report reviewed by CD available. Committee established and reviewed reports submitted to the Hon. Minister on 27th March 2019 available. Picture album was sighted.		
2.	Improving Equitable access to quality Basic Education	Facilitate the release of Feeding Grant for all pupils in Special Schools and Capitation grant for all pupils in public basic schools. Facilitated implementation of the new curriculum in first term of 2019/20 academic year. (Focus on 4Rs (Reading, wRiting,	• Submit request letters • Forward correspondence to GetFund as follow-up for the release of funds • Facilitate the disbursement of the funds • Facilitate the release of funds • Facilitate the training of at	**Target achieved.** First, second and third term Feeding Grant and Capitation Grant paid. **Target achieved.** Curriculum for KG and P1-6 published and implemented in September, 2019. Training of Teachers	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		aRithmetic & cReativity)	least 80,000 Teachers on the new curriculum across the country and the printing of TLMs • Monitoring visit to three training sites	on the new curriculum conducted with One hundred and fifty-seven thousand and ninety-two (157,092) teachers benefitting and the breakdown is as follows: Thirty-six (36) simulators; 0ne hundred and fifty-six (156) master trainers; Three thousand nine-hundred (3,900) regional/district trainers; and One hundred and fifty-three thousand (153, 000) teachers. Monitoring visits to three (3) training sites conducted in August and report with CD's reviews sighted.		
3.	Improving Equitable access to quality Senior High School Education	One (1) Stakeholder Forum for Heads of 200 Low Performing Senior High Schools across the country to discuss ways of improving learning outcomes at WASSCE in Kumasi and Accra Organized	• Facilitate the organization of forum/workshop. • Review and forward report to Hon. Minister • Facilitate the request and release of funds. • Facilitate the procurement	**Target achieved.** Stakeholder forum organised in Kumasi and Accra on 15th and 29th March, 2019. Two (2) reports dated March, 2019 with CD's review available. Evidence of submission to the HM sighted.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Free SHS Implemented in 2019/20 academic year to benefit **795,860** students. Monitored the placement process of students from public JHS to ensure that 30% are placed	process to provide exercise books to all first year students. • Facilitate the procurement process to provide school uniform and school cloth to all first years • Facilitate the production of placement report • Review the placement report to ensure 30% equity in 54 elite SHS • Facilitate the 30% equity-monitoring visit to schools. • Facilitate the signing process • Facilitate the release of funds. • Disburse funds appropriately	**Target achieved.** Free SHS implemented for One million, one hundred and ninety-three thousand, four and fifty-four (**1,193,454)** beneficiaries for the 2nd Semester of 2018/19 academic year and report with evidence of CD's review available. Contract awarded to Messrs Sourceone Management Services Ltd for supply of core maths revision guide. ETC document for the supply of exercise books for the SHS in Ghana available. PPA approved single sourcing to Akosombo Industrial Co. for the supply of school cloths under the FSHS programme. **Target achieved.** 30% Equity Monitoring on placement carried out and students placed		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		in 54 elite SHS		in 54 schools in November, 2019. Equity Evaluation Report produced with evidence of CD's review. Report on 2019 CSSPS Placement produced with evidence of CD's review.		
		Facilitated the Signing of performance contract with 696 Heads of public SHS		**Target achieved.** Performance contracts for all Heads of six hundred and ninety-eight (698) Public SHS, Regional and District Directors signed for the year 2019. Signing report available.		
		Provided scholarship to 10,000 beneficiary continuing students under SEIP.		**Target achieved.** Scholarship and Bursaries provided to ten thousand and twenty-seven (10,027) beneficiaries under SEIP with each student receiving an amount equivalent to US$150. Activity report available.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
4.	Improving Equitable access to quality Technical Vocational Education	Commenced Refurbishment of 34 NVTI Centres Facilitated the commencement of Upgrading of 13 facilities in TVET institutions	• Secure funding for the refurbishment. • Secure funding to commerce the upgrading • Monitor progress of work	**Target achieved.** Funding secured for work to commence on the upgrading of 34 NVTI centres across the country. **Target achieved.** Funding Secured for work to commence on the upgrading of 13 TVET Institutions across the country. Progress report developed with evidence of CD's review.	12	12
5.	Equitable access to Tertiary Education	Facilitated the drafting of the Tertiary Education Policy. Cabinet Memo for the Amendment of Institute of Marketing Bills, 2018 submitted.	• Facilitate the drafting process • Facilitate the Organisation of stakeholder consultation to solicit inputs. • Facilitate the drafting of the Cabinet Memo • Forward memo to Cabinet	**Target achieved** Tertiary Education policy launched. Validation workshop report developed. **Target achieved** Cabinet Memo forwarded to Cabinet for the Amendment of Chartered Institute of Marketing Bills, 2018	12	12
Sub-Total					**60**	

5.17.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **29.375** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 56: Performance of CD, Education in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS in 26th February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 21st August 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 30th August 2019 and approval granted.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated August, 2019 was available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 16th January instead of 15th January 2020		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4.8**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Four (4) Audit Committee Meetings held and minutes dated 21st March and 26th June, 26th September, 9th December, 2019 available. Minutes of special meeting of Audit Committee dated 30th April,		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	2019 available. • Summary of action by management report dated December, 2019.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan electronically submitted to PPA dated 11th December, 2018. • Minutes of four (4) Entity Tender Committee Meetings dated 4th January, 3rd May, 5th July, and 8th November, 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory of items provided and dates of acquisition not indicated for items. Documents signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.8**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual dated 17th August, 2017 available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 25th July, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 25th July, 2019.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument was available dated January and July, 2019 respectively.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 10th May, 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 6th February 2020 instead of by 30th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 20th May, 2019 • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 16th July and 18th December 2019 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available • Report on efforts to enforce discipline available		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analyzed reports available but not dated. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 1st Nov., 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational		**2**	**2.0**
a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meetings dated 30th April, 16th August, 25th		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	September, and 18th December, 2019 and summary of activities for the year available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter available with evidence of MSD's participation dated 2018. • Service Charter for NABPTEX and National Inspectorate Board.	**4**	**3.875**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available • CSU officers trained at the CSTC. Back to office report available. • Mid-year report submitted to OHCS on 24th August, 2019. • End of year report available with no evidence of submission to OHCS.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Pictures on Minister's engagement with Media and WhatsApp platform available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Newsletters, brochures (MOE NEWS) and flyers available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Data management system developed and in use to ensure work efficiency. • Digitization of Inspection Tool for inspection of Schools developed (for school compliance)	**5**	**5**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	• Hand book for the inspection of Public and Private Pre-Tertiary Schools in Ghana – 2019.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring of activities through submission of reports by GES. • Media Tracking- press releases available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of twelve (12) Management Meetings sighted • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted • Report dated 31st December, 2019 on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. • Memo dated 13th November, and 10th December, 2019 submitting report on Medical Health Screening and recreational activity for staff available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD dated 5th July, 2019 available. Software deployed to improve Records Management through electronic means. • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Management training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Construction of additional offices, canteen and basement garage.		
Overall Total			**29.375**

5.17.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 57 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 57: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Education

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1.	To upgrade skills in contemporary Legal issues	Attend conference	Participated in the Ghana Bar Association Annual Conference held in Takoradi from 9th – 13th November, 2019. Programme and back to office report available.
2.	Contemporary knowledge in leadership	Attend training	Leadership Dialogue for Skills and Employment 19th June -21st June, 2019. Back to office report
3.	Upgrade Knowledge In Education Assessment	Attend Training	Participated in Assessment organised by National Council for Curriculum and Assessment held from 8th – 12th July, 2019 at Blue Royal Hotel. Back to office report
4.	To upgrade skills in education planning	Attend	Participated in the meeting of the International Appointments Committee and the international A&F Committee of WAEC, Lagos, 3 – 4 July 2019 Back to office report available
5.	Upgrade skills in global education issues	Attend World Skills Forum	Participated in 40th Session of the UNESCO General Conference on World Skill Forum from 12th – 27th Nov., 2019. Report available.
Sub-total			**10**

5.17.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **99.375** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.17.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Chief Director mentioned that the meeting had been fruitful especially considering the fact that this was his first time of taking part in the exercise. He thanked the Team and indicated that he had taken note of all the concerns raised and would work towards addressing them in the future. He assured the Team that his evaluation report will be shared with the management team in the Ministry to enable officers know their strengths and weakness and improve on their weakest links. He thanked the Team for their time and promised to give off his best in future exercises.

Team's Remarks

The Evaluators thanked the CD and his team for their preparedness and innovations showcased. They encouraged the CD to share some of these ideas with his colleague Chief Directors especially regarding the development and deployment of the Document Management Software at the workplace to fast track their work. The Evaluators were of the view that if the system was shared with other Sector Ministries, it would help improve work process and improve service delivery in the Civil Service.

The CD was encouraged to ensure that the concept of performance management permeated all aspects of the work of the Ministry and its Departments and Agencies since this would help to improve the efficient and effective use of resources for the attainment of optimum results.

5.17.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	2019 Education Sector Performance Report Produced and Disseminated to relevant Stakeholders.	• Education Sector Performance Report from the Policy Planning Budgeting Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate dated August, 2019. • Invitation letter dated 26th July, 2019 from the Ministry to Stakeholders with list of participants available. • Dissemination letters dated 30th August, 2019 from the Ministry to stakeholders.
	2019 National Education Week (NEW) Organised	• Memo dated 26th April, 2019 from Director PBME to Ag. Chief Director seeking approval to constitute committee to plan event with list of committee members. • Memo dated 17th June, 2019 from Head, M&E through Director Administration to Hon Minister to seek approval to conduct the

		2019 National Education Week. • Sample e-mails dated 28th June, and 11th July, 2019 from the Ministry submitting proposal to donor partners for support to organise the national education week. • Memo dated 2nd August, 2019 from PBME through Chief Director to Hon. Minister requesting for the release of funds to conduct of national education week. • Memo dated 20th August, 2019 submitting the 2019 National Education Week Report and Aide Memoire. • Invitation letter dated 26th July, 2019 from the Ministry to Stakeholders with list of Participants. • National Education Week Event Brochure dated 6th -9th August, 2019 available. • Copy of Hon. Minister Key note address is in the 2019 National Education Week Brochure. • NEW Report produced.
	2019 National School Census Organised	• Memo dated 11th February, 2019 from Director SRIM through the Chief Director to the Minister requesting for funds to conduct Census available. • Memo from Director SRIM through Chief Director to Minister dated 22nd July, 2019 requesting for the release of funds to complete census activity. • Letter dated 20th February, 2019 from the Ministry inviting participants to 2018/19 Census orientation workshop with list of participants available. • Census Orientation Workshop Report dated March, 2019 from Director SRIM available. • Memo from Director SRIM dated 26th March, 2019 submitting Census orientation workshop report to Chief Director. • Memo from Director SRIM dated 19th February, 2019 submitting Census Schedule/work plan from Director SRIM to Chief Director. • Census activity report from Director SRIM dated July, 2019 available. • Memo dated 20th August, 2019 from Director SRIM submitting request for approval to release 2018/2019 EMIS Annual School Census Data. • Report on Basic Statistics and Planning Parameters for Basic Education in Ghana 2018/2019 dated June, 2019. • Report on Basic Statistics and Planning Parameters for Technical and Vocational Education in Ghana 2018/2019 dated June, 2019. • Memo dated 9th October, 2019 from Director SRIM to HM thru' CD submitting data to UNESCO Institute of Statistics, 2019.
	2019 President's Independence	• Memo dated 20th February, 2019 from Director Pre-Tertiary to

	Day Awards to include Special Schools Organized	Chief Director seeking approval to form the Committee to plan the event. • Report of Committee dated March, 2019 available from Pre-Tertiary Directorate. • Media Publication from online sources. • Report dated March 2019 from Pre-Tertiary Directorate of the event including list of national awardees. • Memo dated 27th March, 2019 from Director Pre-Tertiary through Chief Director submitting report to Hon Minister. • Album (Pictures).
2.	Facilitate the release of Feeding grant for all pupils in Special Schools and Capitation grant for all pupils in public basic schools.	• Request letter dated 22ndAugust, 2019 from the Ministry to GetFund for the payment of the outstanding priority programmes. • A release dated 8th April, 2019 from Ministry of Finance to Controller and Accountant General Department. • Letter dated 23rd April, 2019 from the Ministry of Finance releasing funds to the Ministry for the programmes for the 1st Term. • Third quarter Ceiling for implementation of Budget dated 24th July, 2019. • Memo dated 18th November, 2019 from Director PBME to HDM through Director, Administration for the release of funds for the payment of Capitation Grant for the first Term the 2019/2020 Academic year. • Letter dated 21st November, 2019 from the Hon Minister to the Hon Minister Ministry of Finance for a release of funds for the payment of Capitation Grant for the 1st Term. • Evidence of payment for feeding and capitation Grants.
	Facilitated implementation of the new curriculum in first term of 2019/20 academic year.	• Copies of Curriculum dated April, 2019 from NaCCA. • First term of 2019/2020 Implementation Report. • Training of teachers on the new curriculum nationwide completed and report dated August. 2019. • Copies of Teaching Learning Materials (TLMs) dated April, 2019 from NaCCA. • Monitoring report dated August 2019.
3.	One (1) Stakeholder Forum for Heads of 200 Low Performing Senior High Schools across the country to discuss ways of improving learning outcomes at WASSCE in Kumasi and Accra Organized	• Invitation letter dated 11th March, 2019 from the Ministry inviting Heads of Low performing schools to the meeting. • Report on stakeholder forum dated March, 2019 from the Pre-Tertiary Directorate. • Copy of score Cards 2014-2018 for Schools from Director Pre-Tertiary indicating performance of SHS in WASSCE. • Report of school ranking dated March, 2019 from Pre-Tertiary Directorate. • Memo dated 17th April, 2019 from the Director, Tertiary thru' CD forwarding the report to the Hon Minister.

	Free SHS Implemented in 2019/20 academic year to benefit **795,860** students	• Copy of request letter dated 26th February, 27th March, and 16th August, 2019 from the Ministry of Education to the Ministry of Finance for the release of funds to implement Free SHS. • Letter from Ministry of Finance dated 8th April, 16th August, and 28th October, 2019 to Controller and Accountant General Department for Budget Allotment Ceilings for second quarter. • PVs dated 4th June, 2019 indicating payment of all absorbed Fees. • Memo dated 10th May, 2019 from Director PBME through Chief Director to Minister for the payment of arrears due 1st year students for the 1st semester of the 2018/19 academic year with copy of breakdown of schools. • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from Director PBME through Chief Director to Minister for the payment of arrears due 1st year students for the 1st semester of the 2018/19 academic year with copy of breakdown of schools. • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from Director PBME through Chief Director to Minister for the payment of arrears due 1st year students for the 2nd semester of the 2018/19 academic year with copy of breakdown of schools. • Letter dated 4th June, 2019 from the Ministry to the Bank of Ghana requesting for the transfer of funds to schools. • Report on the 2019 CSSPS placement process dated November, 2019. • Tender documents for the procurement of core textbooks/exercise books dated July, 2019 and March, 2019 from FPMU. • Letter 23rd April, 2019 from the Ministry to PPA requesting for approval to single source Akosombo Industrial Co. for the supply of school cloths under the FSHS programme. • Evidence of payment of all absorbed fees. • Evidence of payment of subsides for continuing SHS students. • Video on implementation of the FSHS. • Award of contract for supply of core maths revision guide between the Ministry and Messrs Sourceone Management Services Ltd dated 4th March, 2019. • ETC document for the supply of exercise books for the SHS in Ghana dated July, 2019.
	Monitored the placement process of students from public JHS to ensure that 30% are placed in 54 elite SHS	• Placement report dated November, 2019 available. • Memo dated 27th December, 2019 from Assistant Director 1 through the Head M&E to the CD submitting the Equity Evaluation Report. • Report from CSSPS Secretariat dated December, 2019.
	Facilitated the Signing of	• 698 Copies of performance contracts signed between the Director

	performance contract with 696 Heads of public SHS	General and School Heads, Regional and District Directors from September 2019 – July, 2020. • Report on the signing of performance contract with Heads of Secondary schools in Ghana dated October, 2019.
	Provided scholarship to 19,940 beneficiary continuing students under SEIP.	• Memo dated 15th January, 2019 from the SEIP Coordinator through Chief Director to Minister requesting for approval to pay 2nd and 3rd terms (2nd Semester) of 2018/19 academic year (COHORT 3). • PV dated 18th February, 2019 being payment of Scholarship for 2nd and 3rd terms of 2018/19 academic year with Regional breakdown. • A memo dated 19th June, 2019 from the SEIP scholarship coordinator to Minister requesting for approval to pay 1st and 2nd semesters of 2018/19 academic year including list of beneficiaries Schools (AF Cohort 1) and (AF Cohort 2). • PV dated 25th June for payment of bursaries for 1st and 2nd semester of 2018/19 academic year available including disbursement Regional breakdown. • Scholarship activity report from SEIP Coordinator (scholarship task team leader) dated August, 2019.
4.	Commenced Refurbishment of 34 NVTI Centres	• Request for no objection letter dated 17th January, 2019 sent to the Ministry of Finance. • Effective date of contract letter dated 31st January, 2019. • Copy of loan Agreement between Ghana and ING Bank dated 19th March, 2019. • Letter 18th June, 2019 from the Ministry requesting for exemptions from all duties, taxes and levies on local and foreign suppliers. • Letter dated 28th August, 2019 from the Ministry of Finance approving the waivers. • Progress report from COTVET dated 14th August, 2019. • Letter dated 20th June, 2019 from P.C. Education Africa Ventures to the Ministry submitting the condition precedent in terms of the Agreement for 'the overall upgradation and Modernization of the Vocational Education System in Ghana'. • Letter dated 19th August, 2019 from P.C. Education Africa Ventures to the Ministry submitting an invoice for Advance payment along with the Advance payment guarantee and performance guarantee for the Ghana NVTI Project – insurance guarantee from GLICO. • Letter dated 17th October, 2019 submitting proposed NVTI Project Launch plan to the Ministry.
	Facilitated the commencement of Upgrading of 13 facilities in	• Request for no objection letter dated 17th January, 2019 was sent to the Ministry of Finance. • Effective date of contract letter dated 31st January, 2019.

	TVET institutions	• Letter dated 24th June, 2019 from the Ministry to the Director of Budget, MoF requesting for advance payment – Ghana-China project on upgrading and rehabilitation of Polytechnics and Technical Institutes. • Progress report from COTVET dated 14th August, 2019s report from COTVET dated 14th August, 2019.
5.	Facilitated the drafting of the Tertiary Education policy.	• Tertiary Education policy document dated January, 2019. • Invitation letter dated 4th January, 2019 from the Ministry to Stakeholders for workshop on Tertiary education policy available. • Report from Tertiary Directorate dated 11th January, 2019 on the validation workshop of the Tertiary education policy.
	Cabinet Memo for the Amendment of Chartered Accountants Bills, 2018 submitted.	• Letter dated 4th January, 2019 from the Ministry forwarding the Cabinet Memo on the Chartered Institute of Marketing Bill to Cabinet. • Letter dated 15th February, 2019 from the Ministry forwarding the Bill to the Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice.

5.18 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Health

5.18.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 58 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **58.1** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 58: Performance of CD, Health in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Accelerating implementation of community-based health planning and services (CHPS) policy to ensure equity in access to quality health care	Implement Project cycle, commission and monitor the following: 1. Eight (8) CHPS Centre's 2. Five (5) Polyclinics 3. Five (5) District hospitals 60% complete 4. One (1) Regional hospital 5. Upgrade of one (1) Teaching Hospital	• Supervise eight (8) monitoring visits to project sites • Facilitate the payment for completed projects through the World Bank and Ministry of Finance • Facilitate the Commissioning: a. Eight (8) CHPs project sites b. Five (5) Polyclinics c. One (1) District hospital d. One (1) Regional hospital • Review monitoring	**Target achieved.** Project cycle implemented, commissioned and monitored for the following: 1.Eight (8) CHPS Centre's 2.Five (5) Polyclinics 3.Five (5) District hospitals 60% complete 4.One (1) Regional hospital - Wa 5.Upgrade of (1) Teaching Hospital Progress Reports for all sub targets available – no indication of authors. No reviews of reports were sighted.	12	11

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			reports			
2.	Improve medical supply chain management system	Assessed National Supply Chain System (NSCS) Facilitate the implementation of the initial operating capacity for Logistics Management Information System (LMIS) in the following facilities • Temporary Central Medical Stores • Ten(10) Regional Medical Stores • Four(4) Teaching Hospitals • Ten(10) Regional Health Directorate • Ten (10) Regional Hospitals	• Constitute a task team to undertake assessment • Facilitate the organization four (4) meetings to review framework contracting • Brief Sector Minister • Facilitate the procurement of 883 computers and 306 laptops • Facilitate and approve training workshops for users • Facilitate the go-live and launch of the LMIS • Approves vendor payments • Review monthly progress	**Target achieved.** Task Team constituted. Four (4) meetings organized and minutes available. National Supply Chain System (NSCS) assessed. Briefings of the Sector Minister on the National Supply Chain Assessment and Framework Contracting available. **Target achieved.** Implementation of the initial operating capacity for Logistics Management Information System (LMIS) facilitated. The under listed were implemented: • Temporary Central Medical Stores • Ten(10) Regional Medical Stores • Four(4) Teaching Hospitals • Ten(10) Regional Health Directorate • Ten (10) Regional Hospitals • Four (4)	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		• Four (4) Psychiatric Hospital	reports and quarterly steering committee meetings	Psychiatric Hospital Reviewed monthly progress reports available. Reviewed quarterly steering committee meetings available. Training reports available. Pictorial evidence of training available.		
3.	Strengthening public health emergency preparedness and response	Review NHIS Medicines price list Implement National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance	• Constitute and inaugurate National Medicines Pricing Committee (NMPC) • Facilitate the organisation of three (3) meetings of NMPC and review reports • Brief Minister of NMPC • Facilitate work of the Committee and review report • Facilitate stakeholder meetings for	**Target achieved.** Constituted and inaugurated the National Medicines Pricing Committee (NMPC). Report on inauguration available. Three-day workshop on NMPC organized and report available with evidence of review. NHIS medicines price list reviewed. Briefs to the HM on NMPC available. **Target achieved.** National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			the Malaria Vector Control Programme	implemented and reviewed report available.		
		Coordinate Malaria Vector Control Programme	• Coordinate rollout of the Malaria Vector Control Programme	**Target achieved.** Malaria Vector Control Programme implemented and report available.		
4.	Improving production and distribution mix of critical health personnel	Implement online recruitment and distribution of Health Personnel	• Coordinate two (2) stakeholder meetings • Supervise the distribution of staff to the Agencies • Review monitoring reports • Facilitate two (2) stakeholder meetings to renew Cuban Specialists agreement to work	**Target achieved.** Two (2) stakeholder meetings undertaken and minutes available. Online recruitment and distribution of Health Personnel implemented. Monitoring of portal reports available. Team was shown how the online recruitment worked	12	12
		Coordinate the External Health Cooperation Programme with foreign countries	• Facilitate the implementation of the debt recovery programme with Cuba • Facilitate two (2) meetings to discuss the	**Target achieved.** External Health Cooperation Programme with foreign countries coordinated. Stakeholder meetings to renew Cuban Specialists agreement held and report available. Meetings to discuss		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			MOU with Barbados on the recruitment of nurses	the MOU with Barbados on the recruitment of nurses held and reports available.		
5.	Enhance efficiency in governance and management of the health system	Submit National Blood Service (NBS) Bill to Cabinet and Parliament for consideration Undertake consultative meetings on review of Act 525 Constitute and inaugurate Five (5) Governing Boards and 10 Advisory Boards of Health Training Institutions duly	• Facilitate the preparation of Cabinet Memo for NBS Bill and brief Minister • Submit Cabinet Memo to Cabinet Secretariat • Constitute Steering Committee and Technical working group for the review of Act 525 • Facilitate the organisation of two (2) Steering Committee meetings on the review of Act 525 • Facilitate the composition and inauguration of Boards • Coordinate the inauguration of Boards	**Target not achieved.** NBS Bill submitted to Cabinet for consideration. Yet to go to Parliament. **Target achieved.** Consultative meetings on review of Act 525 undertaken and reports available. **Target achieved.** Three (3) Governing Boards and duly constituted and inaugurated Four-three (43) Advisory Boards of Health Training Institutions constituted and inaugurated. Though technically, five (5) Governing Boards were not constituted and inaugurated, it is recognised that the larger number of Advisory Boards constituted and	12	11.1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Implement Amended Section 37(1) of Act 525	• Facilitate meeting between MoH, A-Gs Department and Parliament • Coordinate the Organisation of one (1) stakeholder meeting • Facilitate the composition, appointments and inauguration of the Governing Boards of Teaching hospitals	inaugurated could offset the inability to reach the target for the Governing Boards. Composite report available. **Target achieved.** Concept Paper developed. Amended Section 37 (1) of Act 525 implemented.		
Sub-Total					**58.1**	

5.18.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **27.95** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 59: Performance of CD, Health in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.8**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• SectorAnnual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Directors Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS 15th March, 2019 instead of February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-Year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS on 15th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Report on Follow-up/remedial actions dated 10th October, 2019 available.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Mid-year review session held and Report available dated 2019. No ownership.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS on 7th February, 2020 instead of 15th January 2020		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• The team sighted minutes of four (4) quarterly audit committee meetings dated 15th March, 31st May, 29th August, 30th October, 2019. • Summary of action report to address audit queries available.	**5**	**4.5**
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement Plan available. • Minutes of four (4) Entity Tender Committee meeting dated 28th February, 17th May, 3rd and 17th July, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Updated assets register available **not** signed by Estates Officer but authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• 2018 Financial Statement and covering letter forwarding dated 28th February, 2019 available		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate.	• Dated organisational manual available dated 2019.	10	9.9
• Updated staff list as at 31st December, 2018	• Updated Staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff.	• Job schedule available but did not have all staff.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding	• Establishment levels available letter dated July, 2019 forwarded to OHCS.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
letter to OHCS			
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Report submitted on 8th July, 2019 to OHCS.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Reports on Planning and Mid-year on 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument, not dated and no ownership.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Report submitted on April, 2019 to OHCS. • Evaluation report forwarded to OHCS on 31st January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan submitted to OHCS 12th March, 2019. • Mid-year 25th July, 2019 and End-of-year Reports completed and submitted 5th March, 2020.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly report on staff attendance available. • Memo dated 19th Aug., 2019 submitting report on efforts. (General information to all staff about the official working hours). Letter dated July, 2019 querying a Stenographer Secretary.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Report submitted to CD on December, 2019. • Promotion Register submitted to OHCS dated 16th December, 2019 instead of November 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of members available. • Minutes of two (2) meetings dated 18th January and 31st July, 2019 available.	**2**	1.25

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter Draft available (August 2019). Process being managed with MSD. • Service Charter for Nurses and Midwifery Council available and copy forwarded to OHCS – 19th August, 2019.	**4**	**3.5**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated CSU office available. • CSU Officers not trained – training postponed. • Mid and end year report available submitted to OHCS on 26th July, 2019 and 6th January, 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website available. • Official Facebook, Twitter, Instagram. • Quarterly reports showing updates of the website available. • Newsletter, brochures, flyers etc. Available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Ministry created Recruitment portal, creation of new Directorates and Units.	**5**	**5**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitor the sub-national activities of the Ministries through Joint Monitoring with the DPs – reports. Also reports from GHS which operates throughout the country. • Media Tracking- daily media scanning and analysed report developed and forwarded to CD for attention.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of fifteen (15)		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives e. Management of physical environment	managements meetings. • Minutes of four (4) staff durbar available. • The Ministry operates a gender inclusiveness policy – equal sex of Heads of Directorates and Units. • Report on Staff Health and Well-being activities available. – held Aerobics from September – December, 2019 • WhatsApp group for all staff at the various Directorates and Units, Notice Board available where information are posted for staff. • Evidence of engagement with PRAAD letter 22nd July, 2019 requesting for additional staff • Training for records officers' undertaken memo dated 18th Nov. 2019 submitting a back to office report. • Annual report indicating Improvement in the washrooms, paintings undertaken and the cleanliness of office environment.		
Overall Total		**27.95**	

5.18.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 60 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 60: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Health

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Management	Participate in the orientation programme for CDs	Participated in the orientation Programme for all Chief Directors 2nd April, 2019.
2	Health Financing	Participate in the Health financing meeting by World Bank, Washington D.C	Participated in the Health financing meeting by World Bank, Washington DC, 9th -11th April, 2019. Back to office Report.
3	Health Summit	Attend the Health Summit	Participated in the Health Summit from 15th - 17thApril, 2019. Back to office Report.
4	Quality of Health Care	Attend Summer Camp	Participated in the Institute of Health Improvement summer camp in Seattle and Cincinnati, 22nd – 25th June, 2019. Back to office Report.
5	GAPAM Conference	Attend GAPAM Conference	Participated in the GAPAM Conference in Cape Coast from 17th – 18th July, 2019. Back to office Report.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.18.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **96.050** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.18.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The representative for the CD emphasised that every Director contributed to the success of the exercise. She promised to work harder on issues raised by the Team to improve the process, for example, by ensuring that every document had an owner and was dated. The Ministry would also take opportunity of the mid-year review to change any target (s) needed to. She was grateful to all and glad to have received guidance through the process. The exercise had helped her to learn a lot. She indicated that she would communicate the outcome of the discussions to the CD upon his assumption to duty.

Team's Remarks

The Team mentioned that the exercise was an opportunity for all participants to know what they were supposed to be doing. The process also helped all to realise their strengths and weaknesses and redefine team spirit and team work. It was hoped that it would also make all staff work harder for the Ministry and the nation as a whole when the importance of each officer's role was realised. It was emphasised that the Agreement should be used as a guide to help with the work of the Ministry and a system had to be put in place to ensure that all deliverables in the Agreement were strictly adhered to especially with respect to their timely delivery.

Meeting with the Hon. Minister

During the meeting with the Hon. Minister, the leader of the Evaluation Team gave the Hon. Minister a brief on the objectives for the exercise.

The Hon. Minister indicated that the CD had been helpful in all the areas of work being undertaken within the Ministry though not a health professional himself. He had brought his expertise as a staff of the GIFMIS to bear on the financial management of the Ministry. The CD had been greatly helpful in terms of programmes organized by the Ministry such as: The Health Summit, engagement with IMF and the Ministry's diverse relationships with its Development Partners. He was glad to have the CD on board and prayed he continued to work hard to help him improve the performance of the Ministry.

5.18.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Implement Project cycle, commission and monitor the following: 6. Eight (8) CHPS Centre's	• 2nd Progress reports on the 5 District Hospitals and 1 Polyclinic dated Sept, 2018 to February, 2019. • Monitoring and site reports dated o 17th Jan, 2019 o 18th Jan, 2019

	7. Five (5) Polyclinics 8. Five (5) District hospitals 60% complete 9. One (1) Regional hospital 10. Upgrade of one (1) Teaching Hospital	○ 28th Feb, 2019 ○ 17th April, 2019 ○ 18th April, 2019 ○ 22nd July, 2019 ○ 26th July, 2019 ○ 27th July, 2019. • Requests for funds letters to MoF ○ 20th February, 2019 ○ 25th April, 2019 ○ 25th April, 2019 ○ 25th April, 2019 ○ 9th May, 2019 ○ 17th May, 2019 ○ 21st May, 2019 ○ 21st May, 2019 ○ 21st May, 2019 ○ 2nd December, 2019 • Invitation letters to commissioning dated ○ 3rd June, 2019 ○ 11th June, 2019 ○ 4th November, 2019 • Various Memos from Ag. Dir. Infra. through CD to Hon Minister indicating his reviews dated ○ 20th February, 2019 ○ 17th May, 2019 ○ 14th June, 2019 ○ 22nd August, 2019 ○ 26th August, 2019 ○ 16th October, 2019 ○ 28th October, 2019 ○ 8th November, 2019 ○ 2nd December, 2019 ○ 5th December, 2019
2.	Assessed National Supply Chain System (NSCS)	• Memo dated 14th February, 2019 from Ag. Director Infrac. through' CD to Hon Minister proposing membership for the establishment of the National Health Sector Supply Chain Assessment Technical working group. • Letter 28th March, to the Director General – GHS requesting for nominations to serve on the National Health Sector Supply Chain Assessment Technical (NSCS) working group. • Invitation letter dated 25th April, 2019 to inauguration of NSCS. • Terms of reference. • Forwarding memo dated 25th June, 2019 for Framework

		contracting report. • Minutes of meeting for NSCS dated 8th May, 2019. • Minutes of meeting dated 15th May, 2019 on pre-bid conference procurement of essential medicines under Framework contracting. • Minutes of meeting dated 30th May, 2019 on procurement of essential medicines under Framework contracting for the Ministry of Health through National competitive tendering. • Minutes of ETC meetings dated 15th and 30th May, 3rd and 17th July, 2019. • Evaluation Report dated September, 2019. • Memo dated 4th December, 2019 from Ag. Director Proc. & Supply Chain to CD submitting draft report on National Supply Chain Assessment. • Memo dated 29th November, 2019 from CD to Hon Minister submitting brief on National Supply Chain Assessment report. • Memo dated 4th Dec., 2019 from CD to Hon Minister submitting brief on Framework Contracting.
	Facilitate the implementation of the initial operating capacity for Logistics Management Information System (LMIS) in the following facilities • Temporary Central Medical Stores • Ten(10) Regional Medical Stores • Four(4) Teaching Hospitals • Ten(10) Regional Health Directorate • Ten (10) Regional Hospitals • Four (4) Psychiatric Hospital	• Letter dated 15th January, 2019 inviting stakeholders to the launch of the Ghana Integrated Logistics Management Information System. • Letter dated 30th January, 2019 inviting stakeholders to the training session from 4th – 7th February, 2019. • Letter dated 1st March and 29th August, 2019 to the Fund Portfolio Manager, Global Fund responding to an invoice submitted. • Contract on the procurement of computers and laptops dated 23rd April, 2019. • Monthly progress reports available. • Letters inviting users for training workshops. • Copies of contract forms. • Letter dated 2nd July, 2019 communicating acceptance of Certificate to Omega Compu-Sytem Engineering Ltd. for 883.
3.	Review NHIS Medicines price list	• Memo dated 3rd April, 2019 from Director Tech. Coord. through CD to Hon Minister setting up and inauguration of National Medicines Price Committee. • Appointment letter dated 8th May, 2019. • Invitation letter to NMPC inauguration dated 24th June, 2019. • Letter dated 1st July, 2019 inviting members to a workshop on the development of Pricing Guideline. • Report of NMPC inauguration on 3rd July, 2019. • Forwarding memo to CD of workshop report dated 8th - 12th

		July, 2019.
	Implement National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance	• Memo Constituting Committee. • Memo requesting for funds to CD. • Invitation letter to members dated 8th April, 2019. • Minutes dated 25th April, 2019 of antimicrobial resistance platform. • Invitation letter to members dated 12th March, 2019 on inter-ministerial meeting on AMC. • Report dated 21st March, 2019 on inter-ministerial meeting on AMC. • Report reviewed by CD. • Memo dated 28th March, 2019 from CPO through Director, Tech. Coord. to CD submitting report on inter-ministerial meeting on antimicrobial resistance held at Coconut Groove Hotel, Accra. • Memo dated 22nd July, 2019 from CPO through Director, Tech. Coord. to CD requesting for approval of members to serve as focal persons for AMR activities. • Memo dated 23rd July, 2019 from CPO through Director, Tech. Coord. to CD nominating institutional focal persons for the implementation of ARN action plan.
	Coordinate Malaria Vector Control Programme	• Invitation letters dated 2nd April, and 29th May, 2019 inviting stakeholders to a meeting. • Monitoring reports dated December, 2019.
4.	Implement online recruitment and distribution of Health Personnel	• Invitation letter and request for vacancies dated 29th April, 2019. • Report on quota and health professionals' distribution dated 15th May, 2019. • Memo dated 20th November, and 31st December, 2019 from Head IT through Director HRHD to CD submitting Portal reports on second round recruitment. • Letter dated 24th June, 2019 – recruitment of accredited private and public Nurses. • Letter dated 25th June, 2019 – Public Announcement. • Report dated May, 2019 on Technical Meeting on quota distribution and other issues among the agencies. • Two (2) minutes of meeting available dated 9th October and 5th December, 2019.
	Coordinate the External Health Cooperation Programme with	• Minutes of meeting dated 25th – 28th March, 2019 between the negotiating group of the Republic of Cuba and the Republic of

	foreign countries	Ghana from 25th to 28th March, 2019 in the protocol Halls of the Ministry of Foreign Trade and Investment. • Renewed agreement document dated 31st January, 2019. • Report on a series of meetings dated 8th – 18th November, 2019. • Letter dated 26th November, 2019 submitting final document on liquidation agreement with Cuba.
5.	Submit NBS Bill to Cabinet and Parliament for consideration	• Letter forwarding draft Cabinet Memo to MOJ dated 8th February, 2019. • Response from MOJ dated 15th March, 2019. • Letter dated 20th June, 2019 forwarding NBS Bill to Cabinet.
	Undertake consultative meetings on review of Act 525	• Constitution of Committee – memo dated 22nd February, 2019. • Appointment letter dated 12th March and 17th April, 2019 for steering committee. • Memo forwarding Draft Bill.
	Constitute and inaugurate Five (5) Governing Boards and 10 Advisory Boards of Health Training Institutions duly	• Letter to Office of the President for Composition of Boards. • Approval dated 10th June, 2019. • Letters dated 17th June, 2019 and 29th July, 2019 from Office of the President appointing the governing body of the centre for Plant Medicine Research. • Inauguration of Boards undertaken on: 14th June, 2019, 2nd July, 2019 and 6th August, 2019. • Letters dated 10th June, 2019 from Office of the President appointing the governing body of the Allied Health professions Council. • Letter dated 11th June, 2019 inviting members to the inauguration. • Composite report on the inauguration of the Advisory boards in the Health Training Institutions.
	1. Implement Amended Section 37 (1) of Act 525	• Letter dated 4th June, 2019 from Parliamentary Select Committee inviting the Ministry to a meeting. • Stakeholder meeting by Parliamentary Select Committee held on 7th -9th June, 2019. • Memo dated 1st July, 2010 from Deputy Director, Legal Affairs through CD to Hon Minister submitting draft revised Amendment of section 37 (1) of Act 525. • Forwarding letter dated 9th July, 2019 to AJD & MOJ. • Letter dated 1st August, 2019 from AJD & MOJ to the Ministry on the Bill.

5.19 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources

5.19.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 61 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **57** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 61: Performance of CD, Lands and Natural Resources in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Restoring degraded landscapes through forest plantation development	10,000 ha of plantations established	• Facilitate the release of funds • Review of Monitoring Reports	**Target achieved.** 24,941 ha plantations established. Funds for 10,000ha sourced from the Ministry of Finance. Four (4) field monitoring reports available with evidence of CD's review. Ministry works with Forestry Research Institute of Ghana (FORIG) to identify species of trees to be planted.	10	10
2.	Employment creation	32,250 jobs created in plantation development areas in the country	• Facilitate release of funds • Review of Monitoring Reports	**Target achieved.** 64,500 youth employed under the Youth in Afforestation Programme. Employment is by both Government (60,500) and the private sector (4000). Four (4) field monitoring reports	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				available with evidence of CD's review.		
3.	Providing alternative livelihoods for selected forest fringe communities	150 Households from 30 selected forest fringe Communities provided with preferred livelihood schemes. (Apiculture, Mushroom Rearing, Soap Making and Efficient Charcoal Production)	• Sign contracts for procurable items necessary to operationalize the Livelihoods options • Ensure handing over of livelihood packages to the beneficiaries	**Target achieved.** 1,060 persons identified in Western and Brong Ahafo Regions and assisted in community based livelihood programmes such as soap making, bee keeping and mushroom production. Choice of activity decided by the beneficiaries but should not be related directly to trees. Pictorial evidence available.	10	10
4.	Promoting efficiency in Land Title Registration	Turn-around time for Title Registration reduced to 120 days	• Monitor progress on the deployment of Ghana Enterprise Land Information System (GELIS) • Review monitoring report	**Target not achieved** for title registration for Greater Accra. The average turn-around time for deeds registration in all other Regions is 14 working days, except Gt. Accra which is 30. The average turn-around time for title registration for Greater Accra is 150 working days. Relevant documentation with reviews sighted.	10	7
5.	Strengthening the	Parliamentary processes on the	• Facilitate the completion of the	**Target achieved**. The Land Bill at	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
	Institutional and Legislative Framework	passage of the Land Bill completed	Parliamentary processes of the Land Bill • Review workshop report • Brief Hon. Minister	Parliament awaiting second reading. Workshop Report available with evidence of CDs review. Evidence of CD briefs to HM on the reviewed Land Bill 2019 was available.		
6.	Implementing Alternative Livelihood Programme for the Youth	600,000 oil palm seedlings established at Dunkwa-on-Offin in the Central Region 4,046 ha established in galamsey affected areas in the Central and Western Regions	• Facilitate the release of funds • Review Quarterly Reports • Monitor Progress • Facilitate the release of funds • Review Quarterly Reports • Monitor Progress	**Target achieved.** 1,000,000 oil palm seedlings established at Dunkwa-on-Offin in the Central Region. 750,587 seedlings procured and distributed in the Eastern Region. **Target achieved.** 5,076.78 ha of oil palm plantation established on the Alternative Livelihood Programme in the Eastern Region. 2,339 beneficiary farmers have been registered and issued seedlings.	10	10
Sub-Total						**57**

5.19.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **27.425** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 62: Performance of Chief Director, Lands and Natural Resources in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	3.9
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 22nd October, 2019 instead of February 2019		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 29th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 17th September, 2019 and approval granted.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Mid-year report, dated 30th August, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 13th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	4.5
a) Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Four (4) Audit Committee meetings held and minutes dated 20th February, 21st May and 31st July, and 28th November, 2019 available. • Sighted an Annual report of the Audit Committee with actions		

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	taken to address issues arising from meetings.		
b) MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA on 11th March, 2019. • Three (3) Entity Tender Committee Meetings held with minutes dated 28th February, 23rd July and 10th September, 2019 available.		
c) Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Assets Register signed and dated by Estates Officer but not authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor and did not have dates of when items procured.		
d) **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		10	8.2
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate;	• Organization Manual dated (2013) available and under review – Review letter dated 8th March, 2019 available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualized job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 8th March, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 appraisal report was available and forwarded to OHCS on 24th July, 2019 instead of		

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument were available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 24th May, 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 3rd February 2020 instead of 30th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• Training Plan dated March, 2019 available but not submitted to OHCS. • Mid and End year reports dated July, 2019 and January, 2020 respectively available but not submitted to OHCS.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available. • No query issued but during staff durbars, cautions were given.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analyzed reports dated June and December, 2019 available but not submitted to OHCS. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 13th December instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Functional Ministerial Advisory Board		**2**	2
a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organized	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meetings dated 19th		

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	February, 22nd May, 24th July and 3rd Dec., 2019 available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	**3.825**
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organization	• Undated Client Service Charter available. • Service Charter for Office of the Stool Lands available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC. Back to office report dated 11th-13th Nov., 2019 available. • Mid-year report available and submitted to OHCS on 21st June 2019. End of year report available but not forwarded to OHCS.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website and WhatsApp platform for Management available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. Memo dated 31st Dec., 2019 forwarding reports to CD. • Internal newsletters – 'LARNAR News', available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**5.0**
a. Efficiency gains in organizational operations	• The Ministry has installed CCTV Camera and provided modems and WI-FI for some selected staff to work from anywhere outside the office.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Sub-national level activities monitored through reports submitted by the various		

Key Result Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	monitoring teams during field visits especially by staff of the Forestry Commission. • Media Tracking- Newspaper cutting available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of twelve (12) Management meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Gender policy document developed. • Report dated 29th December, 2019 on Medical Screening and Sensitization of staff available. • Welfare Policy developed. • Transport Policy developed. • WhatsApp and Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD dated 3rd July, 2019. • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Some cleaning was carried out during the Civil Service Week celebration. • Refurbished existing garage and markings done to ensure safe parking. Introduction of CCTV.		
Overall Total		**27.425**	

5.19.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 63 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 63: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Lands and Natural Resources

No.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTION	CD's PERFORMANCE
1.	Negotiation/Lobbying Skills	Attend Conference	Participated in Mining Indaba in South Africa on from 4th to 7th February, 2019 on the theme "Championing Africa's Sustainable Economic Growth". Back to office report available.
2.	Strategic Policy Development Skills	Attend workshop	Participated in workshop on Planning and Delivery of Public-Private Partnership organized by Setym International from 29th July, to 9th August, 2019 in Canada. Certificate of Participation available.
3.	Change Management Skills	Facilitate workshop for Directors and Head of Departments	Facilitated 3 days' workshop for Directors at Central Hotel from 29th to 31st July, 2019. Back to office report available.
4.	Leadership and Governance Skills	Attend training	Attended leadership retreat at Roffrey Park Leadership Institute from 2nd to 6th September, 2019, at Crown Agent in UK. Certificate available.
5.	Governance and investment skills in Mining	Participate in mining investment forum	6th Ordinary meeting of the Council of Ministers of the Association of African Diamond producing countries in Windhoek on 9th July, 2019. Communique and experts report available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.19.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **94.425** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.19.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD remarked that the process had always been a platform for learning and had further provided the opportunity for officers to show commitment towards their work since one knows that at a point in time someone will hold them accountable. He mentioned that he was looking forward to improving on his performance this year. He admitted that although there was a schedule officer monitoring the implementation of his Agreement, due to excessive work load they sometimes lost track of their progress but assured the Team that they would put in their best to address this challenge.

Team's Remarks

The Team highlighted that the exercise had been a good one since it helped to improve effectiveness and efficiency of officers' performance. It also aimed at strengthening the Performance Management culture in the Service and was not to be seen as a punitive measure. The CD was advised to take advantage of the mid-year review sessions to revise targets and obtain approval from the OHCS. It was suggested that officers that had not completed their appraisals should be sanctioned to enable staff take the completion of the staff appraisal instrument more seriously

5.19.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MoVs)
1.	10,000 ha of plantations established	• Letter dated 28th January, 2019 on the subject "Re: Request for Release of Funds to Pay Allowance of the Youth in Afforestation Programme" from the Ministry to the Ministry of Finance. • Letters dated 4th February, 12th March, 6th May, 24th July, 12th September, 18th October, and 23rd December, 2019 respectively from the Ministry of Finance to the Ministry for release of funds for the national afforestation programme. • Letter dated 26th March, 2019 on the subject "Re: Release of Funds for the National Afforestation Programme" from the Ministry to Forestry Commission. • Memos dated 3rd April, 11th July, 22nd October, 2019 and 3rd January, 2020 from the Technical Director, Forestry submitting the four (4) quarters reports to the CD. • Photo gallery prepared by the Policy Planning Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate dated 27th September, 2019.

2.	32,250 jobs created in plantation development areas in the country	• Letter dated 28th January, 2019 from the Ministry to Ministry of Finance requesting for funds. • Letter dated 29th April, 2019 from Forestry Commission to Ministry of Finance requesting for funds. • Letter dated 30th April, 2019 from Ministry to Ministry of Finance requesting for funds. • Letter dated 2nd May, 2019 from Ministry to Minerals Development Fund requesting for funds to pay for allowance for the Youth in Afforestation Programme. • Letter dated 24th June, 2019 from the Ministry to Ministry of Finance requesting for release of funds to pay outstanding allowance for the YIA programme for the period of March to June, 2019. • Copy of list of beneficiaries attached. • Memos dated 26th June, 18th July, 30th September, 2019 and 3rd January, 2020 from the Technical Director, Forestry, submitting the four (4) quarters reports to the CD.
3.	150 Households from 30 selected forest fringe Communities provided with preferred livelihood schemes. (Apiculture, Mushroom Rearing, Soap Making and Efficient Charcoal Production)	• Memo dated 23rd April, 2019 from Technical Director, Forestry, forwarding; a) the list of the selected forest fringe communities and b) Contract Agreement for the Supply and Delivery of Start-Up Kits for Community Based Enterprises: Five hundred and fifteen (515) Apiculture (Beekeeping) Kits, Four hundred and fifty-two (452) Soap Making Kits, and Ninety-four (94) Mushroom Production Kits between MLNR and Jadaamo Company Ltd and Lamsikany Ltd, dated April, 2019. • Memos dated 14th March and 10th July, 2019 from the Technical Director, Forestry, submitting reports on commissioning and handing-over of Livelihood Schemes. • Memo dated 19th December, 2019 from the Technical Director, Forestry, submitting to CD waybills for the supply and delivery of start-up kits for Community Based Enterprises.
4.	Turn-around time for Title Registration reduced to 120 days	• Letter dated 4th January, 2019 from the Ministry to the Presidency submitting update on the planned move to use PPP for improving Land Administration in the country. • Memo dated 1st February, 2019 from the Technical Director, Lands, forwarding the Final Invoices for Ghana Land Enterprise Information System (GELIS) to Chief Director. • Memo dated 12th February, 2019 from the Technical Director, Lands, forwarding national competitive tendering for financial analysis and economic for private sector participation in Ghana's Land Administration and a list of evaluation panel.

		• Memo dated 9th January, 2019 from Procurement Unit to the Chief Director on the subject "Payment for Publication of Request for Expressions of Interest" initiating processes on GELIS. • Letter date 29th March, 2019 from the Ministry to the Cabinet submitting a Cabinet Memo on the Private Sector Participation in the Delivery of Land Administration Service at the Lands Commission. • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from Technical Director, Lands, to Chief Director submitting Terms of Reference for the Evaluation and implementation of GELIS. • Memo dated 25th July, 2019 from Technical Director, Lands, to Chief Director on Minutes on GELIS meeting. • Memo dated 26th August, 2019 from Technical Director, Lands, to Chief Director submitting Progress Report on GELIS from January, to August, 2019. • CD's minutes on Memos dated 25th July and 26th August on the progress report on GELIS • Memo dated 18th December, 2019 from Technical Director, Land, to Chief Director submitting progress report on GELIS.
5.	Parliamentary processes on the passage of the Land Bill completed	• Letter dated 11th April, 2019 submitting the revised Bill to AG's office. • Letters dated 26th June and 3rd July, 2019 respectively, from the Parliamentary Service inviting the Ministry for the reading on the Land Bill. • Letter dated 17th July, 2019 on the response from AG's office on the review of the Land Bill 2019. • Letter dated 22nd July, 2019 from the Ministry on the Review of Land Bill 2019 requesting AG's office to proceed with various processes prior to resubmission of the Bill to Parliament. • Letter dated 29th July, 2019 from AG's office on the Land Bill 2019 submitting copies of the explanatory memorandum to the Ministry. • Letter dated 31st July, 2019 from Ministry forwarding Land Bill 2019 to the AG's Office. • Letter dated 31st July, 2019 from Ministry forwarding Land Bill 2019 to the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs and Clerk of Parliament. • Letters dated 30th September and 22nd October, 2019 from the Parliamentary Service respectively inviting participants to a Workshop on the Land Bill. • Chief Director's minutes on memo dated 5th November, 2019 on the Workshop Report. • Memos dated 18th July and 8th November, 2019 from Chief Director to Hon. Minister forwarding reviewed Land Bill 2019. • Memo dated 30th November, 2019 from the Technical Director, Lands, submitting the reviewed Land Bill, 2019 to the CD.
6.	600,000 oil palm seedlings established	• Letters dated 20th February, 5th May, 15th July, 1st August, 9th September, and 9th December, 2019 respectively from Ministry of Finance to the Ministry on

	at Dunkwa-on-Offin in the Central Region	payment of royalties to Minerals Development Fund. • Letters dated 9th January, 26th February, 27th May, 27th May, 16th August, 19th September and 16th December, 2019 respectively from the Minerals Development Fund to the Minerals Commission on the subject "Disbursement of Mineral Royalties". • CD's comments on reports dated 5th April, 10th July, 11th October, 2019 and 9th January, 2020 on Alternative Livelihood Project. • Memo dated 12th April, 15th July, 16th October, 2019 and 14th January, 2020 from the Technical Director, Lands submitting monitoring Reports on the Implementation of the Oil Palm Alternative Livelihood Project (ALP) in the Eastern Region.
	4,046 ha established in galamsey affected areas in the Central and Western Regions	• Letters dated 20th February, 5th May, 15th July, 1st August, 9th September, and 9th December, 2019 respectively from Ministry of Finance to the Ministry on payment of royalties to Minerals Development Fund. • Letters dated 9th January, 26th February, 27th May, 16th August, 19th September and 16th December, 2019 respectively from the Minerals Development Fund to the Minerals Commission on the subject "Disbursement of Mineral Royalties". • CD's comments on reports dated 5th April, 10th July, 11th October, 2019 and 9th January, 2020 on Alternative Livelihood Project.

5.20 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development

5.20.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected eight (8) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of seven point five (7.5). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 64 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **44.5** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule

Table 64: Performance of CD, Local Government and Rural Development in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Improve popular participation at Regional and District levels	1. Facilitate the inauguration and establishment of six (6) newly created Assemblies	• Constitute a Committee for the inauguration • Recommend the draft programme of action for the inauguration and establishment of the newly created Assemblies for Hon. Minister's approval • Seek funding for the inauguration of the new Assemblies • Award Contract for the building of Office Blocks	**Target achieved**. All six (6) Assemblies inaugurated and established. The Evaluation Team advised the CD to facilitate the development of a policy to guide the management of the process for the creation of Districts, especially with respect to assets sharing.	**7.5**	7.5
2.	Deepen Political and Administrative Decentralization	Organize nationwide campaign/ sensitization of citizen for a 'YES' vote in the Referendum for the elections of	• Constitute a Committee to develop a national campaign strategy towards the Referendum • Review the	**Target achieved.** Nationwide campaign carried out through Town Hall meetings from 11th November-16th December, 2019 and a sensitization	**7.5**	6.75

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		MMDCEs	National Campaign Strategy for Hon. Minister's approval • Seek funds for the Referendum • Constitute teams to carry out Sensitisation exercise	and consolidated report on the Town Hall meetings available. The Team noted that the National Campaign Strategy document was undated. There was, however, a review of the document by the CD.		
3.	Enhance Capacity for Policy Formulation and Coordination	Seek and transfer funds for District Assembly Performance Assessment Tool (DPAT) 1 and Conduct Assessment for DPAT 2 and 3 in year 2019	• Seek and transfer funds to successful MMDAs • Procure Consultants for DPAT II and III • Advertise for expression of interest • Constitute a Team to evaluate Technical and Financial Proposals • Review report • Submit report for Hon. Minister's approval • Deploy successful Consultants to MMDAs	**Target achieved.** DPAT 1 funds transferred and assessment for DPAT 2 and 3 conducted. The Team did not sight evidence of review of documents by the CD as indicated in his role.	**7.5**	6.75

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Constitute a Team to review Consultant's Report • Deploy Consultants to conduct assessment • Submit report for the Hon. Minister's approval			
4.	To Improve agri-business through enhanced interface between the private and public sectors at the district level	Reviewed the LED Policy and Operational Manual.	• Constitute a team to review the LED Policy and Operational Manual. • Seek funds for Sensitisation Workshops • Review report of Sensitisation Workshops • Submit Validated Report to the Hon. Minister	**Target not achieved** Committee/team in place and efforts made to secure funds. The CD explained that it was difficult for the team members to meet since budget preparation process was ongoing at the time.	**7.5**	2
5.	Improve quality of life in rural areas	Launched the Rural Development Policy and Conduct Sensitization Workshops on the Rural Development Policy	• Constitute a team to organize Regional Workshop on the Rural Development Policy • Seek funding to Launch the Rural Development Policy	**Target not achieved.** The policy document was not launched by H.E. the President as planned but out-doored under the launch of the Ghana Safety Net Project	**7.5**	5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
				and also during the Ministry's turn at the Meet the Pressprogramme. In the words of the CD, the document had not been launched and it was hoped to be done this year. Draft report on the Launch of the Ghana Safety Net Project available but the final report could not be produced for verification as promised.		
6.	To provide infrastructure in Selected Towns and Cities and improve on IGF mobilization	Initiated the Implementation Ghana Secondary Cities Support Project (GSCSP)	• Facilitate a signing ceremony with MMDAs • Launch of GSCSP • Empanel a Team to procure Consultants • Review Evaluation Reports • Submit to Hon. Minister for approval • Issue contracts letters to Consultants	**Target achieved.** GSCSP launched and implementation on-going. The Team did not sight evidence of review of evaluation report by the CD as indicated in his role.	**7.5**	6.75

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
7.	Expand the community population registration	Digitized the entire paper records of registered Births and Deaths	• Review proposal from the Births and Deaths Registry • Forward proposal to Hon. Minister for approval. • Write to the Ministry of Communicationfor assistance. • Review progress report	**Target not achieved.** The digitization of the entire paper records not completely done though consultant procured for Births and Deaths Registry by the Ministry of Communications. No evidence of reviewed proposal and progress report. The progress report and contract were not dated. Over 13,000 documents representing about 80% of the Records of the Registry had beenscanned with **s**om**e** 0.62% of these indexed.	**7.5**	3.75
8.	To provide employable skills for illegal miners	Facilitated the training of 1,500 of unskilled illegal miners in technical and vocational education	• Request for funds from IMCIM • Request for Monitoring Report • Review draft Monitoring Report • Submit Report to Hon. Minister • Request and forward Progress	**Target was achieved** (2,000 unskilled illegal miners trained). Undated Monitoring and Annual reports by Dept. of Community Development available. There was also no	**7.5**	6

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			Report to the Hon. Minister	evidence of review of monitoring reports by the CD and their submission to the Hon. Minister		
Sub-Total					**44.5**	

5.20.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **22.405** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 65: Performance of CD, Local Government and Rural Development in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance –Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance reporting		**4**	**2**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Letters dated 27th February, 2019 forwarding copy of Plan to the OHCS available.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment Report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Not available		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Not available		
d. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the	• Not available		

Key Result Area	Performance –Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
sector annual action plan e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced	• Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2019.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries. b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved. c. Assets Register updated, signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/External Auditor d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• Minutes of meeting dated 2nd January, 2019, 1st February. 2019, 15th May, and 16th September, 2019. • Report on follow up actions not available. • Procurement plan available and submitted to PPA. • Evidence of ETC meetings – 5th December, 2019. • Inventory of assets available. The authentication and signatures not done as required. • Copy of expenditure returns for end year 2018 available and letter dated 28th February 2019 forwarding it to CAGD.	**5**	**3**
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list available	• Organisational Manual available. • Updated staff list available.	**10**	**8.7**

Key Result Area	Performance –Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
• Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and a copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Individualised job schedules for all staff notavailable. • Establishment levels available and found satisfactory.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Composite analyzed report on 2018 Appraisals prepared and forwarding letter to OHCS dated 15th February, 2019		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Planning and Mid-year report not available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Did not sign Agreement. • Evaluation report submitted to OHCS on 27th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan prepared and submitted to OHCS on 8th March 2019. • Mid-year report submitted on 25th July, 2019 to OHCS. • End year report submitted on 20th January, 2020 to OHCS.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly staff attendance report available and well analysed. • Various queries on 3rd, 5th, March and 3rd December, 2019. Committee of enquiry report dated December, 2019. • Notice on attendance to work to all staff as preventive measure.		

Key Result Area	Performance –Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analysed report available but not dated. • Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • Minutes of meetings dated 15th January and 27th November, 2019 available.	**2**	**1.25**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Charter available but being reviewed. • A charter for Department for Community Development available and copy forwarded to OHCS.	**4**	**3.75**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• CSU available. • The officer is new and no formal training provided. However, given guidance on what was expected of her. • Mid & End-of-year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 4th July, 2019 & 30th December, 2019 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website available but not very effective as a result of technical challenges from NITA. Facebook, Twitter and Instagram available. • Reports on quarterly website updates not available. • Newsletters, brochures and		

Key Result Area	Performance –Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	flyers available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**3.705**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• WhatsApp platform has been created for staff to help with communication.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Sector-wide monitoring report available. Also linkage with District Assemblies through the Office of the Head of the Local Government Service. • Daily news tracking report available and copy forwarded to the CD and to the Sector Minister.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of eight (8) management meetings sighted. • Minutes of three (3) staff durbars sighted. • Gender Inclusiveness- Efforts were made to ensure that training programmes benefitted both sexes. • Eye screening exercise held in March, 2019 and staff medical bills paid. • Internal Newsletter or catalogue of information posted on notice board.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• No engagement with PRAAD • No training for the records officers.		
e. Management of physical environment	• The buildings were painted, environment weeded and reception		

Key Result Area	Performance –Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	refurbished.		
Overall Total		**22.405**	

5.20.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 66 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 66: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Local Government and Rural Development

COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD'S PERFORMANCE
Financial Management and Re-engineering for Public, Corporate and Personal Development	Attend Seminar	Participated in a training on Financial Management and Re-engineering for Public, Corporate and Personal Development on 18th May, 2019 in Accra by the Chartered Institute of Administrators and Management Consultants. • Certificate sighted
Communication and Branding	Attend Seminar	Participated in a seminar on Corporate Communication and Branding Prospects on 30th November, 2019 by the Chartered Institute of Administrators and Management Consultants. • Certificate sighted
Knowledge sharing and Networking	Attend Conference	Participated in the National Conference for Administration Professionals on 23rd July, 2019 by the Chartered Institute of Administrators and Management Consultants. • Certificate sighted
Reform decentralized Local Governance System	Attend Seminar	Participated in a seminar on Strengthening the Sub-District Structures in a Reformed Decentralized Local Governance System on 19th June, 2019 by IDEG.

		• Back to office report sighted
Local Governance	Attend Seminar	Participated in a seminar on Public Conversation on Party Based Local Governance: European Experience by IDEG on 25th June, 2019. • Back of office report sighted
Sub-Total		**10**

5.20.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **76.905** out of the maximum score of **100**.

5.20.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Chief Director thanked the Team for their time and mentioned that the exercise had always provided an opportunity for new things to be learnt. He indicated that the meeting had been more interactive as compared to previous years and his officers now appreciated how their actions and inactions would affect the performance of the CD.

He further stated that the evaluation was a collective responsibility of all his staff and hoped that all the officers present would ensure that assigned tasks were carried out on time. The CD confessed that the mid-year review exercise was not taken seriously and this had affected their preparation for the end of year exercise. He promised to pay attention to such exercises going forward.

Officers that supported the CD during the exercise confirmed that they had learnt a lot from the process and had taken note of the following:

- Importance of dating and owning reports and paying attention to details;
- The need to organize documents in an orderly manner for smooth flow and easy referencing in their work;
- Timely delivery on targets since the assessment will not always be for the CD;
- Put in place a system to generate feedback from clients for improved service delivery; and
- Utilise mid-year monitoring feedbacks and take opportunity to review targets and reprioritise where necessary.

Team's Remarks

The evaluators explained that the exercise was useful to instil the performance management culture in all civil servants and the aim was not to punish officers but to help put in place corrective measures for better work output. The CD and his team were advised to work harder next time by ensuring that the quality of reports were good before sending them out. There was also the need for good preparatory activities towards the evaluation exercise.

5.20.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MOVs)
1.	Facilitate the inauguration and establishment of 6 newly created Assemblies	• Memo dated 4th January, 2019 to committee members signed by CD. • Memo dated 18th February. 2019 for the release of funds from an Assist. Director to CD. • Copy of programme for the inaugurations of the Assemblies • Sample of Contract documents dated October, 2019. • Letter dated to the Common Fund dated 14th and 24th October, 2019 for the mobilization of selected distressed and newly created Assemblies. • Letters dated 8th May, 2019 of award of contracts to various contractors.
2.	Organize nationwide campaign/ sensitization of citizen for a YES vote in the Referendum for the elections of MMDCEs	• A list of Membership of ten (10) campaign teams. • A letter dated 7th November, 2019 selecting members. • Programme for the campaign. • Roadmap for the campaign. • Campaign Strategy, not dated. • A letter dated 26th June, 2019 requesting for funds from the IMCC. • Various letters requesting for funds from the MoF. • Various internal memos. • A report dated Nov. 2019 on the sensitization. • A consolidated report on the Town Hall meetings dated November, 2019.
3	Seek and transfer funds for DPAT 1 and Conduct Assessment for DPAT 2 and 3 in year 2019	DPAT 1 • An extract from the 2020 Budget indicating the transfer of funds to successful MMDAs. DPAT 2 and 3 • Advertisements for DPAT 2 and 3 dated 28th February, 2019 in the Ghanaian Times. • Letter dated 4th March, 2019 constituting an evaluation team. • An evaluation proposal and contract negotiation report dated June, 2019. • A report dated August, 2019 for DPAT 2 – Nsawam

		– Adoagyiri. • Copy of the results of the consultancy assignment published in the Ghanaian Times dated 18th November. 2019. • Letter dated 25th October, 2019 through MoF to the KfW Desk Officer to draw money from an Account for DPAT 2. • Consolidated Reports (Western North and Western Region) dated December, 2019 for the consultancy assignment for DPAT 3. • Award letters dated 10th July for the consultant DPAT 2. • Award letters dated 22nd August, 2019 for the consultant DPAT 3. • Minutes of meeting dated 22nd October, 2019 approving the work of the DPAT 2 consultant. • Sample report dated December, 2019 for Savelugu District for DPAT 3.
4	Reviewed the LED Policy and Operational Manual.	
5	Launched the Rural Development Policy and Conduct Sensitization Workshops on the Rural Development Policy	• Memo dated 4th September, 2019 setting a committee for the launch. • Memo dated 14th October, 2019 requesting for funds for the launch. • Draft report dated August, 2019 for the Launch of the Ghana Safety Net Project and outdooring of the Rural Development Policy.
6	Initiated the Implementation Ghana Secondary Cities Support Project (GSCSP)	• Letter dated 21st February, 2019 inviting the various Assemblies to a sensitization and a signing ceremony. • A report on a programme launch dated 7th May, 2019 in Koforidua. • Copies of the Agreements signed with the various Agencies (CHRAJ, EPA, Land Use and Spatial Planning and Land Evaluation Board) dated 27th February, 2019. • Advertisement for the consultant for various activities in the Ghanaian Times dated 15th February, 2019. • Evaluation report dated April, 2019. • Copies of the individual contract for various services

		dated April, 2019.
7	Digitized the entire paper records of registered Births and Deaths	• Letter dated 24th January, 2019 submitting the proposal for Capture of backlog of records on registered births and deaths. • Letter dated 6th June, 2019 to Ministry of Communication seeking for assistance. • A contract signed between Ministry of Communication and the Department of Births and Deaths – not dated. • A project management plan, submitted by the company (VILT IBERICA SLU and TWENTY-THIRD CENTURY SYSTEM Ghana Ltd.) dated 21st May, 2019. • Digitization report on status of implementation – not dated.
8	Facilitated the training of 1,500 of unskilled illegal miners in technical and vocational education	• Letters (dated 31st January, 1st July and 2nd August, 2019) requesting for funds to the Chairman on the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Illegal Mining. • Monitoring report arising out of visits from 24th -29th March from Department of Community Development – not dated • Annual report – not dated

5.21 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation

5.21.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 67 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **51.4** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 67: Performance of Ag. CD, Monitoring and Evaluation in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Strengthening feedback mechanisms in public service delivery	Annual Citizens Assessment Survey conducted Government Priority Programmes Evaluated and Report produced (APR) Government Flagship Programmes Evaluated and report produced	• Review TOR for the engagement of a Consultant • Review Inception report and participate in Inception Meetings • Review Contract for the assignments • Review final report assessment	**Targets not achieved.** Terms of Reference (ToR) on Annual Citizens Assessment Survey developed, reviewed and feedback received from the World Bank on 14th June 2019. Procurement process for consultant being undertaken Terms of Reference on Government Priority Programmes Evaluated and Report developed Consultant selected and inception report available With respect to Government High Priority Programmes TOR developed and approved by the World Bank. Inception report developed and work on-going	12	8.4

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
2.	Promoting public interest in performance monitoring reports of public institutions	International Conference on Evidence to Action organised PFJ Indicators and Associated Data quality / Aggregation issues monitored	• Participate in planning discussions with ICED leadership • Support the developments of conference programme • Participate in conference • Review conference report • Review Concept Note for PFJ field monitoring and data quality assessment • Review of final report	**Target achieved with respect to ICE.** Conference organized (9^{th} – 12^{th} July 2019) with 15 countries participating and the importance of data highlighted Final Report submitted by ICED and available **Target not achieved on the PFJ Indicators.** Concept Note reviewed and project implementation plan revised. Detailed work plan available.	12	10
3.	Strengthening capacity of public institutions to undertake policy analysis, development planning, monitoring and evaluation.	National M&E Policy developed 2019 targets for the Government High Priority Programmes (GRFHP) developed M&E Focal Persons from 33 Ministries staff	• Review of concept Note of the NMEP validation workshop • Participate in NMEP validation • Review updated GRFHP • Review Concept Note for M&E training for Focal Persons and MoME staff • Facilitate M&E training for Focal Persons and	**Target achieved.** Final draft of the National M&E Policy developed and submitted to the Honourable Minister for onward transmission to Cabinet for approval **Target achieved.** 2019 targets of Government High Priority Programmes (GRFHP) developed **Target achieved.** M&E Focal Persons from 33 Ministries	12	11

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		trained PPMEDs of 33 Ministries implementing PSRRP equipped.	MoME staff • Review Training Report	trained in data collection and analysis and report available with evidence of CDs review. **Target not achieved.** Specifications for laptop computers for 33 Ministries and "No Objection" secured from the World Bank. Equipment yet to be procured.		
4.	Strengthening capacity of MoME staff	MoME Staff trained	• Lead the conduct of training needs assessment • Review Concept Note • Review training modules • Facilitate training • Review Contract • Review training report • Hold discussions with the TTL (World Bank)	**Target achieved.** ToR on MoME Training Needs Assessment developed. Concept Note for Training reviewed. Contract for the data collection and analysis training reviewed and signed with the Consultant. Training modules submitted by the Consultant (Firm) reviewed and finalised. 20 MoME staff trained in data collection and analysis and report available. Review sighted.	12	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
		3 vehicles procured for MoME		**Target not achieved.** Specifications developed and submitted to PSRRP for action.		
5.	Enhancing operational effectiveness of MoME	1. Organisational Manual for MoME developed 2. MoME Website and domain address developed	• Review draft organisational manual • Organise meeting with MSD • Monitor development of website	**Target achieved.** Final draft of the Organisational Manual for MoME developed after series of meetings and reviews. Initial validation of the Manual held with MSD and OHCS Document to be submitted for approval by Civil Service Council **Target achieved.** Website developed and fully functional	12	12
Sub-Total					**51.4**	

5.21.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **20.775** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 68: Performance of Ag. CD, Monitoring and Evaluation in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**2.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement not sighted and not submitted to OHCS.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 19th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• No follow-up/remedial actions undertaken.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan undertaken. Report dated June, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 16th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**5**
a) Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Managed by OoP		**(1)**
b) MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
c) Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d) **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 13th Feb: 2019, available. • Managed by OoP • Managed by OoP		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec., 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes	• Organization Manual dated May, 2019 available. • Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff not available. • Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 2nd October, 2019. • Report on 2018 appraisals available but not forwarded to OHCS. . • End of year 2019 staff appraisal report available, inclusive of reports on Planning and Mid-year phases. • Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 13th August,2019. • Evaluation report not available. • 2019 Training Plan linked training needs identified	**10**	**5**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	through the appraisal process • 2019 end of year report available.		
f. Management of discipline	• Quarterly reports from January -December available. • Regular contact with the staff		
g. Report on staff movements	• Not available • 2020 Promotion register not available		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of two (2) meeting dated 31st July and 20th November, 2019 available.	**2**	**1.25**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Draft Service Charter dated 2019 available with evidence of MSDs participation in the process. • Department Charter – not available.	**4**	**2.25**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers not trained. • No report available.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, WhatsApp platform, Twitter, Facebook, available. • Reports on quarterly website updates **not** available. • Flyers, brochures available.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**4.375**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Ministry initiated the process of procuring laptops and other accessories for staff to improve work efficiency.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Linkage established with PPMEDs of all MDAs to promote good M & E practices, among others. • Monitoring through the Monitoring and Evaluation focal persons from sector Ministries • Media Tracking- newspaper cuttings and analyses available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of three (3) Management Meetings sighted • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted • No gender report available • Organized health trip to Sogakope • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Physical environment satisfactory		
Overall Total		**20.775**	

NOTE: The Ministry is only responsible for the management of its procurement activities with other issues under KRA 2 being managed by the OoP. To obtain the score for this KRA, the score obtained is multiplied by a factor of 5/1.

5.21.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 69 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 69: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Monitoring and Evaluation

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Improve knowledge in Public Service Management and Administration	Attend training	Participated in induction of newly appointed Chief Directors organized by the Office of the Head of the Civil Service at the Civil Service Training Centre in Accra, Ghana from 18-22 March 2019.
2	Knowledge in Public Service Management and Administration	Attend meetings	Participated in all Quarterly Meetings for Chief Directors organized by the OHCS.
3	Enhance capacity in data collection and analysis	Participate in training	Participated in training in data collection and analysis, Accra 17 to 21 June 2019 organised by MoME at Best Western Hotel in Koforidua.
4	Improve knowledge on emerging evaluation concept	Attend in seminar	Participated in Evidence to Action 2019 in Accra from 9 to 12 July, 2019 at ISSER, Accra.
5	Improve skills and competencies in implementing public policies	Participate in training	Participated in first session of online and face-to-face Executive Training in Implementing Public Polices (IPP), at Cambridge MA, USA.20 May to 15 June 2019. The course successfully completed and Certificate awarded in December 2019.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.21.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **82.175** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.21.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD expressed his appreciation to the Team and the learning that had taken place. He said the process was thorough and evidenced-based which was encouraging. He had learnt to be meticulous in every activity being undertaken. He indicated his willingness to work hand in hand with the OHCS to strengthen the M and E Directorates in the Service.

Team's Remarks

This exercise was a learning process to help other staff know how their inactions affect the work of the CD. The exercise was meant, among other things, to help in deepening the performance management culture in the Civil Service and for every Civil Servant to himself/herself as part of the process towards achieving good performance in the Service. The CD should see the Agreement as a document for the entire Ministry, identify the deliverables, who had to deliver what and when they were to be delivered. This would allow for a good monitoring of the process and the ultimate attainment of desired results.

5.21.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	1. Annual Citizens Assessment Survey conducted 2. Government Priority Programmes Evaluated and Report produced (APR) 3. Government Flagship Programmes Evaluated and report produced	• ToR on Annual Citizens Assessment Survey dated 14th June 2019. • ToR on Government Priority Programmes • Inception Report available
2.	1. International Conference on Evidence to Action organised 2. PFJ Indicators and Associated Data quality / Aggregation issues monitored	• Minutes of meeting with ICED: on April 26, 2019. • Final Concept Note: submitted by ICED on May 23, 2019. • Draft program: submitted by ICED on May 28, 2019. • Certificate of participation from Campbell Collaborations and Thank you letter from ICED. • Concept Note reviewed on 04th April, 2019. • Revised the PIP with AGRA and other partners on 4th June,

		2019. • Draft data collection forms reviewed.
3.	1. National M&E Policy developed 2. 2019 targets for the Government High Priority Programmes(GRFHP) developed 3. . M&E Focal Persons from 33 MDAs staff trained 4. PPMEDs of 33 Ministries implementing PSRRP equipped.	• Concept Note dated 07th June, 2019, requesting for approval of the NMEP validation workshop. • E-mail-TOR and background documents dated 14th June, 2019. • Memo dated 2nd June, 2019 requesting for payment of the NMEP validation workshop. • GRFHP for 2019 developed. Final version submitted on 11th June, 2019. • Email- Memo of M&E Focal persons training dated 22nd May, 2019. • Draft training programme submitted by E-mail dated 28th May, 2019. • E-mail- final Training programme dated 29th May, 2019. • List of participant.
4.	1. MoME Staff trained 2. vehicles procured for MoME	• WhatsApp discussion with TTL on 13th May, 2019.
5.	1. Organisational Manual for MoME developed 2. MoME Website and domain address developed	• Email of internal review on 22nd May, 2019. • Draft organisational Manual and Service Charter received on. • Minutes of Meeting with MSD dated 18th May, 2019. • Memo requesting for the design of website submitted on 14Th May, 2019. • Website completed and staff trained.

5.22 Performance of the Chief Director, Office of the Head of the Civil Service

5.22.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected nine (9) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1. Three (3) TPAs were each assigned a score of six point six-six (6.66). The six (6) other TPAs were each assigned a score of six point six-seven (6.67). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 70 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **57.33** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 70: Performance of CD, Office of the Head of the Civil Service in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Civil Service Performance Management and Reporting	2018 APR of the Civil Service prepared, published and distributed.	• Review and issue APR guidelines and template for 2018 • Review draft 2018 APR and submit to HCS/Civil Service Council • Facilitate the release of funds for the production of APR • Ensure the distribution of the 2017 Civil Service APR to relevant stakeholders	**Target achieved.** Revived guidelines for APR available. Reviewed draft 2018 APR and submitted to HCS/Civil Service Council available. APR published and distributed to key stakeholders. APR available as well as distribution list.	6.67	6.67
2	Improving efficiency and effectiveness in the performance of officers at all levels in the Civil	Chief Directors'/Directors and Heads of Department Performance Agreement System implemented.	• Facilitate the procurement of Evaluators • Review 2019 CDs Performance Agreement Guidelines and template	**Target achieved.** 35 Performance Agreements with CDs signed and available. 200 Performance Agreements between CDs and Directors	6.67	6.67

	Service	• Publish the 2018 CDs Evaluation Report • Organize 2019 signing ceremony • Organize 2018 awards and • Undertake 2019 CDs midyear monitoring.	• Review 2019 Directors/HoDs Performance Agreement Guidelines and template • Participate in the facilitation of the signing of PA by Ambassadors etc. • Chair committee for the organization of the Civil Service week • Review and forward following reports to HCS: ✓ Midyear monitoring report ✓ Selection report for the awardees for the Civil Service week	and Analogous grades signed and available. 48 Heads of Mission, 7 Consul Generals and 58 A1 Directors signed Performance Agreements. 2018 CDs Evaluation report published and available. 2019 signing report available. Civil Service week with associated 2018 awards ceremony organised. Report and pictures available. Undertook 2019 Mid-year monitoring. Report available.		
3.	Effective implementation of the Staff Appraisal Instrument	Service-wide Staff Performance Appraisal in Ministries and Departments implemented. • Produce composite report on 2018 SPAR	• Review 2018 composite report and 2019 planning & mid-year phases and ensure feedback • Review Terms of Reference for Online SPAR	**Target achieved.** Reviewed composite report on 2018 SPAR available. Reviewed composite report of 2019 Planning and Mid-year phases available. TOR for the online SPAR and Concept	6.67	6.67

		• Track implementation of 2019 planning and midyear phases		note/demo available.		
4.	Strengthening the regulatory framework in the Civil Service	Draft Civil Service Bill prepared and submitted to Cabinet. Cabinet Memo for Policy Approval submitted. Cabinet Memo for approval of draft Bill submitted.	• Review and approve concept paper to IMCC for EU funding for the preparation of the Bill.	**Target not achieved.** Civil Service Bill yet to be submitted to Cabinet. Cabinet Memo for Policy approval available with CD's review. Document yet to go to Cabinet for Policy approval before Bill submitted.	6.67	4.0
5.	Organisational Development and Management	Eight (8) Organizational Manuals for MDAs developed/reviewer Five (5) Client Service Charters for MDAs reviewed. Six (6) Schemes of Service for MDAs revised/developed	• Review developed Manuals • Submit to HCS for approval • Review draft Charters. • Submit to HCS for approval. • Review updated Schemes of Service. • Submit to HCS for approval	**Target achieved.** Eight (8) Organizational Manuals available. **Target achieved.** Five (5) Client Service Charters available. **Target achieved.** Six (6) Schemes of Service for MDAs available.	6.66	6.66

6.	Service-wide Human Resource Management	Service-wide recruitments undertaken. • Develop online Graduate entrance registration system • Develop online Graduate entrance exams system HR facilities (study leaves, conversions, upgrading, etc.) processed and composite report on applications prepared Service-Wide and Competency Based Training and Development for Civil Servants facilitated.	• Facilitate acquisition of financial clearance • Review report on selection process • Issue appointment letters • Review TOR for assignments • Facilitate the procurement for the development of online systems • Review mid and end year reports on applications • Review training reports.	**Target achieved.** 300 new staff recruited into the Civil Service and reviewed report available. Online registration system developed and operational. Online graduate exams conducted for 4,620 applicants. **Target achieved.** Composite report on applications available. **Target achieved.** 1,537 staff trained at OHCS Training schools and GIMPA and reviewed report available. Study Leave facility report available. MOU between OHCS and EPL available.	6.66	6.66
7.	Promoting sustainable Procurement and supply Chain Management	PSCMD monitoring exercise in 15 MDAs undertaken	• Review monitoring report and ensure feedback to MDAs	**Target achieved.** Monitoring report on Twenty two (22) MDAs available and feedback provided to MDAs.	6.67	6.67

	systems throughout the Civil Service					
8.	Ensuring effective and efficient functioning of Records Offices of Ministries and Departments	500,000 images of archival materials digitized.	• Review project status report. • Recommend payment for approval.	**Target achieved.** 1,000,000 archival materials digitized. Status report available and reviewed.	6.67	6.67
9.	Reforms for improved public sector delivery	Existing HR data of the Civil Service updated. OHCS work plan for the PSRRP implemented.	• Review reports on updates • Review TORs for all sub-activities • Facilitate meeting of the PIT • Review work plan	**Target achieved.** Updated and reviewed HR data report available. **Target achieved.** Reviewed ToRs for all sub-activities available. Reviewed reports on key activities implemented available. Meetings of PIT facilitated and minutes available - Work plan reviewed.	6.66	6.66
Sub-Total						**57.33**

5.22.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **29.586** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 71: Performance of CD, Office of the Head of the Civil Service in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**4**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 22nd February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-Year self-assessment report submitted to D/PBME with memo dated 19th August, 2019 and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Memo dated 30th September, 2019 submitting targets reviewed in the 2019 CD's PA document after the mid-year assessment exercise to the Head of the Civil Service.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Mid-year Sector Performance report submitted with memo dated 2nd August, 2019.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4.75**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Four (4) meetings held on 31st January, 4th April and 27th June, 2019 and 20th December, 2019 but the team sighted		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	minutes for only three (3). • There was report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 26th March, 24th April, 30th April, 11th June, 9th October and 21st November, 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Updated Assets Register signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor available.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 29th March, 2019.		
KRA 3: Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.9**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual dated (2019) available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list submitted with memos dated 20th March and 30th December, 2019.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualised job schedules for all staff submitted with memo dated 20th March, 2019.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 21st March, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Composite analysed report on 2018 Appraisals available with forwarding memo dated 31st		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	January, 2019. • Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument available and submitted with memos dated 29th March, and 16th August, 2019 respectively.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 17th May, 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 4th March, 2020 instead of January 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted with memo dated 3rd April, 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on 8th July and 3rd January, 2020 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January. December available. • Report on efforts to enforce discipline (including preventive measures) with memo dated 12th December, 2019 and some queries dated 8th March, 15th April, 13th June and responses.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite **analysed** reports on staff movements for mid and end of year report submitted with memos dated 2nd July and 31st December, 2019 respectfully.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 24th November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• N/A • N/A	**2**	-
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation **b.** Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Service Charter dated 2015 available. • Draft Service Charter for MSD and PSCMD available. • Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC - Memo dated 14th November, 2019 submitting report on training for CSU Officers for capacity development Officers. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to CD on 25th July 2019 and 10th February, 2020 respectively. • Reports on mini survey on service delivery in the Civil Service submitted with memo dated 13th December, 2019. • Evidence of tracking of OHCS Service Delivery Standards. • Functional interactive website/social media platforms. • Reports on updates of website submitted to CD with memo dated 11th April. 27th June, 10th December, 2019 and 10thJanuary, 2020, • Ghana Civil Service News	**4**	**4**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	Maiden Edition vol.1, GSS school brochure and Civil Service Week and Awards Night celebration poster available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**5**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Innovations in organisational operations (electronic, administrative, management). – developed Operations Manual for all Directorates and Units.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Membership of IMCC provides means of getting feedback on sub-national activities of the OHCS. • Evidence of tracking and analysis of public opinion/media reports and follow-up actions available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of fourteen (14) Management Meetings available. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. • Report on Medical and Breast Screening and Sensitization of staff available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD. Letter dated 26th September, 2019 inviting PRAAD to assess and decongest the OHCS records office.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. Management of physical environment	• Evidence of actions taken to improve records management. Letter dated 8th April, 2019 inviting Records Staffs for Records Mgt. training at OHCS. • Annual report on the management of the physical environment was sighted. Security lights installed and painting done.		
Overall Total		**29.586**	

NOTE: Since the OHCS did not have a Ministerial Advisory Board, they could not be scored for KRA4. The overall total score should thus be based on 28. To get a score relating to the overall score of 30, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 30/28, that is, 1.07.

5.22.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 72 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 72: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Office of the Head of the Civil Service

NO.	COMPETENCIES/ SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Improve effectiveness and efficiency of organisations	Attend Retreat (presentation)	• Participated in a MFARI management retreat on the topic "Coordination with other MDAs and among Bureaux" to discuss, among others, performance management from 24th to 26th Jan. 2019 at Hill View Guest Centre.
2	Policy Analysis	Attend Conference *Attend Workshop (*	• Participated in a 2nd African Evidence to Action Conference and Exhibition 2019 in Accra from 9th to 12th July, 2019 at the Institute for Statistics, Social and Economic Research (ISSER) Conference Hall, UG. • Attended a Workshop on National Monitoring and

		comments on the Policy) Attend Workshop Attend Programme and Report	Evaluation Policy Review from 15th to 17th February, 2019 at Sogakope. • Participated in the 2019 Anti-corruption and transparency week activities on 2nd December, 2019 at La Palm Royal Beach Hotel, Accra. • Attended the "Climate Policy Mainstreaming: Parliament's Responsibility." On 18th December, 2019 in Parliament House.
3	Optimizing value for money in the construction of hospitals, schools & roads	Attend Forum	Participated in a forum on the role of KNUST Alumni-"TEKNOKRATS" in cost-effective Public Infrastructural Development at Local Level on 30th April, 2019 at the Engineering Centre, Roman Ridge, Accra.
4	Public Sector Administration	Attend lecture Attend Forum Member of Panel to discuss subject	• Attended a lecture on Surcharging to Safeguarding: Next Steps in the Fight to Protect the Public Purse at British Council on 14th June, 2019 • Attended a Forum by JICA Alumni Association of Ghana (JAAGHA) on 12th March, 2019 at Alisa Hotel • Attended a Conference on the Fight Against Corruption: The Role of Board and Management on 11th April, 2019 at Accra International Conference Centre.
5	Public Financial Management (PFM)	Attend lecture Attend Meeting Attend Workshop Attend Sensitization Programme	• Attended a Lecture on "*From Surcharging to Safeguarding: Next Steps in the Fight to Protect the Public Purse* on 14th June, 2019 at the British Council Hall, Accra. • Participated in a meeting on the 2019 Budget Implementation Instructions and New Reforms on 9th May, 2019 at Civil Service Training Centre (CSTC). • Participated in a Workshop on "Enhancing Public Service Accountability and Performance on 11th June, 2019 at Justice Annan Auditorium of Parliament. • Participated in a Sensitization programme on International Public Sector Accounting Standards on 4th June, 2019 at Cleaver House, Accra.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.22.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **96.916** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.22.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Chief Director was grateful to all present and the Team for the continuous support in promoting performance management in the Civil Service. He indicated that the Office successfully put into action most of its activities regardless of both the internal and external challenges encountered during the execution year. However, the Office was working on the provision of stable internet access for effective and efficient productivity.

Team's Remarks

The Team expressed its appreciation to the CD for the manner in which the OHCS was playing the role of managing the Civil Service and at the same time managing its own internal operations. They indicated that with respect to the service-wide activities, a lot more needed to be done with respect to providing feedback to the Ministries on issues on which they had to report to the OHCS. The Team emphasised that the evaluation exercise was not punitive in nature but was aimed at promoting and building the performance management culture within the OHCS and ultimately the Civil Service. They hoped the CD and his staff had acquired some useful lessons from the interaction.

5.22.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	2018 APR of the Civil Service prepared, published and distributed.	• Email dated 11th November, 2018 sending draft guidelines for the development of 2018 APR. • Letter dated 13th November, 2018 informing MDs to access the guidelines on the OHCS website and requesting for copies reports. • Memo dated 19th October, 2018 to the CD for the revision of the template for the development of the 2018 APR. • Letter dated 2nd January, 2019 reminding Chief Directors to submit 2018 APR. • Various Letters dated 17th January, to 8th February, 2019 giving feedback to Ministries. • Email dated 18th December, 2018 for CD's review on the APR. • Email dated 18th June, 2018 to submit APR to Council. • Memo dated 27th March, 2019, to CD for the initiation of the procurement process for the printing of the APR. • Memo dated 18th June, 2019 and a revised distribution list of APR.

		• Various letters dated 15th July, 2019 to all CDs for the distribution of the APR. • Invoice dated 28th May, 2019 for the printing of the APR. • Memo dated 18th July, 2019 to seek approval to upload the 2018 APR.
2.	Chief Directors'/Directors and Heads of Department Performance Agreement System implemented. • Publish the 2018 CDs Evaluation Report • Organize 2019 signing ceremony • Organize 2018 awards and • Undertake 2019 CDs midyear monitoring.	• Memo dated 26th February, 2019 to submit the Guidance Notes of the CDs PA Template. • Memo dated 26th February, 2019 to submit the Guidance Notes of the Directors/HODs PA Template. • Memo dated 5th November, 2018 to CD on the proposal for the selection of Evaluators for 2018 evaluation. • Memo dated 23rd November, 2018 to the HCS through CD requesting for the procurement of evaluators. • Letter dated 8th November, 2018 for EOI. • Letter dated 22nd November, 2018 on the constitution of Panel for the evaluation of the performance of CDs. • Minutes of pre- evaluation meeting and copy of TOR. • 2019 Directors/HoD Performance Agreement guidelines and template available on the OHCS website. • Memo dated 10th May, 2019 to CD requesting for approval for the printing of the evaluation report. • Memo dated 17th June, 2019 to HCS requesting for approval for the distribution of the 2018 Evaluation. • Various letters dated 4th July, 2019 giving feedback on evaluation to all CDs. • Letter dated 11th December, 2018 to submit schedule for CDs evaluation. • Letter dated 2nd Jan. 2019 to request for copies of the Directors/HODs evaluation reports. • Memo dated 21st June, 2019 to submit the 2018 Directors/ HODs/Analogous grades Evaluation report. **Signing report** • Letter dated 8th March, 2019 informing CDs to access the Performance Agreement Template online. • Letter dated 20th May, 2019 to request for PA reports from MDs. • Memo dated 8th March, 2019 to HCS requesting for approval to upload revised 2019 CDs Performance Agreement Template on OHCS website.

		• Letters dated 18th March, 2019 and schedule of visits issued to all CDs on the signing of the CDs/HoDs/Directors Performance Agreement. • Letters dated 26th April, 3rd, 7th 10th 15th 24th and 30th May, 2019 sending appreciation to the MDs. • Memo dated 26th July, 2019 to submit composite report on the 2019 signing of Director/HOD's/Analogous grades. **2018 awards report and pictures available** • Memo dated 28th May, 2019 submitting proposal for sponsorship of award packages for best performed CDs. • Letter dated 10th June, 2019 to request for sponsorship for a study tour for selected CDs. • Various letters dated 7th to 20th June, 2019 requesting for sponsorship for the awards ceremony. • Memo dated 16th July, 2019 to request for approval to purchase plaques and citation. • Letter dated 12th July, 2019 to request for nominations for CS awards. • Letters dated 4th November, 2019 sending list of awardees to MDs. • Memo dated 27th September, 2019 to submit list of best performed Directors/HODs. • Letters dated 4th November, 2019 sending invitations. • Letter dated 24th October, 2019 to request for logistical support for clean-up exercise. • Letters dated 15th, 19th, 20th and 21st November, 2019 sending appreciation to participants. • Memo dated 5th November, 2019 to submit the Awards Evaluation Committee's report. • Memo dated 2nd December, 2019 submitting report on CS week and the awards night report. • Memo dated 20th December, submitting the 2018 Awards ceremony report. **2019 Mid-year monitoring report available** • Letter dated 27th June 2019 to all CDs requesting them to submit self-assessment reports and also schedule of visit for Mid-year monitoring.

		• Memo dated 20th June 2019 requesting for the release of funds to organize pre-mid-year monitoring meeting and a strategy paper. • Memo dated 19th November, 2019 to submit Mid-Year monitoring report. • Memo dated 25th September, 2019 to submit summary report on the Mid-Year monitoring exercise. • Letter dated 24th December, 2019 submitting report on the dissemination of findings of the 2019 mid-year monitoring exercise. • Emails indicating that the Mid-year Monitoring report has been sent to CDs.
3.	Service-wide Staff Performance Appraisal in Ministries and Departments implemented. • Produce composite report on 2018 SPAR • Track implementation of 2019 planning and midyear phases	• Memo dated 4th April 2019 submitting minutes of meeting held to discuss Staff Performance Appraisals. • Letter dated 19th August, 2019 to submit template for SPA reporting. • Questionnaires towards the implementation of the online SPAR. • Memo dated 2nd July 2019 submitting report on 2018 composite SPAR in the Civil Service for CD's review. • Email dated 30th December, 2019 on review of TOR for online Appraisal. • Memo dated 2nd July 2019 submitting the TOR for the development of an electronic Performance Appraisal Application System. • Memo dated 25th September, 2019 submitting Composite report on 2019 Planning and Mid-year phases. • Letters dated 2nd, 6th, 7th and 15th May, 2019 providing feedback to Ministries. • Concept demo for SPAR. • 2020 Work program for the World Bank project.
4.	Draft Civil Service Bill prepared and submitted to Cabinet. • Cabinet Memo for Policy Approval submitted. • Cabinet Memo for approval of draft Bill submitted.	• 21st February, 2019 draft proposal for support to review the Civil Service law 1993, Act 327 and Interim Regulations 1960. • Email dated 18th February, 2019 to revise the EU Work plan. • Letter dated 27th February, 2019 submitting the proposal to IMCC for funding. • Emails dated 13th, 14th and 18th February, 2019 submitting EU Project Proposal and Work plan to CD. • Letter dated 7th August, 2019 submitting the Cabinet Memo

		to OSM. • Letter dated 13th May, 2019 submitting the Cabinet Memo through the Chief of Staff for approval. • Email dated 18th February, 2019 to submit the CS Act proposal and work plan to CD for review. • Emails dated 9th and 26th April, 2019 forwarding Cabinet Memo to CD for review. • Email dated 8th October, 2019 to submit the updated OHCS Cabinet Memo to CD. • Copy of Cabinet Approval for DTAP work program available
5.	Eight (8) Organizational Manuals for MDAs developed/reviewed	• Letter dated 7th February, 2019 submitting draft Org. Manual for Min. of Special Development Initiative. • Letter dated 8th February, 2019 submitting Min. of Parliamentary Affairs' Org. Manual. • Letters dated 21st January, and 5th February, 2019 for a request to assist develop Manual for Registrar General. • Letter dated 2nd May and 14th May, 2019 requesting for support to validate Organizational. Manual for Min. of Inner-City and Zongo Development. • Letter dated 22nd February, 2019 inviting MSD to review Organizational. Manual for Min. of Sanitation and Water Resources. • Letter dated 15th May, 2019 on request to develop Operational Manual for ITS. • Letter dated 30 April, 2019 to approve Min. of Parliamentary Affairs Organizational Manual. • Letter dated 7th June, 2019 to approve Min. of Business Development Organizational Manual. • Letter dated 10th December, 2019 to approve Min. of Planning Organizational. Manual.
	Five (5) Client Service Charters for MDAs reviewed.	• Letter dated 7th February, 2019 constituting a technical team to review Service Charter for Min. of Energy. • Letter dated 4th, 12th and 24th April, 2019 to validate the Service Charter for Min. of Defence. • Letter dated 2nd and 15th April, 2019 requesting for development of Administrative Manual and Service Charter for Min. of Regional Reorganisation and Development. • Letter dated 13th, 21st March and 16th April, 2019 requesting for technical assistance to validate Service Charter for Min. of Special Development Initiative. • Letter dated 28th March, 2019 inviting OHCS and MSD for

		validation of Service Charter for Min. of Sanitation and Water resource. • Letter dated 8th January, 2020 to approve the CSC of Min. of Inner-City & Zongo Development. • Letter dated 30th August, 2019 to approve the CSC of Min. of Energy. • Letter dated 11th November, 2019 to approve the CSC of Min. of Special Development Initiatives. • Letter dated 23rd December, 2019 to approve CSC of Min. of Employment.
	Six (6) Schemes of Service for MDAs revised/developed.	• Letter dated 28th June, 2019 inviting MSD to a validation workshop for scheme of service for Min. of Agric. • Letter dated 4th February, and 31st May, 2019 submitting draft scheme of service for Min. of Agric. • Letter dated 14th May, 2019 to review the scheme of service for the Veterinary Service Dept. of MOFA. • Letter dated 10th June, 2019 submitting draft scheme of service for Veterinary Class. • 26th June, 2019 sending reviewed commends on the scheme of service for Veterinary Class. • Letter dated 26th June, 2019 and 10th Feb. 2020 to send comments to MSD on Veterinary Class Scheme of Service.
6.	Service-wide recruitments undertaken. • Develop online Graduate entrance registration system • Develop online Graduate entrance exams system	• Letter dated 25th June, 2019 requesting for financial clearance to Ministry of Finance. • Memo dated 22nd March, 2019 submitting findings on staffing gab analysis to the HCS through CD. • Letter dated 5th February, 2019 distributing the development of recruitment plan to all CDs and HoDs. • Memo dated 6th June, 2019 submitting examination and interview report through D/RTDD to CD. • Letters dated 28th February, and 29th March, 2019 issuing appointments. • Memo dated 18th March, 2019 sending a proposal for developing and hosting of e-application system for OHCS. • Memo dated 18th July, 2019 submitting actionable areas on meeting that discussed the upcoming online examination. • Memo dated 3rd July, 2019 submitting a report on the test phase of the Civil Service online graduate entrance examination to CD. • Memo dated 1st August, 2019 submitting report on the Civil Service recruitment system to CD.

		• Memo dated 26th November, 2019 submitting the terms of reference on the online exams system.
	HR facilities (study leaves, conversions, upgrading, etc.) processed and composite report on applications prepared	• Memos dated 2nd and 5th July 2019 submitting mid-year report on Human Resource facilities to CD. • Memos dated 27th and 31st December, 2019 and 20th January, 2020 submitting the end of year HR report. • Memo dated 20th January, 2020 to submit the composite HR Facility report for 2019.
	Service-Wide and Competency Based Training and Development for Civil Servants facilitated.	• Letter dated 16th May, 2019 inviting MDAs to post Graduate Diploma in Public Administration course. • Memo dated 5th July, 2019 to submit the midyear report on activities of the RTDD. • Memo dated 10th July, 2019 proposing course content for the scheme of service training programme to CD. • Memo dated 30th May, 2019 submitting service-wide training plan report to CD. • Memo dated 18th October, 2019 submitting RTDD's third quarter report. • Memo dated 30th December, 2019 to submit study leave facility report. • Memo dated 16th January, 2019 submitting the MOU between OHCS and EPL. • Memo dated 17th September, 2019 to submit nominees to be trained on the OHCS
7.	PSCMD monitoring exercise in 15 MDAs undertaken	• Letter dated 15th January, 2019 notifying MDAs of Procurement and Supply chain monitoring. • Letter dated 27th March, 2019 giving notice of 2nd quarter monitoring in MDAs. • Letter dated 8th April, 2019 Submitting 1st quarter monitoring report to CD. • Letter dated 15th July, 2019 submitting 2019 mid-year monitoring report to CD. • Letter dated 14th October, 2019 submitting 2019 3rd quarter monitoring report to CD. • Letter dated 13th January, 2020 submitting 2019 Annual monitoring report to CD. • Letter dated 23rd December, 2019 sending feedback reports to MDs on monitoring.

8.	500,000 images of archival materials digitized.	• Letters dated 20th, 27th June, 2019 clarifying matters on contract between OHCS and the contractor. • Letter dated 21st May, 2019 submitting request for payment for the digitization. • Memo and letter dated 17th and 22nd May, 2019 respectively, requesting Internal Audit to conduct special audit on the digitization project. • Letters dated 9th and 30th April, 2019 on revenue projections. • Letter dated 8th November, 2019 submitting final report on the digitization project. • Letter dated 15th January, 2020 submitting report on digitization project. • Letters dated 6th August, 19th November, 2019 and 10th January, 2020 submitting mid-year, third quarter and end-of-year reports on records digitization.
9.	Existing HR data of the Civil Service updated.	• Report on review and management of establishment level of the MDs on the HRMIS • Report on update of existing HR data of the civil service from January, to June, 2019 • Memo dated 25th July, 2019 to submit quarterly report on update of existing HR data. • Email dated 25th July 2019 forwarding the monthly analysis report on existing Human Resource database to CD. • Email dated 31st July, 2019 submitting mid-year report on HR database to CD. • Email dated 26th July, 2019 submitting 2nd quarter report on HR database to CD. • Memo dated 31st July, 2019 to submit Jan-June on update of existing HR. • Memo dated 8th July, 2019 to submit processed IPPD input forms.
	OHCS work plan for the PSRRP implemented.	• Memo dated 26th April, 2019 submitting TOR and work plan for the 2019 OHCS component of the PSRRP through CD to Head. • TOR's and Work Plan for 2019 OHCS Component of the Public Sector Reform for Results Project developed and submitted to OSM. • Emails dated 24th January, 2019 forwarding TORs to CD for review and reviewed TORs • Email dated 17th January, 2019 sending draft OHCS Work plan of the GPSRRP to CD and comments.

		• Email dated 15th March, 2019 sending the TOR for the 2019 OHCS component of the PSRRP to Director, Procurement. • Memo dated 16th April 2019 submitting minutes of meeting of AIT for PSRRP to CD. • Memo dated 10th September, 2019 submitting minutes of meeting held b/t OHCS, the PMU and World Bank team. • Memo dated 4th June 2019 submitting report on Project Management Unit and PIT working session to CD.

5.23 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Office of the President

5.23.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 73 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **42** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 73: Performance of Ag. CD, Office of the President in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Strengthening oversight of and synergies between OoP Agencies	Mechanism for coordination implemented Two (2) M&Efield visits to eight (8) OoP Agencies undertaken	• Coordinate Two (2) meetings between Chief of Staff (CoS) and the Agencies • Seek approval of the CoS to convene meetings • Issue correspondences to Agencies • Review minutes of meetings and reports from Agencies • Ensure that action is taken on emerging issues from meetings • Request for submission of	**Target achieved.** Approval sought to convene the meeting from CoS. One meeting for coordination held and mid-year reports collated and analysed. Minutes available with CD's reviews. Report on emerging issues identified and forwarded to the Chief of Staff for her attention. **Target achieved.** Two (2) M&Efield visits to eight (8) OoP Agencies undertaken and reports available with CD's review. The agencies are: • Scholarships Secretariat • State Interests and Governance	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			Bi-annual routine reports from the Agencies • Analyse and take action on emerging issues from reports/meetings • Approve schedule for field monitoring to Agencies • Issue correspondence to agencies for Monitoring visits • Review Monitoring visits report	• State Protocol Department • Internal Audit Agency • Ghana AIDS Commission • Millennium Development Authority • Microfinance and Small Loans Centre • Office of the Administrator-General • Ghana Investment Promotion Centre		
2.	Ensuring effective Service Delivery by the Office of the President	New standards of service delivery developed for twelve (12) OoP Agencies Revised survey instrument to Twelve (12) Agencies administered Survey instruments collated and analysed	• Seek approval for new standards • Approve revise survey instrument • Request for inputs from Agencies • Review Draft survey report. • Submit reviewed	**Target achieved.** Approval given by the Chief of Staff. Survey instrument revised to include the twelve (12) agencies. Survey report available with CD's review. Summary of survey submitted to the CoS. New standards of	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		New standards for agencies developed	survey report to CoS • Facilitate the development of the new standards	service delivery developed for the twelve (12) OoP Agencies under the Office.		
3.	Strengthening of information management Systems for the OoP	MIS framework suite developed in 2017 operationalised Corporate e-mails to Middle-Level Civil Service Staff assigned Officers trained on the usage of the corporate e-mails Usage of emails monitored	• Coordinate the operationalizati on of the MIS framework suite developed in 2017 • Approve list of e-mails for Senior Civil Servants and issue memo for usage • Coordinate the training on the usage of the emails • Review training reports • Monitor the proper functioning of the usage of the corporate emails	**Target not achieved.** Though the operationalisation of the MIS framework suite was done in 2017, the activities to be undertaken 2019 were not all undertaken. Operationalized MIS framework suite and report available. List of approved corporate e-mails for senior officers (first phase). No training undertaken. Monitoring not undertaken.	12	**6**
4.	Managing State Facility	State Banquet Hall renovated and refurbished	• Seek approval from CoS to engage services of Consultant and Contractor • Facilitate the procurement of	**Target on hold** – CD could not implement.	12	**0**

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			a Consultant and a Contractor to undertake the project • Facilitate Meetings with the Consultant and Contractor • Constitute a project committee and facilitate meetings • Review estimates and design for CoS approval • Undertake site inspection • Review progress report from Consultant • Facilitate payment for work done			
5.	Enhancing ICT for OoP	Installation of physical connectivity system within the Jubilee House completed	• Ensure installation of physical connectivity at General Services Building of the	**Target achieved.** Physical connectivity successfully installed in both the general services	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			Jubilee House • Facilitate the payment to contractors	and the Jubilee House – including a local area network which was wired and connected. Report available.		
Sub-Total					**42**	

5.23.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **27.713** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 74:Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Office of the President in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement available but not forwarded to OHCS 19th March, 2019 instead of February 2019.	4	3.8
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report and forwarded to OHCS on 30th September, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
of the sector annual action plan e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	sector annual action plan report dated July, 2019 available. • 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 31st January 2020		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries. b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved. c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Four (4) meetings held and Minutes dated 15th March and 20th June, 24th October, and 12th December, 2019 respectively available. • There was a report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee. • Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 11th March, 16th April, 14th May, 14th June, 16th and 25th July, 14th October, 15th November, 2019. • Assets Register updated but **not**signed by the Estate Officer. However, signed by Chief Internal Auditor. • 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.	5	4.5

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.85**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual dated (2019) available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 2nd November, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 21st March 2019 instead of January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Planning Phase report dated June and mid-year phase report dated July, 2019 available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 21st May, 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 6th February 2020 instead of by 30th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 10th May, 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on July, 2019 and January, 2020		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
	respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January - December, 2019 available. • Internal memos on efforts to enforce discipline available (queries, lateness etc.). Some disciplinary cases being handled.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analyzed reports dated 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 12th December instead of November, 2019		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational		**2**	**-**
a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up	• N/A		
b. Quarterly meetings organised	• N/A		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	**3.5**
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter available dated February, 2018. • No Department/Agency Charter available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC From 11th – 13th November, 2019. Back to office report available. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS 4th February, 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, WhatsApp platform available. Web-portal and call centre available.		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Reports on mid and end of year website updates available. • Newsletters, brochures and flyers.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Digitization of official records. • Monitoring reports of Agencies. • Media Tracking-media follow-ups undertaken. • Minutes of nine (9) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of one (1) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen (women heading Directorates is equal to number of men heading). • Organized 'breast cancer screening, medical screening and report available. • Catalogue of information posted on notice boards. • Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available – letter dated 22nd May, 2019 inviting PRAAD to decongest the Estate Unit at the Castle – Osu and response from PRAAD dated 14th June, 2019. • No training or other records management activities undertaken.	**5**	**4.25**

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
e. Management of physical environment	• Physical environment satisfactory.		
Overall Total		**27.713**	

NOTE: Since the Ministry did not have a Ministerial Advisory Board, they could not be scored for KRA4. The overall total score should thus be based on 28. To get a score relating to the overall score of 30, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 30/28, that is, 1.07.

5.23.3 Schedule 3:Ag. CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 75 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 75: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Office of the President

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Developing new ways of improving performance in Public Administration and Management	Attend conference	Attended the International Conference of the Institute of Auditors (IIA) in Anaheim, California.
2	Quality leadership, a critical skill for attainment of service delivery.	Attend leadership Training	Participated in Crown Agent leadership retreat on 2nd to 6th September, 2019.
3	Public Administration and Management	Attend meeting	The Chief Director's last quarter General Meeting was held on Wednesday, 11th November 2019 at the Alisa Hotel.
4	Contemporary Public Management	Participate in the celebration	Participated in the 2019 Civil Service Week and Awards Celebrations from 4th – 8th November, 2019. Back to Office Report available.
5	Security awareness	Participate in a workshop	Participated in a workshop on Cybercrime/Security For Chief Directors at the KAIPTC, Teshie On 22nd October, 2019 during a National Cyber Security Awareness Month (NCSAM). Back to Office Report available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.23.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **79.713** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.23.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD expressed his appreciation to the Team and indicated his willingness to improve upon his work based on the comments made. He had always seen the exercise as a learning opportunity. He indicated that his team had taken notes and would meet to discuss these so that in the ensuing years, improved output would be achieved.

Team's Remarks

The Team thanked the Ag. CD and his staff for the fruitful and positive interaction. They appreciated the efforts the Ag. CD had made towards bringing together the diverse institutions constituting the Office of the President and acknowledged the fact that there was still more to be done towards realising the goal of having an effective coordinating mechanism for all the institutions. They were of the view that the concept of performance management and the Agreement he signed could be a way of building the type of mechanism he had in mind. They advised the Ag. CD to make the Agreement the tool which he used for his day to day activities.

5.23.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Mechanism for coordination implemented	• One (1) meeting for mechanism for coordination between CoS and OoP Agencies held on 15th July, 2019. • Letter dated 15th July, 2019 inviting Agency heads to meeting. • Minutes of meeting reviewed. • Emerging issues identified for follow-ups Approval sought to convene meeting. • Routine Reports from Agencies received and analysed. • Follow-up issues identified during meeting and actions taken.
	Two (2) M&Efield visits to twelve (12) OoP Agencies undertaken	• Approved schedules for monitoring visit to ten (10) OoP Agencies during mid-year and end of year respectively. • Letter dated 21st June, and 14th November, 2019 sent to OoP Agencies for Monitoring visits. • Monitoring visits reports reviewed.
2.	New standards of service	• Memo dated 16th July, 2019 forwarding draft survey

	delivery developed for twelve (12) OoP Agencies	instrument to the CD for approval. • Letter dated 24th July, 2019 forwarding survey instrument to agencies for their inputs.
	Revised survey instrument to Twelve (12) Agencies administered	
	Survey instruments collated and analysed	• Survey report reviewed. • Summary of survey submitted to the CoS.
3.	MIS framework suite developed in 2017 operationalised	• Report on operationalized MIS framework suite available
	Corporate e-mails to Middle-Level Civil Service Staff assigned	• List of approved cooperate emails for senior officers
	Officers trained on the usage of the corporate e-mails	
	Usage of emails monitored	
4.	State Banquet Hall renovated and refurbished	• Target on hold
5.	Installation of physical connectivity system within the Jubilee House completed	Report on physical connectivity system available

5.24 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Office of the Senior Minister

5.24.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected seven (7) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1. Three (3) TPAs were each assigned a score of eight point five-eight (8.58). The four (4) other TPAs were each assigned a score of eight point five-seven (8.57). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 76 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **34.07** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 76:Performance of Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Implementing National Public Sector Reform Strategy (NPSRS) 2018-2023	Donors Conference to mobilize resources for the implementation of reforms organized	• Facilitate the setting up of a committee and their meetings • Facilitate the mobilization of resources for the conference • Review conference papers and speeches • Formal conference • Facilitate the setting up of a committee and their meetings • Facilitate the mobilization of resources for the conference	**Target not achieved.** Donor's Conference not held. Undated and authored draft concept note for conference produced awaiting approval by the Senior Minister, Ministry of Finance and the World Bank. Email discussion on the concept note with the World Bank dated 12th March, 2019 verified. Letters drafted for sponsorship sighted. Target on hold, awaiting response from the World Bank.	8.57	3.2

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Stakeholder conference organised for the preparation of Guidelines to help mainstream the NPSRS, 2028-2023 into the functional activities of MDAs and MMDAs	• Review conference papers and speeches • Formal conference	**Target not achieved.** Stakeholders' conference not held. Letters for sponsorship of 15th July, 2019 sent to some possible sponsors of conference. Target on hold awaiting funds.		
2.	Implementing World Bank supported Public Sector Reform for Results Project (PSRRP)	Project Operations Manual (POM) for PSRRP developed PSRRP implemented	• Facilitate the development of a Project Operations Manual (POM) for the PSRRP • Review Operations Manual (POM) for the PSRRP • Facilitated the setting up of Project Implementation Teams (PITs) • Facilitate the constitution of a Project Steering Committee (PStC)for the PSRRP • Facilitate the procurement	**Target achieved.** Project Operations Manual (POM) for PSRRP developed, July, 2019. No review sighted. **Target not achieved.** PITs established in all beneficiary Agencies of the PSRRP and operating Letters sent to all Public Sector nominees of the PStC for their acceptance. By World Bank (WB) conditions, three (3) of the nominees to the PStC were to be from CSOs. They are to be competitively engaged. The PMU	8.57	7

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			of goods for equipping of office for Project Management Unit • Facilitate the preparation of work and procurement plans for the project • Facilitate the preparation of TORs for various consultancies of the project • Review TORs for the various consultancies	advertised this in 2 major newspapers. Applications have been received and evaluation completed. Report yet to be submitted to the WB for a "No Objection" for the inclusion of CSOs on the Committee. Quantities, specifications and prices of items to be procured and approved by the Project's Task Team Leader for a "No-Objection". Some of the items including vehicles advertised and bids ready to be evaluated. Draft Work and Procurement Plans prepared and dated June, 2019 and approved by the Senior Minister on 4th July, 2019 and were approved by the World Bank for implementation through emails. Draft 2020 Work Plans submitted to the World Bank to meet the December, 2019 deadline.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				Various TORs were prepared and cleared by the World Bank. All of the thirty-two (32) TORs received from Beneficiary Agencies were reviewed and nineteen (19) of them submitted to the World Bank for "No Objection".		
3.	Enhancing Institutional framework relating to monetary policy management	Develop draft Ghana Beyond Aid Charter and Strategy Complete consultations with key stakeholders such as Council of State, National House of Chiefs, Development Partners, Civil Society, Media, Faith-Based Organisation. Finalise the Ghana Beyond Aid Charter and Strategy Document based on feedback Present Ghana Beyond Aid Charter and	• Constitute teams and facilitate their meetings • Review draft Charter and Strategy document • Coordinate the laying of the Ghana Beyond Aid Charter and Strategy Document by the President of the Republic in Parliament for approval and acceptance as a national strategy	**Target partially achieved.** Team constituted at the Senior Minister's Office. Draft Ghana Beyond Aid Charter and Strategy Document dated April, 2019 completed. Review not sighted. Various stakeholder consultations on-going – (Council of State, some Regional Houses of Chiefs, Development Partners visited). No report available. Document yet to be finalised and submitted to	8.57	3

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		strategy Document to Parliament for adoption Embark on Nationwide sensitization	• Facilitate the organisation of stakeholder consultations across the country; National House of Chiefs, Council of State, etc. • Facilitate the sensitization of Ghana Beyond Aid Agenda	Parliament for adoption with subsequent nationwide sensitisation.		
4.	Implementing Service Delivery Improvement measures	Generic Client Service Charter (CSC) template for adoption/adaptation by all MDAs, MMDAs and Public Institutions introduced and monitored	• Mobilize resources for the review of the generic CSCs • Facilitate procurement activities on behalf of PSC and OHCS to assist in the introduction of the CSCs • Coordinate the organisation of a validation workshop on the reviewed CSC	**Target not achieved.** TORs for the recruitment of consultants to undertake this Target for both OHCS & PSC approved. Project Management Unit yet to request for Expression of Interest through advertisement to start procurement process.	8.58	3

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate the monitoring of CSCs nationwide to ensure compliance			
5.	Institutionalizing Best Practices in Public Service Delivery	Promoted the implementation of the 4th OGP Action Plan	• Facilitate the preparation of the 4th OGP Action Plan • Participate in two international events • Oversee the organisation of two OGP Steering Committee meetings • Facilitate the participation of bi-annual stakeholders meetings	**Target not achieved.** Action Plan not prepared due to budgetary constraints. Two (2) International events participated (1 local and 1 foreign) and presentations available. Three (3) Steering Committee meetings held, (one (1) international and two (2) local) and minutes available. One (1) bi-annual meeting participated in. Communique available out of a round table engagement.	8.58	5
6.	Strengthening the institutional and legislative framework	Cabinet memorandum on African Charter on the Principles and Values of Public Administration re-submitted to Cabinet	• Facilitate the release of funds • Re-submit draft Charter to Cabinet for approval	**Target not achieved.** Legal opinion on Cabinet Memo on African Charter on the Principles and Values of Public Administration	8.58	4.3

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate the printing of copies of Charter	being sought from Attorney-General's Department. A Cabinet memorandum on the Charter reviewed for Senior Minister's approval. Printed the first sixty (60) copies of the Charter for Cabinet.		
7.	Implementing E-records & archives management programme	Proposal for funding developed and submitted to Development Partners (DPS) for consideration and approval; and Negotiate funding terms with DPs in collaboration with the relevant local authorities	• Facilitate the preparation of documents for presentation to Development Partners for funding and; • Facilitate negotiation for external funding	**Target achieved.** Proposal for funding developed by the Public Records and Archives Administration Department (PRAAD) in collaboration with the Office of the Senior Minister (OSM) sent to the Ministry of Finance for external funding from China. Ministry of Finance (MOF) applied to the Chinese Government for a concessional loan of US$70 million for the implementation of the programme. All the necessary documents for loan evaluation	8.57	8.57

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				submitted to the Government of China by OSM, MOF and PRAAD for review. Loan negotiations are pending the review of loan documentation.		
Sub-Total					**34.07**	

5.24.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **24.316** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 77: Performance of Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.3**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy not submitted.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 16th August 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 3rd Sept., 2019 and approval granted.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Not available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 21st January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**3.95**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Team sighted minutes of two (2) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 10th April and 28th August 2019. • There was a report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting not available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Assets Register updated. Prepared by the Estate Officer and not signed but authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 14th August, 2019 instead of March 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.1**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial	• Organization Manual dated (2017) available.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec., 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff available. • Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 12th December, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 25th October, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 29th May, 2019 • Evaluation undertaken and report submitted on 29th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal available but not submitted to OHCS. • Mid and end year reports available but not submitted to OHCS		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January - December available. • Internal Memos on efforts to enforce discipline dated 1st Oct, 2019 available – a driver who had an accident with an official vehicle after several warnings.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
g. Report on staff movements	• Undated composite analyzed reports. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 4th December instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	 • N/A • N/A	**2**	**-**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation **b.** Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	 • Service Charter not available. • No Department charter. • Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers not trained. • Mid & end of year reports available but no evidence of forwarding to OHCS. • Functional website, Facebook and Instagram. • Reports website updates available but not quarterly. • Newsletters, flyers available.	**4**	**2.625**
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	 • The Ministry created work stations for staff to make space available for all staff and improve work flow. • No activities relating to the sub-national level. • Media Tracking- cuttings of Newspapers was available.	**5**	**3.75**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of six (6) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of two (2) Staff durbars sighted • No measures taken to promote gender inclusiveness • Report on Breast Cancer Screening and Sensitization of staff dated 28th October, 2019 available and a distressing retreat trip on 13th September, 2019 • Internal memos, WhatsApp platform and notice board available.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available decongestion exercise from 28th September\, - 5th October, 2019 • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Management. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• New Air-conditioners installed, renovation works undertaken, installation of CCTV camera, washrooms rehabilitated, improvement in fire management for staff.		
Overall Total		**24.316**	

NOTE: Since the Ministry did not have a Ministerial Advisory Board, they could not be scored for KRA4. The overall total score should thus be based on 28. To get a score relating to the overall score of 30, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 30/28, that is, 1.07.

5.24.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 78 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 78: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Office of the Senior Minister

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	General Project Management (World Bank)	Participate in training	Attended World Bank – PMU Capacity Building Training from 2nd to 3rd September 2019. Back to office report available.
2	Procurement Management	Attend workshop	Attended Training workshop for Project Management Unit (PMU) & Selected Entities (SEs) Project Implementation Team ((PIT) Members 12th to 13th September 2019. Back to office report available.
3	General Management	Attend conference	Participated in the 10th Annual Conference of Chairpersons of Government Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and Chief Executives of the Ghana Public Services 17th to 20th October 2019. Back to office report available.
		Attend workshop	Participated in the Chief Director's Capacity Building Workshop. Back to office report available.
4	Financial Management	Attend workshop	Attended workshop from 7th to 9th June 2019 on Training of Board of Directors and General Managers of Rural and Community Banks on Basel I and II. Back to office report available.
5	Risk Management	Attend Workshop	Attended workshop from 18th to 20th August, 2019 on Training of Board of Directors and General Managers of Rural and Community Banks on risk management. Back to office report available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.24.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **68.386** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.24.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD was grateful for the exercise. He saw the exercise to be evidence-based and thus very objective with CDs having to provide the evidence to support whatever that they claimed to have done. He advised that the incoming Ag. CD must have innovative ways of managing the office and must be tactful and diplomatic in all her dealings in the Office. He was grateful for the learning experiences he had had from the exercise.

Team's Remarks

The exercise was a way for all to learn and discover more. All members of staff of the Ministry would have to do their part to bring out their strengths and weaknesses in their bid to strengthen the performance management culture of the Ministry in particular and the Civil Service in general. The Agreement should guide the daily work of the Ag. CD and not be kept only with the evaluation exercise in mind.

5.24.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Donors Conference to mobilize resources for the implementation of reforms organized.	• Letters for sponsorship dated 15th July, 2019 signed by the Senior Minister to some selected private and public sector entities.
	Stakeholder conference organized for the preparation of Guidelines to help mainstream the NPSRS, 2018-2023 into the functional activities of MDAs and MMDs.	• Letters for sponsorship dated 15th July, 2019 signed by the Senior Minister to some selected private and public sector entities.
2.	Project Operating Manual (POM) for PSRRP developed	• PITs established in all beneficiary agencies of the PSRRP by a letter dated 28th May, 2019 issued by this Office to the World Bank Country Director in Ghana. • Memo dated 14th May, 2019 by the Senior Minister establishing and inaugurating a Project Steering Committee for the implementation of the PSRRP. • Letter dated 11th July, 2019 from the Ministry to all public sector nominees of the PStC for their acceptance. • Copies of adverts placed in the Newspapers (daily graphic and Ghanaian Times) sighted.
3.	Develop draft Ghana Beyond Aid Charter and Strategy	• Letter dated 7th May, 2019 on the presentation of the "Ghana Beyond Aid" Charter and Strategy document to the Council of State.

		• Letter dated 30th May, 2019 to Federal Republic of Germany (workshop to discuss "Ghana Beyond Aid" Charter and Strategy document with Heads of missions and development partners in Ghana). • Letter of appreciation to Development Partners dated 12th July, 2019.
4.	Generic Client Service Charter (CSC) template for adoption/adaptation by all MDAs, MMDAs and Public Institutions introduced and monitored	Terms of reference (ToR) to engage consultants approved.
5.	Promoted the implementation of the 4th OGP Action Plan	• Memo dated 28th February, 2019 from the Assistant Programmer to Ag. CD submitting proposal on OGP workshop. • Presentation at a world vision international workshop at western premier hotel on 16th April, 2019. • Back to office report on meeting with Hon. Catherine A. Afeku and John Penrose of the British Parliament on 30th May, 2019 at the Shaw Center in Ottawa. • Minutes of meeting dated 29th May, 2019 for Steering committee meeting held at the global level in Canada, Ottawa. • Memo dated 25th June, 2019 proposal for the development of the fourth OGP action plan from Director F & A, through CD to Hon. Minister. • Minutes of meeting of the OGP steering committee meeting with the Hon. Senior Minister held on 9th August, 2019. • Minutes of meeting on the development of a Grant Proposal for OGP held at the Forest Hotel from 11th – 12th October, 2019.

5.25 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs

5.25.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 79 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **52** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 79: Performance of CD, Parliamentary Affairs in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Strengthening the Capacity of Parliament to Exercise Oversight on Government Finances and Implementation of Policies and Programs	**Two (2)** Needs Based Technical Workshops For Selected Committees of Parliament Organized	• Set up a committee and develop ToR • Facilitate Meeting • Prepare welcome Address	**Target achieved.** As a cost-cutting measure and also in view of the schedule of Parliament, only one (1) engagement with the Environment, Science and Technology and Constitutional Legal and Parliamentary Affairs Committees of Parliament on Climate Change Policy Mainstreaming instead of the two (2) planned for which the CD was preparing. This was held on 18th December 2019 and minutes/report with evidence of CD's review available Committee set up and Concept Note developed, with evidence of CD's review.	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Two (2) Meetings With Core Leadership of Parliament Organized. Government business on the floor of Parliament facilitated		**Target achieved.** **Two (2)** Meetings with Core Leadership Organized on 20th June 2019 and 21st December 2019. Committee set up and Concept Note developed, with evidence of CD's review. Evaluation form with evidence of review available.		
2.	Strengthen Independent Governance Institutions to Perform their Functions Effectively	**Two (2)** Meetings with Independent Constitutional Institutions Organized	• Review Minutes of Meeting • Review Report and submit to the Minister	**Target achieved.** Two (2) Meetings Organized on 20th March, and 13th December 2019 respectively with the Electoral Commission (EC), the National Media Commission (NMC) and the Parliamentary Press Corps.	10	10
3.	Strengthening Systems and Structures for ensuring Transparency and Accountability in the Management of Public Funds	**Two (2)** Workshops with Committees of Parliament and other Independent Constitutional Institutions Organized	• Set up a committee and develop ToR • Review concept paper • Develop ToR for Resource persons and consultants • Coordinate the organization of Meetings	**Target achieved.** One (1) Workshop on Fiscal Impact Analysis held with the Finance and Constitutional Legal and Parliamentary Affairs Committees of Parliament held on 28th November 2019 with CHRAJ and NCCE's involvement. This was a cost-cutting measure and	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate the release of Funds • Review speeches, presentation and key note address • Review post Evaluation Report • Review Reports and submit to the Minister	also took into account the schedules of the various bodies invited to participate in the Workshops. Committee set up and Concept Note developed, with evidence of CD's review. Minutes/report of meeting with evidence of CD's review available.		
4.	Strengthening the Judiciary, Parliament, Security Service and Other Anti-Corruption Institutions to perform their functions affectively	**Two (2)** Meetings with Anti-Corruption Institutions Organized.	• Set up a committee and develop TOR • Review Concept Notes • Develop ToR for Resource persons and consultants • Coordinate the organization of meetings • Facilitate the release of funds • Review speeches, presentations and key note address • Review post evaluation	**Target Achieved.** Committee set up and Concept Note developed, with evidence of CD's review. **Three (3)** Engagements held with Political Parties, Parliamentary Network Africa (PNA) and National Stakeholders involving; MPs, Judicial Service, Security Agencies, CHRAJ, NCCE, GII, CSOs on: • Monetization of Politics - **30th May and 8th July 2019 and** • High Attrition in Parliament - **26th June 2019.** Report of meetings available.	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			Report • Review Reports and submit to the Minister.			
5.	Instituting Mechanism for Effective Inter-Service/Inter-Sectoral Collaboration and Cooperation at District, Regional and National Levels	**Two (2)** Workshops for MPs and MMDCEs for **Two (2)** Regions Organized. **One (1)** Research on the relationship between MPs and MMDCEs Conducted	• Set up a committee and develop ToR • Facilitate the committee's work • Review Concept Note • Review Reports and submit to the Minister • Review post evaluation Report	**Target not achieved** Committee set up and Concept Note developed, with evidence of CD's review. A major collaboration with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration (MOFARI), Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs (MoPA) and United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA) aimed at bringing MPs and MMDCEs for a Policy Dialogue was called off due to some administrative hitches. This has been rescheduled to March 2020. **Target Not Undertaken**due to non-availability of financial resources. This was not foreseen during the mid-year review.	10	2

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
6.	Improve participation of Civil Society(media, traditional authorities, religious bodies) in National Development	Organize two (2) Engagements with Civil Society	• Set up a committee and develop ToR • Review concept Notes • Develop ToR for Resource persons and consultants • Coordinate the organisation of Seminars • Facilitate the release of funds • Review speeches, presentations and key note address • Review post-evaluation Report • Review press Statements • Review Reports and submit to the Minister	**Target was achieved.** Two (2)Workshops organizedwith CSOs on the Implementation of RTI Law on 30th April, 2019 and Engagement with the Media on Political Vigilantism on 2nd May, 2019 respectively. Committee set up and Concept Note developed, with evidence of CD's review. Reports of workshops available.	10	10
Sub-Total					**52**	

5.25.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **25.197** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 80: Performance of Chief Director, Parliamentary Affairs in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 25th March, 2019 instead of February, 2019.		
~~b.~~ Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement available and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• The CD explained that the feedback provided after the mid-year reviews was used to strengthen their programmes.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated 16th August, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries	• Team sighted minutes of four (4) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 18th January, 6th May, 14th November, and 16th December, 2019.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA on 2nd January, 2019. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 18th April, 23rd October, 15th November, and 27th December, 2019		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory of items provided and dates of acquisition indicated for all items. Documents signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 27th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**7.257**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec., 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Organization Manual copy forwarded to OHCS on 18th April, 2019. Approval received from OHCS on 30th April, 2019. • Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff available. • Establishment levels available with no variance but submitted to OHCS on 18th April, 2019.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Unsatisfactory composite 2018 Appraisals reportwas available and forwarded to OHCS on 24th April, 2019. Report did not analyse the overall appraisals of the staff of the Ministry but the appraisal instruments were forwarded to the OHCS.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Reports not sighted.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• No Director at post hence no agreement was signed hence no evaluation conducted.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 8th April, 2019. • Mid-year reports submitted to OHCS on 8th July 2019. End of year report not available.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available but there was no trend analysis. • One-on-one interaction with staff as preventive measures to forestall indiscipline.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Undated composite analysed reports available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 28th November, 2019.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meeting dated 17th February, 15th April, 22nd July and 23rd December, 2019 available.	**2**	**2**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Draft Service Charter dated February available. • Departmental Charter not available - Ministry has no Department.	**4**	**2.96**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available • No training of CSU officers • Unsatisfactory mid and end of year CSU reports available.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website (www.mopa.gov.gh), social media platforms such as Twitter, Facebook and Instagram. • Reports on website updates available. • Brochures and flyers available		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Committee system introduced to promote teamwork and moderate all programmes. In view of size of Ministry, the Ministry uses the multi-tasking approach to get all staff involved in its activities.	**5**	**4.08**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring and evaluation reports/sector reviews including the effects of sector policies, programmes and activities on stakeholders (with evidence of data gathering and analysis) was not executed. • Evidence of media reportage on all programmes available. Media Monitoring Matrix developed for tracking and follow up actions. About twenty-two (22) media houses report their programmes. Research indicates that the Ministry maintained high level presence.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of eight (8) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Measures put in place to promote gender inclusiveness - capacity building for women and involvement of all genders in activities of the Ministry. • Staff took part in the health screening during the Civil Service Week. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available, letter dated 30th January, 2019 and response dated 7th February, 2019. • No training undertaken since the Senior Records Supervisor was recently posted to the		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. Management of physical environment	Ministry • Physical Office environment satisfactory and maintained by the Estate Department of the Office of the President. • Beautification of the external environment is done by the Department of Parks and Gardens. The National Security Council provides security for the office complex. • Adequate safety measures have been put in place, with fire extinguishers placed at vantage points and regularly serviced by the Ghana National Fire Service (GNFS) as well as entry and exit points clearly labelled.		
Overall Total		**25.197**	

NOTE: Since the Ministry did not have Directors at post as well as any Departments, they could not be scored for issues relating to the Performance Agreements with Heads of Departments and Directors/Analogous Grades. The sub-total score should thus be based on 8.5. To get a score relating to 10, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 10/8.5, that is, 1.18.

Similarly, the Ministry does not have any Department, therefore, the requirement for Departmental Charter is not applicable. The sub-total score used for this KRA is therefore 3.5 and not 4.0. To get a score relating to 4.0, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 4/3.5, that is, 1.14.

5.25.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 81below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 81: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Parliamentary Affairs

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Best Practice in Parliamentary Administration	Engage Parliament	Engaged with Parliament and its Committees deepen insights into the working of Parliament (Core Leadership, Finance Committee, Committee on Environment Science and Technology, Constitutional Legal and Parliamentary Affairs Committee) on 20th June, 18th, 21st and 28th December, 2019. Back to office report available.
2	Public Sector Management and Administration	Attend training	Participated in the Newly Appointed Chief Directors' Orientation Programme at CSTC, Accra from 18th - 22nd May, 2019. Back to office report available.
3	Management, Leadership and Mentoring Competency	Attend conference	Participated in the 2nd African Public Sector Conference and Awards (APSCA) 2019 in Accra from 23rd - 24th October, 2019. Served as a Panelist on their discussion forum. Back to office report available.
4	Results Based Performance Planning and Evaluation Skills	Attend conference	Participated in the Evidence to Action Conference by Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation (MoM&E) at ISSER, University of Ghana, Legon, from 9th-12th October, 2019. Back to office report available.
5	Improving networking	Attend conference	Participated in the 10th Annual Conference of Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and CEOs of the Ghana Public Service, Koforidua, from 17th-20th October, 2019. Back to office report available.
Sub-Total			10

5.25.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **87.197** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.25.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD and his team were appreciative especially with the conducive atmosphere under which the exercise was conducted which made all staff feel at ease and freely contributed to the discussions. He informed the meeting of having learnt a lot through the interaction. The CD's team expressed their satisfaction at how the CD had always taken time to guide them through their work thereby offering them the opportunity to sharpen their skills. The CD urged his team to see the exercise as a collective effort aimed at the overall organisational success and should take note of the gaps identified to help improve future reporting. The CD finally thanked the OHCS for the initiative and confirmed that the exercise had helped officers to constrain their behaviour and work harder towards the achievement of set deliverables.

Team's Remarks

The Evaluators made it clear to the Officers that the exercise was not meant to punish anyone but rather offered an opportunity for all to learn and improve on service delivery standards. Again, the CD's contributions had been insightful and it was believed that the evaluation would help improve the performance management culture in the Service. The importance of the involvement of other staff in the exercise was very important to enable them appreciate their input into the entire work process of the Ministry. The Evaluation Team finally advised the CD to see the Agreement as a 'living document' and put in place a system which would ensure that target timelines were being met.

5.25.6 List of Means of Verification

TPA	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	**Two (2)** Needs Based Technical Workshops For Selected Committees of Parliament Organized	• Memos dated 24th October, 2019 from CD to Hon. Minister and other staff inviting them to service on the Committees. • Undated draft ConceptNotes – Climate Policy Mainstreaming: Parliament's Responsibility. • Letter dated 13th December, 2019 to committee members inviting them to a meeting with the Parliamentary committee on Environment Science and Technology and Constitutional Legal and Parliamentary Affairs, Theme; 'Climate Policy Mainstreaming: Parliament's Responsibility'. • Minutes of meetings dated 16th and 17th December, 2019 on the need-based committee. • Welcome address by the CD at Parliament House, 6th Floor East Wing dated 18th December, 2019. • Copies of Reviewed Speeches and Presentation by Prof.

		Godfred Bobpim. • Reviewed Post- EvaluationReport dated 18th December, 2019, on the Need-based seminar with the committee for Environment Science and Technology of Ghana's Parliament. • MediaPublications.
	Two (2) Meetings With Core Leadership of Parliament Organized.	• Memo dated 18th April and 24th October, 2019 from the CD nominating core leadership to serve on a committee. • Reviewed draft ConceptNotes for 18th April and 21st October, 2019 engagements. • Letter dated 14th June, 2019 and 18th December, 2019 from the CD inviting core leadership of Parliament to an engagement. • Minutes ofMeeting on 7th June, 2019 of Core Leadership Committee's meeting. • Reviewed programmes for the two (2) meetings. • Reviewed report on the first and second engagements with the Core Leadership of Parliament, Theme; 'sustaining Ghana's democracy: A review of the 1st meeting of the 3rd session of the 7th Parliament of the 4th Republic'. • Evaluation form.
2	**Two (2)** Meetings with Independent Constitutional Institutions Organized	• Letter dated 26th February, 2019 inviting the Chairman and Electoral Commissioners to interact with the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. • Reviewed minutes of meeting. • Reviewed report on the engagement with the Electoral Commission of Ghana at the Minister's Office on 20th March, 2019 Programme. • Memo dated 24th October, and 20th November, 2019 inviting members to serve on a committee for the engagement with the National Media Commission and the Media respectively. • Reviewed ConceptNotes. • Reviewed report on the engagement with the National Media Commission at the 6th Floor, Ministry of Communication on 13th December, 2019. • Media monitoring report. • Reviewed address of the Hon. Minister.
3.	**Two (2)** Workshops with Committees of Parliament and other Independent Constitutional Institutions Organized	• Memos dated 6th June, 2019 from CD constituting Committee to serve on the Expanded Leadership engagement. • Minutes of meetings dated 30th October, and 21st November, 2019 on the expanded Leadership committee. • Reviewed ConceptNote. • Letter dated 20th November, 2019 inviting members to a meeting with the Parliamentary committees of Finance and Constitutional Legal and Parliamentary Affairs programme. • Reviewed reports of Meetings. • Copies of Reviewed Speeches for 18th December, 2019 and welcome address for 28th November, 2019. • Reviewed Post- EvaluationReport dated 28th November, 2019.

		• MediaPublications – Ghana-web 2nd December, 2019.
4.	**Two (2)** Meetings with Anti-Corruption Institutions Organized.	• Memo dated 18th April, and 9th May, 2019 constituting Committee to serve on committee (Political Parties). • Reviewed ConceptNotes (engagement with Parliamentarians and Political Parties on the Monetization of Ghanaian Politics and Money, Influence, corruption and Capture: Can Ghana's democracy be safeguarded?' • Letters dated 22nd May, and 25th April, 2019 inviting member to a meeting with National /Executives Political Parties. • Reviewed reports of Meetings. • Copies of Reviewed Speeches delivered by Hon. Minister dated 30th May, and 19th June, 2019 and Presentations welcome addresses by CD. • Report by planning committee for the engagement with Political Parties dated 27th May, and 5th July, 2019. • Reviewed Post- EvaluationReport on the engagement with Parliamentarians and Political Parties on the Monetization of Ghanaian Politics dated 8th July, 2019. • Minutes of meeting of the planning committee for National Stakeholders' Consultation on Monetization of Ghanaian Politics dated 24th and 27th June, 2019. • MediaPublications.
5.	**Two (2)** Workshops for MPs and MMDCEs for **Two (2)** Regions Organized. **One (1)** Research on the relationship between MPs and MMDCEs Conducted	• Reviewed ConceptNote for the 3rd Stakeholders' High Level Policy Dialogue from 17th – 18th March, 2019. • Letter dated 13th February, 2019 from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration inviting members to the High Level Policy Dialogue from 17th – 18th March, 2019. • Copy of programme outline.
6.	Organize two (2) Engagements with Civil Society	• Memo dated 18th April, 2019 from CD nominating members to serve on a committee (Civil Society Organizations). • Reviewed Concept Note – 'Towards the Implementation of the Right to information Law; the contribution of Civil Society organizations'. • Copy of Revised ToR.

		• Letter dated 24th April, 2019 from the Ministry inviting participants to a dialogue with CSOs on the Implementation of the RTI Law. • Copies of Revised Speeches and Presentations. • Reviewed planning committee's report dated 25th and 29th April, 2019. • Reviewed Post- Evaluation Report on the dialogue with CSO's on the Implementation of the RTI Law dated 30th April, 2019 and report on the dialogue with the Media on Vigilantism on 2nd May, 2019. • Reviewed address by Hon. Minister at Alisa Hotel, on 30th April, and 2nd May, 2019. • Welcome address by CD at Alisa Hotel, on 30th April, and 2nd May, 2019. • Media Publications – 6th May, 2019. • Memo dated 18th April, 2019 from CD nominating members to serve on a committee (Media). • Reviewed Minutes of meeting on Media engagement committee meeting on 25th April, 2019. • Reviewed Concept Note – 'curbing political vigilantism in Ghana: The Media's take Programme. • Pictorial evidence.

5.26 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Planning

5.26.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 82 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **48** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 82: Performance of CD, Planning in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Ensuring accountability in the use of state resources by MDAs and MMDAs	a. West Africa Growth Ring Corridor (WAGRIC) Steering Committees facilitated. b. WAGRIC Technical Committee Meetings held.	• Convene and Preside over meetings • Facilitate the release of funds for the • Review Minutes • Follow up on meeting outcomes • Convene and Preside over meetings • Facilitate the release of funds for the • Review Minutes • Follow up on meeting outcomes • Review Proposals • Participate in IMAT meetings • Review minutes of IMAT meetings	**Target achieved** One (1) Steering Committee meeting held. One (1) private sector engagement held. One (1) Ghana-UEMOA Team meeting held. Evidence of follow up actions in the form of diverse letters conveying decisions and actions to be taken. **Target achieved** Two (2) Technical Committee meetings held. Two (2) task team meetings held and reports available. Evidence of follow up actions in the form of diverse letters conveying decisions	12	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		c. Proposal for research on proposed topics for IMAT developed.		and actions to be taken. **Target not achieved** Concept note not developed.		
2.	Monitoring compliance with policies of MDAs	a. Inputs on sector policies and programmes reviewed/provided as requested by MDAs b.Rationalization of CPESDP and budgets of MDAs and MMDAs and Technical report produced	• Review concept notes/policy reports • Prepare advise papers on topical issues to HM • Follow-up on HM's directives project bank with development partners and the Ministry of Finance and forward to the HM • Convene meetings • Facilitate the release of funds • Review report and forward to HM	**Target not achieved** Concept note prepared and forwarded to the Hon. Minister but the necessary approval was not given for the implementation of the recommendations. **Target has been rescheduled to 2020** The Ministry was to assess the extent to which MDAs plans are aligned to the Coordinated Programme of Economic and Social Development Policies. Though action was initiated the activity could not be undertaken since the schedule officer was appointed to the NDPC.	12	4
3.	Strengthening and enhancing the technical capacity of development planning officers in	Procurement process for consultancy services for development of Training manuals commenced.	• Initiate procurement process • Facilitate release of funds for procurement process. • Facilitate the	**Target achieved** Procurement process initiated for the hiring of a Consultant to develop modules for training. Advertisement for EOI	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
	MMDAs		procurement of consultants • Approve procurement process	in the newspapers. Three (3) firms selected to submit financial proposals.		
4.	Providing fora for dialogue on policy and strategic thinking on national development programmes and policies	a. 4 policy dialogues covering strategic topics. b. Inputs on sector policies and programmes reviewed/provided as requested by MDAs	• Facilitate logistical arrangements and release of funds for the policy dialogue series and meetings. • Review concept notes/policy briefs and reports and forward to HM. • Communicate outcome of Policy dialogues to HM for follow-up. • Release funds for the meetings • Review concept notes/policy reports • Prepare advise papers on topical issues to HM • Follow-up on HM's directives project bank with development partners and the Ministry of Finance and forward to the HM	**Target achieved** Concept notes developed and approved. Six (6) topics proposed and four (4) selected. Organised two (2) stakeholder engagements and reports available. **Target achieved** Reports provided on the National Youth Policy Review, National Advisory Committee on Ageing, Decent Work Country Programme III with evidence of CDs Review.	12	12
5.	Mainstreaming international benchmarks into	a. Bi-monthly meetings of HLMC organised	• Draft invitation letters • Review minutes and agenda	**Target achieved** Four (4) HLMC meetings organised and hosted.	12	12

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
	development plans	b. Initiate discussions for establishment of SDG Resource Centre c. Joint Programmes initiated and developed	• Facilitate release of funds • Draft briefs for HM • Follow HM's directives • Facilitate discussions for the setup of the resource centre • Identify partners for the SDG resource centre • Prepare proposals and share with partners • Initiate discussions for the formation of partnerships/collaborations • Develop/review concept notes and forward to HM • Facilitate release of funds and administrative support	Cabinet Information papers prepared and forwarded to the Cabinet Secretary. **Target achieved** Potential Site identified for the establishment of the SDG Resource Centre. Publications and materials on SDG activities for Resource Centre being sourced. Proposals emailed to UNFPA and DFID. **Target achieved** Held Bi-lateral Meeting between Ghana and China on 28th June 2019. Conference on Population and Development Jointly held with the National Population Council. Funds and administrative support provided for activities. Concept papers sighted.		
Sub-Total						**48**

5.26.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **24.86** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 83: Performance of CD, Planning in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed	• SectorAnnual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget, available and forwarded to OHCS dated 28th January, 2019.	**4**	3.4
b. Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement	• Mid -Year Assessment Report forwarded to OHCS on 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Mid-year report incorporating observations of Evaluation Team revised and submitted to OHCS under cover of letter dated 4th September 2019. • Letter requesting revisions to 2019 CDPA submitted to OHCS on 15th October 2019. • Copy of emails sent and forwarding letter available. • Response dated 21st October, 2019.		
d. Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Not available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced	• Available and forwarded on 16th January, 2020 instead of by 15th January 2020.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	3.25
a. Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Minutes of one (1) meeting dated 28th November, 2019 available. • Summary of actions available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Copy of Plan forwarded to PPA. • Two (2) ETC meetings held on 15th March and 17th September, 2019 and minutes available.		
c. Assets Register updated	• Available, however, not signed and authenticated.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Available. Copy of forwarding letter dated 16th April 2019 to CAGD. Delayed Submission.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	9.8
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate.	• Available and dated December, 2019.		
Updated staff list as at 31st December 2019	• Updated Staff list available.		
Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualised Job schedules available.		
Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels Available with variance.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized. d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• Available and submitted to OHCS 13th February, 2019. • Planning and Mid-year phases reports available. • Signing Report forwarded on 22nd May, 2019. • Evaluation report forwarded on 5th February, 2020 instead of January 2020. • Training Plan available and forwarded to OHCS on 5th February, 2019. • Mid-year and end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS by expected dates. • Attendance Report available. • Query letters dated 30th May and 18th December 2019 to Officers who absented themselves from work available. • Composite analysed reports on staff movement available. • 2020 promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 4th December, 2019 instead of November 2019		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	 • List of Board members available. • Two (2) minutes of meetings	**2**	1.25

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	dated 30th October, and 11th December, 2019 available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	3.2
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Draft Service Charter available. • No Department hence no Departmental charter prepared.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• CSU office space available. • CSU Officer yet to receive training. • Mid and end of year report forwarded to OHCS on 15th July, 2019 and 6th January, 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, no social media platforms. • One (1) Report on website updates dated 9th December, 2019 available. • Newsletters, Brochures and flyers available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	3.96
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Introduction of Smart workplace to reduce the use of paper, introduction of workstations for staff.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Reports not available. • No evidence of media tracking sighted.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of eleven (11) meetings available. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars available.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Measures to promote gender inclusiveness – No specific actions taken. • Back to office report from Assistant Planning Officer on Maternal health training through population database planning. • Internal newsletters/ catalogue of information - pictorial evidence of information posted on notice board available.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives.	• Letter dated 13th February, 2019 to PRAAD requesting for assistance.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Records staff trained. • Physical environment found satisfactory. • Met with Castle Estate and other CDs to contribute towards the cleaning of the washrooms.		
Overall Total		**24.86**	

NOTE: Since the Ministry has no Departments, the OVI relating to Departmental Charters did not apply. The total score was thus multiplied by the factor 4/3.5 = 1.14

5.26.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 84 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 84: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Planning.

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	**PLANNED ACTIONS**	**CD's PERFORMANCE**
1	Understanding of the Voluntary National Review Process as part of national reporting on the Sustainable Development Goals	Participate in online course	Participated in online course on "Strengthening stakeholder engagement for the implementation and review of the 2030 Agenda" jointly. organized by UNDESA and UNITAR from 8th – 14th February, 2019. Certificate available.
2	Policy and Institutional Coherence on SDGs	Participate in High Level Political Forum	Participated in High Level Political forum on SDGs in New York from 9th – 18th July 2019. Back to office report available dated 11th Sept., 2019.
3	Contemporary issue in public policy	Participate in annual Chief Executives Conference of the Public Services Commission	Participated in the 10h Conference of Public Service Chief Directors, Chief Executives and Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils in Koforidua from 17th – 19th October 2019. Back to office report available dated 12th December, 2019.
4	Integrated Financing Frameworks	Participate in the "Peer Learning Workshop Series	Participated in the "Peer Learning Workshop Series: Development Finance Assessments and Strengthening Integrated National Financing Framework from 5th – 6th November 2019 in Brussels. Back to office report available dated 19th November, 2019.
5	Understanding demographic diversity in promoting economic growth and sustainable development.	Participate in Nairobi Summit on Accelerating the Promise	Unable to participate in the scheduled meeting due to work exigencies.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.26.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **82.86** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.26.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD indicated that the process had always been a learning experience and was grateful for the recommendations made by the Evaluation Team. She promised to feature in her 2020 Agreement some of the suggestions by the Team. The CD, however, complained about the fact that she had only one (1) substantive Director and this obviously had affected her ability to achieve her Schedule 1 deliverables and hoped that the OHCS would post some Directors to the Ministry.

Team's Remarks

The Evaluation Team advised the CD and her team on the following:

- Take advantage of the mid-year review to revise targets;
- Identify and harness their strengths;
- Build synergy with the team and create value to promote the work of the Ministry; and
- Strong supervision to ensure optimum performance.

5.26.6 List of Means of Verification

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	WAGRIC Steering Committees facilitated.	▪ Letter dated 19th June, 2019 requesting support from JICA to UEMOA Conference in Abidjan. ▪ Report of attendance of UEMOA Meeting dated 20th July 2019. ▪ Letter dated of 22nd August 2019 from UEMOA to the Hon. Minister appreciating the participation of the programme. ▪ Letter dated 13th December 2019 UEMOA to the Hon. Minister on the provision of related studies in the Master Plan CACAO project. ▪ Follow-up letter dated 20th December, 2019 to Ministry of Agric. on request for information on WAGRIC priority project. ▪ Letter dated 9th July, 2019 for the release of funds from the Ministry to the Chief of Staff.
	WAGRIC Technical Committee	▪ Invitation letters dated 3rd May, 2019 for WAGRIC Tech

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	Meetings held.	Committee Meeting. ▪ Minutes of WAGRIC Tech Committee meetings dated 9th April and 13th May, 2019. ▪ Email correspondences dated 13th and 23rd December, 2019 from AKZIVIA requesting for projects. ▪ Follow-up letter dated 20th December, 2019 to the Ministry of Roads and Highways on request for information on WAGRIC priority project. ▪ Memo dated 5th& 6th July, 2019 approving release of funds and approval for UEOMA meeting.
	Proposal for research on proposed topics for IMAT developed.	Memo dated 14th November, 2019 requesting for proposed concept note.
2.	Inputs on sector policies and programmes reviewed/provided as requested by MDAs	▪ Memo dated 14th January, 2019 forwarding concept notes to Hon. Minister for coordinating of implementation of flagship projects and planning perspectives for new regions. ▪ Letters dated 1st February, 2019 forwarding concept notes to the Ministry of Reorganization and Regional Development. ▪ Letter dated 20th September, 2019 from the Ministry LMI Holdings responding to request inter-ministerial coordination of DAWA City Development planning. ▪ Follow-up email correspondences dated 20th September, 3rd October, 9th December, 16th and 18th December, 2019 on the request. ▪ Letter dated 10th October, 2019 to MDAs requesting for nominations. ▪ Letter dated 24th October 2019 constituting an Inter-ministerial Technical Committee. ▪ Memo dated 11th November, 2019 from the ARO to the CD forwarding Minutes of Technical Committee Meeting of 31st October 2019.
	Rationalization of CPESDP and budgets of MDAs and MMDAs and Technical report produced	Letter dated 5th December, 2019 to NDPC requesting to collaborate.
3.	Procurement process for consultancy services for development of	▪ Proposals from eleven (11) firms submitted on 20th February, 2019.

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	Training manuals commenced.	▪ Technical evaluation of bids reports. ▪ Memo dated 11th March, 2019 from the Supply Officer to CD requesting for approval of Evaluation Panel and minutes by CD approving the Panel. ▪ Invitation letters to Evaluation Panel members dated 14th March, 2019. ▪ Memo dated 26th July, 2019 approving Evaluation report from the Evaluation Team dated 28th March, 2019. ▪ Memo dated 20th June, 2019 forwarding comments on the Technical Evaluation report back to Officer in Charge. ▪ Recommended consultants invited to submit financial proposals by letter dated 26th August, 2019. ▪ Letter dated 16th October and 20th November, 2019 requesting for negotiating meeting. ▪ Letter dated 20th November, 2019 to DAME-DAME Development Alternative Ltd following up on their response after the negotiation meeting. ▪ Letter dated 23rd December, 2019 acknowledging revised fees. Resource mobilized to support development of manuals ▪ Back-to-Office Report dated 18th December, 2019 on discussions with UNEP from the ARO to CD, with CDs minutes. ▪ Email dated 27th December, 2019 forwarding draft concept note and letter dated 23rd December, 2019 requesting for support from UNEP.
4.	4 policy dialogues covering strategic topics.	▪ Memo dated 8th July, 2019 from the SPO to CD proposing six (6) strategic topic with CD selecting Four (4). ▪ Memo dated 8th July approving release of funds. ▪ Minutes of Management meeting of 8th March and 2nd May approving topics for policy dialogues ▪ Invitation Letters to MDAs to participate in the 11th Policy Dialogue series dated 29th August and 19th December, 2019. ▪ Reports of 2 Policy dialogues
	Inputs on sector policies and programmes reviewed/provided as requested by MDAs	▪ Memo dated 22nd January, 2019 from the APO to Dir. Social Planning submitting report of inputs made to National Advisory Committee on Ageing. ▪ Memo dated 28th June, 2019 from APO to CD

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		forwarding report of participation in Thematic Working on National Youth Policy Review, with CDs review. ▪ Report of Validation of National youth Policy dated 29th November, 2019 from the APO to CD with CDs minutes. ▪ Memo dated 16th December, 2019 from APO to CD forwarding report on Stakeholder Validation of Decent Work Country Programme III. ▪ Memo dated 28th June, 2019 from the APO to CD forwarding reports and comments on Evaluation Work for SDG 4. ▪ Memo and comments dated 10th June, 2019 on Working Visit to Kenya. ▪ Memo dated 20th February, 2019 forwarding report on Improving Environmental Health at District Level. ▪ Memo dated 28th May, 2019 from staff to CD forwarding report on Ghana Entrepreneurs Round Table on SDGs. ▪ Memo dated 15th April, 2019 from APO requesting for permission to participate in a validation workshop. CD minutes approving the release of funds. ▪ Memo dated 1st July, 2019 from the APO to CD forwarding report and comments on Maternal Health through Population based data planning. ▪ Letter dated 27th May, 2019 from the Ministry to MDAs forwarding minute of High Level Inter ministerial Roundtable on Nutrition and Healthy Lives. ▪ Letter dated 18th September, 2019 from the Ministry forwarding speaking notes for President for 74th Session of UNGA. ▪ Letters dated 31st January, 2019 from the Ministry to various MDAs on cooperation with Kingdom of Belgium. Cabinet Information Papers ▪ Memo dated 16th May, 2019 from a staff to CD forwarding Cabinet Information Paper on Inter ministerial Round Table on Nutrition and Healthy Diets. ▪ Memo dated 3rd September, 2019 from CD forwarding Briefing paper to Hon. Minister on CSE. ▪ Memo dated 10th October, 2019 from CD forwarding Cabinet Information Paper to Hon. Minister on CSE. ▪ Letters dated 12th September, 2019 from the Ministry

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		forwarding inputs for President's speeches on UHC, FfD and SDGs for 75th UNGA to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration.
5.	Bi-monthly meetings of HLMC organised.	▪ Invitation letters dated 6th May, 2019 and Agenda for HLMC meetings dated 6th February, 9th May, 5th April and 7th June, 2019. ▪ Minutes of HLMC meetings dated 6th February, 9th May, 5th April and 7th June, 2019 available. ▪ Attendance Sheets dated 6th February, 9th May, 5th April and 7th June available. ▪ Letter dated 11th February, 2019 from the Ministry to organizations, requesting for case studies for the Voluntary National Review (VNR). ▪ Letter dated 31st July, 2019 from the Ministry forwarding Cabinet Information Paper to the Cabinet Secretary. ▪ Information paper on proceedings at HPLF ▪ Letter dated 2nd October, 2019 from the Ministry forwarding Presenters notes and Power point presentation on SDGs to Dep. Minster of MOFA&RI. ▪ Memo dated 24th January and 21st February, 2019 from the Director, Social Planning to the CD requesting for approval for commencement of the VNR preparations. CD's minutes sighted. ▪ Memo dated 2nd February, 2019 forwarding Minutes of Preparatory Committees Minutes to Director Social Planning. ▪ Memos dated 10th January, 1st March and 13th March, 2019 from Director, Social Planning to CD for the release of funds for consultations on the VNR. ▪ Memo dated 6th May, 2019 from APO to CD forwarding remarks to Hon. Minister. ▪ Memos dated 22nd January, 6th, 8th, 10th , 20th and 29th May and 2nd July, 2019 approving release of funds for various activities/meetings of the HLMC.
	Initiate discussions for the	• Memo dated 31st January, 2019 from CD to Hon.

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	establishment of SDG Resource Centre	Minister forwarding concept note for SDG Resource Centre and identification of a site. • Letter dated 11th February, 2019 from the Ministry to organizations requesting for Publications for the SDG resource Centre. • Letters received from MDAs and DPs forwarding publications for the resource centre. • Letter dated 9th September, 2019 from the Ministry to George Padmore Library for siting of SDG Resource Centre. • Letter dated 31st October, 2019 from the Ministry in response to George Padmore Library for alternative location. • Email dated 12th July, 2019 forwarding Proposal developed for the establishment of Resource Centre and SDG Coordination. • Emails dated 15th September, 2019 and 14th October, 2019 forwarding proposals to UNFPA and DFID respectively.
	Joint programme/ initiatives initiated and developed	▪ Letter dated 28th March, 2019 from the Ministry informing NPC of approval of Ghana to host the 3rd CACPD. ▪ Memos dated 30th May, 19th, 20th and 25th June, 3rd and 5th July for the release of funds for the 3rd CACPD. ▪ Report dated 3rd CACPD from 23rd – 26th June, 2019. ▪ Memo dated 28th June, 2019 from the APO to CD forwarding bilateral meeting between Ghana and China. Creation of Pipeline of Bankable Projects ▪ Letter dated 26th September, 2019 from the Ministry requesting for support to create a pipeline of Bankable Projects. ▪ Emails correspondences dated 19th November, 2019 etc. soliciting partnership on Bankable Project. ▪ Letter dated 4th November, 2019 from the Ministry inviting MDAs for a workshop of pipeline on bankable projects. ▪ Report dated workshop dated 26th November, 2019 from APO to the CD. ▪ Email dated 9th December, 2019 from NDPC to the CD

TPA	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		forwarding Roadmap developed. Technical Expertise to support MoP ▪ Email correspondences of 5th – 10th December, 2019 from CD to EPL requesting for placement of Technical Experts. ▪ Letter dated 5th December, 2019 from the Ministry to EPL requesting for technical support. Collaborations ▪ Letter dated endorsement dated 6th May, 2019 from the Ministry to the UN System in support of Integrated Social Protection Programme. ▪ Memo dated 21st May, 2019 from CD forwarding meeting summaries to Hon. Minister.

5.27 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Railways Development

5.27.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Acting Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 85 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **40** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 85: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Railways Development in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Reconstructing/Rehabilitating Railway Lines to facilitate passenger & freight movement	1. Narrow gauge railway lines Rehabilitated: • Kojokrom to Tarkwa (56km) • Achimota to Nsawam (40km)	• Facilitate Monitoring and Evaluation Committees meetings and review minutes • Ensure periodic monitoring visits to inspect progress of works and review reports	**Target not achieved.** The Ministry rehabilitated the narrow gauge for Kojokrom to Tarkwa and Achimota to Nsawam. The former was 75% completed and the latter 98% completed. Monitoring reports for the 3rd and 4th Quarters were not available.	12	9
		2. Rehabilitation of the narrow gauge railway line from Nsawam to Koforidua (40km) commenced	• Facilitate the release of funds for project implementation	The Accra to Nsawam track was undergoing a test run with pictorial evidence available. Reports of the 2nd quarter Monitoring with evidence of review were available for the Kojokrom –		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				Tarkwa and Achimota – Nsawam Lines. However, the memo submitting the reports was not signed. The Ministry provided an undated bill of quantities as well as cost estimates for the rehabilitation of the Nsawam to Koforidua line. However, in view of the fact that there was no clarity as to what was meant by "commenced", a one page status report was requested and this provided some appreciation of the work done.		
2.	Construction of New Railway Lines	1. Construction of the standard gauge line completed: • Kojokrom to Eshiem (5km) • Tema to Mpakadan (97km)	• Constitute a Negotiation Committee to negotiate contract • Submit contract to Ag. for review	**Target was not achieved.** The construction of the standard gauge lines for Kojokrom to Eshiem was 68.43% completed and Tema to Mpakadan 55% completed.	12	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Obtain Cabinet approval on the contract • Arrange for the signing of the contract • Arrange for the commencement of the project • Facilitate periodic monitoring visits to inspect progress of works • Facilitate the release of funds for project implementation	Evidence of Negotiation Committee available. Signed contract documents were available. Three (3) Progress Reports of project with pictures were verified. Cabinet Information paper on project available but no Cabinet approval obtained. Evidence for release of funds sighted.		
		2. Commenced construction of the standard gauge line from: • Eshiem to Manso and beyond (17km) • Manso to Dunkwa (134km) • Kumasi		**Target achieved** Work had started on the construction of the Eshiem to Manso and beyond, Manso to Dunkwa and Kumasi towards Buipe lines with the latter being 5% completed. Progress and monitoring reports were available.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		towards Buipe.				
3.	Implementing ECOWAS Protocol on free movement of people and goods	1. Feasibility studies for the development of Trans-ECOWAS Line from Aflao to Elubo completed 2. Feasibility Studies completed and private sector investor procured to develop the Ghana/Burkina Faso Railway project	• Facilitate stakeholder engagements /validation workshops and review deliverables (progress reports) • Facilitate the release of funds for project implementation • Facilitate regular meetings with Consultants to ensure successful completion of studies	**Target was not achieved.** The Stakeholder consultation was held to review the consultant's Inception & Data Analysis Trans-ECOWAS reports. Minutes of a workshop was available dated 28th February, 2019. Evidence of review of progress reports by CD was not sighted. **Target not achieved.** Reports on the inception & preliminary alignment of the Ghana/Burkina Faso Railway project had been submitted. Stakeholder consultations at advance stage but yet to be held.	12	4.2

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		3. Feasibility studies for the development of a rail line from Kotoku to Huni Valley completed. 4. Feasibility Studies for the development of Central Spine (Kumasi-Paga) completed		**Target not achieved.** Expression of Interest (EOI) & Request for Quotations (RFQ) for the development of the rail line from Kotoku to Huni Valley undertaken. Consultant yet to be appointed to undertake the feasibility studies. The Ministry seemed to have excluded target four (4) from the agreement without the approval of the OHCS and accordingly given a score of zero (0).		
4.	Developing an integrated light rail transit system In major urban areas to support public transportation	Feasibility studies for the development of Metro / Light Rail Transit systems in Accra and Kumasi completed.	• Facilitate stakeholder engagements /validation workshops and review deliverables (progress reports) • Facilitate the release of funds for project implementation	**Target not achieved.** The Inception report for the development of Metro / Light Rail Transit systems in Accra and Kumasi submitted. Stakeholder meeting held and minutes available. Evidence of minutes of	12	6.3

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate regular meetings with Transaction Advisor to ensure successful completion of studies • Facilitate procuremen t process for the engagement of the private sector developer	meetings with Transaction Advisor sighted. There was also no indication of the procurement process for the engagement of the private sector developer.		
5.	Strengthening institutional framework	1. Continue the modernization of the Railway Training Institute and Location Workshops	• Facilitate periodic monitoring and evaluation of works and review reports • Facilitate stakeholder engagement s/validation workshops for Master Plan and Design works • Facilitate	**Target achieved.** The Railway Training school was renovated and location workshops were completed with pictures to verify. MoU for utilization have been signed by UMaT. Also, Monitoring Reports and Commencement Certificates were available. Evidence of review of monitoring reports by CD was	12	10.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		2. Railway Master Plan revised 3. Conceptual designs for the Accra & Achimota Railway Stations completed	the release of funds for implementation of the assignments • Facilitate regular meetings with Consultants and contractor to ensure successful completion of assignments	not sighted. **Target achieved.** Draft revised Master Plan available. There was evidence of engagements/validation workshops but no reports were available. **Target achieved.** Conceptual designs for both Accra & Achimota Railway Stations completed**.**		
Sub-Total					**40**	

5.27.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **25.15** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 86: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Railways Development in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.3**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• SectorAnnual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Directors Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS on 10th April, 2019 instead of end of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-Year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement and soft copy forwarded to the OHCS on 17th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Not available.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Mid-year review session held on 30th August, 2019 and Report available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• APR submitted on 31st January, 2019 instead of 15th January, 2019.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**4.5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings	• The team sighted minutes of four (4) quarterly audit		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
& actions taken to redress audit queries.	committee meetings dated 27th March, 6th June, 19th September and 18th December, 2019. • Summary of action report available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement Plan available. • Minutes of one Entity Tender Committee meeting dated 1st March, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Updated assets register available as at 31st December, 2019. Document is not signed on each sheet by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final Accounts submitted	• 2018 Financial Statement and covering letter forwarding dated 27th February, 2019 available.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.8**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	Dated organisational manual available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualised job schedules available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available letter dated 18th July, 2019 forwarded to OHCS.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades e. Training programmes f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• Report submitted on 16th January, 2019. • Memo dated 15th July, 2019 submitting the Planning and Mid-year report to CD. • Report submitted on 30th May, 2019 to OHCS. • Evaluation report submitted to OHCS on 10th February, 2020 instead of end of January 2020. • 2019 Training Plan submitted to OHCS 7th March, 2019. • Mid-year 18th July and End-of-year Reports completed and submitted 20th January, 2020. • Monthly report on staff attendance available. • Report submitted on 31st December, 2019. Queries as well as verbal warnings issued to staff with respect to lateness to work. No other disciplinary issues identified. . • Report submitted on 31st December, 2019. Report found satisfactory. • Promotion Register submitted to OHCS dated 18th December, 2019 instead of November 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	 • List of members available. • No meeting held.	**2**	**0.5**

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives		**4**	**3.35**
a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter Draft available. However, it is yet to be finalized. • No Department Charter Available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated CSU office available. • CSU Officers trained at the CSTC. • Mid and end year report available submitted to OHCS on 17th September, 2019 and 23rd December, 2019 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website available Official Facebook, Instagram, WhatsApp platforms set up. Participated in the 'Meet the Press' series. • An annual report showing updates of the website. Quarterly reports not available. • Newsletter 'Railway News' available and in circulation.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**3.7**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• New Records Office set up and Official staff email available.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring reports on progress of work and stakeholder engagements during the construction of the railway lines available. Through such engagements the Ministry is able to assess the effects of its policies and programmes at the sub-national level. • Media Tracking- Newspaper		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
c. Management/Staff engagements	cuttings available with no evidence of analysis. • Minutes of six (6) management meetings available. • Minutes of staff durbar available. • No report available for the promotion of gender inclusiveness. • Report on Health Talk held on 20th September, 2019 available. • Internal Newsletters available.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• No evidence of engagement with PRAAD. • Training of records officers not done and no specific action taken to improve records management.		
e. Management of physical environment	• The institution was found to have a clean environment, signage at entrance, good washrooms, furnished with a security desk and had fire extinguisher. However, there was no disability-friendly access.		
Sub-Total		**25.15**	

5.27.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 87 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 87: Schedule 3: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Railways Development

	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	**PLANNED ACTIONS**	**CD's PERFORMANCE**
1	Public Private Partnership	Study Tour	Participated in a Study tour to Rome, Italy to hold business meetings with officials of team engineering S.P.A from 5th – 10th August, 2019.
2	Negotiation Skills	Negotiation table	Participated in a pre-feasibility study in Manga, Burkina Faso, from 8th -9th October, 2019. Back to office report of Joint Committee of Experts meeting – transaction Advisor for the Ghana/Burkina Faso Railway Interconnectivity Project.
3	Transport and Logistics skills	Conference participation	Attended Transport and Logistics conference organized by Chartered Institute of Logistics & Transport at the Ghana Shipper's Authority on 27th April, 2019.
4	Emerging Rail Technologies Management Strategies	Conference participation	Attended International Rail Conference in India from 22nd – 23rd October, 2019.
5	Rail Financing & Investment Promotion	Participation in Forum	Participated in African Investment Forum in Johannesburg, South Africa from 11th – 13th November, 2019.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.27.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **75.150** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.27.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD was appreciative of the process and stated that the exercise kept all officers in check and was a good management tool. The Ag. CD promised to give off his best despite the staffing and office accommodation challenges. He emphasized on the following:

- Implementation of the Ministry's action plan should be a priority;
- Assets register to be properly compiled, duly authenticated and signed;
- Promote team work;
- Effective use of internal auditors within the institution; and
- Delivering assignments on time.

Team's Remarks

The evaluators explained that the exercise was useful and the aim was not to punish officers but to help put in place corrective measures for better work output and ultimate improvement in the performance of officers and the Ministry. The potentials of officers were also identified during the evaluation process through the identification of strengths and weaknesses. It again provided an opportunity for officers to keep to the core values of the institution.

The Agreement should be a "living" document and a daily reference manual for the Ag. CD. A schedule officer should be put in charge of the document for the effective management of the process. They also advised the Ag. CD to review all documents relating to the Agreement before being sent out.

5.27.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGETS	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MOVs)
1.	Narrow gauge railway lines Rehabilitated: • Kojokrom to Tarkwa (56km) • Achimota to Nsawam (40km) Rehabilitation of the narrow gauge railway line from Nsawam	• Memo establishing M&E Committee dated 19th February, 2019 – not signed and 2nd May, 2019. • Memo dated 15th July, 2019 submitting monitoring report. • Evidence of reviewed M&E reports. • Bill of quantities. • Letter forwarding interim certificate for payment to MoF 17th May, 2019, on Accra-Nsawam Railway Line. • Letter dated 17/6/19 for request of warrant to MoF. • Warrant received from MoF for payment for work done on

	to Koforidua (40km) commenced	the Achimota–Nsawam Line 10th March, 2019, 25th March, 2019, 2nd April, 2019, 9th June, 2019, 10th May, 2019, 8th August, 2019.
2.	Construction of the standard gauge line completed: • Kojokrom to Eshiem (5km) • Tema to Mpakadan (97km) Commenced construction of the standard gauge line from: • Eshiem to Manso and beyond (17km) • Manso to Dunkwa (134km) • Kumasi towards Buipe.	• Memo dated 23rd January, 2019 from Ag. CD to Director F&A submitting negotiating committee members for approval. • List of committee members, minutes of negotiation meetings dated 20th January, 2019. • Minutes of pre-contract negotiation meetings: Manso-Dunkwa 28th and 30th January, 2019 and 4th February, 2019, Kumasi and Buipe (Becheem) 30th January, 2019 and 1st – 4th August, 2019. • Letter dated 17th May, 2019 submitting contract to AG's office for a legal advice. • Letter date 17th June, 2019 from AG's office in response to the legal advice. • Letter dated 8th May, 2019 forwarding Cabinet information paper on the contract. • Signed contract document dated 27th April, 2019 between Ghana and China No.5 Engineering Group Company Limited. • Documentation for arrangement for commencement of project dated 8th May, 2019. • Letters dated 8th May, 2019 showing the facilitation of release of funds. • Forwarding letters to MoF 9th and 11th April, 2019, 17th and 29th May, 2019 and 10th June, 2019. • Release of funds letter from MoF dated 2nd April, 2019, 25th June, 2019 and 2nd July, 2019. • Stakeholder Consultation report. • Contract document dated 27th April, 2019. • Progress reports dated 30th April, 2019, 31st May, 2019 and June, 2019 available.
3.	Feasibility studies for the development of Trans-ECOWAS Line from Aflao to Elubo completed Feasibility Studies completed and private sector investor	• Letter dated 4th February, 2019 forwarding inception reports from Messrs Technofin on Trans- Ecowas Railway line from Aflao to Elubo. • Letter dated 13th February, 2019 inviting Stakeholders for inception meeting. • Minutes meeting held on 28th February, 2019 to review the inception report.

	procured to develop the Ghana/Burkina Faso Railway project Feasibility studies for the development of a rail line from Kotoku to Huni Valley completed. Feasibility Studies for the development of Central Spine (Kumasi-Paga) completed	• Letter dated 13th February, 2019 inviting Stakeholders for review of inception report. • Letter dated 10th May, 2019 from Messrs Technofin submitting data analysis report to the Ministry. • Memo dated 1st August, 2019 submitting analysis report to the Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 28th February, 2019 to MoF requesting for specific warrant for Trans-Ecowas line. • Forwarding letters to MoF dated 27th March, 2019, 15th May, 2019 and 17th June, 2019. • Release for payment 3rd March, 2019. Letter received from MoF on 21st May, 2019 for release of warrant. • Letter dated 20th May, 2019 from Team Engineering and Vision Consult submitting inception on Ghana-Burkina project report to the Ministry. • Memo dated 25th March, 2019 submitting inception report to the Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 28th March, 2019 inviting Stakeholders for inception meeting. • Minutes of Stakeholders meeting dated 5th April, 2019 for the review of inception report. • Letter dated 27th March, 2019 to MoF. • Letter dated 18th April, 2019 from ABP Consult submitting inception report of feasibility studies on Central Line project to the Ministry. • Memo dated 14th May, 2019 submitting inception report to the Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 18th July, 2019 inviting Stakeholders for inception meeting. • Letter dated 15th May, 2019 to MoF.
4.	Feasibility studies for the development of Metro / Light Rail Transit systems in Accra and Kumasi completed.	• Letter dated 2nd April, 2019 from Systra submitting inception report on Accra Light Rail project to the Ministry. • Memo dated 3rd May, 2019 submitting inception report to the Hon. Minister. • Letter dated 15th April, 2019 inviting Stakeholders for inception meeting. • Minutes of the inception meeting. • Warrant received from MoF dated 11th March, 2019. • Letter dated 11th February, 2019 from PWC submitting inception report on Kumasi Light Rail project to the Ministry.

		• Memo dated 22nd February, 2019 submitting inception report to the Hon. Minister. • Letter of invitation to Stakeholders for site visit to Kumasi dated 8th March, 2019 available. • Memo dated 18th April, 2019 submitting report on site visit. • Letter dated 15th February, 2019 inviting Stakeholders for a review of the inception report. • Minutes of meeting dated 5th March, 2019 for the inception report. • Letter dated 14th March, 2019 to MoF. • Warrant from MoF dated 25th April, 2019.
5.	Continue the modernization of the Railway Training Institute and Location Workshops Railway Master Plan revised Conceptual designs for the Accra & Achimota Railway Stations completed	• Letter dated 13th March, 2019 from Adjaye Associate submitting Conceptual Design of Achimota Railway station to the Ministry. • Minutes of Stakeholder meeting to discuss the Conceptual Design dated 25th April, 2019. • Memo dated 13th June, 2019 requesting for funds for monitoring activities. • Letter to MoF requesting for payments for work done 9th and 10th January, 2019 and 28th March, 2019. • Warrant from MoF dated 1st, 3rd and 10th March, 2019 and 12th May, 2019.

5.28 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Regional Reorganisation and Development

5.28.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected four (4) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1 instead of a minimum of five (5), each TPA was assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 88 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **48** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 88: Performance of CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	Findings	Scoring	
				Total	Awarded
1.	A functioning Regional Coordinating Councils for newly created regions	Procure 48No. cross country vehicles and fifteen (15) motorbikes for the new regions	**Target achieved.** Forty-nine (49) vehicles and Thirty (30)motorcycles procured.	12	12
2.	A functioning decentralised department and agencies of the new regions	Facilitated the acquisition of land for the Regional Coordinating Councils (RCCs) in the six (6) regions half year 2019	**Target achieved.** Land available for construction of RCC buildings and bungalows in the regional capitals and office blocks and bungalows for decentralised departments in four (4) district capitals in each of the new regions. The size of the land in each of the regional capitals is between 200 and 250 acres and 20 acres each for each of the district capitals.	12	12
		Liaise with LUPSA to draw land use plan for land acquired for the six (6) regions by the end of the third quarter 2019	**Target achieved.** Land use plans developed for the six (6) regional capitals to guide development in the RCC office enclaves.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	Findings	Scoring	
				Total	Awarded
		Commence the design and construction of 6No. regional Administration by 31st Dec., 2019 Lead the process in the acquisition of furniture and office equipment for the 6No. new RCCs and decentralized departments	**Target achieved.** Contracts awarded and construction of RCC blocks in each of the new regions in progress. **Target achieved.** Furniture and equipment procured to the tune of GH₵11,620,500.00.		
3.	Improved access to government by people in newly created regions	Initiate the construction of 10No. bungalows in each of the six (6) regions	**Target achieved.** Contracts awarded and construction of RCC blocks in each of the new regions in progress.	12	12
4.	Establishment levels of new regions for effective human resource development for new regions	Facilitate the posting of 600No. staff to the new RCCs Facilitate the development of the Ministry's Administrative Manual	**Target achieved.** All key staff posted. Each RCC has over 100 staff. All the RCC are fully setup. **Target achieved.** Organizational Manual prepared and approved by OHCS.	12	12
Sub-Total				**48**	

NOTE: The Chief Director did not provide information on his roles but made available the necessary documentation during the evaluation.

5.28.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **12.973** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 89: Performance of CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**2.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Available but not submitted to OHCS.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Available and submitted to OHCS 9th September, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• No follow up action.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• Submitted to OHCS on 30th January, 2019.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**-**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• No AC. Managed under the OoP.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Managed under the OoP.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer	• Managed by OoP.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Managed under the OoP.		
KRA 3 - Human Resources Management		**10**	**3.54**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organizational Manual available and approved by OHCS.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualised job schedules for staff.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment schedule available from the OHCS dated 2nd October, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Staff Appraisal not available.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• 2019 Staff Appraisal reports not available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• No Director available.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan not available. • Mid and end year reports not available.		
f. Management of discipline	• Not available. • Issued queries to two (2) – 1 absenting himself and another faking the signature of the CD – no documentation.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Report on staff movement not available. • 2020 Promotion register		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	available but not forwarded to OHCS.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	 • Managed under the OoP • Managed under the OoP	**2**	**-**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation **b.** Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	 • Draft Client Service Charter available. • Has no Departments. • No designated office space. • No CSU Contact Officers. • No reports available. • No website available. • No quarterly updates of website. • Brochure of the Ministry available.	**4**	**1.14**
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements	 • Tasked system development manager to change the operations of the office. • Contact with the RCCs to monitor activities at that level. • Press cuttings available. • No management meetings. But every morning there is a meeting with the Minister (CD, Minister and Tech. Officer). No minutes are kept. • Nothing done to promote gender. • Payment of medical bills for staff. • Information posted on notice board.	**5**	**2.399**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Contacted PRAAD to carry out some work. Evidence not available. • No training for staff.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Satisfactory.		
Overall Total		**12.973**	

NOTES

KRA 2: The Ministry has responsibility only for the management of assets. Other issues are handled by the OoP. They could not be scored for the other OVIs. The sub-total score should thus be based on 1.5. To get a score relating to 5, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 5/1.5, that is, 3.33.

KRA3: Since the Ministry did not have any Directors at post as well as any Departments, they could not be scored for issues relating to the Performance Agreements with Heads of Departments and Directors/Analogous Grades. The sub-total score should thus be based on 8.5. To get a score relating to 10, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 10/8.5, that is, 1.18.

KRA 4: The Ministry did not have a Ministerial Advisory Board; therefore they could not be scored for KRA4.

KRA5: Since the Ministry did not have any, they could not be scored for issues relating to Client Charters for Department. The sub-total score should thus be based on 3.5. To get a score relating to 5, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 4/3.5, that is, 1.14.

The overall total score should thus be based on 23. To get a score relating to the overall score of 30, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 30/23, that is, 1.30.

5.28.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook three (3) capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 90 below. The CD obtained a score of **6**out of the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 90: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Regional Reorganisation and Development

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Best practices in regional governance and development	Short course	-
2	Effective implementation and coordination in the Public	Short course	Participated in the Public Services Commission conference on Value

	Service		Creation and Efficient Service Delivery in Public Service Organisations in the Era of Ghana Beyond Aid from 17th to 20th October, 2019 at Capital View Hotel - Koforidua
3	Project Management/Public Procurement	Training programme	Attended training programme on Public Procurement from 29th August to 1st September, 2019 at A.H. Hotel, Accra.
4	Project Evaluation	Training programme	-
5	Change Management and Productivity/ Leadership	Training programme	Attended a training programme on Leadership on 11th December, 2019 at the Alisa Swiss Spirit as part of the CDs quarterly meeting.
Sub-Total			**6**

5.28.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **66.973** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.28.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

A lot of the Ministry's activities have to do with what is happening at the RCCs. However, now that the Ministry is functional, they have to monitor their operations to see whether or not the expectations for their establishment were being achieved. If this is well done, the Ministry could then advise the Government on the lessons learnt. Working in the Ministry had been a good opportunity for which his previous experience as a CD had been very useful. He currently had to define and redefine the objectives of the Ministry. He also had to ensure that he had the full complement of staff to work with.

Definitely, the evaluation exercise was helpful in the sense that it provided an insight into how he was operating, the shortcomings associated with what was being done and the lessons learnt would be helpful on the way forward.

Team's Remarks

The Team appreciated the frankness with which the interaction had been undertaken and advised the CD to take a critical look at the objectives of the Ministry in order to craft out TPAs which would address the work of the Ministry especially now that the RCCs had become operational.

Meeting with the Hon. Minister

The Head of the Team briefed the Minister on the aim of the evaluation exercise. The Minister mentioned that the Ministry was new and its mandate different from those of other Ministries. The CD had brought a lot of dynamism into the work of the Ministry despite the fact that the Ministry was grossly understaffed. The experience of the CD had really come to bear on the work of the Ministry and this had contributed immensely towards the Ministry's achievement.

5.28.6 List of Means of Verification

TPA	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Procure 48No. cross country vehicles and fifteen (15) motorbikes for the new regions	• Procurement plan indicating the vehicles to be procured dated 2019 sent to PPA. • Letter dated 14th October, 2019 from the Hon. Minister to a number of contractors informing them about the 'erection and completion of I No. 3-storey Regional Coordinating Council Administration Block in each of the six (6) newly created regions'. • Letter 3rd June, 2019 from the CD to the Managing Director Toyota Company Limited on Award for the supply vehicles. • Letter 24th August, 2019 from the CD to the Managing Director Toyota Company Limited on Award for the supply of six (6) Nissan Pickup vehicles. • Letter 30th Aug., 2019 from the Hon. Minister to the Managing Director Toyota Company Limited on Award for the supply of two (2) Toyota Hilux Pickup vehicles.
2.	Facilitated the acquisition of land for the Regional Coordinating Councils (RCCs) in the six (6) regions half year 2019	• Land Used Plan for each of the six (6) regional capitals
	Liaise with LUPSA to draw land use plan for land acquired for the six (6) regions by the end of the third quarter 2019	• Local use plans for RCC Office in six (6) regional capitals (Goaso, Dambai, Techiman, Nalerigu, Setwi Wiawso and Damongo available
	Commence the design and construction of 6No. regional Administration by 31st Dec., 2019	
	Lead the process in the	Copy of procurement documents available

	acquisition of furniture and office equipment for the 6No. new RCCs and decentralized Departments.	
3.	Initiate the construction of 10No. bungalows in each of the six (6) regions	Copy of procurement documents available
4.	Facilitate the posting of 600No. staff to the new RCCs	
	Facilitate the development of the Ministry's Administrative Manual	Letter dated 9th September, 2019 to OHCS inviting staff of OHCS for validation of the draft Organization Manual and Client Service Charter.

5.29 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Roads and Highways

5.29.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected ten (10) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of six (6). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 91 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **59.5** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 91: Performance of Ag. CD, Roads and Highways in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Rehabilitation & Maintenance of Roads	Planned Road Maintenance program implemented; Periodic maintenance of road network -GHA-105km -DFR-950km -DUR-460km	• Facilitate the approval and release of funds from the Road fund to the road agencies • Review Agency implementation reports	**Target achieved.** Quarterly reports for GHA, DUR and DFR submitted -GHA- 125.7km -DFR-500km -DUR-327 km Evidence of various communication on reviews of the quarterly reports sighted.	6	6
2.	Improving mobility on urban and national road network to support key economic sectors	Construction works for (2) two interchanges/bridges on the urban network commenced Procurement processes completed for construction of Volivo, Buipe, Yapei and Daboya Bridges on the trunk roads	• Facilitate the commencement of bridge projects • Facilitate the procurement of consultants and contractors • Facilitate the signing of commercial agreement and commencement of Czech bridges project • Facilitate the	**Target achieved.** Progress on the interchanges as at 31st December 2019: - Tamale – 15% - Obetsebi Lamptey – 5% - Pokuase – 52% - Tema – 79% **Target achieved.** Procurement process completed for the selection of consultants for Volivo. Evaluation reports for contractors for Buipe, Daboya	6	5.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			implementation of Sinohydro Projects • Facilitate the preparation and submission of Cabinet Memo	and Yapei bridges being undertaken. Final decision taken by PPA and the Ministry working out the financial arrangements for the contractors (3 foreign) to start work. **Target achieved.** • Commercial and Financing Agreement signed • Addendum Financial Agreements signed • Addendum Commercial Contract signed • Conditions Precedent (CPs) met and detailed Engineering design for foundations ongoing. • Provisional EPA permit obtained, EGAP Insurance paid by MOF, PPA approval obtained. • Manufacturing of the steel components ongoing in Czech • Procurement of		
		Commercial and financial agreement signed and works commenced for the construction of 50No Czech bridges across the network				

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Sinohydro agreement signed and phase 1 projects commenced whiles phase 2 projects packaged Cabinet and Parliamentary agreement for phase 2 prepared and submitted		contractors to be done in Jan-Feb. **Target achieved.** • Camp Site and accommodation completed • Technical Committee meeting held • MRH Preparatory Progress Report available • First Steering Committee held. **Target not achieved.** Mandate letter issued and final concept design for phase 2 to be agreed on with the Independent Technical Committee (ITC) Cabinet memo prepared submitted. Cabinet approval not obtained as at 31st December 2019 for document to be submitted to Parliament		
3.	Innovative financing of Road Infrastructure projects through PPP	Development of at least one (1) PPP Project Facilitated	• Facilitate PDT meetings • Facilitate Feasibility Studies • Facilitate the procurement of Concessionaire • Facilitate the	**Target not achieved.** Number of discussions currently going on but no firm decision with respect to any of the projects. • Draft Concession Agreement	6	6

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			preparation of Cabinet Memo	available for Accra-Tema Motorway. • Feasibility study report dated 2019 on Tema Arterial roads project available. • Accra-Kumasi – inception report available. Route alignment presented but unable deliver full report. • No Concessionaire procured yet. • No Cabinet Memo submitted.		
4.	Improvement of Governance Effectiveness and Accountability in the Road Sub-Sector	Monitoring & Evaluation of Road Projects undertaken in at least	• Approve monitoring Programme • Facilitate the implementation of recommendation from Monitoring reports	**Target achieved.** • Approved Monitoring Programme available. • Monitoring of Projects completed in 2 Regions – BAR, AR & 42No. Projects (Special Exercise) in VR, OR, NR, UER, UWR, NER, AR and reports available. • First joint meeting held in September, second held in December, 2019 and minutes available. • Approval given for the monitoring programme.	6	6

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
5.	Privatization and upgrading of tolling	New private service provider to upgrade and manage at least 5 toll booths Procured and contract signed	• Facilitate the procurement of private service provider • Facilitate the upgrading of at least 5 toll booths	**Target achieved.** Agreement negotiated and signed. Private operator took over in December, 2019. • TRML procured • Minutes of Negotiations available • Approval given for the construction of 3No. Toll stations at Ayimensah, Biriwa, Kubease.	6	6
6.	Asset Preservation	General overloading along road corridors reduced to less than 6% vehicles weighed	• Facilitate the Axle Load Control Programme • Facilitate the construction of new weigh station the beach road	**Target achieved.** First, second, third and fourth quarter reports submitted • 2018 Annual Axle Control Report reviewed • TOR and Tender documents completed and submitted to EU • EU has given No Objection.	6	6
7.	Improving the Road Construction Industry	E-portal for Contractor Classification Prototype launched Integrated GIS of road network and asset management application developed	• Facilitate development of E-portal • Facilitate the development of GIS and asset management tool • Facilitate the review of contract database	**Target achieved.** • Inception report submitted • First progress report submitted • Draft final report submitted • Two Proposals submitted • Updated on the website monthly as	6	6

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Contract database updated		at the end of June • Comments sent to consultants to commence RAMMS		
8.	Improving safety on roads	Hazardous sections on the road are identified and improved by road agencies Routine maintenance of road signs, roadline markings and other safety furniture conducted on road network	• Facilitate the release of funds for road safety works • Monitor implementation of safety activities	**Target achieved.** Reports available on various actions taken by the road agencies in various parts of the country.	6	6
9.	Trade facilitation	Operations of JBP at Noepe Monitored Quarterly NFC meetings	• Facilitate JMC meetings • Facilitate NFC meetings	**Target achieved.** Operations of JBP at Noepe monitored. Quarterly meetings held with minutes available Two (2) workshops held and reports available.	6	6
10.	Supporting the Agric Sector ("Planting for Food and Jobs") and creating Jobs	10.1 Feeder roads rehabilitated to support Agriculture sector; 250 km improved 10.2 At least 200 skilled and unskilled staff employed in the project corridor	• Facilitate meeting with MOFA • Review reports • Brief Minister	• 100 km completed under GoG projects. 152 km under cocoa roads • 225 people employed in the project corridor	6	6
Sub-Total					**59.5**	

5.29.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **28.32** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 92: Performance of CD, Roads and Highways in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 15th January, 2019.	**4**	**4**
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 15th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 28th August, 2019 and approval granted		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated August, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Team sighted minutes of three (3) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 18th February, 7th June, 14th August and 17th December, 2019. • There was a report on actions	**5**	**4.25**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 13th March, 22nd August, 24th September, and 18th December, 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory of items provided and dates of acquisition not indicated for all items. Documents signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 25th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.9**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Organization Manual dated (2015) available. Review going on with MSD. • Updated staff list available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff available. • Establishment levels available/updated but not submitted to OHCS.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 28th		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	March, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument were available dated 7th February, 30th August, 2019 and 29th January, 2020.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 6th May 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 14th February, 2020 instead of by 30th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 17th September, 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on 31st July and 31st December 2019 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January – December available. • Internal Memos on summary efforts to enforce discipline dated 8th January, 2020, available.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analyzed reports dated 31st Dec., 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 19th November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational		**2**	**1.25**
a. Ministerial Advisory Board	• List of Board members		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	available. • MAB in place and minutes of two (2) meeting dated 27th March and 22nd May, 2019 available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Letter dated 2nd September, 2019 requesting for approval from the Civil Service Council available. • Service Charter for Urban Roads, Ghana Road Fund, KTC available.	**4**	**4**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC. Back to office report available. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 15th August 2019 and 10th February, 2020 respectively.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Facebook and Instagram available. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Newsletters available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• The Ministry has recommended the use of soil stabilizers. New manual designed for low	**5**	**4.92**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	volume roads.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Technical support and training to the District Assemblies. • Media Tracking - Content Analysis of Newspapers was available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of ten (10) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen – guidelines for mainstreaming gender in Transport. Ministry's annual report on gender mainstreaming. • Report on Medical Health Screening and Sensitization of staff available • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Management. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Reports on the management of the physical environment was sighted. Security lights installed and cleaning of office environment. • Disability friendly assess. • Fire-fighting devices available.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	• Signage at entry and exit points.		
Overall Total		**28.32**	

5.29.3 Schedule 3:Ag. CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 93 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 93: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Roads and Highways

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Management and Government	Attend workshop	Participated in the Management and Governance Workshop for GHA Board at Regent Hotel, Accra Back to office report
2	Continuous Professional Development	Attend conference	Participated in Annual Conference of GhiE Back to office report dated 4th April, 2019 available
3	Introduction to the New Low Volume Roads Design Manual	Attend workshop	Participated in AfCAP workshop Back to office report dated 16th July,2019
4	Management and Leadership	Attend meeting	Participated in Introduction to leadership workshop for CDs at the Alisa Hotel Back to office report
5.	Knowledge on the RTI Act	Attend workshop	Participated in a workshop on introduction to the RTI Act for Directors of MRH Back to office report
Sub-Total			10

5.29.4 Overall Performance

The **Ag. Chief Director** obtained an overall score of **97.820** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.29.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD thanked the Evaluation Team for the exercise and mentioned that it had, as usual, been a learning process for him and his staff. He promised to do better next year since the feedback provided would be utilised. He was grateful to the staff for their support and encouraged everyone to do their best since their output would be a reflection of his performance.

Team's Remarks

The Team advised the staff to pay attention to detail in whatever they did and also ensure proper documentation. They made the Ag. CD aware that the Agreement document should be seen as a living document which should guide his work and those of the staff on a daily basis. The staff must ensure that they supported in the implementation of the document so that they could see the impact on the CD's performance. The exercise must be seen as a way to learn and improve on the potentials and discover strengths and weaknesses and correct them. This would help to promote synergy and improve the performance management culture in the Service.

5.29.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Planned Road Maintenance program implemented; Periodic maintenance of road network -GHA-105km -DFR-950km -DUR-460km	• Memo dated 12th February, 2019 submitting Technical committee meeting held on 6th February, 2019. • Technical Committee meeting held on 9th April, 2019 and minutes available. • Quarterly reports from Agencies available with evidence of reviews seen. • Periodic releases of Road Fund available. • Monthly progress reports on Pokuase interchange.
2.	Construction works for (2) two interchanges/bridges on the urban network commenced	• Monthly progress report for Tamale interchange dated December, 2019. • Final report on the finding and recommendations on the design and construction of the Obetsebi-Lamptey interchange and other ancillary works dated August, 2019. • Two (2) progress report on construction of the Obetsebi-Lamptey interchange dated November and December, 2019. • Request for administrative review, Finance, design &

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		Construction of three (3) bridges in the Northern Region dated 18th July, 2019. • Project Monitoring Report dated June, 2019. • Sinohydro Master Project Support agreement construction of priority infrastructure Projects-Roads, Interchanges and Bridges Component dated June, 2019. • Letter dated 19th August, 2019 on Design & construction of Bridges over Black Volta & Buipe,Yapei and Daboya respectively. • Letter dated 1st August, 2019, RE: Request for administrative review-Finance, design and construction of 3 Bridges in the NR. • Letter dated 27th September, 2019 from the Ghana Highway Authority to the Ministry submitting monthly project monitoring report on Tema intersection – mid-year. • Letter dated 3rd February, 2019 from the Ghana Highway Authority to the Ministry submitting monthly project monitoring report on Tema intersection – end of year. • Monthly progress summary dated May, 2019 on Tema intersection.
	Procurement processes completed for construction of Volivo, Buipe, Yapei and Daboya Bridges on the trunk roads	• Tender Evaluation Report and recommendation for award of contract. • PPA response to petition dated 30th July, 2019.
	Commercial and financial agreement signed and works commenced for the construction of 50No Czech bridges across the network	• Signing of loan and commercial Agreement for 50 No. composite bridge for Czech Republic dated 19th March, 2019. • Commercial agreement dated 12th July, 2019 between the Republic Of Ghana & Deutsche Bank acting as Lender. • Letter dated 20th June, 2019 from the Ministry of Finance for the release of funds • Contract documents signed in April, 2019. • Letter dated 9th December, 2019 from the Ministry to the Contractor on notice to Commence installation of Modular Bridges. • Letter dated 11th November, 2019 from the Ministry communicating PPA's approval to contractor.
	Sinohydro agreement signed and phase 1 projects commenced whiles phase 2 projects packaged	• Letter dated 14th January, 2019 on the Sinohydro project facility – Phase II request for status of proposed projects to the Ministry's Departments and Agencies.

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		• Minutes of meetings held on 18th July and 16th December, 2019 on review of pile foundation. • Various letters dated 16th September, 2nd December, 2019 from the Ministry inviting steering committee members to a meeting held with minutes available. • Status report Sinohydro project dated June, 2019 available. • Review Design Report for the Tamale interchange dated 2019 available. • Joint Cabinet Memo to Cabinet for the approval of the Commercial contract and credit facility agreements for the design and construction of Obstesbi Lamptey interchange and ancilliary works phase 2.
	Cabinet and Parliamentary Agreement for phase 2 prepared and submitted	• Letter dated 30th April, 2019 to MoF submitting design and build of Obetsebi/Winneba Flyover ancillary works – phase 2. • Letter dated 21st November, 2019 to the MoF submitting the joint Cabinet Memo. • Copy of Memo available.
3.	Development of at least one (1) PPP Project Facilitated	• Letter dated 6th November, 2019 from the GHA to Powerchina Internation Group Ltd. requesting for proposals for development of Accra-Tema motorway and extensions project to be executed on Design, Finance, Build, Operate and Transfer. • Letter dated 13th June, 2019 from GHA to MPGA Tema road consortium requesting for proposals for development of Accra-Tema motorway and extensions project to be executed on Design, Finance, Build, Operate and Transfer. • Letter dated 15th February, 2019 from OOP approving the Cabinet Memo on requesting for proposals for development of Accra-Tema motorway and extensions project to be executed on Design, Finance, Build, Operate and Transfer. • Route alignment report for the Accra-Kumasi expressway dated 19th July, 2019 and draft inception report dated 31st July, 2019. • Transaction advisory services for the PPP feasibility studies and follow-up procurement activities for the Accra-Takoradi motorway Project – volume 1 alignment design and topographical survey report. • 5 No. Minutes of PDT meetings held on: - *Accra-Kumasi – 1No.*

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
		- *Accra-Takoradi – 1No.* - *Accra-Tema – 1 No.* - *Tema Arterial roads – 2 No.*
4.	Monitoring & Evaluation of Road Projects undertaken in at least	• Memo dated 4th February, 2019 requesting for approval for the monitoring plan. • Minutes for the discussions on the first Joint monitoring Report available dated October and December 2019. • Various Regional monitoring available.
5.	New private service provider to upgrade and manage at least 5 toll booths Procured and contract signed	• Minutes dated 14th June, 2019 on upgrade and private management of 20 selected toll stations. • Minutes dated 30th October, 2019 on Urgent stakeholders' meeting to discuss outstanding issues. • Progress on selected Toll Stations and routes dated December, 2019. • Letter dated 16th May, 2019 on notification of award for private management of 20 selected Toll Stations. • Signed Service contract dated October, 2019 for the 20 selected Toll Stations.
6.	General overloading along road corridors reduced to less than 6% vehicles weighed	• Quarterly reports on the status of the Axle Load implementation programme with evidence of CDs review.
7.	E-portal for Contractor Classification Prototype launched	• Memo dated 20th December, 2019 from APO to Director RSIM submitting the status report on MRH contractors Classification and Licensing E-Portal system. • Memo dated 22nd October, 2019 submitting minutes of meetings with NITA and consultant from J Solutions Ltd. • Evaluation report for the procurement of the consultant dated June, 2019. • Technical proposal from Consultant on the development of the Road Integrated Contract Monitoring System dated 22nd August, 2019. • Inception report from consultant dated 14th January, 2019. • User manual dated July, 2019 available.
	Integrated GIS of road network and asset management application developed	• List of contractors in Good and bad standing dated 31st December, 2019.

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
	Contract database updated	• Minutes of meeting. • Comments on Diagnostic report. • Six No. Transmittal letters.
8.	Hazardous sections on the road are identified and improved by road agencies	• Letter dated 28th June, 2019 from the Ministry to GHA on Road line marking of Accra – Kumasi road.
	Routine maintenance of road signs, roadline markings and other safety furniture conducted on road network	• Various letters from Road Fund Secretariat on payment of period maintenance works for their Department and Agencies.
9.	Operations of JBP at Noepe Monitored	• Report on training held at the Noepe – Akanu JBP from 23rd – 26th April, 2019. • Minutes of meeting of the Noepe – Akanu JBP dated 13th February, 2019. • Letter dated 10th July, 2019 inviting members to the meeting. • Report of the Noepe – Akanu JBP Technical Committee meeting dated 7th March, 2019. • Memo dated 24th January, 2019 submitting programme and speech to be delivered by H.E the President. • Memo dated 13th June, 2019 requesting for funds for the meetings.
	Quarterly NFC meetings	• Minutes and reports of meetings of the JBP available.
10.	Feeder roads rehabilitated to support Agriculture sector; 250 km improved 10.2 At least 200 skilled and unskilled staff employed in the project corridor	• Letter dated 26th June, 2019 submitting minutes of meeting to the CEO between MRH and MOFA and Ghana Cocoa Board. • Letter dated 4th July, 2019 to the CEO of Cocoa Board forwarding concession Agreement for signing.

5.30 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Special Development Initiatives

5.30.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 94 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **50.8** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 94: Performance of CD, Special Development Initiatives in Schedule 1.

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Establishing Special Development Authorities for savannah, middle and coastal belt.	Management, Operation and Maintenance Manuals (MOMM) for 7 Flagship projects Developed	• Constitute MOMM Committee • Ensure the organisation of Committee workshops and meetings • Facilitate the release of funds • Review workshop reports • Review Draft manual. • Ensure procurement processes are followed for Recruitment of Consultants • Chair Inception meetings • Chair validation and consultative workshops	**Target achieved.** Committee constituted for MOMM development. Cabinet Information Paper dated 13th November, 2019 developed and submitted to Cabinet. National validation of Manuals undertaken and report available. Seven (7) Management, Operation and Maintenance Manuals developed and shared with stakeholders (Public Toilet Systems, Operations and maintenance of Ambulances, operations and maintenance manual for Clinics, Maintenance of Markets, Funded Community Water	10	8.1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate the release of funds • Facilitate the constitution of the committee	Supply Systems, for Small Dams Under one-village-one-Dam project – all in March, 2019).		
		Policy document on Infrastructure for Poverty Eradication Programme (IPEP) Developed	• Review draft strategy • Facilitate release of funds • Convene meetings to validate strategy • Review proposal • Review TOR for Committee	**Target not achieved.** The Entity Tender Committee approved the Technical Evaluation report and approval given for the financial evaluation. The procurement process for the recruitment of a Consultant is on-going Undated Terms of Reference available.		
		Communication strategy developed	• Convene and Chair Meetings	**Target achieved.** The draft Communication Strategy prepared (2010-2021) and available.		
		Technical working group with DPs Established		**Target not achieved.** Proposal submitted to the partners and available. Discussions going on.		
2.	Implementing the government's flagship intervention of "one village , one dam" to facilitate the	200 small dams constructed in the three Northern Regions	• Facilitate the release of funds • Review monitoring reports. • Undertake monitoring visits	**Target achieved.** 200 small dams completed. Progress/monitoring reports available but no reviews sighted.	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
	provision of community owned and managed small –scale irrigation, especially in the Afram Plains and Northern Savannah		• Facilitated the constitution of 200 small dams	Project fact finding report available. List of beneficiary Communities available. Pictures available.		
3.	Facilitate the provision of storage infrastructure with drying systems at district level	25no. warehouses with dryers, laboratory and gatehouse completed	• Facilitate the release of funds • Review monitoring reports. • Undertake monitoring visits • Facilitated the constitution of 25 warehouses	**Target not achieved.** 15 warehouses completed with two handed over. 10 others at 80% completion. Quarterly status reports available.	10	7.0
4.	Implementing programme under IPEP initiative	500 institutional/ community WC toilet facilities completed Construction of 500 No. Solar Powered Community Water System completed	• Review monitoring reports. • Facilitate payment of works certificate • Undertake monitoring visits • Review monitoring reports. • Facilitate payment of works certificate • Undertake monitoring visits	**Target achieved.** 600 Institutional WC toilets completed. Payment sheets available. Monitoring reports available. **Target achieved.** 500 Solar Powered Community Water System completed and fitted with solar pumps. Payment sheets available.	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				Monitoring reports available.		
5.	Accelerating implementation of community-based health planning and services (CHPS) policy to ensure equity in access to quality health care	275 Ambulance Supplied 8000 Hospital beds supplied Construction of 26 Clinics completed	• Ensure procurement processes are followed through • Constitute evaluation panel • Review evaluation reports • Undertake pre-manufacturing visit • Facilitate release of LCs by MoF and BoG • Undertake pre-delivery visit • Ensure procurement processes are followed through • Constitute evaluation panel • Review evaluation reports • Review monitoring reports • Facilitate payments to contractors • Facilitated the	**Target achieved.** 307 ambulances procured for the National Ambulance Service. **Target achieved.** Undated Evaluation report for 10,000 beds available. **Target not achieved.** All procurement processes completed and work commenced on the construction of 26 Clinics nationwide. Evaluation report dated April, 2019 available. Contract document and designs available. Two (2) of the Clinics are completed with 24 at 70% completion. Monitoring reports available.	10	8.7

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			construction of 26 Clinics.			
6.	Developing modern markets and retail infrastructure in every district	Construction of 25 rural and 2 modern markets completed	• Review monitoring reports • Facilitate payments to contractors • Undertake monitoring to project sites • Facilitated the construction of 25 rural markets.	**Target not achieved.** Procurement process completed for construction of 25 rural markets in selected districts nationwide. 3 of the rural markets completed. Construction started on the 2 modern markets in Dome and Mankessim.	10	7
Sub-Total						**50.8**

5.30.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **26.27** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 95: Performance of CD, Special Development Initiatives in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.8**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 28th March, 2019 instead of February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	submitted to OHCS on 15th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 21st August, 2019		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan dated 30th December, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 30th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**2.5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Two (2) meetings held and minutes dated 18th and 27th December, 2019 available. • Report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee **not** available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of five (5) meetings dated 7th Feb., 12th June, 29th March, 16th April, and 31st December, 2019 available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory prepared **but not** signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.97**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec., 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Organization Manual dated 2019. • Updated staff list dated December, 2019 available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff dated 2019 available. • Establishment levels submitted to OHCS on 14th February, 2019 available.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 24th February, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning phase dated March, 2019 and end of year report dated 14th February, 2020 available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• N/A • N/A		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process emailed to OHCS on 8th March, 2019 • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 5th July, 2019 and 27th January, 2020 respectively.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	• Monthly reports on staff attendance was available. • Verbal reprimand. Discipline issues discussed at staff durbars. • 2019 Annual Staff Movement Report dated 9th January, 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 18th December, 2019 instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of three (3) meetings dated of 28th March, 13h June, and 28th November, 2019 available.	**2**	**1.625**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation **b.** Functional Client Service Unit (CSU) **c.** Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Service Charter dated December 2019 available. • No Service Charter for any of the Authorities. • Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU training for three (3) Officers at the CSTC. Back to office report available. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 26th June, 2019 and 2nd January, 2020 respectively. • Functional website, Facebook, Twitter, WhatsApp platforms • Reports on two (2) website	**4**	**3.375**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	updates available. • Newsletter (MSDI News) available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**5**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Introduced a specialised tracking and monitoring system for projects and to generate reports on them.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring undertaken at all projects sites in the various Development Zones and reports submitted to the Ministry. • Media Tracking- Press briefing in upper East region in response to media reports on status of Dams under 1V1D initiative.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of twelve (12) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen - Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness (seminar by MOGCSP on gender mainstreaming on 16th May, 2019. • Staff health walk and screening at Sogakope. Talk on Tier II Pension, first Aid box available. • Information posted on notice boards.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available - Ministry engaged PRAAD to create a specialised dispatch book.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
e. Management of physical environment	• Evidence of training for Records officers at the CSTC. Back to office report available. • Created a new office space, refurbishment undertaken. • Satisfactory.		
Overall Total		**26.27**	

Note. Since the Ministry did not have any Directors at post as well as any Departments, they could not been scored for issues relating to the Performance Agreements with Heads of Departments and Directors/Analogous Grades. The sub-total score should thus be based on 8.5. To get a score relating to 10, the score obtained is multiplied by the factor 10/8.5, that is, 1.18.

5.30.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 96 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 96: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Special Development Initiatives

NO	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Enhance Coaching and Mentoring skills	Mentor young people	Mentoring three (3) young Civil Servants under the Emerging Public Leaders mentorship programme of the Civil Service.
2	Strengthen competencies in project Management	Undertake Project Management Professional (PMP,PMI) workshop	Project Management Course by LeadAfrique Ghana Ltd from 18th -23rd December 2019. Certificate of participation available.
3	Improve knowledge in Trade	Attend training	Attended a Seminar on Trade from 3rd -14th June 2019 at the Ministry of Trade on the African Free Trade Area. Conference documents available.

4	Develop skills and competencies in Corporate Governance	Attend workshop on corporate Governance for Boards and Senior Executives	Attended a workshop by MadinsonPine ltd on Corporate Governance from 25th -29th November 2019. Pictures of training session and training report available.
5	Develop competencies in work place security	Attend training programme	Attended training programme by the Doyan Security Services from 13th -15th May 2019. Training Material available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.30.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **87.07** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.30.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD saw the evaluation exercise as a learning process especially with respect to the need to provide evidence to support whatever actions had been undertaken. This, he found most useful as a guide to an effective approach to work. He appreciated the presence of the staff who could see how their actions and inactions affected the work of the CD and thus the Agreement. This brought out clearly the need for team work to achieve results. He was happy to have been part of the exercise for some time now.

Team's Remarks

The Team thanked the CD for his words and further explained that the exercise was not of a punitive nature but served to help CDs appreciate better the work they were doing. The presence of the support also helped them to appreciate the importance of team work in the attainment of goals and targets. They hoped that through the exercise the staff will also ensure that performance management at all levels was part of their management culture.

5.30.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Management, Operation and Maintenance Manuals (MOMM) for 7 Flagship projects Developed	• Minutes and reports of meeting dated 10th January, 2019. • Invitation letters for meetings dated 27th February, 2019 inviting stakeholders (committee on management, operation and maintenance manual for IPEP). • Minutes of IMC on IPEP meeting on 28th May, 2019. • Various letters dated 7th, 8th and 9th October, 2019 inviting stakeholders' for the workshop. • Copies of the draft manuals. • Emails dated 26th June, 2019 forwarding the drafts manuals to stakeholders. • Validation report. • Attendance sheet of participants. • Copy of manuals after inputs form validation and inputs from IMC-IPEP. • Copy of information paper to Cabinet.
	Policy document on IPEP Developed	• Copy of TOR. • Memo dated 15th April, 2019 from Head, PUC to CD requesting for approval to contract Consultants. • Copy of letter to PPA dated 29th July 2019. • Copies of proposals from Consultants. • Approval letter from PPA dated 28th August, 2019. • Letter dated 21st Oct. 2019 appointing evaluation panel. • Evaluation report dated 13th November, 2019.
	Communication strategy developed	• Email dated 8th July, 2019 sharing document with management for review. • Draft Communication Strategy developed.
	Proposal for partnering Development Partners developed	• Copy of Proposal to Development partners. • Letters dated 26th September, 2019 forwarding proposal.
	Technical working group with DPs Established	
2.	200 small dams constructed in the three Northern	• Various letters dated 26th June, 2019 terminating the Construction of Small Dams/Dugouts. • Project Fact finding report dated 29th July, 2019.

	Regions	• Progress report dated February, 2019 available. • Quality Control proposal on Dam project from Ing. Michael Obeng Konadu dated August, 2019. • Pictures and location of completed projects. • Payment sheets.
3.	25no. warehouses with dryers, laboratory and gatehouse completed	• Reviewed monitoring reports dated 5th March 2019. • Letters of termination to non-performing contractors dated 15th June, 2019. • Letters to PPA/CRTC dated 19th July, 2019 requesting for Single Sourcing. • Response from PPA dated 31st July, 2019. • Copies of Contracts. • Status reports. • Payment certificates. • Pictures of projects.
4.	500 institutional/ community WC toilet facilities completed	• Letters of termination to non-performing contractor dated 19th July, 2019. • Monitoring reports dated August, 2019. • Fact Finding Committee report on the use of unsuitable material in the construction of some of the 10-seater water closet toilets with bio digester and mechanised boreholes under IPEP in the Oti Region. • Payment certificates. • Pictures of projects.
	Construction of 500 No. solar powered community water system completed	• Reviewed monitoring reports. • Status reports. • Payment certificates. • Pictures and list of location of completed projects.
5.	**1.** 275 Ambulance Supplied **2.** 8000 Hospital beds supplied	• Letter to PPA dated 5th February, 2019. • Contract documents. • Letter to MOF for establishment of Letters of Credit dated 5th February, 2019. • Letter dated 10th April to Manufacturer of Ambulances on the procurement of 307 4×4 CDI 315 Mercedes Benz sprinter Ambulances. • Letters dated 27th June and 24th July, 2019 to the Chief of Staff requesting for permission to undertaken official visit to Germany on the procurement of the Ambulances. • Inspection of prototype ambulance from 16th - 20th June, 2019. Letters to Chief of Staff for approval dated 12th February and 30th

		May, 2019. Letter to Hon. Minister of Foreign Affairs dated 3rd June, 2019. Letter dated 12th June, 2019 to Hon. Minister of Information. • Approval letter from PPA dated 2nd November, 2019. • Pictures of inspection to manufacturing Company. • Pictures of Ambulances. • Pictures of handing over of Ambulances.
	Construction of 26 clinics completed	• Evaluation report. • Letter on acceptance of inception reports dated 11th July, 2019. • Copies of contract documents. • Warning letters dated 13th June, to non-performing contractors. • Design and location of Clinics • Pictures of completed and ongoing clinics • Status report on Clinics • Payment certificates
6.	Construction of 25 rural and 2 modern markets completed	• Letter to PPA dated 20th November, 2019 requesting for the use of restricted tendering procurement method for the construction of 50 Markets • Response from PPA dated 20th November, 2019 • Evaluation report • Offer letters to Contractors • Various warning letters to defaulting contractors • Various letters terminating contracts • List of communities where markets are located • List of completed markets • Pictures of markets • Pictures of monitoring visits

5.31 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture

5.31.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 97 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **53.4** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 97: Performance of CD, Tourism, Arts and Culture in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Tourism Management and Administration	Two (2) Public-Private Partnership Fora Organised National Tourism & Hospitability Training Policy (NTHTP) Developed 1. Monitoring &	• Set-up PPP Secretariat • Review the PPP Work Plan • Review PPP implementation Budget • Review Terms of Reference • Facilitate the release of funds for the organisation of PPP Fora • Appoint a Facilitator (policy expert) • Set-up Technical Team to plan the process • Facilitate the release of funds to organise five	**Target achieved.** PPP Secretariat set up (Office Space and Three (3) Officers assigned to the secretariat) Two (2) fora organized at the National Theatre (stakeholder forum with the Creative Arts) and Koforidua (PPP forum) and reports available. Report on Koforidua forum was of unsatisfactory quality. It didn't even include list of participants **Target achieved.** Policy Expert appointed. Consultative	12	11.4

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Evaluation (M&E) undertaken 2. World Bank Project Implemented with recruitment of following consultants: • Social Environmental & Communication specialist; • Gender Inclusion & Citizen specialist; • Enterprise Diagnostics firm; and • Capacity Building Firm. And procurement of vehicles	(3) stakeholder consultative meetings • Review Report • Facilitate the release of funds to undertake the exercise • Review Reports • Advertise for expression of Interest • Set-up Evaluation Panel • Negotiations undertaken • Give notifications • Award Contract	meetings organized (Accra and Kumasi) and reports available. Draft National Tourism and Hospitality Training Policy developed and submitted to Cabinet. **Target not achieved.** Though activities were to be undertaken every quarter, only first and second quarter M&E field visits to specific projects and Agencies undertaken. Reports available but not reviewed. **Target achieved.** Consultants and vehicles procured going by World Bank procedures.		
2.	Tourism Product Development	Women in Tourism Empowerment Summit Organized	• Facilitate the setting up of the Planning Committee	**Target achieved.** Women in Tourism Empowerment Summit Organized	12	11

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate the release of funds for related activities • Review speeches for Minister • Review Reports	and report available. Minister's speech seen though there was no evidence of review of final reports by CD.		
3.	Tourism Research Marketing	Four (4) international conferences participated	• Facilitate the release of funds to participate in international fairs & exhibitions • Review Reports	**Target achieved.** The Ministry of Tourism Arts and Culture participated in Four (4) International Conference (Angola, Azerbaijan, Italy and Benin) and reports available with no evidence of review by CD.	12	11
4.	Tourism Quality Assurance	Restructuring of HOTCATT undertaken	• Facilitate the setting up of a technical committee • Provide funds to facilitate the work of the committee • Review Reports	**Target not achieved.** Technical Committee inaugurated The technical committee completed work and report available without review by CD. No indication that HOTCATT had been restructured based on the report.	12	8

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
5.	Culture, Creative Arts and Heritage Management Programme	Film Board inaugurated Creative Arts Bill prepared	• Write letters nominating people to serve on the board • Communicate nominees to the Presidency for approval • Submit amendments of Creative Arts Bill to Attorney-General Department • Upon receipt of amendments bill from Attorney-General Department, a Committee will be organised to review the bill submitted by AGs Office • Submit reviewed bill to cabinet	**Target achieved.** Approval from the Presidency obtained. Film Board inaugurated – sixteen (16) membership. Three (3) meetings held and minutes of meetings available. **Target achieved.** Submitted Bill to Cabinet. Cabinet requested the Ministry to undertake amendments to the Bill and resubmit.	12	12
Sub-Total					**53.4**	

5.31.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **24.16** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 98: Performance of Chief Director, Tourism, Arts and Culture in Schedule 2

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.8**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 19th March 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 12th September 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 7th October, 2019 and approval granted.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report dated 12th July, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 29th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**2.95**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Minutes of four (4) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 21st February, 25th July, 11th October, and 14th		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	November, 2019 available. • There was no report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 9th April, 5th June, 19th August and 31st Dec., 2019		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory of items provided but not signed on each sheet by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to Controller and Accountant General's Department on 2nd May 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**8.45**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Draft Organization Manual dated (2019) available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and submitted to OHCS on 23rd October, 2019.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 1st March, 2019.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument available and forwarded to OHCS on 22nd July, 2019.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 22nd July, 2019. • Evaluation not conducted.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 8th March, 2019. • Mid-year report not available. • End year report submitted to OHCS on 10th January 2020.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports from January - December available. • Internal Memos on notice board on efforts to enforce discipline, available. Query letter dated 13th September, 2019 to the PRO.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite analysed reports dated 9th January, 2019 available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 8th January, 2020 instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational		**2**	**1.625**
a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of three (3) meeting dated 10th April, 13th Aug., and 20th		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	December, 2019 available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Revised Service Charter dated 2018 available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • No Service Charter available for any of the Agencies/Department.	**4**	**2.875**
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU officers trained at the CSTC. • Mid-year report not available • End of year report available but not submitted to OHCS.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Instagram, Twitter available. • Reports on quarterly website updates not available. Website was not functioning for a while. • Newsletters, brochures and flyers available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• The Ministry introduced a new organizational structure, with a Tourism Directorate and others. The initiative has helped the Ministry move forward better with its tourism agenda.	**5**	**4.46**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring through the Agencies (Ghana Tourism Authority and National Commission and Culture) of the Ministry.		

Key Result Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	• Media Tracking- daily tracking of Newspapers and analysis available		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of five (5) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of two (2) Staff durbars sighted. • The Ministry does not discriminate against the sexes in its activities. • Report on Eye Test Screening on 16th July, 2019 and a talk on the Spine on 5th March, 2019 of staff and report available. • Internal newsletters/catalogue of information posted on notice boards and through meetings, WhatsApp for staff.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available letter dated 7th May, 2019 and a response dated 30th May, 2019. Report on the assessment available. • Evidence of training for records officers available 8th October, 2019. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Reports on the management of the physical environment were sighted. Security and safety of offices, quality of washrooms, beautification of work environment, creation of kitchenette.		
Overall Total		**24.16**	

5.31.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 99 below. The CD obtained a score of 8 out of the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 99: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Tourism, Arts and Culture

NO.	COMPETENCIES/ SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Protection of cultural and heritage property	Participate in workshop	Participated in the workshop on the popularization of the AU model law on protection of cultural property and heritage in Cotonou, Benin
2	Knowledge on filing of VAT, NHIL, GETFUND and Tourism	Attend training	Participated in the Internal Audit training in the computation and filing of VAT, NHIL, GETFUND and Tourism Levy.
3	Inclusive Governance	Attend workshop	Participated in a workshop on Inclusive Governance.
4	Auditing	Participated in the Annual Audit Forum	Participated in the 2019 Annual Internal Audit Conference.
Sub-Total			**8**

5.31.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **85.56** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.31.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD noted that the evaluation exercise was a very important exercise which helped improve the capacity of staff. He was glad other staff were given the opportunity to participate in it and trust that they had learnt a lot from the exercise. He was grateful to the evaluation team for the opportunity.

Team's Remarks

The Team mentioned that the exercise brought out the team spirit in staff and for them to know their strengths and weaknesses. They were advised to work hard to enable them meet the mandate of the Ministry.

5.31.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Two (2) Public-Private Partnership Fora Organised	• Various letters dated 29th June, 2019 appointing officers for the Secretariat from Chief Director. • Memo dated 5th July, 2019 Tourism Development Project-Public Private Dialogue (PPD) on the setting up of a PPD secretariat and approval of the following documents. o Workplan for PPD activities. o Terms of Reference for PPD mechanism. • Memo dated 5th July, 2019 to Chief Director- Tourism Development Project-Public Private Dialogue (PPD) Budget for the organisation of two PPP fora from Tourism Officer- PPME (MOTAC). • Letter dated 15th August, 2019-Tourism Development Project inviting participants to a Public-Private Dialogue Forum on 26th August, 2019. • Memo dated 20th August, 2019- Release of funds to organise the workshop. From Chief Director. • Memo dated 4th September, 2019-Tourism Development Project-Public-Private Dialogue Submitting Report for review. • Copy of final report. • Letter dated 18th October, 2019- Tourism Development Project- an invitation to Public-Private Dialogue to be held Thursday, 31st October, 2019. • Memo dated 28th October, 2019- Release of funds to organise the workshop. From Chief Director. • Copy of final report.
	National Tourism & Hospitability Training Policy (NTHTP) Developed	• Letter dated 28th March, 2019 appointing a facilitator to develop the National Tourism and Hospitality Training Policy from Chief Director-MOTAC. • Memo dated 8th April, 2019 from CD to nominees inviting them in an inception meeting with technical team to lead the planning and organisation of stakeholder consultative Meetings. • Memo dated 14th May, 2019- (GTDP)- submitting a draft minute on inception meeting held with the Technical Team at KNUST Engineering Guest House on the Policy- 30th April, 2019 -1st May, 2019 from Deputy Director-GTDP.

		• Copy of final copy. • Memo dated 2nd May, 2019- Request for the release for funds to organise GTDP Stakeholders Consultative Forum to Develop a National Tourism and Hospitality Training Policy (NTHTP) on Monday 6th May, 2019. • Memo dated 9th May, 2019 submitting the draft report on Stakeholder Consultation on the development of NTHTP in Kumasi on 6th May, 2019. • Copy of final report. • A memo dated 7th May, 2019 to Chief Director, GTDP - Request for the release of funds to organise a workshop on Tourism Training Policy at Oak Plaza on 9th May 2019. From Principal Tourism Officer. • A memo dated 13th May, 2019 to Chief Director submitting draft Report on National Tourism and Hospitality Training Policy stakeholder consultation workshop held in Accra at Oak Plaza from Deputy Director. • Copy of Final Copy. • Copy of Draft National Tourism and Hospitality Training Policy submitted to the cabinet. • A letter dated 21st October, 2019 forwarding Cabinet Memorandum to Cabinet.
	Quarterly Monitoring and Evaluation(M&E) of Agencies Undertaken	• A memo dated 11th March, 2019 - Monitoring of Projects in MOTAC for the release of funds for sector Ministry M&E field exercise. • A memo dated 11th July, - submitting draft Mid-Year Report on M&E of MOTAC sector for review. From Deputy Director M&E Unit. • Final Copy of Report. • A memo dated 2nd December, 2019 - Monitoring of Projects in the Sector Ministry from M&E Unit for the release of funds for M&E field exercise. • A memo dated 16th December, 2019- Report submitted for review M&E of projects in the sector from M&E Unit. • Copy of Final report.
	World Bank Project Implemented • Social	• Copy of Advert for Social, Environmental Communication, Citizen Engagement and Gender Inclusion. • A memo dated 8th July, submitting Expression of Interest Assessment Report on Social Safe Guards from Committee Chairman.

	Environmental & Communication specialist recruited • Gender Inclusion & Citizen Engagement recruited	• A memo dated 16th July 2019 submitting interview Report on the selection of social Safeguards for the Tourism Development Project. • A letter dated 22nd July, 2019-Nomination of a Negotiation Panel for Individual Consultants for the Ghana Tourism Development Project from Chief Director. • Copy of Consultancy Service Contract on Social Safeguards Consultant, 29th July, 2019. • A memo dated 8th July, submitting Expression of Interest Assessment Report for shortlisting of individual environmental safeguards consultant. • A memo dated 17th July, 2019 Submitting interview Report on the selection of Environmental Safeguards for the Tourism Development Project. • Copy of Advert for Social, Environmental Communication, Citizen Engagement and Gender inclusion. • A memo dated 9th July, 2019 submitting Expression of Interest Assessment Report for shortlisting of individual Citizen Engagement and Gender Inclusion Consultant. • A memo dated 19th July submitting interview Report for the selection of Citizen Engagement and Gender inclusion for the Tourism Development Project. • A letter dated 6th August, 2019- Notification of Award, Citizen Engagement and Gender Inclusion Consultant for the tourism Development Project from Chief Director. • Copy of Award of contract for consultancy services for the Development of Citizen Engagement Plan and Gender Inclusion Plan for the Tourism Development Project.
	Enterprise Diagnostics firm recruited	• Copy of Advert for Enterprise Diagnostics and Capacity Building Firm. • A Memo dated 7th July, submitting Expression of Interest Assessment Report for shortlisting of consulting Firm for Tourism Enterprise Diagnostics. • A letter dated 13th December, 2019- RE: Consultancy Services for Tourism Enterprise Diagnostics. From Chief Director.
	Capacity Building Firm Recruited	• Copy of Advert for Enterprise Diagnostics and Capacity Building Firm. • A letter dated 24th October, 2019 - Formation of Panel for the Evaluation of Request of Proposals for Capacity Building for the Tourism Development Project from Chief Director. • A Memo dated 7th July, submitting Expression of Interest Assessment Report for shortlisting of consulting Firm for

		Capacity Building Assessment and Design of a program for public sector Tourism Stakeholders. • A memo dated 8th November, 2019 submitting Technical and Financial Evaluation Report for Capacity Building Assessment and Design of Program for Public Sector Tourism Stakeholders.
	Vehicle procured	• Copies of letters requesting for bids, the opening of bids as well as the Evaluation Panel. • A letter dated 2nd January, 2019 to Atodreams Limited-Notification of Award of Contract to supply 1(one) Motorbike. From Chief Director. • Copy of Contract Agreement between the MOTAC and Japan Motors to Supply two (2) Foton Tuland.
2.	Women in Tourism Empowerment Summit Organized	• A memo dated 13th August, from Chief Director setting-up the planning committee to plan the women in Tourism Empowerment Summit. • A letter dated 20th May, 2019 - Request for Financial Support from Ministry of Finance to Host 2019 United Nations World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO) Regional Congress On women Empowerment in the Tourism Sector, A Focus on Africa, from 25th - 27th November, 2019, from Chief Director. • Memo dated 18th December, 2019-Request for the Release of Funds- WiTEP Payments from Tourism Officer to Chief Director. • Copies of letters requesting for Visa on Arrival, Accra International Centre (AICC), Dispatch Rider, SPD Vehicles etc. • A memo dated 20th November, 2019 - Submitting draft speech for Minister to Chief Director for Review from Director PPME. • Copy of Speech for the Hon Minister. • Copy of Speech for the Vice President. • A memo dated 31st December, 2019 submitting a draft report to Chief Director. From Director PPME. • Copy of Final Report.
3.	Four (4) international conferences participated	• A letter dated 15th May, 2019 to the Chief of Staff, requesting for approval for the release of funds to purchase an air ticket, per diem and accommodation to attend World Tourism Forum held in Angola from 23rd -25th 2019 from Chief Director. • A memo dated 31st May, 2019 - Submitting Draft Report on World Tourism Forum held in Angola from 23rd -25th 2019 from Director-PPME. • Copy of Final Report. • A letter dated 29th June, 2019 - Request for Fund to participate in the 110th session of Executive Council of United Nation's world

		Tourism Organisation in Baku Azerbaijan 16th - 18th June 2019 from Chief Director to Office of the president. • A memo dated 24th June, 2019 Submitting Draft Report on the 110th session of Executive Council of United Nations World Tourism Organisation in Baku Azerbaijan 16th -18th June, 2019 from Deputy Director. • Copy of Final Report. • A letter dated 24th April, 2019 requesting for the release of funds for the cost air tickets and accommodation to participate in the Ghana Pavilion at the 58th International Art Exhibition in Venice-Italy, 11th - 14th May, 2019. • A memo dated 7th June, 2019 - Submitting Draft Report on trip to participate in the Ghana Pavilion at the 58th international art exhibition in Venice- Italy, 11th - 14th May, 2019 from Director – PPME. • Copy of Final Report. • The popularization of the AU Model Law on Protection of Cultural Property and Heritage Cotonou, Benin Republic, 27th - 31st May, 2019. • A memo dated 7th August, 2019- Report on trip to Benin to participate in the Popularization of the AU Model Law on Protection of Cultural Property and Heritage Cotonou, Benin Republic, 27th - 31st May, 2019 from Director-Tourism.
4.	Restructuring of HOTCATT undertaken	• A letter dated 4th January, 2019 - Inauguration of Technical Team to lead the Restructuring of HOTCATT from Chief Director-MOTA. • A memo dated 12th February, 2019, submitting minutes of Technical committee meeting for the Restructuring of HOTCATT. • A letter to GTA requesting for funds to facilitate the work of the technical committee. • A letter dated 26th August, 2019- Draft Report on the Restructuring of HOTCATT.
5.	Film Board inaugurated	• A letter dated 5th June 2019 - Request for Nominations to serve on the National film Authority Board. • A memo dated 8th July, 2019 from Chief Director to Josephine Ohene- Osei- Nomination to serve on the Governing Board of the National Film Authority. • A letter dated 19th July, 2019 to the Chief of Staff- Formation of the Governing Board of the National Film Authority, conveying names of nominee's and their CVs to the chief of staff for approval.

		• A letter dated 26th July, 2019 from Chief Director to Chief of Staff submitting names of nominee and CVs. • A letter dated 16th December, 2019- Appointment of Governing Body of National Film Authority.
	Creative Arts bill prepared	• A letter dated 18th July, 2019-RE: Creative Arts Industry Bill 2018 from Chief Director-MOTAC to AGs to review the bill and onwards submission to cabinet. • A Copy of letter dated 12th November, 2019 issued to committee members to review the bill.

5.32 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Trade and Industry

5.32.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Evaluation Team noted that the Ag. CD had included an additional TPA which was not in the original agreement he signed and had also not been approved by the Head of the Civil Service. This TPA "Implementing the Rural Enterprises Programme (REP)" was, therefore, not assessed by the Team.

The Ag. Chief Director was scored on six (6) Top Priority Areas for schedule 1, with each of the TPAs assigned a score of ten (10) each. The targets, findings and scores for each TPA are presented in the Table 100 below.

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **53** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 100: Performance of Ag. CD, Trade and Industry in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Developing a Customized Web-Based Platform for consultations with the private sector	Business Consultative Portal (BCP) developed and launched	• Facilitate the organisation of two trainings on the use of the BCP • Facilitate the launching of the BCP and review report	**Target not fully achieved.** The portal had been developed and validated by stakeholders but yet to be launched. A ten (10) day training on the Regulatory Impact Assessment was organised and copy of report with evidence of CD's review wasavailable.	10	8
2.	Implementing One District, One Factory (1DIF) Initiative	Access to credit for 60 participating factories facilitated (15 each quarter) and incentive package established for IDIF facilitated	Facilitate access to credit for participating companies of the IDIF initiative	**Target achieved.** Access to credit for sixty (60) participating factories facilitated (15 each quarter). Incentive package for participating 1D1F companies had been approved by Parliament.	10	10
3.	Supporting the development of Strategic Anchor Industries	Launch and implement the Automobile Industry Development	• Facilitate meetings of the Auto policy team • Facilitate the	**Target achieved.** Policy launched and implementation going on. Two (2) technical	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Policy.	Ministry's participation in Auto Conference	committee meetings were held on the Ghana AutomobileDevelopment Policy and minutes available. A report on Ghana's participation in the Sub-Saharan African Automotive Sector Orientation workshop programme held on 12th - 16th March 2019 in Durban, South-Africa available. The Automobile Industry Development Policy was launched by Hon. Minister on 14th August, 2019. Three (3) Auto Companies had submitted registration application to participate in Government's Auto Development Programme. The Ministry in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance had submitted Draft Bills on Fiscal Incentive under the Auto Development Programme for Approval.		
4.	Promoting Made in Ghana Goods	Participation of Exporters in Three (3)	• Facilitate the participation of exporters in two	**Target achieved.** CD explained that Target	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		International Fairs, Expos and Exhibitions facilitated. Participation in Made in Ghana promotional fairs and campaigns facilitated.	(2) international trade fairs and Expos. • Facilitate the organisation of two (2) Made In Ghana fair	should have related to Two (2) and not Three (3) International Fairs, etc. Facilitated the Participation of exporters and businesses in two (2) international fairs, Expos and Exhibitions. Facilitated the participation of the organisation of three (3) Made In Ghana fair and reports available. • 2nd Kwahu Donkomi Trade Fair held at Kwahu Dwaso from 17th - 22nd April 2019. • 2019 Ghana Trade Exhibition. • Kumasi Street Fair.		
5.	Implementing the African Continental Free Trade Agreement (AfCFTA)	AfCFTA implemented	• Facilitate implementation of the AfCFTA	**Target achieved.** Completed and submitted Ghana's Bid to host the AfCFTA Secretariat. Organised a National Conference on Implementation of the AfCFTA from 19th -21st August, 2019. A National Institutional Support Structure and Inter-Ministerial	10	10

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
				Facilitation Committee had been set-up to support implementation. Submitted a proposal for Technical Support from the Trade Advocacy Fund to develop MoTI/TAF AfCFTA Support Programme. the AfCFTA. Hosted Senior Trade Officers Preparatory Meeting, 10th African Ministers of Trade (AMOT) and the 2nd AfCFTA Trade Ministers Forum from 9th – 15th December, 2019 in Accra.		
6.	Preparing the National Quality Policy and Reviewing the Ghana Standards Board Act	National Quality Policy and Revised Ghana Standards Authority Bill amended submitted to Cabinet and Parliament respectively for approval.	• Facilitate a review and submission of the draft policy and amendment proposal to Cabinet. • Follow up on approval and brief Hon. Minister	**Target not achieved.** Policy and Amendment Bill reviewed at meeting in May, 2019 Draft of National Quality Policy and Ghana Standards Authority Amendment Bill revised and submitted to Hon. Minister for consideration. They were yet to be submitted to Cabinet and Parliament respectively.	10	5
Sub- Total						**53**

5.32.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The Ag. CD obtained a score of **25.305** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 101: Performance of Ag. CD, Trade and Industry in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	3.8
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed	• Copy of Action Plan emailed to OHCS on 25th June, 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement	• Copy of Mid-Year self-assessment report emailed to OHCS on 16th August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Copy of Action Points from Mid-Year CDs self-assessment report available. Copy of Memo dated 21st November, 2019 and signed by CD, inviting Directors and Team leaders to a meeting to discuss the status of implementation of Actions Points from Mid-Year CDs Assessment Report.		
d. Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Copy of Sector-wide Mid-Year Progress Report dated July, 2019.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report forwarded to OHCS on 28th January, 2020 instead of 15th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**3.25**
a. Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to	• Three (3) Audit Committee meetings held and actions to		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
redress audit queries	redress audit queries available • Minutes of Meetings dated 11th October, 10th and 19th December, 2019. • Report on follow-up actions on Audit Committee was available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved	• Copy of System generated annual Procurement Plan available. • Two (2) ETC meetings held and minutes dated 5th March and 13th August 2019 available,		
c. Assets Register updated	• Not available.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Copy of letter dated 28th February, 2019 submitting 2018 Final Accounts to the CAGD.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	9.75
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Copy of organization manual dated 2016 but yet to be reviewed.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Copy of Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualised Job Schedules available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Letter dated 23rd August, 2019 submitting copy of Establishment level with variance to OHCS.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• Letter dated 19th June, 2019 submitting to OHCS composite analysed report on 2018 appraisals.		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Copy of composite Reports on the planning, mid-year and end of year phases of Staff Performance Appraisal Form.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Letter dated 22nd May, 2019 signed by the Ag. Director submitting Report on the signing of Performance Agreement to OHCS. • Evaluation report submitted on 4th March with permission granted by the OHCS.		
e. Training programmes	• Training Plan available and submitted to OHCS on 11th March, 2019. • Mid-year report on the implementation of the 2019 Training Plan submitted to OHCS on 4th July, 2019. • End of year report available but not submitted to OHCS.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports on daily staff attendance available. • Report on efforts to enforce discipline available.		
g. Report on staff movements	• Composite **analysed** report on staff movements (recruitments, replacements, promotions, postings, retirements and resignations) in 2018 with implications for the effective functioning of the Organisation available. • 2020 Promotion register available and copy forwarded to OHCS on 28th November, 2019.		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available • Two (2) meetings held; Minutes of meeting of the Ministerial Advisory Board held on 16th April, and 20th December, 2019 at the Ministry's Conference Room.	**2**	1.25
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Draft Service Charter available. • Departmental Charters not sighted.	4	3.355
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• There is designated visitors office at the entrance and a Client Service Unit with basic office equipment on the first floor of the Ministry. • CSU contact Officers attended training at the CSTC. • Mid-year report on CSU submitted to the OHCS on 2nd July, 2019. • End of year available but not forwarded to OHCS.		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• The Ministry has a functional interactive website (www.moti.gov.gh), what sap and an active face book account. • Copy of quarterly updates of website available but not dated. • Copy of Newsletters, brochures and flyers available.		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	3.9
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Copy of Work completion Forms on installation of telephone facilities.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Depending on the policy areas they engage the local authorities. The Ministry works closely with the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development. • Facilitated an Impact Assessment Study of the Rural Enterprises Programme: o Copy of Impact Assessment Study on the Rural Enterprises Programme of the Ministry. o Copy of PowerPoint Slides and workshop documents presented at the DAAD Alumni Conference on Impact Evaluation in Bochum, Germany. • A tracking system by the communication Team where updates are provided (print and audio media). Evidence of tracking and analysis of public opinion/media reports and follow-up actions. Copy of daily news tracking report submitted to Hon. Minister and Chief Director.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Six (6) management meetings held and minutes dated available. • Two (2) staff durbars held and Minutes of meetings available. • Gender desk Officer available.		

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
	Workshop Report on gender equality and mainstreaming in Ghana's National Policies available. • Copy of undated Report of Health Screening for staff from 22nd – 23rd July, 2019 available. • Internal newsletters/ catalogue of information – evidence of use of internal notice board available.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• No evidence of PRAAD engagement. • Head of Records trained on record management in April, 2019 at the OHCS. No back to office report available		
e. Management of physical environment	• Refurbishment of Minister and CD's Offices. • Fire-extinguishers available. • Cleanliness of office environment. • Quality of washrooms satisfactory.		
Overall Total		**25.305**	

5.32.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag. CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 102 below. The Ag. CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 102: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Trade and Industry

No.	**COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS**	**PLANNED ACTIONS**	**CD's PERFORMANCE**
1	Public sector management skills	Attend Chief Directors Orientation	Attended Chief Directors Orientation Workshop in April, 2019.

		Workshop	
2	Right to Information	Training	Participated in Chief Director's Training on the implementation of the Right to Information (RTI) Act at the CSTC in December, 2019.
3	Negotiation Skills	Training	Participated in the WTO Regional Trade Simulation Course held in Accra from1-5 July, 2019. • Group picture of Participants.
4	Emerging Issues of Industrial Development	Participate in workshop	Participated in the National Association of Automotive and Component Manufacturers, Durban in South Africa. • NAACAM Show Durban ICC on 19th – 22nd April, 2019.
5	Competition Policy	Attend Training	Participated in a training from 15th -19th October, 2019 in Dakar.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.32.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **88.305** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.32.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD admitted that the exercise was very useful and effective. He noted that there had been a remarkable improvement with respect to target delivery and the level of preparedness as compared to the previous years. He advised officers to ensure that deadlines were met and also to ensure the quality of reports with respect to issues such as dating and ownership. He indicated that he would ensure that all staff participated in the performance management system since it was in the interest of the Ministry. The Ag. CD finally promised to increase the number of management meetings to have more peer reviews to benefit all staff.

Team's Remarks

The Team confirmed that the exercise was a good experience and had offered the opportunity for all to know their strengths and weaknesses so as to increase effectiveness and improve work conditions. Officers were advised on how their actions and inactions could affect the Ag. CD's performance. The Ag. CD was advised to keep his Agreement as a "living" document which provided daily guidance on his work and a schedule officer assigned to manage the implementation process for desired results. The Team was of the opinion that all staff must be oriented to understand the importance of the evaluation/appraisal exercise since this will go a long way to help strengthen the performance management culture in the Ministry and thus the Civil Service.

5.32.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MoVs)
1.	Business Consultative Portal(BCP) developed and launched	• Minutes on the Public Sector stakeholders' consultations on the development of the Ghana Business Portal dated 9th January, 2019. The event was held at Ellking Hotel, Accra. • Inception Report received on the 24th January, 2019 from Indexcom Ltd. On the development and maintenance of an online government portal for interactive public consultation on Business Regulation and related policies in Ghana. CD minute the report on 24th January, 2019 as evidence of review. • Minutes on the Working Group Meeting on the development of the Ghana Business Portal on 30th January, 2019 at BRR Conference Room. • Letter dated 25th March, 2019 inviting stakeholders to a training workshop on Ghana's Business Consultation Portal. Event to be held on 3rd April at the Alisa Hotel, Accra. • Copy of guidelines on the use of the portal dated 30th March, 2019. • Letter dated 20th June, 2019 to (Association of Ghana Industries, Ghana Chamber of Commerce and Industry, Private Enterprises Federation and Ghana Union of Traders Association) requesting for contact details of Council Members and senior officials for registration on the Ghana Business Consultations Portal. • Letter dated 13th May, 2019 inviting MMDAs to a ten-day Certificate Course on Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA). Training was held on Wednesday, 22nd May to 3rd June, 2019 at Fiesta Royale Hotel, Accra. Evidence of CDs review. • Copy of final report for the development and Maintenance of the Ghana Business Consultation Portal received on 24th June, 2019 from Indexcom Ltd. CD minuted the report on 25th June, 2019 as evidence of review. • Copy of publicity brochures on the BCP. CD reviewed and approved final draft. **Regulatory Impact Assessment** • Report on the High Level Retreat on Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA) Policy in Ghana Workshop held at Aqua Safari Hotel,Ada from 6th – 8th May,2019.

		• Copy of letter dated 13th May, 2019 inviting MMDAs to a ten-day Certificate Course on Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA). Training was held on Wednesday, 22nd May to 3rd June, 2019 at Fiesta Royale Hotel, Accra. • Copy Report on the ten (10) day Technical Workshop on Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA) held at Fiesta Royale Hotel, 22nd May to 3rd June, 2019. • Copy of Invitation letter dated 14th August, 2019 and signed by Ag.CD inviting stakeholders to a five-day training of trainers programme in Regulatory Impact Assessment at Coconut Grove Hotel, Accra. • Copy of Memo dated 15th August, 2019 submitting a Handbook for Regulatory Impact Assessment for consideration by Hon. Minister. • Copy of Proposed RIA Policy Framework for Ghana submitted to the Ministry for consideration. • Copy of Terms of Reference (TOR) for consulting Services to Support Pilot Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA) on four (4) key Business Regulations as part of the capacity building of RIA in Ghana. • Copy of Preliminary RIA report on the Non-Adherence to Ethical Standards in the Advertising Industry of Ghana Version of 27th September, 2019. • Copy of Preliminary RIA Report on the right to terminate a contract in Ghana. **E-Registry** • Memo dated 19th November, 2019, from the Team Leader BRR submitting an Inception Report by Indexcom Ltd on the development of the E-Registry Project. • Memo dated 9th November, 2019, from the Team Leader BRR submitting the First Progress Report on the Assembling, Classification and Digitisation of business-related Regulations in Ghana submitted on 19th November, 2019. • Copy of Second Progress Report by on the Assembling, Classification and Digitisation of Business related Regulations in Ghana submitted on 29th November, 2019.
2.	Facilitated access to credit for 60	• Copy of Parliamentary Memo dated 28th February,2019 requesting

	participating factories facilitated (15 each quarter) and incentive package established for IDIF.	Cabinet's approval to grant incentives for IDIF Companies. • Copy of letter dated 3rd May, 2019 from the Parliamentary Service seeking approving the request for waiver of import duties, Import Tax, GETFund Levy, Import NHIL and Exim Levy on plant machinery and equipment or parts as well as corporate tax for five years of operation being tax incentives to support implementation of the 1D1F programme. • Copy of IDIF combined Process Flow chart. • Copies of varied letters dated 13th May – 17th October, 2029 from the Ministry acknowledging receipt of Expression of Interest in the IDIF Programme. • Copies of varied reports dated 26th November, 2019 - on Review and Evaluation of Expression of Interests in the IDIF Programme from the Ministry to the various companies. • Copies of various acceptance letters dated 17th May – 30th December, 2019 from the Ministry informing applicants of their inclusion in the IDIF Programme. • Copies of letters dated 28th February, - 30th December, 2019 from the Ministry introducing participating selected applicants of the IDIF Program to financial institutions for support. • Copy of IDIF National Implementation Map for one hundred and eighty-one (181) projects as at December, 2019. CD commissioned and reviewed report. • Copies of monitoring reports on implementation of the IDIF Program from the various companies dating from October, November and December. • Pictures of commissioning ceremonies for IDIF beneficiary Companies. • A video clip on the launch of a pineapple plantation by Casa De Ropa. • Copy of publicity materials for Ghana Results Fair held from 14th – 16th January, 2020. CD reviewed and approved drafts. • A press statement by the Ministry in response to social media reportage on selected 1D1F projects dated 18th December, 2019.

3.	Launch and implement the Automobile Industry Development Policy.	• Copy of letter dated 11th January, 2019 from the Ministry requesting Cabinet Approval for implementation of the Ghana Automobile Development Policy and Programme. • Copy of letter dated 31st January, 2019 from the Office of the President granting Cabinet Approval for implementation of the Ghana Automobile Development Programme. • Copy of the Ghana Automotive Development Policy dated January, 2019. • Copy of Information Brief for prospective vehicle assemblers under the Ghana Automotive Development Policy (GADP). • Copy of News item (Myjoyonline) and pictures on the launch of the Auto policy. • Copy of letter dated 25th January, 2019 from the Ministry to DVLA nominating a representation to serve on the task team on the GADP. • Copy of Invitation Letter signed to the Chief Executive of Ghana Ports and Harbours Authority dated 15th May, 2019 to a Technical Committee Meeting on the Ghana Automotive Manufacturing Development Programme scheduled for 22nd May, 2019 at 9am at the MOTI Conference Room. • Copy of minutes of the Technical Committee Meeting on the Implementation of the GAMDP held at MoTI on 17th April, 2019. • CD's reviewed list of Members of the Committee to Hon. Minister on 18th April, 2019. • A brief Report on Ghana's participation in the Sub-Saharan African Automotive Sector Orientation workshop programme held from 12th to 16th March, 2019 in Durban, South Africa Minutes of Technical Committee. • Minutes of second Auto Policy Technical Meeting on 24th April, 2019 held at MOTI. • A copy of an Opening Statement by Hon. Alan Kyeremanteng, Minister for Trade and Industry for the Experts meeting on the revised Draft ECOWAS Automotive Industry Policy Framework held on 9th May, 2019 at Mensvic Hotel. • A copy of report on the meeting of Ministers of Industry on Validation of ECOWAS Automotive Industry Policy Framework

		dated 10th May 2019 and approved by the CD on 14th May, 2019. • Copy of Custom (Amendment) Bill, 2019 reflecting fiscal incentives for manufacturers and assemblers under the Auto Development Programme. • Report on the 2nd Preliminary Legislative Hearing of the Ghana Automotive Development Policy held at the Ministry of Finance on 30th September, 2019. • Copy of minutes of Technical Committee Meeting on the Implementation of the Ghana Automobile Development Programme held at the BRR Conference room on 3rd July, 2019. • Copy of letter dated 23rd July, 2019 inviting members to a committee meeting on vehicle finance scheme under the automotive policy on 30th July, 2019. • Copy of letter dated 23rd July, 2019 requesting for senior staff of GRA to participate in a Workshop on 25th July, 2019. • Copy of Minutes of Auto Technical Committee Meeting held at the BRR Conference Room on the 5th of September, 2019. • Copy of Automotive Technical Committee Meeting held at the BRR Conference Room on 9th September, 2019. • Copy of Technical Paper on the case of Ghana Automotive Development Programme dated 19th October, 2019. • Copy of Value Added Tax (Amendment) Act, Act 870, 2019 to support of the Automobile Development Programme. • Copy of Income Tax (Amendment) Act, Act 896, 2019 to support of the Automobile Development Programme. • Copy of Special Import Levy (Amendment) Act, Act 861, 2019 to support of the Automobile Development Programme. • Copy of draft Technical Regulations on Compulsory Vehicle Standards and Homologation. Review comments and Recommendation on approach to enactment.
4	Participation of Exporters in Three (3) International Fairs, Expos and Exhibitions	**China Africa Economic and Trade Expo** • Letter dated 8th March, 2019 from the Ministry accepting invitation from the Chinese Government to participate in the first China-Africa

	facilitated.	Economic and Trade Expo. • Letter dated 28th March, 2019 from the Ministry requesting for representatives to participate in the *first China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo from 27th to 29th June, 2019.*Ag.CD signed the letter. • Letter dated 2nd April, 2019 from the Ministry requesting for pictures and promotional videos for the first China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo. • Invitation letters dated 2nd April, and 4th April, 2019 from the Ministry requesting stakeholders to participate in the first China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo 27th – 29th June, 2019. • Letter dated 8th April, 2019 to the Economic and Commercial Counsellor of the Embassy of the People's Republic of China from the Ministry requesting for support to organise a Business and Investment Forum at the side-lines of the first China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo. • Letter dated 8th May, 2019 from the Ministry requesting for nomination to attend the China-Africa Trade and Economic Trade Expo 2019. • Letters dated 9th May, 2019, from the Ministry requesting for Sponsorship to the Managing Director, GIHOC Distilleries and Chief Executive Ghana Exim Bank to participate in the First China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo 2019. • Copy of order received through email correspondence from a participant of the First China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo 2019 dated 26th July, 2019. • Memorandum by SCO/ Export Trade dated 23rd July, 2019 forwarding Report on 1st China-Africa Economic and Trade Expo. Ag. CD's review and approval. • Copy of Memo from S.C.O dated 19th June, 2019 to Ag. CD requesting for funds to clear and transport Exhibits from Shanghai to the Expo Ground in Changsha. ***Tea Expo*** • Copy of report on Ghana's participation in the 3rd China International Tea Expo 2019 reviewed and approved by Ag CD on 20th June, 2019.

		Dubai Expo • Copy of letter dated 4th February, 2019 from the Ministry inviting the National Planning Committee (NPC) of the Dubai Expo 2020 to a meeting at the Ministry's Conference Room on 6th February, 2019. • Copy of letter dated 11th February, 2019 from the Ministry inviting stakeholders to the Expo 2020 Dubai Stakeholders Workshop from 12th – 16th February, 2019 at Alisa Hotel. • Copy of the programme for Expo Dubai 2020 Technical Team Visit to Ghana on a theme statement workshop from 13th -16th February, 2019. • Letter dated 13th June, 2019 from the Ministry forwarding brochure and leaflets on the Dubai 2020; District 2020 Country Programme. • Memo dated 19th December, 2019 from Senior Commercial Officer, Export Trade to Ag. Chief Director. • Copy of draft brochure and exhibition design concept for Dubai Expo 2020.
	Participation in Made in Ghana promotional fairs and campaigns facilitated.	• Letter dated 6th February, 2019 from the Ministry to the MFARI on preparation towards the celebration of Ghana's 62nd Independence Anniversary-Addis Ababa and Copy of the report of the celebration. • Memo dated 7th October, 2019 from Assistant Commercial Officer, Domestic Trade to Ag. Chief Director requesting for support to participate in the Kumasi Street Fair. Ag. CD's minute of approval on 8th October, 2019. • Memo dated 21st October, 2019 forwarding a copy of report on Kumasi Street Fair. • Letter dated 29th March, 2019 from Imgaine8 Company Ltd. Inviting the Ministry to participate in the Second Kwahu Easter Donkomi Trade Fair – Kwahu Dwaso from 17th – 22nd April, 2019 at Kwahu - Mpreaso High Street. • Memo dated 12th April, 2019 from Team Leader, Domestic Trade requesting for DSA and a Vehicle to participate in the Kwahu Easter Donkomi Fair. • Report on the Second Kwahu Easter Donkomi Trade Fair – Kwahu Dwaso at Kwahu - Mpreaso High Street from 17th – 22nd April, 2019.

		• Memo dated 10th June, 2019 from PCO/Domestic Trade requesting for logistics to attend a Trade Exhibition from 17th – 22nd April, 2019 at the GTFC, Accra. • Copy of Invitation letter to the Ghana Trade Exhibition 2019 dated 4th March, 2019 minuted on by Ag CD. • Copy of report on the 2019 Ghana Trade Exhibition (GTE) held at the Ghana International Trade Fair Centre from 14th to 15th June, 2019.
5.	AfCFTA implemented	• Copy of letter dated 12th March, 2019 from the Ministry Expressing Ghana's Interest to Host the AfCFTA Secretariat signed by Ag CD. • Portfolio of Bid documents and submissions prepared by MoTI Internal Committee chaired by Ag.CD. Ghana's Bid to Host the Secretariat of The African Continental Free trade area (AfCFTA, Proposal for Hosting the AfCFTA Secretariat in Ghana; Pictures of bid Submissions) Programme; Visit of Evaluation Team – 13th – 16th May, 2019. • Copy of letter dated 15th May, 2019 from the Ministry submitting completed questionnaires and supporting Documents on Ghana's Bid to Host the AfCFTA secretariat in Ghana. • Minutes of Meetings held on 27th March, 2019 in Chief Director's office of collaboration with MFARI in preparing for Bid Evaluation Mission by AUC. • Minutes of Meetings held on 1st April, 2019 in Chief Director's office on bid Strategy. • Pitch video commissioned by MoTI to support Ghana's bid to host the AfCFTA Secretariat. • Evidence of announcement of Ghana's successful bid at the 12th Extraordinary session of the Assembly, on 7th July, 2019, Niamey, Niger. • Copy of report on Technical Assessment of facilities by AUC on Safety and Security in Accra Ghana on 23rd August, 2019. • Copy of Draft Hosting Agreement. • Copy of Drawings of AfCFTA Secretariat designs and specifications commissioned by Ag. CD. • Copies of letters dated 15th and 16th August, 2019 from the Ministry

		inviting stakeholders to participate in the AfCFTA Conference. • Memo dated 17th August, 2019 from Ag. CD inviting team leaders of MOTI to participate in the AfCFTA Conference. • Copy of Programme for the AfCFTA Conference on 19th -21st August, 2019. • Copy of letter dated 9th July, 2019 Constituting an Inter-Ministerial Committee for the Secretariat of the AfCFTA. • Copy of letter dated 15th July, 2019 from the Ministry inviting the Inter-Ministerial Committee for the AfCFTA for a meeting on 17th July, 2019. • Copy of letter dated 4th August, 2019 from the Ministry inviting the Inter-Ministerial Committee for the AfCFTA for a meeting on 15th August, 2019 signed by Ag. CD. • Letter dated 8th March, 2019 from Ministry to Linda Aaslien, Programme Director-Trade Advocacy Fund (TAF) requesting for Technical Support from the UKAID Trade Advocacy Fund for implementation of the AfCFTA. • Copy of letter dated 29th May, 2019 from the Ministry introducing - Dr. Max Mendez-Parra to the Ghana High Commissioner in London, UK RI facilitate the visa application process for the Senior Trade Advisor engaged to undertake scoping study for Technical Support. • Copy of letter dated 25th June, 2019 from the Ministry to stakeholders requesting for a meeting to discuss the Capacity Constraints in the implementation of AfCFTA from 17th – 21st July, 2019. • Invitation letters dated 5th December, 2019 from the Ministry to the Hon. Minister, Lands and Natural Resources to open the specialised Technical Committee on Industry, Trade and Minerals. • Request for review of the Draft Host Agreement between the AU and the government of Ghana for Hosting of the AfCFTA Meetings in Accra, Ghana 9th – 15th December, 2019 from the AU Office to the Ag. CD. • Draft Agreement between Government of Ghana and the African Union on Material and Technical Organisation of the Meeting of the Negotiating Forum (NF), Specialised Technical Committee-Trade, Industry and Mining, Senior Trade Officials (STOS), African Ministers of Trade (AMOT) and the Council of Ministers in Accra,

		Ghana. • Letter dated 6th December, 2019 from the Ministry inviting H. E. the President to the opening Ceremony of the tenth meeting of the African Union ministers of Trade (AMOT) in Accra on Saturday, 14th December, 2019. • Copy of draft programme for meeting of Senior Officials on 9th December, 2019. • Copy of draft programme for meeting of Ministers on 10th December, 2019. • Copy of Calendar of the Activities of the DTI from 5th to 9th December, 2019. • List of Internal Taskforce and Committees established by Ag.CD. (AMOT Meetings Task force Team list). • Letter dated 1st November, 2019 from the Ministy submitting list of Multi-Disciplinary task Teams for the Establishment of the AfCFTA Secretariat in Accra Ghana signed by Ag. CD. • Copy of letter dated 19th November, 2019 submitting Grant concept note and request for Regional Funding from African Development Bank and signed by Ag. CD.
6.	National Quality Policy and Revised Ghana Standards Authority Bill amended submitted to Cabinet and Parliament respectively for approval.	• Memo dated 29th April, 2019 and signed by Ag.CD to Director/Standards, PCO/MBRT,PIPO/SAI, SIPO/PPMED inviting them to a meeting to review a Cabinet Memo on Ghana Standard Amendment Bill and National Quality Policy from 4th – 5th May, 2019 at the Alisa Hotel. • Copy of National Quality Policy dated 26th June, 2019. • Copy of Cabinet Memo on Ghana Standard Authority Bill dated 3rd May, 2019.

5.33 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Sanitation and Water Resources

5.33.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected six (6) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of ten (10). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table103 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **53.1** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 103: Performance of CD, Sanitation andWater Resources in Schedule 1

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Development and Improvement of Water Facilities and Delivery	Facilitated the Construction of Yendi Water Supply Project Facilitate the construction of the Upper East Water Supply Project	• Facilitate the preparation of Parliamentary Memorandum for the loan agreement • Facilitate meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on Finance • Facilitate meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on Works and Housing • Facilitate Parliamentary Approval of Tax Waivers • Review progress report • Undertake site visit	**Target achieved.** The Target is definitely not clear. All that has happened in the phase of the project is to ensure that the loan facility is obtained. No construction activity has started. Preparation of Parliamentary Memorandum for the loan agreement done. Facilitated meeting with the Parliamentary committee on Works and Housing. Waivers have been granted. **Target achieved in terms of monitoring of the project**.	10	9.7

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Monitored Facilitated the Construction of Tamale and Damongo Water Supply Project	• Facilitate the preparation of Cabinet Memorandum • Facilitate submission of Cabinet Memorandum • Facilitate the preparation of Parliamentary Memorandum for the loan agreement • Facilitate meeting with Parliamentary Select Committee on Finance • Facilitate Parliamentary Approval	Progress report by the Consultant available but not reviewed. Report of site visits available. **Target achieved.** Parliamentary approval received for the loan facility for the construction of Tamale and Damongo Water Supply Project.		
2.	Providing Household and institutional Toilet Facilities	1. Facilitated the Provision of 1,200 Household and 50 Institutional Toilets and Monitored	• Review Monitoring Reports • Undertake site visit • Facilitate the release of funds	**Target achieved.** 1,200 Household and 50 Institutional Toilets provided and monitored and report available. No evidence of review.	10	9
3.	Development and Improvement of Solid Waste	1. Facilitated the Purchase of 100 acre Parcel of Land for the	• Facilitate site visit • Facilitate the	**Target achieved.** This is a World Bank sponsored	10	10

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
	Facilities	Development of Engineered Landfill site	meetings with land owners • Ensure the participation of Lands Commission • Facilitate the procurement of land • Facilitate release of funds	project All land acquisition activities undertaken. Processed the amount involved for the payment of the land. Access to the land given to the Ministry by the land owners.		
4.	Strengthening the Sanitation Policy Framework	Facilitated the Preparation of the Consolidated Sanitation Strategy	• Facilitate the procurement of a consultant • Facilitate the organisation of consultative meetings • Facilitate final review and validation meeting • Facilitate the release of funds	**Target not achieved.** Consultant not procured but in-house resources used to prepare Draft Consolidated Sanitation Strategy. Document yet to be subject to validation.	10	6
5.	Promoting behavioural and attitudinal change among the citizenry on sanitation	Facilitated the roll-out of the National Sanitation Tour Programme	• Facilitate the procurement of logistics • Facilitate the social gatherings in GAMA	**Target not achieved.** Though target related to the whole country, tour was only done in GAMA and Ashanti Region.	10	9.4

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Review monitoring reports • Undertake an evaluation of the activities of the Assemblies on sanitation	Only report on GAMA aspect of tour available. **Target achieved.** 5,000 No. litter bins for major streets in GAMA distributed. Distribution list available.		
		Facilitated the provision of 4,000 No. litter bins for major streets in GAMA Facilitated Media Engagement and Involvement in Attitudinal Change	• Facilitate the release of funds • Facilitate the procurement of 4,000 No. waste bins • Facilitate distribution of waste bins • Facilitate release of funds • Facilitate the organisation of two press conferences • Facilitate the launch of Toilet Jama Competition • Facilitate Training Workshop for Media personnel	**Target achieved.** Two (2) press conferences held Held Toilet Jama Competition and report available Training for media personnel undertaken		

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Ensure Release of Funds			
6.	Strengthening Transboundary Water Resources Management	Volta Basin Authority (VBA) Conference Organised Facilitated the Ratification of UN Conventions on the uses of Water Courses	• Approve composition of committee and facilitate meetings • Facilitate payment of VBA country contributions • Facilitate organisation of VBA conference • Review Speech for Hon. Minister • Facilitate the drafting of a Cabinet Memo • Submit Cabinet Memo to Cabinet Secretariat • Facilitate the drafting of Parliamentary Memo • Submit Parliamentary Memo to parliament	**Target achieved.** Volta Basin Authority (VBA) Conference Organised but no report available. **Target achieved.** Ratification of UN Conventions on the uses of Water Courses signed and document available.	10	9

No.	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Facilitate Parliamentary Joint Committee meeting on memo • Submit Parliamentary Approval to Ministry of Foreign Affairs for drafting of instruments of Accession			
Sub-Total					**53.1**	

5.33.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **19.59** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 104: Performance of CD, Sanitation and Water Resources in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**2.5**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 22nd February, 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• No assessment.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• No follow up.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 14th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**1.5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Two (2) meetings held and minutes dated 20th March and 28th November, 2019 available. • Summary of action **not** available.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved. c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA 15th January, 2019. • Held ETC meetings and minutes available • **Not** available • Though Final Accounts were supposed to have been submitted to the CAGD, copy of forwarding letter was not available for confirmation.		
KRA 3: HR Management h. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS i. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal j. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized k. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Draft Organization Manual not sighted and not made available as promised. • Updated staff list **not** sighted. • Individualized job schedules for all staff dated 2019 available. • Establishment levels **not** available. • 2018 Appraisals available **not** submitted to OHCS. • Reports on the planning and mid-year phases not available. • No signing with Directors • No evaluation undertaken.	**10**	**7.965**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
l. Training programmes m. Management of discipline n. Report on staff movements	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process emailed to OHCS on 27th March 2019. • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 26th July and 24th December 2019 respectively. • Reports on staff attendance was available. • 2019 Annual Report on staff discipline dated December 2019 available. Copies of queries to officers. • 2019 Annual Staff Movement Report available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 7th November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • No meeting held.	**2**	**0.5**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Revised Service Charter dated 2019 available with evidence of MSDs participation in the review process. • Service Charter of GWCL available • Designated office space for the CSU available.	4	**3.25**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• CSU officers not trained • Mid & end of year reports available but **not** submitted to OHCS • Functional website, Facebook available • Reports on quarterly website updates available • Brochure available		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level c. Management/Staff engagements	• Innovations in organizational operations – additional office created for the Chief Accountant to ease work at the Accounts office. • Created a platform – Ghana Sanitation Thinkers platform – lot of information is received. National working group of Sanitation, Emergency WASH • Media Tracking- Daily news compilations on Water and Sanitation. • Minutes of nine (9) Management Meetings sighted • No Staff durbars held. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen – breast cancer screening for male and female staff. • No health/well-being for staff report available. • Internal of information posted on notice boards, management WhatsApp, memos.	**5**	**3.875**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives e. Management of physical environment	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD not available. • Evidence of training for records officers not available. • Digni-loo installed Ministries. • Refurbishment undertaken in some officers. • Engaged the Ghana Fire Service – Fire audit, conducted training to staff.		
Overall Total		**19.59**	

5.33.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 105 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 105: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Sanitation and Water Resources

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	High Level Key Issues Sustainable Development Goals	Attend conference	Participated in the 10th Annual Conference of Chairpersons of governing Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and Chief Executives of the Ghana Public Services from 17th – 20th October, 2019 at Koforidua.
2	Water Management	Participate in Conference	Participated in Amsterdam Water Week in November, 2019.
3	Deepen knowledge in Public Management	Facilitate at GIMPA	Facilitated Diploma in Public Administration at GIMPA from 27th May – 16th August, 2019.
4	Deepen Knowledge in	Attend training	Budget training with Ministry of Finance

	financial management		on the 2020 budget.
5	Public Sector Management and Administrative Skills needed	Attend training	Attended GIFMIS training meeting in March, 2019.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.33.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **82.690** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.33.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD expressed his appreciation to the Team for the thorough work done and the observations made. He said he had taken note of all the comments and hoped to address them. The CD indicated that the exercise had been a learning curve and a good experience. Even though he had observed the process from his former office, he now noticed its intensity as he was faced with the realities. He promised to work and do better in the ensuing years.

Team's Remarks

The Team expressed its gratitude to the CD and his staff for the interaction. They said that though the exercise was being scored, what mattered most was the learning that was associated with the exercise. It was hoped that the CD and his staff would take note of all the comments that had been made to help them in their work. The CD and his staff were advised to put some system in place to ensure the deliverables with timelines were noted and acted on in the course of the year. Basically, the Agreement should guide the work of the Ministry.

5.33.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Facilitated the Construction of Yendi Water Supply Project	• Memo dated 4th January, 2010from the Ag. CD to the Director F&A on the joint Parliamentary Memo on Yendi Water Supply project. • Letter dated 10th January, 2019 to the Secretary to Cabinet submitting additional information on Yendi Water Project for Cabinet consideration. • Letter dated 31st January, 2019 from the Minister to the Hon

		Minister MoF on the Joint Parliamentary Memorandum on the Yendi Water Supply Project. • Letter dated 7th February, 2019 inviting the Managing Director – GWCL to a meeting with the Parliamentary Select Committee.
	Construction of the Upper East Water Supply Project Monitored	• Letter dated 12th November, 2019 to the Managing Director, GWCL responding to a submission of review of progress report – upper east water supply project.
	Facilitated the Construction of Tamale and Damongo Water Supply Project	• Copy of letter forwarding Cabinet dated 20th February, 8th May, 13th May, and 22nd May, 2019. • Copy of Parliamentary Memo dated 5th June, 2019 from the Ag. CD to Director F&A on the Joint Cabinet Memo on Tamale Water Supply project. • Letter dated 22nd July, 2019 from the Parliamentary Service to the loan Agreement on the Loan.
2.	Facilitated the Provision of 1,200 Household and 50 Institutional Toilets and Monitored	• Monitoring report dated 16th September, 2019 to the Project Coordinator GAMA-SWP, submitting report on the verification of the Institutional School toilets being constructed by the GAMA-SWP. • Letter dated 5th February, 2019 to the Hon. Minister of Education on a visit to institutional Toilet facilities constructed under the Greater Accra Metro area sanitation and Water Project (GAMA – SWP). • Letter dated 4th September, 2019 from PRO to CD requesting for logistic to embark on a working visit to MMDA in the Greater Accra Region to ascertain the current sanitation situation. • Memo dated 28th Nov., 2019 from the CD to Dir. EHSD discussing the report.
3.	Facilitated the Purchase of 100 acre Parcel of Land for the Development of Engineered Landfill site	• Minutes of meeting dated 13th, 18th June and 24th July, 2019. • Correspondence with Lands Commission dated 2nd May, 24th September, 11th and 21st October, 2019. • Contract document dated 25th October, 2019. • Letter dated 15th November, 2019.
4.	Facilitated the Preparation of the Consolidated Sanitation Strategy	• Letter dated 13th June, 2019 to the Managing Director, Rexel Investment Ltd responding to a letter. • Letter dated 2nd May, 2019 from the Land Commission – Land Valuation Division responding to request for Land Valuation. • Letter 24th September, 2019 to the Bank of Ghana, Lands Registry requesting for a search acquisition of a Land at

		Aydan in the Greater Accra Region. • Letter dated 21st October, 2019 from Land Commission responding to a request for a search. • Letter dated 25th October, 2019 to PPA requesting for approval to use single source procurement method to procure a 65.5 acre Land at Ayidan in the Greater Accra Region. • Letter dated 15th November, 2019 to MoF requesting for payment – Purchase of a 65.5 acre Land at Ayidan in the Greater Accra Region. • Memo dated 5th April, 2019 from the Ag. Director, EHSD to CD submitting the sanitation strategy.
5.	Facilitated the roll-out of the National Sanitation Tour Programme	• Memo dated 4th September, 2019 from PRO to CD requesting for logistics to embark on visits. • Letter dated 5th September, 2019 requesting for an Official bus from MWH to undertaken the working visit. • Various letters to the MMDAs informing them of the working visit to selected MMDAs in Greater Accra Metro area. • Various letters to Korle Klottey Municipal Assembly and other Assemblies informing them about the visits by the Hon Minister. • Memo dated 20th November, 2019 from the Ag. Director, EHSD to CD submitting report on findings of the Tour.
	Facilitated the provision of 4,000 No. litter bins for major streets in GAMA	• Memo dated 24th June, 2019 from Principal Pro. Officer to Ag. CD submitting contract Agreements to supply and installation of 240 Litre wheeled bins with metal protection cage, IFT No: MSWR/GOG/NCT.02/19. • Letter dated 13th September, 2019 to all stakeholder on the use of space on the street litter bins for Commercial Advert. • Letter dated 22nd May, 2019 inviting stakeholders to the launch of Public Litter Bins. • Letter dated 1st August, 2019 to MoF requesting for payment for the bins.
	Facilitated Media Engagement and Involvement in Attitudinal Change	• Memo dated 5th September, 2019 for PRO thru' CD to Hon Minister requesting for interview with Graphic TV. • Memo dated 5th September, 2019 for PRO thru' CD to HM proposing press briefing by Hon Minister on the 2019 World Water Week forum in Sweden. • Memo dated 22nd August, 2019 from Dir. EHSD to CD submitting reports – outdooring of toilet Jama competition. • Campaign against open defecation in schools dated September, 2019.

		• Follow up training on WASH Journalists from 19th – 21st December, 2019.
6.	Volta Basin Authority (VBA) Conference Organised	• Letter dated 12th February, 2019 to the Exec. Director. Water Resources Commission on the 7th Session of the Volta Basin Authority Council of Minister's Conference. • Letter dated 27th Feb., 2019 to the CAGD requesting for release of funds to the Volta Basin Authority. • Various letters on the conference Local Organizing Committee meeting.
	Facilitated the Ratification of UN Conventions on the uses of Water Courses	• Letter dated 20th May, 2019 submitting the Cabinet Memo of the Accession to the Cabinet Secretariat. • Letter dated 8th August, 2019 to the Ex. Secretary Water Resources Commission on the Accession to the UN Water Courses Convention and the UNECE Convention on the projection and use of transboundary watercourse and international lakes. • Letter dated 9th September, 2019 to the Clerk to Parliament submitting Parliamentary Memo Accession to the UN Water Courses Convention and the UNECE Convention on the projection and use of transboundary watercourse and international lakes.

5.34 Performance of the Ag. Chief Director, Ministry of Transport

5.34.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Ag. Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 106 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The Ag**.** CD obtained a score of **53.9** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 106: Performance of Ag. CD, Transport in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Role	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Improve Road Safety	Passage of National Road Safety Authority Bill coordinated	• Liaise with Attorney-General's Office to submit draft Bill to Parliament • Liaise with Parliament for passage of the Bill	**Target achieved.** The Bill has been passed by Parliament and assented by His Excellency the President. Act 993, Act 2019. The Attorney-General's Office submitted the draft Bill to Parliament through the Clerk of Parliament.	12	12
2.	Strengthening road transport service Regulations	Ten (10) Regional Stakeholder consultations on the use of motorcycles and tricycles for commercial purposes organised	• Solicit funds for the consultations • Facilitate the organization of Regional consultative meetings • Review the regional reports on stakeholder consultations	**Target achieved** Ten (10) Regional Stakeholder Consultations held and a composite report available. Facilitated the mobilization of funds for the Regional consultations on the use of motorcycles and tricycles. Evidence of review of Workshop report by CD seen.	12	12

3.	Improving Public Transport Services	1. Construction of Tudu BRT Terminal completed and procurement of Facility Manger initiated 2. Facility Manager for Adenta BRT Terminal procured	• Facilitate release of funds • Facilitate the organization of the handing over ceremony of the BRT terminals • Finalise the procurement of facility manager for Adenta BRT Terminal • Initiate the procurement of Facility Manager for the Tudu BRT terminals • Monitor the operations of Facility Managers • Brief Hon. Minister (HM)	**Target not achieved** The Tudu BRT terminal construction works completed. The procurement process for the Facility Manager for Tudu BRT terminal is currently on-going. Handing over and Project completion reports not authored and dated available. **Target achieved.** Facility manager for Adenta procured and Contract signed. No monitoring report was available since the facility was handed over in December.	12	10.5
4	Improving landing facilities for fishing communities	Facilitated the construction of ten (10) Coastal Fish Landing Site	• Liaise with MoF for the signing of the Loan Agreement • Review and submit quarterly monitoring template to	**Target achieved.** Financing for the project secured and work has begun at eight (8) of the landing sites. Loan Agreement Document signed. Templates for four (4) quarters completed and submitted to the Ministry of M&E with no evidence of CDs Review.	12	11

			Ministry of M&E			
5.	Strengthening institutional framework	Reviewed National Transport Policy (NTP) finalized and submitted to Cabinet	• Review the final draft of the revised NTP and implementation plan • Review Cabinet Memo on Revised NTP • Finalize Cabinet Memo and submit to Cabinet	**Target not achieved** Document revised through consultative meetings with no evidence of CDs review. A joint Cabinet Memo prepared but yet to be submitted for consideration by Cabinet. Review of documents undertaken electronically.	12	8.4
Sub-Total					**53.9**	

5.34.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The **Ag.** CD obtained a score of **29.025** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 107: Performance of Ag. Chief Director, Transport in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	**Performance - Observation**	**Score**	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 13th August, 2019 instead of February 2019.	**4**	**3.75**
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 19th August 2019.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
copy forwarded to the OHCS			
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 13th September, 2019 and approval granted.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Report available but not dated.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 22nd January 2020 instead of 15th January 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries.	• Minutes of four (4) quarterly Audit Committee Meetings dated 7th March, 20th June and 3rd September, and 17th December, 2019 seen. • There was report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the Committee		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. Memo dated 21st Jan., 2019 • Minutes of Entity Tender Committee Meeting dated 19th – 21st January, 29th October, 11th and 23rd December, 2019.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor.	• Available. Signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.3**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual Dated (2017) available.		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list available.		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff available.		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels available/updated and forwarded to OHCS.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 13th Feb., 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal instrument were available but not forwarded to OHCS.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report available and submitted to OHCS on 27th May 2019. • Evaluation report submitted on 4th February 2020 instead of by 30th January, 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process submitted to OHCS on 5th March, 2019. • Mid and end year reports and submitted to OHCS on 19th		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
f. Management of discipline g. Report on staff movements	July, 2019 and 15th January, 2020 respectively. • Monthly reports from January – December available. • Disciplinary report available but not dated. • Composite analysed reports available but not dated. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 12th December, 2019 instead of November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meetings dated 3rd June , 29th July, 31st October and 20th December, 2019 available	**2**	**2**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives a. Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Revised Service Charter available with evidence of MSD/OHCS participation in the review process. • Letter dated 24th January, 2020 requesting for approval from the Civil Service Council available • Service Charter for Ghana Maritime Authority, Shippers Authority and State Transport Corporation available • Designated office space for the CSU available • CSU officers trained at the CSTC	**4**	**4**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 15th July 2019 and 31st Dec., 2019 respectively • Functional website, Facebook, and engagement with Media • Reports on quarterly website updates available • Brochures and flyers available		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**4.975**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Digitization of records.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Monitoring through feedback from the press. Some of the Agencies at the local level and the Transport Associations. • Media Tracking- Content summaries and Analysis of Newspapers available but not authored.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of Twelve (12) Management Meetings available. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars available. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen. • Report on Medical Screening and Sensitization of staff available. • Catalogue of information posted on notice boards, WhatsApp page.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available. • Evidence of training for records officers available. Back to office report on Records Mgt. training sighted.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Pavement of Car Park and renovation of the Office block. Installation of energy saving air conditioners. Signage provided at the main entrance of the building. • The Ministry has engaged the services of a private cleaning company.		
Overall Total		**29.025**	

5.34.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The Ag**.** CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance her knowledge and improve her capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 108 below. The Ag.CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 108: Personal Capacity Development Plan for Ag. CD, Transport

NO.	COMPETENCIES/SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Project Financing	Participate in Conference	Participated 14th CII-Exim Bank Conclave on India-Africa Project Partnership Conference. Back to office report available.
2	Management and operations of Private Vehicle Testing	Participate in a Study tour	Participated in Study tour in Sweden on consultancy for feasibility study to license

	Stations		private garages. Back to office report available.
3	Port efficiency and delivery	Participate in Conference	Participated in a Ministerial conference on Fishing Vessel Safety and illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing (Torremolinos Conference on the Cape Town Agreement). Back to office report available.
4	Policy Development and Cabinet Memo writing	Attend workshop	Participated in hands on training for the preparation of Cabinet Memos and policy formulation from 26th -20th August and back to Office report available.
5	Leadership and Public Sector Management	Attend Conference	Attended the first National Conference of the Ghana Association for Public Administration and Management (GAPAM) held at Cape Coast from 17th -18th July 2019 and back to Office report available.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.34.4 Overall Performance

The Ag. Chief Director obtained an overall score of **92.925** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.34.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The Ag. CD was grateful to have participated in the exercise and expressed hope at seeing minimal bureaucracy in the Civil Service through improved work flow systems. She informed the Evaluators of the introduction of an internal mail tracking system that had been developed to improve on mail management. She recommended the introduction of an on-line evaluation system to minimise the paper work the current evaluation exercise generated.

Team's Remarks

The Team mentioned that the exercise was not meant to be punitive but was to help officers discover their strengths and weaknesses as well as improve their effectiveness and efficiency. It was also meant to hold staff accountable for their actions and generally promote the performance management culture in the Service. They

welcomed any process or activity in the Civil Service which would promote a paperless Civil Service and would be willing to work with such an arrangement.

The Team further advised the Ag. CD to keep the Performance Agreement as a living document – not one to be set aside and visited only during the mid and end of the year exercises but one which guided her in her day-to-day activities. All Officers were advised to take their roles seriously since their inefficiencies could negatively affect the CD's performance. Documentary evidence was key to the process and reports should always be dated and authored. The Team advised the Ag. CD to appoint a schedule officer to monitor the implementation of her agreement and give her regular feedback. The Evaluators were of the view that all correspondence going out of the Ministry, especially those relating to the Agreement, should be reviewed by the Ag. CD before they left the Ministry.

Meeting with the Hon. Minister

The Minister expressed his satisfaction with the decision made to bring the CD on board. He admitted that being her first time to occupy such a position, she was likely to have challenges but with the support and guidance from her team she had managed to give off her best. The Hon. Minister mentioned that he was happy with her work output. However, one weakness he had identified was that she was very cautious in dealing with staff faults because she did not want to offend anyone. He was sure she would overcome this with time.

The Hon. Minister confirmed his involvement in the selection of targets stated in the Performance Agreement. The Minister informed the Team about the construction of the landing sites for which funding had been secured and H.E. the President had cut the sod for the commencement of the project. According to him, the communities involved will benefit from social amenities such as schools, toilets, roads etc.

He also commended his team for work done in the Volta Lake where a lot of the tree stumps had been removed thereby contributing towards accident reduction on the Lake by 90%.

He finally announced the introduction of measures, such as, fixing street and traffic lights as well as hotlines for passenger vehicles where reckless drivers could be reported to their Associations for immediate action.

The Hon. Minister thanked the Evaluation Team and admitted that the exercise was useful in holding Officers accountable.

5.34.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MoVs)
1.	Passage of National Road Safety Authority Bill coordinated	• Letter dated 4th April, 2019 from Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice forwarding the Draft Bill to Parliament through the Clerk of Parliament. • Memo dated 22nd April, 2019 from Ag. Director, RSIM to the Chief Director on proposed date for the winnowing session with Parliament. With CDs review.

		• Letter dated 13th May, 2019 inviting Parliamentarians to take part in the National Road Safety Authority Bill at Mac Dic Hotel in Koforidua from 16th -18th May, 2019. • Report dated 3rd June on winnowing session with Parliament and stakeholders available. • Copy of Act available for verification.
2.	Ten (10) Regional Stakeholder consultations on the use of motorcycles and tricycles for commercial purposes organised	• Memo dated 12th February, 2019 from Director, PPME through Chief Director to the Hon. Minister on proposed budget for stakeholder engagement on the use of motorcycle and tricycle for commercial use. • Memo dated 4th March, 2019 from Director PPME to the CD forwarding the under listed correspondences: ➢ Letters dated 4th March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to the Chief Executive of Drivers and Vehicle Licensing Authority for financial support for the stakeholder engagement on the use of motorcycle and tricycle for commercial use. ➢ Letters dated 4th March, 2019 signed from the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to the Director-General of National Road Safety Commission requesting for financial support. ➢ Letter dated 21st March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to the Board Chairman, National Road Safety Commission for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 22nd March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Brong Ahafo, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 22nd March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Ashanti, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 21st March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Eastern, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 22nd March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Western, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop.

		➢ Letter dated 21st March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Volta, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 22nd March, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Central, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 20th May, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Upper East, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 20th May, 2019 signed the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Upper West, Regional Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. ➢ Letter dated 20th May, 2019 signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Northern Region Coordinating Director for a stakeholder consultative workshop. • Memo dated 5th November, 2019 to CD forwarding the undated consolidated report of stakeholder consultations workshop on the use of motorcycles and tricycle for fare paying passengers. • A reviewed consolidated report by the Chief Director on the Regional stakeholder consultations workshop. • Email correspondence in 2019 between the Ministry and the Research for Community Access Partnership (ReCAP) programme on funding for consultations on the motorcycle operations.
3.	Construction of Tudu BRT Terminal completed and procurement of Facility Manger initiated Facility Manager for Adenta BRT Terminal pro	• Letter dated 26th February, 2019, signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Minister of Finance requesting for Sixtieth utilization of USD410,153.90, Sixty-First utilization of USD24,609.23, • Letter dated 15th March, 2019, signed by the Chief Director of the Ministry of Transport to Minister of Finance requesting for Sixty-Second utilization of USD 387,220.47, Sixty-Third utilization of USD 207,797.38, Sixty-Fourth utilization of USD 10,765.39. • Letter dated 25th February, 2019, signed by the Chief Director to the Regional Manager, Scania West Africa for construction of bus terminal at Adenta: Interim payment certificate No. 14. • Letter dated 4th April, 2019, signed by the Chief Director to Scania CV AB on construction of bus terminal at Adenta.

		• Letter dated 8th April, 2019 signed by the Chief Director to Scania CV AB on construction of bus terminal and infrastructure works for the Bus Rapid System at Adenta. • Letter dated 1st July, 2019, signed by the Chief Director to the project Management team inviting them to the Final inspection and handover of completed BRT infrastructure works (Adenta and Accra terminals and Achimota workshop). • Handing over of facility Report undated and unauthored. • Project completion Report of Tudu Bus Rapid Terminal undated and unauthored. • Letter dated 15th August, 2019 from Chief Director to Managing Director, Finest Company Ltd on Notification of Contract Award for Adenta Bus Terminal. • Memo dated 8th October, 2019 from Director, PPME thru Chief Director to the Hon. Minister on contract for the provision of property management services for the Adenta Bus Rapid Transit Terminal. • Signed Contract / Agreement dated 10th October, 2019 between Ministry of Transport and Finest Company Limited. • Newspaper advert on competitive tender for management of Accra Tudu bus rapid transit (BRT) Terminal published in the newspapers dated April, 2019. • Memo dated 5th February, 2019 requesting for proposal for Property Management Services for the Accra-Tudu Bus Rapid Transit Terminal and Nos. MOT/BRT/ACC-TUDU//2019. Issued in March, 2019. CDs review sighted. • Letter dated 26th June, 2019 signed by the Chief Director constituting an Evaluation and Negotiation Panel for Tudu and Adenta Terminals. • Memo dated 15th October, 2019 from Director PPME to CD submitting Evaluation Report on Accra-Tudu Bus Rapid Transit Terminal.
4.	Facilitated the construction of ten (10) Coastal Fish Landing Sites **(Abura Asebu**	• Letter 29th March, 2019 from the MoF inviting the Ministry of Transport to the signing ceremony of the Loan. • Loan Document (Agreement signed on 3rd April, 2019) between Ghana, represented by Ministry of Finance and China Development Bank. • Letter dated 9th May, 2019 inviting the under listed to a stakeholders'

	Kwamankese District Constituency, Nsema East Municipal Assembly, Gomoa West District, Gomoa East District Ahanta West Municipal Assembly and Constituency, Komenda Edna Eguafo Abrem District, Efutu Municipal and Awutu Senya West District)	sensitization on the construction of landing sites: ➢ Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture. ➢ Greater Accra Regional Coordinating Council. ➢ Ledzokuku Municipal Assembly. • Memo dated 20th May, 2019 from CD to Hon. Minister submitting Cabinet Information Paper on the visit to the Coastal Fish Landing sites. • Letter dated 29th May, 2019 from the OOP responding to the Information Paper submitted. • Quarterly implementation of flagship programmes template dated 3rd July, 2019 (only 3 quarters sighted). • Letter dated 25th September, and 1st October, 2019 inviting the under listed to a consultation workshop: ➢ Abura Asebu Kwamankese District ➢ Mp, Abura Asebu Kwamankese constituency ➢ Nzema East District Assembly ➢ Gomoa West District ➢ Ahanta West Municipal ➢ MP, Ahanta West Municipal ➢ Awutu Senya West District ➢ Gomoa East District Assembly ➢ MP, Awutu Senya West Constituency
5.	Reviewed National Transport Policy (NTP) finalized and submitted to Cabinet	• Revised NTP document (MOT/IDA/TSP/CQS/S/2) dated December, 2019. But no review sighted. • Joint Cabinet Memo with Ministry of Aviation developed. But no review sighted. • Letter dated 16thDecember, 2019 signed by the Hon. Minister submitting a joint Cabinet Memorandum on the revised National Transport Policy to Ministry of Aviation.

5.35 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Works and Housing

5.35.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected eight (8) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of seven point five (7.5). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 109 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **59.54** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 109: Performance of Chief Director, Works and Housing in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	**Awarded**
1.	Improving the management and regulatory framework for the Housing Sub-Sector	**Redevelopment Policy implemented. Completed and submitted the** **Draft Rent Bill to Parliament for approval.** **LI for Building**	• Formation of a Technical Committee to coordinate the implementation of the Policy. • Oversee Collation and compilation of list of government properties earmarked for redevelopment • Review and submit proposal to Hon Min for approval. • Facilitate the development of a roadmap for the implementation of the Policy. • Provide updates to the Hon. Minister. • Review Cabinet Memo and submit to Hon Minister for approval and onward submission to Cabinet. • Transmit Cabinet Approval and draft Bill to the Attorney-	**Target achieved.** Terms of Reference dated July, 2019 developed for the inter-agency redevelopment implementation committee and available. Committee set up and evidence available. Facilitated the development of the draft roadmap for the implementation of the policy. Inventory of GoG properties available. Updates to the HM available. **Target not achieved.** Revised Cabinet Memo submitted to Cabinet. CD's review available Ministry in discussions with AG's Office and key stakeholders. Document yet to be submitted to Parliament **Target not achieved.**	7.5	7.04

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Code prepared and laid before Parliament.	General's Department for final drafting of Bill. • Facilitate the organization of stakeholder's validation workshop. • Submit Final Draft Bill to Cabinet.	Copy of Ghana Building Code Regulations available Several stakeholder meetings held and minutes available Reviewed draft submitted to HM Document yet to be laid before Parliament		
		Completed and submitted draft Memorandum to promulgation of a Condominium Bill	• Submit approved Bill to Attorney-General's Department for gazette and submission to Parliament for approval.	**Target achieved.** Cabinet Memo submitted to Cabinet and Cabinet acknowledgement received on 21st Oct., 2019		
		Real Estate Bill completed and resubmitted to Cabinet.	• Formation of Technical Committee. • Facilitate the organization of Stakeholder consultative review workshop.	**Target achieved.** Real Estate Bill completed and resubmitted to Cabinet and Cabinet acknowledgement received on 16th Dec., 2019.		
		Submit Cabinet Memorandum for Review and Architects Act 1969 NLCD, 357 to Cabinet.	• Facilitate Drafting of Building Code Regulations • Review draft and submit to Hon. Minister. • Transmit draft to Attorney-General	**Target achieved.** Cabinet Memorandum for Review and Architects Act 1969 NLCD, 357 developed and submitted to Cabinet.		
		Land Banks for affordable Housing increased by 10% (12,832.93).	• Review Cabinet Memo and submit to Hon. Minister for approval and onward submission to Cabinet.	**Target achieved.** Sourced 39% Land Banks for affordable Housing increased and status report available.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Draft Memorandum on the establishment of National Housing Fund submitted to Cabinet.	• Transmit Cabinet Memorandum on Condominiums to Cabinet • Liaise with the Office of the Attorney-General to finalize the draft Bill. • Review Cabinet Memorandum on the draft Bill and submit to Hon. Minister. • Transmit Cabinet Memorandum to Cabinet. • Reviewed Cabinet Memo and submit to Hon Minister. • Transmit Memo to Cabinet.	Various inspection reports on Land Banks available. Various letters processing payments available. **Target achieved.** Constituted the National Housing Committee. Constituted National Housing sub-committee. Joint Cabinet Memo submitted to Cabinet and available. Reference to the Budget Statement available. Law passed on the establishment of National Housing Fund.		
		Completed and re-submitted the Draft Memorandum on establishment of the Hydrological Authority to Cabinet. **Completed and submitted the Draft Engineering Regulations, 2018 to Cabinet.**	• Transmit Cabinet Approval to Att. Gen for preparation of draft Architects Registration Council Bill, 2019. • Facilitate the organization of a stakeholder consultative review workshop of ARC Bill, 2019. • Submit comments from Workshop Report to Att. Gen to finalize Draft ARC Bill, 2019 • Re-submit Finalized Draft Bill to Cabinet for approval.	**Target achieved.** Completed and re-submitted the Draft Memorandum on establishment of the Hydrological Authority to Cabinet and Cabinet acknowledged. **Target achieved.** Completed and submitted the Draft Engineering Regulations, 2018 to Cabinet. Regulations in Parliament.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Validate existing land banks • Initiate processes for acquisition. • Request to Members of Parliament. • Request to Regional Minister. • Request to Lands Commission and Land Valuation Board to carry out search/ Valuation. • Facilitate inspection of land by Tech team comprising Min. of Works and Housing/AESL and review Reports. • Advise Hon Min on Recommendations of Technical Team. • Facilitate the payment for land acquisitions. • Propose to Hon. Min list of allocations for investors. • Constitute National Housing Committee • Submit list to Hon Min. for approval • Facilitate the development of Terms of Reference for Committee. • Arrange meetings			

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			with Min. of Finance • Facilitate the organization of the Inaugural program • Set up Sub-Committees and TORs • Convene Meetings of Committee. • Convene meetings with selected financial institutions • Initiate Public Relations activities to stimulate demand for Mortgage Housing Scheme • Work with Min. of Sanitation and Water Resources to streamline the role of Water Resources Commission. • Review and re-submit Cabinet Memo to Cabinet. • Transmit Cabinet Approval and draft Bill to the Attorney-General's Department for drafting of Draft Hydrological Authority Bill. • Facilitate the organisation of stakeholders' validation workshop.			

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			• Submit Cabinet Memo and Draft Hydrological Services Authority Bill to Cabinet. • Liaise with the AG's Department for final drafting of Bill. • Submit approved Draft Hydrological Services Authority Bill to Attorney-General's Department for gazette and submission to Parliament for approval • Brief the Hon. Minister. • Facilitate the organization of a Stakeholders' validation Workshop to review the draft Engineering Regulations, 2018. • Review of Revised Draft Engineering Regulations • Transmit Cabinet Memoranda to Hon. Minister for approval. • Transmit Draft Cabinet Memorandum to Att. General			
2.	Increasing resilience of coastal	Ensured the completion of documentation	• Brief the Hon. Minister.	**Target achieved.** Draft Joint Cabinet Memo between Min of	7.5	7.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
	settlements and infrastructure	for the commencement of the Elmina Port Rehabilitation Project. Prepared and submitted Memorandum on the Elmina Port Rehabilitation Project to Cabinet.	• Submission of the following to Cabinet (i). Draft EPC Contract, (ii.) Draft Consultancy Services Agreement and (iii) Project Scoping Report. • Request for Legal Opinion. • Formation of Technical Committee for the Project. • Correspondence with TESCON Ltd/Min. of Finance and Parliament. • Facilitate the organization of Workshop for Parliamentary Sub Committees for Works and Housing, and Finance. • Ensure finalization of EPC Contract and Loan agreement. • Finalize program for sod cutting for commencement of the Elmina Port Rehabilitation Project Phase 2	Finance, Min. of Transport and MWH submitted to Cabinet and available. Addendum submitted to Cabinet. Communication with Min. of Transport available. (i). Draft EPC Contract, (ii.) Draft Consultancy Services Agreement and (iii) Project Scoping Report available. Project Concept Note available.		
3.	Increasing Access to housing for Public Sector officers.	Commenced Phase III of Security Services Housing Scheme for the Ghana	• Ensure attendance of technical staff to project site meetings.	**Target achieved.** Site meeting to commence Phase III of Security Services Housing Scheme for the	7.5	7.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Police. Construction of twenty (20No.) Town-houses and Eight (8) units block of flats at Roman Ridge for Civil Servants completed.	• Ensure submission of Quarterly Project Report. • Review Reports and submit to Hon. Minister. • Monitoring of Project • Request for a revised program of works/work schedule from the contractor indicating completion date. • Convene periodic site meetings. • Conduct quarterly site inspection and review reports. • Facilitate the successful handing over of the properties	Ghana Police and reports and minutes available. Monitoring reports available. **Target achieved.** Construction of twenty (20No.) Town-houses and Eight (8) units block of flats at Roman Ridge for Civil Servants completed. Houses already allocated to Civil Servants.		
4.	Increasing Access to affordable housing	70% completion of all housing units under the Affordable Housing project achieved	• Facilitate the approval of tax exemptions certificate. • Ensure attendance of technical staff to project site meetings. • Quarterly Review of Project Reports • Monthly Review of Consultants Reports	**Target achieved.** Borteyman 90% complete Asorkore 100% complete Kpone 100% complete Reviewed progress and monitoring reports available	7.5	7.5
		Redevelopment of Nima initiated.	• Prepare Cabinet memo for approval to undertake	**Target achieved.** Cabinet Memo prepared and submitted to		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			redevelopment exercise • Liaise with Hon. Minister to appoint a Consultant to develop a Concept Note • Liaise with the Consultant for a Master Plan • Submit Master Plan to Hon Minister for approval • Communicate with Ministry of Inner Cities and Zongo Development • Constitute a Steering Committee • Develop Terms of Reference • Submit Terms of Reference to Hon. Minister for approval • Initiate steps towards inauguration of the Committee • Liaise with the Consultant to prepare Expression of Interest • Liaise with Ministry of Inner Cities and Zongo Development to conduct sensitisation	Cabinet. Cabinet approval available. State of the Nation Address 2019 where target was captured available. Concept Note developed by consultant and available. Expression of Interest developed with consultant and available. Master Development Plan available.		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			programme			
5.	Increasing resilience of coastal settlements and infrastructure	Dansoman Sea Defense Works 90% completed. Adjoa (near Takoradi) Sea Defense Project 95% completed Blekusu Sea Defense Project 80% completed. Amanful Kumah Sea Defense Project 10% completed**.**	• Approve engineering designs. • Ensure compliance with engineering designs. • Convene site meetings. • Quarterly Review of Project Reports • Submission of Project Review Reports to Hon. Minister. • Facilitate the processing of payment Certificates.	**Targets achieved.** Dansoman Sea Defence Works : 90% Completed Adjoa (near Takoradi) Sea Defense Project : 100% Completed Blekusu Sea Defense Project: 100% Completed. Amanful Kumah Sea Defense Project: 45% Completed. Reviewed Progress and Monitoring Reports available.	7.5	7.5
6.	Drainage Management	80%completion of the 2019 Annual Emergency National Flood Control Programme at Accra, Tema, Adenta, Madina, etc. achieved. 50% completion of Preparation of Greater Accra Resilience and Integrated Development	• Develop Cabinet Information papers on: - Flood situations and measures to address same - Ministry's preparedness to contain imminent Floods • Request for Commencement Certificates from MoF. • Facilitate the procurement of successful contractors to	**Target achieved.** The project consists of two components, namely, • Desilting; and • Construction of drains The desilting was 100% completed and the drains 70% completed. With the desilting constituting the major aspect of the work, this represented about 90% of the Flood Control Programme. **Target achieved.** 50% completion of Preparation of Greater Accra Resilience and Integrated Development	7.5	7.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		(GARID) Project achieved Procurement of Consultants for the Engineering Design of Priority Drainage System of selected regions completed: i) Greater Accra Region • Lafa Drain • Baale Drain • Onukpawahe and Gyrokorgyor Drain • Mamahuma Drain • Kordjor and Naapladjor • Nsakyi Drain • Sakumo Drain • Dekyidor Drain • Gblekpo Drain (ii) Ashanti Region • Sisan and Wiwi Drains • Kumasi Kwadaso Drain (iii) Western Region • Kwesimintim	undertake the works. • Facilitate the processing of payment certificates. • Ensure attendance of technical staff to project site meetings. • Review Quarterly Project Reports. • Submission of Project Review Reports to Hon. Minister. • Monthly Review of Consultants Reports • To prepare a Cabinet Memo on status of GARID • Facilitate the procurement of consultants to undertake feasibility studies • Facilitate the organization of stakeholder consultation to validate feasibility studies and draft engineering designs • Facilitate project Monitoring and Evaluation • Vetting and processing of	(GARID) Project achieved Cabinet Memo prepared and submitted to Cabinet and acknowledgement received Document laid before Parliament **Target achieved.** Evaluation of the RFPs conducted Assignment terminated and Hydro-Department tasked to develop the engineering designs for the Priority Drainage System		

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
		Drain (iv) Central Region • Okrudu Drain (v) Volta Region • Ho Seventeen Drain • Ho Volta Barracks Drain (vi) Eastern Region • Nsukwao Drain (vii) Brong Ahafo Region • Sunyani Drain (viii) Northern Region • Tamale Gariba Drain	payment certificates • Liaise with partner Ministries to facilitate approval of Loan Agreement • Facilitate the preparation of Requests for Expression of Interest (REOIs) for advertisement in the National dailies. • Facilitate the preparation of Requests for Proposals (RFPs) and of Evaluation of the RFPs. • Facilitate the Preparation of Award Notifications and Contract documents			
7.	Applied Hydrology	Maintenance of 8No. Telemetry systems completed. Installation of 10No. Telemetry systems completed.	• Facilitate preparation of TORs for the procurement of consultant for the preparation of Technical specification of Telemetry Equipment. • Facilitate the preparation of the Request for Expression of Interest • Facilitate the procurement of contractors for the	**Targets achieved.** Maintenance of 8No. Telemetry systems completed. Installation of 10No. Telemetry systems completed.	7.5	7.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			supply, installation and maintenance of systems • Facilitate the processing of payment certificates. • Ensure effective management of the rehabilitation project			
8.	Management of Government Landed properties	Achieved 100% rehabilitation of 20No. Ministerial Bungalows. 12No. Government Pool Bungalows and Flats Rehabilitated	• Facilitate the application of commencement certificate • Facilitate the procurement of qualified contractors to undertake the works • Undertake periodic site visits • Review and process payment certificates • Conduct survey to determine extent of damage • Facilitate the application for commencement certificate to undertake the works • Facilitate the procurement of qualified contractors to undertake the works • Review and processing of payment certificates • Undertake periodic	**Target achieved.** 100% rehabilitation of 20No. Ministerial Bungalows completed and occupied. **Target achieved.** 12No. Government Pool Bungalows and Flats rehabilitated and occupied	7.5	7.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
			site inspections			
Sub-Total					**59.54**	

5.35.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score of **29.76** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 110: Performance of Chief Director, Works and Housing in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 15th, April 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 23rd August, 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 30th October, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan dated 16th July, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 15th January, 2020		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**5**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit			

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
Committee (AC) meetings & actions taken to redress audit queries. b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved. c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• Five (5) meetings held and minutes dated 20th March, 13th June, 4th September, 29th November, and 18th December, 2019 available. • Report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee available. • Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of thirteen (13) meetings dated 30th January, 6th February , 20th February, 19th March, 17th and 26th April, 20th May, 14th June, 11th July, 17th July, 3rd September, 22nd October, and 19th November, 2019available. • Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor available. • 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 20th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 – Human Resource Management a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate • Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018 • Individualised job schedules for all staff • Establishment levels	• Organization Manual dated 17th August, 2017. • Updated staff list dated 5th July, 2019 available. • Individualized job schedules for all staff dated 19th February,	**10**	**9.9**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	2019 available. • Establishment levels submitted to OHCS on 25th July, 2019 available.		
b. Report on 2018 Staff Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals was available and forwarded to OHCS on 2nd January, 2019.		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• 2019 Report on Planning Phase of Appraisal Instrument dated January, 2019 together with transmittal letter to OHCS dated 5th March, 2019 available. • 2019 Report on Mid-year Phase of Appraisal Instrument dated July 2019 together with its transmittal letter to OHCS dated 23rd July, 2019 available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report submitted to OHCS on 26th April, 2019. • Soft copy of evaluation report emailed to OHCS on 2nd March, 2020 instead of January 2020.		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process emailed to OHCS on 20th February, 2019 • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 25th July, 2019 and 27th December, 2019 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly staff attendance report available. • Memo dated 15th April, 2019 transmitting 1st Quarter Attendance Report dated April, 2019 to Chief Director.		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
g. Report on staff movements	• Memo dated 9th July, 2019 transmitting Midyear Staff Attendance Report dated July, 2019 to Chief Director • End of Year Attendance Report dated December, 2019 together with transmittal memo to Chief Director dated 14th January, 2020 available. • Memo dated 12th July, 2019 transmitting to Chief Director, Mid-Year Report on Disciplinary measures dated July, 2019. • Memos dated 2nd April, 8th July, 8th Nov., and 10th December, 2019 transmitting to Chief Director, Composite **analysed** report on staff movements dated April, July, October, and December, 2019. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 11th November, 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up b. Quarterly meetings organised	• List of Board members available. • MAB in place and minutes of four (4) meeting dated of 12thFebruary, 7th May, 2nd October, and 27th November, 2019 available.	**2**	**2**
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter dated December 2019 available. • Service Charter for Architects Registration Council, Department of Rural Housing, Rent Control Department, State Housing Company Limited	**4**	**4**

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	available.		
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • CSU training for officer undertaken and back to office from 17th – 18th April, 2019 available. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 9th July 2019 and 8th January 2020 respectively. • Functional website address: *www.mwh.gov.gh* , Facebook handle: *Ministry of Works and Housing*		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Reports on quarterly website updates available • Newsletter, fliers, draft Hand Book, 2nd Edition of Works and Housing Digest, available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives		**5**	**4.96**
a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Reports covering 30No. Continuous Skills Development Programmes in various subjects organised throughout the year, and available.		
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Memo dated 16th December, 2019 transmitting to the Chief Director, the outcome of a Research conducted to assess the impact of the various Skills Development Programmes organised available. • Memo dated 20th August 2019 transmitting to the Chief Director Proposal for the conduct of an assessment to ascertain the impact of the Continuous Skills development • At the sub-national level the		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	Ministry related with client well mainly through monitoring reports by the Ministry. • Media Tracking- Daily news briefing, tracking of correspondence and tracking of Contractors' classification and certification to ensure rapid response time in service delivery, statistical reports available.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of eleven (11) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of four (4) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen – Gender specific approach to activities in the Ministry, participated in Gender activities with the Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection. • Reports/Documentation regarding activities aimed at promoting health and wellbeing of staff available. These include: • Activities of the Ministry of Works and Housing Welfare Association. • Medical refunds. • Sensitisation on- Health and Investment Management on 6th Feb.; Sexual harassment on 6th Sept; safety and security 9th August; First Aid on 18th October ; Breast cancer screening on 15th – 16th October, 2019 • Catalogue of various News items posted on the Ministry's Notice Board.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available - Ministry engaged PRAAD for		

Key Results Area	Performance - Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
	reclassification of files dated 26th March, 2019 and PRAAD's response dated 3rd July, 2019 • Evidence of several memos from the Head of Records to the CD requesting for resources and training for Records Officers. Back to office report available.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Cleaning Services out-sourced • Security Services enhanced • Servicing of IT Equipment by Service Provider • Construction of Shed over Generator Set • Servicing of Fire Extinguishers • Maintenance of the Ministry's Generator Set • Refurbishment of offices of Ministry on-going		
Overall Total		**29.76**	

5.35.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 111 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 111: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Works and Housing

NO.	COMPETENCIES/ SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Build Capacity in Alternative Markets for Mortgage Financing	Participate in Meeting	Participated in Ghana Real Estate Annual CEOs Meeting. **Back to office report available.**
2	Training in Leadership and Impact Assessment	Participate in Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA)	Participated in Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA) Leadership and Management Seminar for Senior Officials, organised by Min. of Trade.

		Seminar	**Back to office report available.**
3	Build Capacity in Application of Evidence in Policy making for purposes of Accountability	Attend Workshop	Attended Workshop on Evidence to Action: Strengthening Evidence Generation and Use in Support of Policy Reform and Development Agenda. **Back to office report available.**
4	Improve skills in value creation and efficient service delivery.	Participate in 10th Annual Conference of Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and Chief Executives of the Ghana Public Services.	Participated in 10th Annual Conference of Chairpersons of Governing Boards/Councils, Chief Directors and Chief Executives of the Ghana Public Services. **Back to office report available.**
5	Build Capacity in National Governance and Social Development	Participate in Seminar	Participated in Seminar on National Governance and Social Development at University of Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing, China. **Back to office report available.**
Sub-Total			**10**

5.35.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **99.300** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.35.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD indicated that he saw performance management as a very important tool for the management of the Ministry. The Ministry undertook a mid-term assessment and on the basis of this the CD encouraged all staff to work hard to improve upon their performance so that the targets outlined in the Agreement could be achieved. The Ministry also undertook a peer-review exercise in the course of the year and this helped the various Directors and Heads of Department to reorganise themselves towards achieving their own set targets in their Agreements. The CD was appreciative of the enormous support given him over the years. He was also grateful to the OHCS team for always putting the Ministry on its toes both during the mid and end of year exercises.

Team's Remarks

The Team was happy about the attitude of the CD to whole concept of performance management which was not punitive in nature but to identify strengths and weaknesses in staff and help to have these addressed. The successful implementation of the performance management principles in all aspects of the work of Ministries would definitely go a long way towards raising the image of the Civil Service.

5.35.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Redevelopment Policy implemented	• Nomination letters dated 31st July, 2019 from MDAs. • Memo dated 28th November, 2019 to Hon Minister of proposed list of nominees. • Responses to invitation for nominees dated 13th, 16th and 30th August, 9th September, 2019. • Terms of Reference dated July, 2019. • Draft roadmap. • Inventory of GoG properties dated 23rd December, 2019.
	Completed and submitted the Draft Rent Bill to Parliament for approval	• Revised Cabinet Memo. • Letter dated 9th October, 2019 transmitting the Revised Cabinet Memo. • Acknowledgement by Cabinet dated 14th October, 2019. • Memo dated 8th October, 2019 to Hon. Minister submitting review of the Rent Act, 1963 (Act 225). • Letter dated 13th March, 2019 from the National Security on the Proposal. • Proposal from Attorney-General/Minister for the National Security dated 25th June, 2019. • Draft Rent Bill, 2019 – Letter from MWH responding to Att. Gen dated 14th August, 2019. • Letter dated 21st November, 2019 to the AG's Office submitting a proposal to the Rent Bill.
	LI for Building Code prepared and laid before Parliament	• Invitation letter to Stakeholder on the consultative workshop dated 29th March, 2019. • Minutes of meeting dated 4th April, 2019. • Attendance sheets. • Speech by Hon. Minister at Review Workshop dated 28th November, 2019. • Program for Workshop dated 28th November, 2019. • Memo dated 6th December, 2019 to Hon Minister requesting for

		approval to update the National Building Regulations. • Transmittal letter to Att. Gen of Draft Building Code Regulations dated 20th December, 2019 available. • Attendance Sheets of Technical Committees. • Copy of Draft Ghana Building Code Regulations dated September, 2019. • Memo dated 10th April, 2019 for revised Budget for Stakeholder Workshop.
	Completed and submitted draft Memorandum to promulgation of a Condominium Bill	• Approval by Hon. Minister dated 18th October, 2019. • Copy of Cabinet Memorandum October, 2019. • Letter transmitting dated 18th October, 2019 Memorandum on Condominiums. • Acknowledgement by Cabinet dated 21st October, 2019.
	Real Estate Bill completed and resubmitted to Cabinet	• Letter dated 13th February, 2019 transmitting Draft Real Estate Bill from Attorney-General for comments. • Response from MWH to AG's Office with comments dated 25th March, 2019. • Letter dated 7th May, 2019 from Att. Gen for comments. • Response from MWH to Att. Gen dated 29th May, 2019. • Letter from Attorney-General requesting for provisions against money laundering and terrorist financing dated 25th June, 2019. • Letter from Attorney-General requesting for provision against money laundering and terrorist financing dated 29th July, 2019. • Letter from MWH conveying instructions to Attorney-General dated 13th August, 2019. • Letter from Attorney-General transmitting Real Estate Agency, bill 2019 dated 4th October, 2019. • Letter from MWH conveying approval to Att. Gen for finalization of draft Real Estate Agency Bill 2019 11th October, 2019. • Letter from Att. Gen forwarding Finalized Draft Real Estate Agency Bill dated 17th October, 2019. • Estate Agency Bill 2019 November, 2019. • Reviewed Cabinet Memorandum for approval of Draft Real dated November, 2019. • Estate Agency, Bill 2019 11th October, 2019. • Transmittal letter to Cabinet dated 28th November, 2019. • Memo to Hon. Minister for approval. • Acknowledgement by Cabinet dated 16th December, 2019.

	Submit Cabinet Memorandum for Review and Architects Act 1969 NLCD, 357 to Cabinet	• Cabinet Memo for policy approval October, 2019. • Hon. Minister's approval 7th October, 2019. • Transmittal Letter 8th October, 2019. • Acknowledgement by Cabinet 14th October, 2019.
	Land Banks for affordable Housing increased by 10% (12,832.93).	• Memo dated 18th November, 2019 requesting for documentation from all Land Banks acquired by the Ministry. • Database of Lands/Validation January, 2019. • Several offers of land, Correspondence/Memos to Hon. Minister. • Provisional number of acres-Kordiabe (20,000), Fiankonya (113) Fiankonya (276.24) Oyibi (100) Ojobi (10). • Correspondence with MPs/Regional Ministers. • Correspondence with Lands Commission. • Inspection Reports available. • Applications for Release and processing of payment. • Proposed investors/allocations available.
	Draft Memorandum on the establishment of National Housing Fund submitted to Cabinet.	• Draft Cabinet Memo January, 2019. • Transmittal letter to Min. of Finance 2nd January, 2019. • 2019 Budget Statement "Page 64-65". • Letter inviting nominations for NHC and inauguration 5th April, 2019. • Speech delivered by Hon. Minister 12th April, 2019. • Minutes of inaugural Management. • Newspaper publications available. • Submission of Memo for proposed of members of NHC to Hon. Minister 8th April, 2019. • Terms of Reference of Committee available. • Correspondence/Meetings with MoF/National Housing and Mortgage Fund. • Sub-Committees set up. • Terms of Reference for Sub-Committees developed. • Report dated May, 2019 on Standardized House Types and Standardization. • Forwarding letter from MWH 21st June, 2019. • Request for inspection of proposed sites from MWH to MoF 1st October, 2019. • Response from NHMF inviting NHC to tour sites 14th October, 2019. • Invitation to members of NHC to tour proposed sites 13th November, 2019. • Report on inspection of proposed sites for housing projects.

		• Arrangements for sod-cutting.
	Completed and re-submitted the Draft Memorandum on establishment of the Hydrological Authority to Cabinet	• Copy of Review of Cabinet Memo 29th May, 2019. • Copy of Transmission 23rd May, 2019.
	Completed and submitted the Draft Engineering Regulations, 2018 to Cabinet	• Memo to Hon. Minister 20th February, 2019. • Memo for validation of draft Engineering Regulations 12th March, 2019. • Response from Engineering Council 12th March, 2019. • Program for Workshop. • Letter submitting the Report of Validation Workshop 24th April, 2019. • Report of Stakeholder Validation Workshop April 2019. • Letter dated 2nd September, 2019 to Hon Minister for approval to forward observation of Eng. Council to Attorney-General • Letter dated 2nd September, 2019 from MWH conveying instruction to finalize Regulations. • Letter dated 13th December, 2019 from Att. General forwarding finalized draft Regulations for comments. • Letter 20th December, 2019 conveying instruction to Att. General to finalize draft Regulations.
2.	Ensured the completion of documentation for the commencement of the Elmina Port Rehabilitation Project. Prepared and submitted Memorandum on the Elmina Port Rehabilitation Project to Cabinet.	• Forwarding letter dated 2nd April, 2019 submitting ADDENDUM to Cabinet Memo. • Letter from Att. Gen submitting 1st Draft Engineering Council Regulations dated 9th April, 2019. • Letter forwarding Draft Regulations to Engineering Council for Comments dated 24th April, 2019. • Letter from Eng. Council submitting comments dated 8th May 2019. • Letter from MWH transmitting comments of Eng. Council to Att. Gen dated 29th May, 2019. • Letter from Eng. Council submitting revised draft Regulations to MWH dated 9th August, 2019. • Letter from MWH forwarding revised draft Regulations to Eng. Council dated 15th August, 2019. • Letter from Eng. Council conveying observations on reviewed draft Regulations 2nd September, 2019. • Memo to Hon. Min for approval to forward observations of Eng. Council to Attorney-Generalon 2nd September, 2019. • Letter from MWH conveying instruction to finalize Regulations

		2nd September, 2019. • Letter dated 11th November, 2019 submitting draft Joint Cabinet Memo to the MWH team for Comments. • Letter, from Att. Gen forwarding **Finalized** Draft Regulations for **comments** 13th December, 2019. • Letter conveying instructions to Att. Gen to finalize draft Regulations 20th December, 2019. • Letter from Att. Gen requesting MWH to forward Regulations to Parliament 27th December, 2019. • Letter to Eng. Council requesting for advice on date for meeting with Parliamentary Committee on Subsidiary Legislation 30th December, 2019.
3.	Commenced Phase III of Security Services Housing Scheme for the Ghana Police.	• Minutes of various site meetings. • Attendance sheets available. • Various progress reports. • Various correspondence with contractor (Amandi Holdings Limited) to ensure compliance with project designs. • Monitoring reports available. • Various letters for applications for release of funds.
	Construction of twenty (20No.) Town-houses and Eight (8) units block of flats at Roman Ridge for Civil Servants completed.	• Letter dated 30th October, 2019 requesting for progress report. • Minutes of site meetings. • Invitations to site meetings. • Letter dated 29th February, 2019 from contractor to start hand-over of remaining 6 town houses.
4.	70% completion of all housing units under the Affordable Housing project achieved	• Copies of correspondence - TDC Company Ltd. • Programme of works. • Progress reports. • Letter dated 12th February, 2019 from MWH to TDC for a meeting to discuss the selling prices for the apartment at Kpone affordable housing. • Letter from TCD relating to selling prices dated 11th January, and 26th October, 2019. • Letter form MWH approving selling prices dated 16th May, 2019. • Project reports dated 4th April and 9th September, 2019. • Request for programme of Works dated 15th March, 2019. • Various correspondence with SSNIT. • Letter from SSNIT demanding GH52M from MWH for infrastructure dated 29th January, 2019.

		• Various progress reports from SSNIT. • Various progress reports from TDC.
	Redevelopment of Nima	• Letter from MWH to David Adjaye and Associates dated 19th April, 2019. • Master Plan Redevelopment Concept available. • Letter from Sir David Adjaye and Associates available. • Master Plan approved by **H. E the President** and Hon. Minister. • Letter from MWH to MICZD dated 12th April, 2019. • Letter from MWH to Min of Lands and Natural Resources dated 12th April, 2019. • Letter dated 10th October, 2019 from MWH to MICZD. • Memo to Hon. Minister for proposed Steering Committee. • Memo to Hon. Minister for proposed Steering Committee. • Terms of Reference developed. • Letter dated 8th October, 2019 from Consultants forwarding **''**Request for Proposal**''.** • Draft Request for Proposal available. • Draft letter of Invitation to Tender letter available. • Letter from MWH to MICZD to begin sensitisation.
5.	a. Dansoman Sea Defense Works 90% completed b. Adjoa (near Takoradi) Sea Defense Project 95% completed c. Blekusu Sea Defense Project 80% completed. d. Amanful Kumah Sea Defense Project 10% completed.	• Report of Monitoring Visits to Selected Projects in Accra, Central, Volta and Western Regions. • Letters requesting for comments from MWH. • Responses and actions taken. • Status reports of coastal projects for. • Copies of letters for release of funds. • Minutes of Site meetings. • Reviewed Project Reports.
6.	80%completion of the 2019 Annual Emergency National Flood Control Programme at Accra, Tema, Adenta, Madina, etc. achieved	• Letters submitting Cabinet Information Papers to Cabinet available dated 23rd April, 2019 and 22nd May, 2019. • Copies of PPA approvals. • Evaluation Reports. • Minutes of Meetings of Entity Tender Committee. • Approval by ETC. • Copies of PPA approvals. • Evaluation Reports. • Minutes of Meetings of Entity Tender Committee. • Approval by ETC. • Award of contracts. • Copies of payment certificates available.

		• Minutes of Site meetings. • Project monitoring Reports.
	50% completion of Preparation of Greater Accra Resilience and Integrated Development (GARID) Project achieved	• Cabinet Information Paper dated 16th April, 2019. • Transmission letter 15th April, 2019. • Acknowledgement by Cabinet dated 24th April, 2019. • **Evaluation reports available forprocurement of**: social and environmental safeguard specialist, financial management and procurement specialist, social safeguard consultant, consultancy for preparation of environmental and social impact assessment for detention ponds, urgent repairs and bridges, Contract agreements for individual consultants. • Correspondence with several MDAs and institutions. • Various Reports. • Aide Memoire dated January, 14th to 15th 2019. • Aide Memoire September, 12th to 13th 2019. • Payment Certificates. • Joint Cabinet Memo dated May, 2019. • Cabinet Approval dated 7th October, 2019. • Parliamentary approval 27th November, 2019.
	Procurement of Consultants for the Engineering Design of Priority Drainage System of selected regions completed: i) Greater Accra Region • Lafa Drain • Baale Drain • Onukpawahe and Gyrokorgyor Drain • Mamahuma Drain • Kordjor and Naapladjor • Nsakyi Drain • Sakumo Drain • Dekyidor Drain • Gblekpo Drain (ii) Ashanti Region	• Expression of Interest. • Advert placed in Daily Graphic. • Evaluation Report available. • Letters to shortlisted firms requesting for Technical and Financial Proposals (RFPs) available. • Combined Technical and Financial Evaluation Report available.

	• Sisan and Wiwi Drains • Kumasi Kwadaso Drain (iii) Western Region • Kwesimintim Drain (iv) Central Region • Okrudu Drain (v) Volta Region • Ho Seventeen Drain • Ho Volta Barracks Drain (vi) Eastern Region • Nsukwao Drain (vii) Brong Ahafo Region • Sunyani Drain (viii) Northern Region • Tamale Gariba Drain	
7.	Maintenance of 8No. Telemetry systems completed. Installation of 10No. Telemetry systems completed.	• Approved Terms of Reference by the World Bank. • Letter establishing the steering Committee. • Request for Expression of Interest. • Project Reports for flood forecasting. • Progress Reports on maintenance and operation of Hydrological Stations.
8.	Achieved 100% rehabilitation of 20No. Ministerial Bungalows	• Application for release of funds. • Documentation of Procurement processes. • Practical Completion Reports. • Several letters. • Copies of payment certificates.
	12No. Government Pool Bungalows and Flats Rehabilitated	• Application for Commencement Certificate. • Survey Report. • Bills of Quantities prepared.

5.36 Performance of the Chief Director, Ministry of Youth and Sports

5.36.1 Schedule 1: Institution Specific Outputs and Deliverables

The Chief Director selected five (5) Top Priority Areas for Schedule 1, with each TPA assigned a score of twelve (12). The Targets and Findings for each TPA are presented in Table 112 below. The scores awarded based on the findings for each TPA are indicated in the last column of the Table.

The CD obtained a score of **47.7** out of the maximum score of **60** for this Schedule.

Table 112: Performance of Chief Director, Youth and Sports in Schedule 1

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
1.	Improving Policy and Legislative Framework for the Sport Sector.	Legislative Instrument on the new Sports Act (Act 934) prepared and Submitted to Cabinet. Cabinet Memo on the hosting of Africa Games in 2023 Submitted.	• Facilitate the recruitment of a Consultant for the preparation of the draft L.I • Facilitate submission of inception Report by Consultant • Facilitate two (2) stakeholder consultation workshop on the draft L.I • Review and submit draft L.I to Cabinet • Facilitate the formation of a team to draft the Cabinet Memo • Facilitate the preparation of the Cabinet Memo • Review and submit memo to Cabinet	**Target not achieved.** Procurement for the recruitment of a Consultant for the preparation of the draft L.I completed. Contract document dated May, 2019 signed and available. Inception Report submitted by Shawbell Consulting Limited in August, 2019. First draft of the L.I submitted by Shawbell on 11th December, 2019. **Target achieved.** Cabinet Memo of 30th June 2019 on the hosting of Africa Games in 2023 prepared, reviewed and forwarded to Cabinet. Copy available. Cabinet queries to the Ministry to undertake a number of activities available.	12	9.5

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
2.	Increasing access to Youth and Sports recreational infrastructure.	Construction of Ten (10) Youth Resource Centres across 10 Regions monitored. Sports Fund established. Memorandum on the establishment of Sports Fund prepared and submitted to Cabinet	• Facilitate the work of the monitoring team • Review Quarterly progress reports on 10 Youth Resource Centres and submit to Hon. Minister • Facilitate the work of the Committee to finalize Cabinet Memo • Facilitate inputs of key stakeholders into the draft Cabinet Memo. • Review memo and submit to Cabinet	**Target achieved.** Four (4) Monitoring Reports available. No reviews sighted though CD indicated he reviewed the documents while being prepared by the M & E officer to save time. Across the 10 Regions the average of completion is 65%. The Centres are in: • Kaneshie sports centre • Ho • Dunkwa-on-offin • Yendi • Navrongo • Koforidua • Dormaa Ahenkro • Nyinahin • Axim • Wa **Target not achieved.** Consultations with the Ministry of Finance, Gaming Commission and Ministry of Communication available. Cabinet Memo on the establishment of the Sports Fund prepared (30th June 2019) and submitted to Cabinet. No information available on the Cabinet decision.	12	10.2

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
3.	Promoting Capacity Development for Sports.	Coordinated the following activities of the National Football Teams: • The Black Stars preparation and participation in the 2019 AFCON tournament inEgypt. • The Black Meteors qualification to the 2019 CAF U-23 AFCON in Egypt. • The Black Satellites in the 2019 U-20 African Cup of Nations Tournament in Niger. • Black Princesses preparation and participation in the 2020 Women's World Cup Qualifying Tournament. • The Black Maidens preparation and participation in the 2020 Women's World Cup Qualifying Tournament.	• Review and submit budget for Chief of Staff's approval. • Facilitate the release of approved funds • Review and forward the Ghana Football Association reports on the various national football team activities to Hon. Minister	**Target achieved.** All budgets reviewed and submitted to the Chief of Staff. Approval received from the Chief of Staff. Reports on the activities on the National Teams from the Ghana Football Association available but no evidence of CD's review.	12	11

No	Top Priority Area	Targets for the Year	CD's Roles	Findings	Scoring	
					Total	Awarded
4.	4. Improving Policy and Legislative Framework for the Youth Sector.	Legislative Instrument on the new National Youth Authority Act (Act 939) prepared and Submitted to Cabinet National Youth Policy and its action plan finalized.	• Facilitate the recruitment of a Consultant for the preparation of the draft L I • Facilitate submission of inception Report by Consultant • Facilitate two (2) stakeholder consultation workshop on the draft L.I • Review and submit draft L.I to Cabinet. • Facilitate crafting of Policy Statements of draft National Youth Policy • Review and submit memo to Cabinet	**Target not achieved.** Procured a Consultant and signed contract available. Inception Report submitted by 1st Law Legal Practitioners in July, 2019. First draft of the L.I submitted by the Consultant available. **Target not achieved.** Policy Statements available but document yet to be submitted to Cabinet. Draft National Youth Policy 2020-2030 available.	12	7
5.	Enhancing Youth Empowerment for National Development	Monitored the following activities of the National Youth Authority. i. ECOWAS Volunteers Meeting. ii. Organization of Voluntary Work activities.	• Facilitate invitation from the ECOWAS Secretariat. • Review monitoring reports and submit to Hon. Minister	**Target achieved.** Report on ECOWAS Volunteers Meeting available. Report on Organization of Voluntary Work activities in Ghana available but with no author and also undated.	12	10
Sub-Total					**47.7**	

5.36.2 Schedule 2: General Operational and Administrative Deliverables

The CD obtained a score **27.17** out of the maximum score of **30** for this schedule.

Table 113: Performance of Chief Director, Youth and Sports in Schedule 2

Key Results Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
KRA 1 - Performance Reporting		**4**	**3.9**
a. 2019 Sector Annual Action Plan developed and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Sector Annual Action Plan broken down into quarters and linked to the 2019 Budget and Chief Director's Agreement and soft copy forwarded to OHCS on 4th, April 2019 instead of February 2019.		
b. Mid-Year self-assessment report on the implementation of the Chief Directors Performance Agreement and copy forwarded to the OHCS	• Mid-year self-assessment report of the CDs Agreement submitted to OHCS on 29th August 2019.		
c. Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-year CDs self-assessment report	• Revised Mid-year self-assessment report submitted to OHCS on 26th September, 2019 and approval granted on 1st October, 2019.		
d. Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan	• Follow up actions/remedial undertaken on Mid-Year Report on the implementation of the sector annual action plan dated 27th September, 2019 available.		
e. 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report produced and submitted to OHCS by 15th January, 2020	• 2019 Sector Annual Performance Report submitted to OHCS on 13th January, 2020.		
KRA 2 - Financial Management		**5**	**3.75**
a. Four (4) quarterly Audit Committee (AC) meetings &	• Three (3) meetings held and minutes dated 24th January, 13th		

Key Results Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	Awarded
actions taken to redress audit queries.	June, and 30th December, 2019 available. • Report on actions taken to address issues arising from meetings of the committee available.		
b. MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan approved.	• Procurement plan was electronically submitted to PPA. • Minutes of eleven (11) meetings dated 12th February, 29th March, 3rd April, 9th April, 29th April, 21st May, 21st June, 21st July, 23rd August, 10th September and 29th November, available.		
c. Assets Register updated signed and dated by Estates Officer and authenticated by Internal/ External Auditor	• Inventory signed by the Estate Officer and authenticated by Internal Auditor. But no indication that it was updated since there were no dates on when the items were procured.		
d. **2018** Final accounts submitted	• 2018 Final accounts submitted to CAGD on 28th February, 2019.		
KRA 3 - Human Resource Management		**10**	**9.85**
a. Organisation manual which is not more than 4 years old and reviewed by MSD to reflect any changes in Ministerial mandate	• Organization Manual dated 2015. Initiated the process of reviewing the document		
• Updated staff list as at 31st Dec 2018	• Updated staff list dated December, 2019 available		
• Individualised job schedules for all staff	• Individualized job schedules for all staff dated 2019 available		
• Establishment levels available/updated and copy of forwarding letter to OHCS	• Establishment levels submitted to OHCS on 21st February, 2019 available		
b. Report on 2018 Staff			

Key Results Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
Appraisal	• 2018 Appraisals report was available and forwarded to OHCS on 22nd February, 2019		
c. 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument operationalized	• Separate reports on the 2019 planning and mid-year phases dated March and August 2019 respectively available.		
d. Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Departments (HoDs) and Directors/Analogous Grades	• Composite signing report submitted to OHCS on 14th May, 2019 • Soft copy of evaluation report emailed to OHCS on March, 2020 instead of January, 2020		
e. Training programmes	• 2019 Training Plan linked to training needs identified through the appraisal process emailed to OHCS on 4th March, 2019. • Mid and end year reports submitted to OHCS on 23rd July, 2019 and 12th February, 2020 respectively.		
f. Management of discipline	• Monthly reports on staff attendance was available. • Copies of queries to officers and responses available.		
g. Report on staff movements	• 2019 Annual Staff Movement Report undated available. • 2020 Promotion register available and forwarded to OHCS on 12th December, 2019 instead of November 2019.		
KRA 4 - Ministerial Advisory Board Operational		**2**	**1.625**
a. Ministerial Advisory Board Set up	• List of Board members available.		

Key Results Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
b. Quarterly meetings organised	• MAB in place and minutes of three (3) meeting dated of 12th April, 2019, 20th Aug., and 30th December, 2019 available.		
KRA 5 - Customer Service Initiatives **a.** Service Delivery Standards and brochures of the Organisation	• Service Charter dated December 2015 available. • Service Charter for National Youth Authority dated 2017 available.	4	3.5
b. Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	• Designated office space for the CSU available. • No CSU training for officer. • Mid & end of year reports available and submitted to OHCS on 20th July 2019 and 3rd January, 2020 respectively		
c. Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	• Functional website, Facebook, Twitter, WhatsApp platforms. • Reports on quarterly website updates available. • Newsletter - Passions and Ghana Bid File for the 13th African Games, 2023 available.		
KRA 6 - Work Environment Improvement Initiatives a. Efficiency gains in organisational operations	• Intensified the pre-auditing to promote better management of resources. • Platforms created for MAB, Audit Committee and Entity Tender for better communication.	**5**	**4.545**
b. Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	• Agencies provide the Ministry with reports on activities at the sub-national level. • Media Tracking- Daily news briefing on Youth and Sports. Individuals also visit the		

Key Results Area	Performance – Observation	Score	
		Total	**Awarded**
	Ministry to share their passion.		
c. Management/Staff engagements	• Minutes of ten (10) Management Meetings sighted. • Minutes of three (3) Staff durbars sighted. • Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness seen - Gender has been mainstreamed into their programmes. • Staff participated in Yoga with the Indian High Commission. Also staff games with Agencies. No report available. • Information posted on notice boards, WhatsApp groups.		
d. Records Management Improvement Initiatives	• Evidence of engagement with PRAAD available - Ministry engaged PRAAD for reclassification of files • Evidence of several memos from the Head of Records to the CD requesting for resources.		
e. Management of physical environment	• Washrooms rehabilitated • New Air conditioners installed		
Overall Total		**27.17**	

5.36.3 Schedule 3:CD's Personal Capacity Development Plan

The CD undertook a number of capacity development programmes to enhance his knowledge and improve his capacity for effective and efficient performance. These are indicated in Table 114 below. The CD obtained the maximum score of 10 for this Schedule.

Table 114: Personal Capacity Development Plan for CD, Youth and Sports

NO.	COMPETENCIES/ SKILLS GAPS	PLANNED ACTIONS	CD's PERFORMANCE
1	Sports branding and strategy	Attend 2019 African Games in Morocco	Attended the 2019 African Games in Morocco on 30th August, - 2nd Sept., 2019 – a communique available.
2	Identification and management of risk in project development and implementation	Attend Workshop on Fiscal Responsibility Act	Attended sensitization of the L.I on the Financial Management Act in March, 2019 at the CSTC.
3	Deepening collaboration with Youth organizations for National Development.	Attend Conference	Participated in the 9th Minister of Youth Forum, Busan, South Korea from 16th-23rd July, 2019.
4	Collaborating with Colleagues to ensure policy harmonization for quality and timely service delivery.	Attend Workshop for Chief Directors	Participated in the 10th Annual Conference of Chair Person, Governing Boards/Councils, CDs and Chief Executives on the Ghana Public Services held at the Capital View Hotel, Koforidua from 17th – 20th Oct., 2019.
5	Collaborating with the Sports Federations and the Ghana Olympics Committee (GOC) to deepen effective combating of doping issues in the management of sports in Ghana.	Attend Conference	Participated in the 2019 World Anti-Doping Agency Symposium in Lausanne, Switzerland from 13th to 14th March 2019.
Sub-Total			**10**

5.36.4 Overall Performance

The Chief Director obtained an overall score of **84.87** out of the maximum score of **100.**

5.36.5 Conclusion

CD's Remarks

The CD indicated that he had realized an improvement in the work being done in the Ministry. He considered the performance management arrangement for the Civil Service and the evaluation as part of the reasons for this. He saw the exercise as being very vigorous and offering staff a lot to learn. The CD was hopeful that the year ahead would be much better in terms of the performance of the Ministry.

Team's Remarks

The Team indicated that one aspect of the evaluation exercise was to help the support staff of the CD to understand his work and the roles they had to play to ensure the attainment of results and the targets in the Agreement. The importance of working as teams in this regard was very important. They hoped that both the CD and his supporting staff had learnt some useful lessons from the exercise.

5.36.6 List of Means of Verification

TPAs	TARGET	LIST OF MEANS OF VERIFICATION
1.	Legislative Instrument on the new Sports Act (Act 934) prepared and Submitted to Cabinet.	• Procurement documents dated March, 2019 technical and evaluation report for the drafting of L.I for National Sports Act (Act 934, 2016). • Contract document dated May, 2019 between the Ministry and Shawbell Consulting Limited for the drafting of L.I for National Sports Act (Act 934, 2016).
	Cabinet Memo on the hosting of Africa Games in 2023 Submitted.	• Internal memo showing request for payment of team dated 3rd July, 2019. • Letter of transmittal to Cabinet from the dated 16th July, 2019. • Copy of Cabinet Memo dated 30th June, 2019. • Letter dated 7th October, 2019 from Cabinet to the Ministry requesting the Ministry to undertaken a number of assignments prior to approval.
2.	Construction of Ten (10) Youth Resource Centres across 10 Regions monitored.	• Internal memo dated 25th February, 2019 requesting for funds to monitor the construction of youth resource centre in Navrongo, Yendi and Dormaa Ahenkro. • First Quarter Report dated April, 2019 on monitoring visits to the Youth Resource Centres. Second quarter report dated July,

		25th and third and fourth quarter dated 2nd October and 30th December respectively are all available. • Letter 22nd May, 2019 from the MoF to the Ministry responding to the request to establish a Sports Fund.
	Sports Fund established. Memorandum on the establishment of Sports Fund prepared and submitted to Cabinet	• Internal memo dated 3rd July, 2019 requesting for funds for Cabinet Memorandum Committee. • Inputs from Gaming Commission, Ministries of Communication and Finance available. • Cabinet memo dated 30th June, 2019 on request for approval to establish a national sports fund.
3.	Coordinated the following activities of the National Football Teams	• Letter dated 18th June, 2019 to Chief of Staff seeking approval of funds for Black Stars in 2019 AFCON. • Letter dated 2nd August 2019 from Office of the President retrospectively approving the budget of the Black Stars in AFCON. • Letter dated 25th September, 2019 on request for funds for Black Meteors participation in U-23 AFCON qualifiers. • Letter dated 17th October, 2019 on request for release of funds for Black Stars Team B and CHAN qualifiers against Burkina Faso. • Letter dated 16th January, 2019 on the request of funds for the Black meteors participation in the qualification match for the 2019 African Cup of Nations. • Letter dated 31st January, 2019 to Minister of Finance for first quarter activities including Black Satellites participation in U20 AFCON in Niger. • Letter dated 31st May 2019 from Ministry of Finance releasing funds for AFCON Tournament. • Letter dated 2nd August, 2019 from the Office of the President to the Ministry approving the participation of the Africa Cup of Nations Tournament Egypt – 21st June to 19th July, 2019. • Forwarded composite reports on 2019 AFCON, 2019 U-20 African Cup of Nations Tournament in Niger and other matches available and dated 27th December, 2019.
4.	Legislative Instrument on the new National Youth Authority Act (Act 939) prepared and Submitted to Cabinet	• Procurement documents dated March, 2019 on technical and evaluation report for the drafting of L.I for National Youth Authority Act (Act 939, 2016). • Contract document dated May, 2019 between the Ministry and 1st Law Legal Practitioners for the drafting of L.I for National Youth Authority Act (Act 939, 2016).

		• Inception Report submitted by 1st Law Legal Practitioners in July, 2019.
	National Youth Policy and its action plan finalized.	• Validated policy statements dated 28th Sept., 2019. • Draft National Youth Policy 2020-2023.
5.	Monitored the following activities of the National Youth Authority. ECOWAS Volunteers Meeting. Organization of Voluntary Work activities.	• Letter dated 2nd May, 2019 from the ECOWAS Commission on the 3rd Forum of National Volunteer Agencies in the ECOWAS Region, Accra – Ghana June/July, 2019.

SIGNATURES OF THE EVALUATION TEAM

1. **MR. EDWIN P. D. BARNES, CHAIRMAN**

SIGNATURE…….. DATE……

2. **PROF. SPENCER DUNCAN, MEMBER**

SIGNATURE…….. DATE……

APPENDICES

APPENDICES

Appendix 1	**-**	**Terms of Reference for the Evaluation Team**
Appendix 2	**-**	**Schedule of Visits for the End of Year Evaluation Exercise of the 2019 Chief Directors' Performance Agreement**
Appendix 3	**-**	**Indicators and Allocation of Marks for Schedule Two**

APPENDIX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE
TERMS OF REFERENCE
EVALUATION OF THE 2019 PERFORMANCE AGREEMENTS OF CHIEF DIRECTORS OF SECTOR MINISTRIES

Introduction

The Civil Service Act, 1993 (PNDCL 327) enjoins the Head of the Civil Service to ensure the overall efficiency of the Service. One of the means of facilitating the achievement of this agenda is the operationalization of the Performance Agreement System which is designed to manage the performance of the top hierarchy of the Civil Service i.e. Chief Directors as well as Directors and Officers on analogous grades. This corps of senior Officers play significant roles in translating Government's agenda into implementable policies, programmes and projects for national development.

With respect to Chief Directors, the Performance Agreement System is designed to enable the Head of the Civil Service have a broad view of their overall performance in terms of how effectively they administer/manage their respective sector Ministries. The System also provides a basis on which to rate performance of Chief Directors and to take appropriate action.

Key Features of the Performance Agreement Document

The Performance Agreement document entails deliverables categorised into three (3) schedules as indicated below:

- Schedule 1 - Institution-Specific Outputs and Deliverables. These deliverables focus on the major areas of work for the Ministry. They are derived from the 2018-2021 Sector Medium Term Plan, 2019 Budget, the State of the Nation Address, and Government Results Framework for High Priorities (Minister's priority areas). The Chief Director is expected to present a minimum of five (5) and a maximum of ten (10) priority areas.
- Schedule 2 - General Operational and Administrative Deliverables. This schedule focuses on the Chief Director carrying out a given, generic set of deliverables aimed at facilitating the smooth running of the sector Ministry. All the deliverables under these KRAs are rooted in the legislative framework that governs the operations of the Civil Service and have been grouped into six (6) broad Key Results Areas.
- Schedule 3 - Chief Director's Personal Capacity Development Plan. This section is intended to enable Chief Directors pay attention to pursuing interventions for their continuous development. They are required to list a minimum of five (5) key activities to be undertaken during the course of the year. The majority of these learning activities are expected to be relevant for the effective management of the Ministry.

2019 Performance Agreements of Chief Directors

The following activities were undertaken in 2019 on the Performance Agreement System for Chief Directors:

- Notification to Chief Directors to draft their 2019 Performance Agreements
- Draft Agreements forwarded to the OHCS and targets/strategic objectives under Schedules 1 were reviewed

- Composite Signing Ceremony at which the Head of the Civil Service formally signed the 2019 Performance Agreements with Chief Directors, Directors/Heads of Department covering January - December 2019 and endorsed by their respective Sector Ministers & Chief Directors.
- A mid-year monitoring session with Chief Directors to track progress madeof their deliverables and individual reports generated. This will serve as a basis for the end of year evaluation.

The evaluation stage is the phase that would complete the cycle for the 2019 Chief Directors' Performance Agreement. It is intended to determine the extent to which deliverables agreed on at the onset of the year have been achieved. Accordingly, in December 2019, the Head of the Civil Service issued a circular to all Chief Directors to prepare a self-assessment report on their own Agreements and submit same to the OHCS by 10th January, 2020. Reports submitted by the Chief Directors would be used as input for the evaluation process.

The Assignment

The task at hand, therefore, is for the Team to undertake an in-depth evaluation of the performance of all Chief Directors on the basis of the deliverables stated in their 2019 Performance Agreements as well as the documentation prepared in support of work undertaken.

Purpose of Assignment

The assessment of the 2019 Performance Agreements of Chief Directors generally seeks to:

- Strengthen the performance management culture in the Civil Service;
- Assess the level and quality of work done by Chief Directors for the period January - December, 2019;
- Increase transparency and accountability in the delivery of public services;
- Stimulate healthy peer competition among Chief Directors and sector Ministries; and
- Provide an opportunity to learn lessons for the way forward.

Scope of Work for the Evaluation Team

Thefollowing key activities are expected to be undertaken by the 2019 Evaluation Team:

- Study the 2019 Performance Agreements and review the self-assessment reports and other supporting documents presented by Chief Directors.
- Hold review sessions with Chief Directors to discuss achievement levels based on the agreed deliverables in their 2019 Performance Agreements.
- Analyse data and prepare a report of the Chief Directors' evaluation exercise for the attention of the Head of the Civil Service.

Composition of the Evaluation Team

Following from the Background, Purpose and Scope of the Exercise, a Team, comprising persons with significant knowledge and understanding of the Civil Service environment and public sector management, has been designated to undertake the assignment. The composition of the Team is as follows:

1. The Head of the Civil Service
2. Representative of the Civil Service Council
3. Public Sector Management Consultant
4. 2 Officers from the PBMED – Secretarial Support

The Head of the Civil Service will participate in the exercise as a Technical Observer, with the PBME Directorate of the OHCS providing technical/administrative support to the Team.

Reporting Schedule

The exercise is expected to span a total period of forty (40) working days, commencing 27th January 2020 and ending 18th March 2020. The Evaluation Team will be expected to undertake its work as per the timeframes indicated in the table below.

At the end of the exercise, an Evaluation Report is to be submitted to the Head of the Civil Service.

Scheduling of Key Tasks for the Assignment

The assignment has been phased out as follows:

Item	Activity	Duration
1.	Pre-assessment meeting to strategise for the CDs' evaluation exercise.	1 day
2.	Review sessions with Chief Directors based on the agreed outputs and deliverables in their 2019 Performance Agreements.	21 days
3.	Data analysis and award of scores to each Chief Director based on performance	5 days
4.	Preparation of the report of the evaluation exercise.	13 days
TOTAL NUMBER OF DAYS		**40 days**

Implications of the Exercise

Following the submission of the report of the Evaluation Team, the recommendations therein would be discussed by the Civil Service Council. The outcomes of the evaluation exercise would have implications for some Human Resource Management decisions.

APPENDIX 2: SCHEDULE OF VISITS FOR THE END OF YEAR EVALUATION EXERCISE OF THE 2019 CHIEF DIRECTORS' PERFORMANCE AGREEMENT

NO	DATE	INSTITUTION	TIME
1.	**MONDAY, 27th JAN.**	Ministry of Environment, Science, Technology & Innovation	9:00 am
2.	**TUESDAY, 28th JAN.**	Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development	9:00 am
3.	**WEDNESDAY, 29th JAN.**	Ministry of Railways Development	9:00 am
4.	**THURSDAY, 30th JAN.**	Ministry of Aviation	9:00 am
5.	**FRIDAY, 31st JAN.**	Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture	9:00 am
6.	**MONDAY, 3rd FEB.**	Ministry of Regional Reorganisation and Development	9:00 am
7.	**TUESDAY, 4th FEB.**	Ministry of Inner City and Zongo Development	9:00 am
8.	**WEDNESDAY, 5TH FEB.**	Ministry of Monitoring and Evaluation	9:00 am
9.	**THURSDAY, 6TH FEB.**	Ministry of Planning	9:00 am
10.	**FRIDAY, 7TH FEB.**	Ministry of Special Development Initiatives	9:00 am
11.	**MONDAY, 10TH FEB.**	Ministry of Trade and Industry	9:00 am
12.	**WEDNESDAY, 12TH FEB.**	Ministry of Transport	9:00 am
13.	**THURSDAY, 13TH FEB.**	Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations	9:00 am
14.	**MONDAY, 17TH FEB.**	Ministry of Sanitation and Water Resources	9:00 am
15.	**TUESDAY, 18TH FEB.**	Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources	9:00 am
16.	**WEDNESDAY,**	Ministry of Education	9:00am

NO	DATE	INSTITUTION	TIME
	19TH FEB.		
17.	**FRIDAY, 21ST FEB.**	Ministry of Communications	9:00 am
18.	**MON. 24 FEB**	Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs	9:00 am
19.	**TUESDAY, 25TH FEB.**	Ministry of Business Development Ministry of Roads and Highways	9:00 am 2:00 pm
20.	**WENDESDAY, 26TH FEB.**	Ministry of Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs	9:00 am
21.	**THURSDAY, 27TH FEB.**	Ministry of Defence	9:00 am
22.	**FRIDAY, 28TH FEB.**	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration	9:00 am
23.	**MONDAY, 2ND MARCH**	Office of the Senior Minister Ministry of Gender, Children & Social Protection	9:00 am 2:00 pm
24.	**TUESDAY, 3RD MARCH**	Ministry of the Interior	9:00 am
25.	**WEDNESDAY, 4TH MARCH**	Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Creative Arts	9:00 am
26.	**THURSDAY, 5TH MARCH**	Ministry of Food and Agriculture	9:00 am
27.	**MONDAY, 9TH MARCH**	Ministry of Energy	9:00 am
28.	**TUESDAY, 10TH MARCH**	Office of the Attorney-General and Ministry of Justice	9:00 am
29.	**WEDNESDAY, 11TH MARCH**	Office of the President	9:00 am
30.	**THURSDAY, 12TH MARCH**	Ministry of Health	9:00 am
31.	**FRIDAY, 13TH MARCH**	Ministry of Finance	9:00 am
32.	**MONDAY, 16TH**	Office of the Head of the Civil Service	9:00 am

NO	DATE	INSTITUTION	TIME
	MARCH		
33.	**TUESDAY, 17TH MARCH**	Ministry of Youth and Sports	9:00 am
34.	**WEDNESDAY, 18TH MARCH**	Ministry of Information	9:00 am
35.	**THURSDAY, 19TH MARCH**	Ministry of Works and Housing	9:00 am

APPENDIX 3: INDICATORS AND ALLOCATION OF MARKS FOR SCHEDULE TWO

KRA 1: Performance Reporting **Total of 4 marks**	2019 MDA Annual Action Plan developed and soft copy forwarded to OHCS by February 2019		1	The annual action had to be presented in quarters and linked to the 2019 budget and the Chief Director's Agreement. The areas presented as TPAs in Schedule One of the Agreement had to be reflected in/have a basis in the Annual Action Plan so that there was consistency in the Ministry's priorities. 10% of mark deducted if document submitted after February 2019
	Mid-Year Report of implementation of the CDPA and soft copy forwarded to OHCS by August 2019		1	This represents the CDs assessment of how the CDPA has been implemented by mid-year and is to be presented to the OHCS for the consideration of the mid-year review Team. The mid-year review could also inform any changes or revisions that a CD would make to his/her performance agreement with OHCS in writing.
	Follow-up/remedial actions undertaken on mid-yearCDs self-assessment report and to be available by September 2019		0.5	The report on follow-up actions was expected to reflect on actions that the Ministry would undertake/had undertaken in line with the recommendations arising from the mid-year performance review. It could address proposals to the HCS for a review of the CDPA. This has to be officially communicated to the HCS
	Mid-year Sector Performance report on the implementation of the sector's annual action plan to be available by December 2019		0.5	This represents a report on the mid-year meeting by the sector to review the implementation of the Sector Action Plan.
	2019Sector Annual Performance Report produced and soft copy forwarded to OHCS by 15th January 2020.		1	This provided inputs into the preparation of the Annual State of the Civil Report to the Government. It followed template provided by OHCS. 10% of mark deducted if document submitted after deadline.
KRA 2: Financial Management: **Total score of 5 marks**	Audit Committee Meetings and Actions Taken to Address Audit Queries	Minutes of Audit Committee meetings	1	The law requires that Audit Committee meetings are held quarterly. This provision was not strictly observed because there were problems in getting the Chairpersons to be available quarterly. Each meeting with available minutes attracted a mark of 0.25.
		Summary of actions from Audit Committee Meetings	1	A report or documentation indicating how the decisions, recommendations and outcomes from the Audit Committee meetings had been acted upon by management, was required as evidence.
	MDA's 2019 Annual Procurement Plan Approved	Annual procurement plan	0.5	Annual procurement plans had been submitted electronically to the Public Procurement Agency (PPA). However, hard copies of the document and copies of electronic correspondence were required as evidence of submission.
		Minutes of Entity Tender	0.5	Entity tender committees were expected to meet at least once a year to

		Committee meetings		approve the Procurement Plan. However, the Team recognised that subsequent meetings of the Committee would depend on the needs of the Ministry. Minutes were checked for dates, attendance and other details.
	Updated assets register signed and dated by Estates Officer and Authenticated by Internal/External Auditor		1.5	The updated assets register had to be dated (preferably 2019), signed by the estates officer and certified and stamped by the internal auditor of the Ministry, **on every page to ensure that the pages could not be compromised**. Evidence that assets had been properly valued and located, preferably following the government assets register format and the document properly signed and authenticated would attract a full mark of 1.5. A presentation of a list of assets was deemed an inventory. However, an inventory, which was signed and properly authenticated, would be awarded a mark of 1. If it was an inventory and was partially signed, dated or authenticated, the CD was given 0.5.
	2018 Final accounts submitted with forwarding letter to CAGD by March, 2019		0.5	Without the 2018 expenditure returns, CAGD would not release funds to the particular Ministry. However, evidence that the accounts had been submitted was still required, especially within the stipulated time frame. In particular, the forwarding letter and other indications of adherence to proper procedure were required. Failure to submit the document by the deadline attracted a deduction of 10% of the mark.
KRA 3: Human resource management: **Total score of 10 marks**	Organizational manual and forwarding letter to OHCS		0.5	To attract the full mark, the Organizational Manual had to be recently updated (not more than four years old). Desirably, it had to be finalized, dated and stamped. Where an Organizational Manual was in draft form, there had to be evidence of the involvement of MSD in its preparation and submission to OHCS, awaiting the Civil Service Council's approval.
	Job Schedules Available	Staff list as at 31st December 2018	0.5	The staff list had to have been updated for 2018 and complete for all categories of staff. Staff were randomly invited to check their names in the staff list
		Individual job schedules for all staff	1	Individual job schedules for **all** staff members located in different divisions and offices had to be provided as a basis for performance assessment. Generic descriptions or job schedules for particular categories of staff were considered inadequate. Staff were randomly invited to confirm their job schedules.
	Approved Establishment Levels: Updated establishment levels/forwarding letter to OHCS		0.5	The establishment level had to have been prepared providing information on the approved establishment, number at post and the

				variance and information forwarded to the OHCS.
	Composite, analysed report on 2018 staff performance appraisal forwarded to OHCS by January 2019		1.5	The composite report on the completed cycle of 2018 staff appraisal and evidence of submission on time had to be made available for verification. If the 2018 composite appraisal report was available with analysis to support decision-making, the full mark of 1.5 is awarded. Without adequate analysis, a mark of 1 was awarded for the report.
	Operationalization of the 2019 Staff Appraisal Instrument: Completed planning and mid-year phases of the appraisal process for 2019 for all eligible staff		0.5	Evidence of action on the two (2) phases of the performance appraisal process had to be provided. Separate reports of these processes had to be satisfactorily completed as far as possible, for all staff. The Team looked for corroborative evidence by interviewing staff at random. Availability of a document on each phase attracted a mark of 0.25.
	Performance Agreements (PAs) with Heads of Department (HODs) and Directors and Analogous Grades	Signed performance agreements with HODs and Directors/Analogous Grades and forwarded to OHCS by March 2019	0.5	A composite report on the signing process for performance agreements with HODs and Directors/Analogous Grades had to be available and tendered in evidence. It was noted that the delay in signing CDPAs affected this OVI with Agreements being signed in March 2019.
		Evaluation of HODs/Directors' performance agreements and report submitted to OHCS by January 2020	1	Evaluation reports had to be completed based on an objective assessment of the agreed priority actions. Clear modes of assessment, criteria as well as scores had to be evident to get the full mark. Communication indicating submission to OHCS was also required. It was recognized that some Ministries, through no fault of theirs, did not have Directors or persons of Analogous Grades. Therefore, their mark for KRA 3 was accordingly adjusted to cater for this.
	Training Programmes	2019 Training plan submitted to OHCS by March 2019	0.5	The 2019 Training Plan was to be prepared based on a Template provided by the OHCS and submitted to the OHCS.
		Quarterly reports on implementation of training plan and forwarding letter to OHCS	1	Each of the four (4) reports attracted a mark of 0.25. Beyond a listing of staff trained in which institutions, durations and dates, there had to be an analysis of the skills gained and the implications for improving productivity for the Ministry. Therefore, matrixes as reports were inadequate. The second quarter report would provide an assessment of extent of implementation and actions to be carried forward.The end of year report would provide a total overview for the year; how skills and capacities gained had been utilised; and the implications for next year.
	Management of Discipline	Monthly reports of analysis of staff	0.5	Reports must provide an analysis of patterns of staff attendance, changes in performance in this regard, the implications for

		attendance indicating trends and actions taken		productivity within the period and actions taken on persistent late comers had to be made available.
		Report on efforts to enforce discipline; including efforts to prevent or discourage indiscipline	0.5	Evidence (including reports) indicating actions to boost discipline as well as disciplinary action taken in the Ministry were examined. The CD was expected to take into account preventive actions as well as sanctions that had been applied
	Report on staff movements	Composite, analysed report on staff movements	1	The report had to present information on recruitments, replacements, promotions, retirements and resignations in 2019. An analysis and discussion on the implications of these for performance and productivity in the Ministry was required. Without analysis of the implications of movements, the candidate would score half of the mark.
		2020 Promotion register and forwarding letter to OHCS by November 2019	0.5	The promotion register was expected to indicate those eligible for promotion in 2020; provide explanations where these were required; and evidence of submission to OHCS on time. Failure to meet the deadline led to a deduction of 10% from the score.
KRA 4: Ministerial Advisory Board: **Total score of 2 marks**	The Ministerial Advisory Board set-up/list of board members		0.5	Evidence of appointed members and inauguration of Ministerial Advisory Boards (MABs) was required. However, it was recognised that organizations such as OHCS, the Office of the Senior Minister and the Office of the President by their roles and structures would not have MABs. Therefore, an appropriate correcting factor was used to address this.
	Quarterly meetings organized		1.5	Ideally, MAB meetings are to be held quarterly and four sets of minutes were required. Owing to problems in getting members to meet, the period within which meetings were held were not seriously considered. Every set of minutes presented and verified attracted 0.375.
KRA 5: Customer Service Initiatives: **Total score of 4 marks**	Service Delivery Standards and Brochures for the Organization	Service charter available and copies forwarded to OHCS	0.5	The Ministry's Service Charter had to have a date of publication; and provide relevant, current information on the services to be provided by the Ministry; and the standards and time-lines to be expected. Relevant information on sector agencies/departments and their contacts had to be listed. Charters that are undated would be awarded 0.45. In view of the forthcoming review of Template exercise to be undertaken by the OHCS, Ministries with draft Charters were advised

				not to have these printed since there might be the need to review all Service Charters after the exercise.
		Service Charters of Sector Departments available and copies forwarded to OHCS	0.5	This year, charters of Allied Agencies were considered as well as Departments to assess availability of information on services to the public and citizenry from sector entities.
	Functional Client Service Unit (CSU)	Designated Office Space for Client Service Unit (CSU) and Basic Equipment provided	0.5	Ideally, a separate, well-equipped office was required for Client Service Units (CSUs). However, the team recognised space constraints that Ministries faced and accepted "shared premises" as long as they were appropriately labelled and potential clients directed to these services.
		CSU Staff: evidence of exposure to capacity development, including internship with other corporate institutions	0.5	Evidence has to be provided that staff had attended capacity development programmes or internship with other corporate institutions. For the capacity development programme, a back to office report was required while a testimonial from the corporate institution or report by the participant was required
		Mid-year and end-of-year reports on the MDAs' compliance with the service delivery standards as well as on operations of CSU as well as copies forwarded to OHCS	0.5	The full mark was awarded to CDs who provided reports on the CSU's operations detailing the range and nature of enquires made, responses and actions taken to address clients' needs; and the extent of compliance with indicated Ministry standards. There also had to be evidence of submission to OHCS. CSU reports that did not provide information on extent of compliance with service delivery standards in the charter were scored half of the mark (0.25).
	Public Information Dissemination Mechanisms	Functional, interactive websites, social media platforms	0.25	In order to make the full mark, the Ministry's website address had to be verified and be functioning.
		Reports on quarterly updates of websites	0.25	Reports detailing efforts at updating the content of websites had to be provided. The team also elicited information as to how content was approved and who contributed to providing information on the Ministry.
		Efforts to publicise the Ministry's services	0.5	Events to familiarize the public with services available in the Ministry that were accepted included social media (Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram), participation in Meet-the-Press Events, National Policy Fairs and Press-Engagements were accepted.
		Brochures, promotional documentation	0.5	Other publications that served purposes of public information dissemination such as bulletins were considered acceptable. Where the Ministry was able to demonstrate ongoing efforts to develop a

				brochure or other promotional and information materials, half the mark (0.25) was awarded.
KRA 6: Work Environment Improvement: **Total score of 5 marks**	Efficiency gains in organizational operations	Innovations in organizational operations	0.5	This has always been a problematic area with some CDs literally swearing to some ideas which may be deemed common as helping them to improve efficiency. Where the innovation cited was related to e-services or information technology, they had to go beyond those indicated in KRA5 above. Other initiatives to enhance productivity including the introduction of new formats and other ways of optimizing resources to transform work would attract the full mark.
	Review of Ministerial activities as they impact on the sub-national level	Monitoring and evaluation reports/sector reviews including the effects of sector policies, programmes and activities on stakeholders at the sub-national level.	0.5	This measure was intended to assess the extent to which the Ministry was sensitive to the effects of policy initiatives and sector programmes on the citizenry. It was also in recognition of the Ministries' responsibilities for monitoring and evaluation role. While CDs provided information of interactions at the sub-national level, the issue of evidence of data gathering, analysis and interaction with sub-national actors to inform policy action was a problem. It may be necessary to take a look at this OVI in future.
		Evidence of tracking and analysis of public opinion/media reports and follow-up actions	0.25	Analysis of media reports and other efforts to track public opinion was also assessed as a means of monitoring the effects of Ministerial action and policies on the Ghanaian public. This was differentiated from Media Engagements that the Ministry had initiated. A collection of press cuttings would attract half the mark. Evidence of analysis of reports to identify trends and issues requiring action would attract the full mark. CDs were encouraged to use their RSIM Directorates to analyse the information and make them available for policy formulation
	Management/Staff Engagements	Monthly management meetings	0.5	Management meetings were interpreted as consisting of meetings between the Chief Director and Heads of Departments and/or Agencies for the purpose of deliberating on management issues. This could also include meetings involving Ministers and Heads of Allied Agencies. A total of twelve (12) management meetings were required to obtain the full mark. Therefore, the number of meetings for whose minutes were available was calculated out of 12 and the proportion applied to the total mark. Each meeting had a score of about 0.042.
	Management/Staff Engagements	Quarterly staff durbars/meetings	0.5	Four (4) staff durbars were required for the year. Minutes were required as evidence that these had been held, depicting participants,

				issues discussed and opportunities for contributions from the staff. The score for each durbar with minutes was 0.125.
		Report on measures to promote gender inclusiveness	0.25	In line with good practice, CDs were required to provide evidence of actions they had taken to enhance gender-sensitivity or promote gender equality in their workplaces. Acceptable initiatives included gender awareness creation programmes, formulation of gender policies, networking and affirmative action, where necessary.
		Report on measures to promote staff health and well-being	0.5	CDs were assessed on initiatives undertaken to promote health and well-being of their staff in the work-place including health screening, health education, support for health care as well as other welfare-enhancement interventions.
		Internal Newsletters/Catalogue of information posted on notice boards	0.25	Scores were assigned for mechanisms for sharing information internally including WhatsApp platforms. The availability of strategically and prominently-located notice boards with regularly updated information was acceptable.
	Records Management Improvement Initiatives	Evidence of Engagement with PRAAD	0.5	Communication between the Ministry and PRAAD as well as reports on actions relating to records inspection, decongestion, storage and archiving and other relevant activities were accepted as evidence of interaction with PRAAD.
		Evidence of actions taken to improve records management	0.25	The team recognised that though the Ministry may not require a major intervention by PRAAD on an annual basis, it was important that there were ongoing efforts to improve management of documents and information. Therefore, Ministries were required to demonstrate such efforts including capacity building and provision of more appropriate facilities and equipment for records management.
	Management of Physical Environment		1.0	CDs were required to demonstrate activities undertaken during the year under review to improve their physical work environments/what they had done differently since the previous year. These included action on • satisfactory cleaning arrangements; • actions to enhance disability-access; • security arrangements/safety of offices/ premises; • occupational safety measures; • adequacy and cleanliness of toilet facilities; • valid fire certificates, fire-fighting equipment and relevant staff training; and other initiatives.

REPUBLIC OF GHANA

GHANA CIVIL SERVICE